

State of Hawai'i
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
Division of Forestry and Wildlife
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

March 31, 2015

Endangered Species Recovery Committee
State of Hawai'i
Honolulu, Hawai'i

Committee Members:

**SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR COMMENTS ON THE NA PUA MAKANI WIND
 ENERGY PROJECT DRAFT HABITAT CONSERVATION PLAN**

BACKGROUND:

A pre-application for the Na Pua Makani Wind Power 25 MW project was originally submitted in 2009 by West Wind Works, LLC (West Wind). In 2011, West Wind's project proposal was designed as a 20.7 MW, nine turbine facility located in Kahuku Agricultural Park. A pre-application was filed and a draft Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) was submitted to DOFAW in May 2011. Champlin Hawaii Wind Holdings, LLC (a subsidiary of Champlin / GEI Wind Holdings, LLC) acquired the Project in 2012 from West Wind, and formed Na Pua Makani Power Partners, LLC (Na Pua Makani). Following acquisition of the West Wind project, Na Pua Makani expanded the project area, and proposed an 8-10 turbine array with up to 25 MW generation capacity.

Na Pua Makani proposes to construct and operate the Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project (Project) with a nameplate generating capacity of up to approximately 25 megawatts (MW) on O'ahu, Hawai'i. The proposed Project would be located on state zoned agricultural land use district and urban land use district leased from State of Hawai'i's Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) and from the Malaekahana Hui West, LLC. The Project is proposed to begin construction in the first quarter of 2015 and begin commercial operation by December 2015.

The anticipated life of the Project is 21 years. Prior to the expiration of the 21-year period, Na Pua Makani will evaluate whether to continue operation of the Project or to decommission it. Should the period of Project operation be extended, the facility may also be upgraded and repowered with appropriate lease, permit, and approval extensions obtained.

Currently, Na Pua Makani is pursuing an Incidental Take License through the development of an HCP – in consultation with U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and the State Division of Forestry and Wildlife (DOFAW) staff – for incidental take associated with wind farm operations.

INCIDENTAL TAKE PROPOSED:

The Project has the potential to result in incidental take of species listed under the federal Endangered Species Act and state endangered species statutes. The following listed species have the potential to be killed or injured by colliding with Project wind turbine generators or other components, or during Project activities: the ‘a‘o or Newell’s shearwater (*Puffinus auricularis newelli*), the ae‘o or Hawaiian black-necked stilt (*Himantopus mexicanus knudseni*), the ‘alae ke‘oke‘o or Hawaiian coot (*Fulica alai*), the ‘alae ‘ula or Hawaiian common moorhen (*Gallinula chloropus sandvicensis*), the koloa maoli or Hawaiian duck (*Anas wyvilliana*), the nēnē or Hawaiian goose (*Branta sandvicensis*), the pueo or Hawaiian short-eared owl (*Asio flammeus sandwichensis*), and the ‘ōpe‘ape‘a or Hawaiian hoary bat (*Lasiurus cinereus semotus*). Indirect take of some of these species could also occur, as it is possible that the death of a listed adult during the breeding season could result in loss of eggs or dependent young.

Common Name	Scientific Name	Level of Take	Requested Authorization
Hawaiian Hoary Bat ‘Ōpe‘ape‘a	<i>Lasiurus cinereus semotus</i>	Tier 1	34 bats
		Tier 2	51 bats
Newell’s Shearwater ‘A‘o	<i>Puffinus auricularis newelli</i>	NA	4 Adults/fledglings 2 Chicks/eggs
Hawaiian Goose Nēnē	<i>Branta sandvicensis</i>	NA	11 birds
Hawaiian Duck Koloa	<i>Anas wyvilliana</i>	NA	4 birds
Hawaiian Stilt ‘Ae‘o	<i>Himantopus mexicanus knudseni</i>	NA	4 birds
Hawaiian Coot ‘Alae ke‘oke‘o	<i>Fulica alai</i>	NA	8 birds
Hawaiian Moorhen ‘Alae‘ula	<i>Gallinula chloropus sandvicensis</i>	NA	8 birds
Hawaiian Short-eared Owl Pueo	<i>Asio flammeus sandwichensis</i>	NA	4 Adults/fledglings 4 Chicks/eggs

ANALYSIS & RECOMMENDATIONS:

DOFAW Staff has worked closely with Na Pua Makani through several rounds of revisions of the draft HCP. The following are concerns that Staff have with the current version of the document:

- *Section 6.1.2.2 Forest Restoration, Management, and Monitoring.* This section reflects the intention of Na Pua Makani to remove feral pigs from the proposed mitigation site. DOFAW has requested that, although the current understanding is that pigs are the only ungulates present within the site, the language be modified to include all other ungulates in case another species is discovered within the site or manages to break into the site in the future.
- *Section 6.1.2.2 Forest Restoration, Management, and Monitoring.* DOFAW staff supports the Hawaiian hoary bat mitigation proposal and the number of acres proposed for restoration, but does not agree with incorporating generation time (i.e. 8 years of mitigation is equivalent to 80 percent of a bat's life) into the calculation.
- *Section 6.1.4 Measures of Success.* The measures of success are quite vague and do not include quantitative goals or a timeline for achieving benchmarks. These measures should be clearly laid out with specific, quantifiable goals.
- *Section 6.4.3 Measures of Success.* This section is another place where DOFAW staff would like to see more quantitative measures of success pertaining to mitigation proposed for waterbird species located at Hamakua Marsh.

Respectfully Submitted,



Lisa J. Hadway, Administrator
Division of Forestry and Wildlife

Attachment I: Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project Draft Habitat Conservation Plan

