

**Group Memory September 9, 2008**  
**`Ahihi-Kina`u / Keone`o`io Advisory Group Meeting**  
**Lokelani Intermediate School Cafeteria**  
**1401 Liloa Drive, Kihei, Maui**

**Advisory Group Members Present:**

Ken Kawahara, Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR)  
Ann Fielding, Island Explorations  
Hannah Bernard, Hawai`i Wildlife Fund  
Carol Reimann, Maui Hotel Association  
Pat Borge, Makena Stables

**Staff:**

John Cumming, Division of Forestry and Wildlife (DOFAW)  
Bill Evanson (DOFAW)  
Matt Ramsey (DOFAW)  
Joe Fell-McDonald (DOFAW)  
Betsy Gagne (DOFAW)  
Phil Ohta, State Parks  
Skippy Hau, Division of Aquatic Resources

**Others:**

Kathy Becklin	Maryanne McNeely
Dee Carson	Joanne Duberstein
Michael de la Cruz	Mary Evanson
Marilyn Holland	Emily Carlson
Kelly Ledford	Dale Bonar
Rick Englmen	Marj Bonar
Mique Klemme	Nicole Davis

**Item A. Call to order.** DLNR Deputy Director Ken Kawahara, as Chair of the Advisory Group, called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. and immediately introduced Staff Matt Ramsey to give updates.

**Item B. Updates.** Staff Matt Ramsey reviewed the 12 objectives in the two year action plan summary that he handed out to the group. Radio communication system still in process; repeater will be situated on `Ulupalakua Ranch land. Two more Rangers will be hired; have just completed the interview process and should be on board within the next few weeks.

July marine monitoring was conducted; follow-up visit will be done next weekend. Anchialine pool monitoring will be done by Staff and Staff will work with SHPD and Maui Community College students to monitor cultural resources.

Member Bernard asked for more information on item 4, providing more information. Staff Ramsey replied that staff is still evaluating best methods for keeping people from entering the closed areas; particularly to fence or not. There are still a lot of people trying to go to both Kalaeloa (“Aquarium”) and Kanahena (“Fish Bowl”) and some groups have been cited.

**Item C. Discussion on Reorganization of Advisory Group.** Chair Kawahara introduced Staff Bill Evanson to summarize past history of group formation. Staff Evanson provided handouts of the group memory for the original facilitated February 12, 2004 meeting, the first meeting of the new `Ahihi-Kina`u / Keone`o`io Advisory Group May 3, 2004, and the List of Advisory Group Members and Resource People. Increased unregulated commercial activity in the entire area was the principal driving force in group organization and action. Commercial use was banned in 2004, following Administrative Rule revisions and a large part of the Group’s concerns simply went away.

Membership in the Advisory Group was suggested by activity/interest, expertise, connection to the area (landowners, residents, practitioners). Group membership is changing, with members leaving the island or assuming other positions. At the August 12, 2008 meeting, it was noticed that nominations made from the floor and voting on members at the previous meeting was incorrect because it was not an agenda item. It was decided to have this as an item on the next meeting agenda to consider future membership on the Group.

For prior group selection, following the February 12, 2004 meeting, names were submitted and DLNR did the selection, not a group vote.

The first meeting was held May 3, 2004, and it was clearly stated that the group was meeting to advise DLNR on matters involving `Ahihi-Kina`u NAR and Keone`o`io. Commercial activity was the major interest of the Group.

Chair Kawahara reviewed Advisory Group membership with respect to the different **categories** and whether they should be represented at the table as a group member or a resource person or to be an organization to be kept in the loop, as discussed in the 2004 organizing meeting. We need to determine what categories on the group and are able to come to meeting, or to be available only when their expertise is needed.

Member Bernard felt funny with so few members present at the meeting with making any decisions. Chair Kawahara: the purpose of this meeting is to look at the **categories**, then accept nominations from the group themselves and others. Group size could vary from 12 to 18. Present group members could nominate themselves or others, and other interested people could also nominate themselves. The Department will be asking each applicant to answer the following questions: 1) what category you represent, 2) what do you bring to the Table, and 2) what do you hope to accomplish on the Advisory Group. Still trying to understand the 2004 group makeup; want to be sure that my successor has clear information on the group now and in the future. The Department will be making

the selections of most appropriate people to fill the **categories** as agreed to for the Advisory Group.

**Item D. Stakeholder and skill set representation: discussion on filling stakeholder positions on the Advisory Group.** The following **categories** follow the 2004 meeting, to review who has a seat at the Table, for discussion at this meeting:

<b>Tourism</b>	<b>Hawaiian Culture</b>
<b>Science/Research</b>	<b>County</b>
<b>Recreation</b>	<b>State</b>
<b>Impactees</b>	<b>Education/Outreach</b>
<b>Community Groups</b>	<b>Conservation/Research</b>
<b>Commercial</b>	

Member Reimann: not clear on the distinction between the Advisory Group and Resource people; Chair Kawahara replied that the Advisory Group provides advice to the NARS Commission on `Ahihi-Kina`u NAR (which in turn advises the Board of Land and Natural Resources); it also provides advice to the Department on Keone`o`io, which is under the Department's Land Division, but is adjacent to the NAR.

Staff Evanson: Resource people are those with expertise in certain fields (i.e. Police, Land Agents), to tap into for land use and enforcement questions; agency people do not need to be at the table, and with no commercial activity in the area, perhaps no place for them at the table.

Member Reimann: representation of commercial interests was important, if just from another view point. Member Borge: commercial use in the NAR was not appropriate and that it should be taken off of the group. Member Reimann: commercial interests offer a different point of view that is important. Member Borge: commercial activity was not allowed in the NAR, it should continue to be protected, and not the same thing all over again.

Member Bernard: good to have commercial boating as resource people with pending buoys for marine boundaries and their potential impacts; but not necessarily at the Table, but at least kept in the loop. Member Borge still felt the commercial point of view was a worry and do not want to go back to those problems again.

Chair Kawahara referred to recreation users on page 3: boaters are mentioned as Resource people, not Group members. Member Fielding: boats are banned from the NAR, but there is a safety issue with rough water or emergency and sometimes and boats need to come into the reserve.

Member Bernard: because of the NARSC, there is no activity in the Reserve, but with all the commercial activity around the Reserve, need to keep them (boaters) in the loop. Member Borge: many boaters can claim they are in because it is rough, but it is a guise

for their commercial operations. Staff Evanson: need a liaison for all boaters, commercial or others who come into the Reserve; they should be a Resource.

Chair Kawahara: for tonight, we do not want names of individual people, need to focus on **categories**. Member Bernard: Division of Boating and Ocean Recreation (DOBOR) is not on the old list; needs to be there. Staff Evanson: tourism important to be at Table; also Science/Research should be at the Table.

Chair Kawahara: recreation users, including fishers are on the Group because it is also for Keone`o`io (where fishing is allowed, as opposed to the Reserve). Staff Evanson: Gary Hashizaki was added to the Group to represent fishers at the Table.

Chair Kawahara: public safety could be on an as-needed basis for information as a Resource and not necessarily at the Table. Member Bernard: there have been more calls to Kihei Station for water incidents, so perhaps County lifeguards should be at the Resource level.

Staff Evanson: impactees should remain at the Table because they are residents adjacent to the area (therefore having the greatest immediate impact). Community groups are hard to get to the Table (or to decide which Community group is most appropriate). Member Borge suggested Kihei Community Association, which is larger and more organized than Makena Community Association; they could represent all of South Maui at the Table.

Staff Evanson referred to the original list of Group Members, pointing out that some members, such as Rob Parsons, the Mayor's Environmental Coordinator, had taken another position; and Kuhea Paracuelles, who was in attendance, was now in that position. Chair Kawahara asked if the County was at the table or at the resource level; Staff Evanson: Resource; Member Bernard: advice as a Resource; perhaps permission from the Mayor. Staff Evanson: they have cooperated with us, are interested in the area, have limited jurisdiction in the area, but the road is still an issue.

Member Borge: road is biggest issue, wants it resolved! The State and County have been fighting about the road all these years, how can they work together. Staff Evanson: road resolution is outside of the Group; facilitated meetings between the State and County need to continue.

Member Bernard asked to hear from Kuhea, as Mayor's representative on whether she should be on the Group or as a Resource person; feels it would be appropriate, as the area is at the heart of Maui County. Chair Kawahara referred back to 2004: the Mayor was invited and participation was up to the Mayor; suggest this be put on hold until public testimony period, and then ask Kuhea.

Staff Evanson: State agencies should continue to be a Resource; Chair Kawahara agreed. Member Bernard: if all State agencies not on the mailing list, they are not up to speed.

Chair Kawahara: Staff Ramsey has been meeting with the Stewardship Group to come up with a plans for four larger areas focusing on recreation ( `Ahihi-Kina`u on Maui, Kealakekua on the Big Island, Ka`ena on O`ahu, and Ha`ena on Kaua`i); he reiterated that he will continue to be on the Group as chair, representing DLNR, which convened the Group; Member Bernard agreed.

Staff Evanson: for Education and Outreach, there should be a two-way communication loop, while in 2004 the category was not listed as Resource, it should be a Resource.

Member Bernard: with the Ranger Outreach Program, someone should be involved from Department of Education; she also suggested adding Coast Guard and Whale Sanctuary to the Federal category along with National Park service, as Resources. Staff Evan son: the Group added a list of things to do including meeting organization, facilitator, etc.

Chair Kawahara asked to take up County participation at this time, asking Kuhea if she was willing to represent the County at the Table. She replied that the County strongly supports DLNR, is working with many Divisions, and would be happy to participate as appropriate; the Mayor is supportive.

Chair Kawahara thanked her, then reiterated the 10 Stakeholder categories, saying DLNR was looking for a Group size of 12 to 18 people across the categories. Nominations for Group members either to nominate themselves or others, or for other nominations, Staff Evanson is to be the contact ([William.D.Evanson@hawaii.gov](mailto:William.D.Evanson@hawaii.gov) or phone 264-9325). The following questions form the core of the application process: 1) which category do you feel you would best represent; 2) what would you bring to the table; and 3) what do you hope to accomplish sitting on the Group.

Nominations/applications must be received over the next three weeks, with the final deadline of September 30, 2008. It is important to keep to the deadline to have this settled by. Member Fielding: different and tricky determining positions; some may qualify for more than one position/seat.

**Item E. Other business combined with Item F. Public Comment Period.** Chair Kawahara wanted focus on the Management Plan as the next item. Staff Ramsey: Advisory Group will be working on the Management Plan; Emily Fielding is organizing a Management Plan Workshop November 12-13, 2008.

A member of the audience (they did not identify themselves and were unknown to recorder) asked about process: who makes the decision. Chair Kawahara: process will follow that of 2004; DLNR will make the decision. Another question (person also unidentified): of those members currently listed that do not show up to meetings, will they continue. Chair Kawahara: in the case of Daniel Ornellas, formerly with Department of Hawaiian Home Lands on Maui, is now with DLNR Land Division on Maui and will be serving in a resource capacity. Others not present at this meeting will be contacted to see if they are interested in continuing or not.

Staff Evanson put up a list of the current Stakeholder categories for reference. Someone asked about the “Friends” on list. Member Borge: in 2001 the Friends of Keone`o`io came together in response to the commercial use in the area. He personally went to see the Governor to get protection back as a priority and do not want to go backwards; otherwise it will be a real battle.

Member Bernard: good point because State wanted commercial activity at the time, but the NARSC helped to back that down. Member Borge: wanted the whole area shut down, but compromise was to leave `Ahihi Bay for tourists; they are lucky they got “Dumps” to snorkel; it is a Reserve, it should be shut down, not a free-for-all; got to be protected.

Staff Evanson: we are planning for the future; the Management Plan is a big challenge; at the end of the two year closure, what then; need to address this now as part of the Management Plan.

Another audience member (who did not state name and spoke very softly; recorder had difficulty) called for openness and honesty from staff; we are not sure what is going on. Some `Ahihi volunteers have gotten together as citizens to keep our group going; we like to show people where they are going; we care about the place and we are just going to for this.

Chair Kawahara: Staff Ramsey and Edwards are in the process of planning a volunteer program meeting to be held within the next two weeks for **all** groups that may want to work in the area. Unidentified audience member: when, we have been waiting; we are ready to make up our own t-shirts. Another unidentified person supported doing something in the area since there was no one there now; these are precious resources, you are not there and we want to be there.

Emily Carlson, Outreach Coordinator for the Whale Sanctuary: supports DOFAW putting the meeting together and seeing all groups working together under DOFAW there. Member Bernard: good for the Division to work with volunteer groups.

Maryanne McNeely: goes to the reserve every Saturday and Sunday and felt that without the large volunteer presence, there are less people using the area. Agree with the importance of education as expressed by volunteer groups, but perhaps not so much attention at the (Kanahena) Cove. What is the use of Rangers (new ones) and how will education through the Rangers provide protection of Dumps” and the cove by the road (Kanahena); will those coves be kept open or closed as well; would like information on those 3 points.

Staff Ramsey: the 6 rangers will continue to do as present staff do; need to get our Education – Outreach plan together.

Maryanne McNeely made the following suggestions/questions that need to done: 1) focus volunteer education at “Dumps” rather than the little cove, since it has a parking

lot; 2) what would be the regulations to close “Dumps” and the little cove; and 3) close the whole Reserve, have guides only.

Staff Ramsey: 1) depends on resources and volunteers available; 2) will be decided over the next two years through the NARSC to the Board of Land and Natural Resources, the Advisory Group will help recommend whether to open, close, etc., but it still is the NARS Commission making recommendations to and then the Board making the final decision; and 3) the gate/road issue has to be settled before there can be any further discussion about gaiting the area. There will be a lot of changes in the “Dumps” parking lot, changes over the next few months with an office to be located there to help provide onsite ability for staff, and bring more focus to that particular area.

Member Bernard: had research on use of the area for 8 years, looked at presence of educational activities and agree they could be a magnet; that is why you need to have before, during, and after impact studies. We found there were about 700 a day going to the end of the road (Keone`o`io), we also had an education table at “Dumps” parking lot, and the numbers stayed the same. The cove area has always been busy; downturn in tourism now too, which gives a different spin. We all care and need to keep collecting information so can see what happens when tourism drops off.

Maryanne McNeely: education is better suited at “Dumps” rather than the small cove.

Mique Klemme: the group wants to work with everybody; but we keep waiting and have not heard anything. Volunteers are a great resource; we want to be able to continue.

Member Borge: all about working together, whether I like you or not; we’re all there for the same thing, but the **State** is in control of the volunteer process; we need to protect for the future and work together whether we like it or not; that is the way it is or you should not be down there.

Chair Kawahara: spoke with staff Ramsey to coordinate a volunteer meeting where your/our expectations may be addressed; agree with member Borge, DLNR has a mandate to take care of the resources and has decided to lead the effort.

**Item G. Adjournment.** There being no further comments, Chair Kawahara adjourned the meeting at 7:37 p.m.

Respectfully submitted as alternate recorder for the meeting,

Betsy Gagné, Executive Secretary  
Natural Area Reserves System

Proposal to reorganize and expand the 12 member Ahihi-Kinau NAR/Keone`o`io Advisory Group to a 25 member group with greater Native Hawaiian and natural resource management and stakeholder representation\* (2004)

- (1) **State Chair:** DLNR Director or Deputy
- (1) **County of Maui:** Kuhea Paracuellas, Environmental Coordinator
- (4) **Community:** Dino Ventura, Pat Borge, Sumner Erdman, Robert Lu`uwai
- (2) **Lineal descendants /Aha Kiole:**
- (2) **Native Hawaiian Cultural:** Charlie Maxwell Sr.
- (2) **Education and Outreach:** Hannah Bernard, Hawaii Wildlife Fund
- (1) **Visitor industry:** Lani Correa, Maui Hotel Association
- (1) **Community volunteer group:**
- (2) **Neighboring landowner:** Daniel Ornellas & Vanessa Medeiros DHHL, Dan Davidson, Land Division
- (2) **Marine/anchialine resources:** Ann Fielding, FWS, DAR
- (1) **Native plant/native species restoration:**
- (2) **Enforcement:** DOCARE, Sydney Kikuchi MPD
- (1) **Fishing:** Gary Hashizaki, Maui Casting Club
- (1) **Boating:**
- (1) **Natural resource/people management:** NPS
- (1) **Alien species:** USGS, NPS, TNC

*\*Individual names listed are current advisory group members*



## Attachment 1. Progress on objectives from 2008 Action Plan

Objective	Action	Due Date	Progress
1. By June 2008, receive BLNR approval on action plan to control access and use within 'Ahihi-Kina'u NAR by zone for two years.	Solicit comment on action plan at advisory group meetings.	April 7, 2008	Completed
	Revise plan as needed, solicit comments on Action Plan at NARS Commission meeting.	April 21, 2008	Completed
	Revise plan as needed, present plan to BLNR for final approval.	May 2008	Completed
2. By August 2008, implement an aggressive and methodical outreach program to inform the general public about the NAR restrictions before they enter the area.	Issue press release to general public through various media.	By August 1, 2008	Completed
	Issue printed notice to visitor industry (rental car companies, concierge, guidebooks, visitor channel)	By August 1, 2008	Completed
	Develop and upload a website	By July 1, 2008	Completed
3. Provide the public with regular, interactive means to track progress through public advisory group meetings and an interactive website.	Develop and upload website	By August 2008	Completed
	Hold quarterly meetings to report progress and receive public input	Beginning in July 2008	In progress
4. By August 2008, provide the public with clear information about access and use by clearly delineating boundaries through the posting of signs, by fencing, and by distributing educational material.	Install 40 regulatory and educational signage	By August 2008	Completed
	Design and distribute NAR informational pamphlet (rules, zones, recommended snorkeling areas).	By July 15, 2008	Completed
	Erect visual barriers (low fencing) to protect Maoanakaia village and help to define zone border	By June 2008	Completed (roping instead)
	Erect physical barriers for future outplanting site and to help define zone border at Kalaeloa	By July 2008	Postponed
5. By August 2008, minimize entry into the restricted zones by increasing presence throughout NAR and ensure effective enforcement of illegal activity if it occurs	Design protocol for educating users on scene and reporting violations	By August 2008	Completed
	Engage DOCARE, MPD, and citizens patrol	By August 2008	Completed

## Attachment 1. Progress on objectives from 2008 Action Plan

6. By August 2008, increase communication capability thorough out reserve by installing a repeater system.	Purchase and install radio repeater	By August 2008	Late (in progress)		
	Purchase radios for expanded outreach programs	By August 2008	Budget cut		
7. By November 2008, increase management capacity by hiring and training 3 well equipped rangers.	Hire and train 3 rangers	1 by June, 2 more by July 2008	Late (1 hired, 2 in progress)		
8. By December 2008 finalize and implement regular monitoring to assess status and trends of key natural resource features (e.g. fish populations, near-shore corals, anchialine pool fauna)	Previous survey methodology evaluated and set of long-term monitoring protocols finalized by August 2008 Baseline monitoring completed on an annual basis.	By December of each year	Geology – pending grant award in progress Anch – started July 16 (in progress) Marine – started July 19 (in progress) Arch sites – not started		
9. By August 2009 complete baseline monitoring for human impacts to resources in and out of restricted zones.	Survey human use behavior	By August 2009	Not started		
10. By August 2009 complete baseline monitoring for natural resources, incorporating previous studies	Protocols developed and baseline human impacts to resources survey completed in open and restricted areas (anchialine, geological, cultural, marine)	By August 2009	Not started		
11. By January 2009, design and test a program to provide reliable, quality, guided educational walks for visitors to Kalaeloa and Mokuha.	Design and test program to provide 2 hikes/ day, 2 days a month	By January 2009	Not started		
	Evaluate feasibility to expanding guided hike program	By May 2009	Not started		
12. By June 2010 delineate clearly marked trails and ocean entry points to prevent degradation of resources and increase visitor safety.	Delineate clear trails that avoid sensitive resources at 'Ahihi Bay and Mokuha	'Ahihi Bay trail by August 2008 All others by June 2010	Completed		
	Assess the possibility of delineating trail to Kalaeloa	By November 2009	Not started		
			Pending grant		