

## **Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes**

Hui No‘eau Visual Arts Center

2841 Baldwin Avenue, Makawao HI 96768 – Media Lab

September 9, 2016

**Present:** Rich von Wellsheim (Chair), Betsy Gagné (Ex-officio), Michael Constantinides (Chair-elect), Gregory Koob, Patrick Conant, Greg Hendrickson, Jonathan Ching, Janet Britt, Kip Dunbar, Nicholas Koch, Jay Warner, Alvin Kyono, Hank Oppenheimer

**Staff:** Irene Sprecher, Marissa Chee, Malia Nanbara

**Guests:** Dawn Horn (MDHE LLC), Matt Horn (MDHE LLC), Jordan Jokiel (Haleakala Ranch), Scott Fretz (DOFAW), Lance De Silva (DOFAW), Katie Friday (Forest Service)

### **1. Call to Order**

Meeting was called to order at 9:30am by Chair-elect Constantinides.

### **2. Welcome New Members and Guests**

### **3. Review and Approval of Meeting Minutes**

#### **3.1 May 27, 2016 meeting minutes**

- The FSAC reviewed the meeting minutes from the May 27, 2016 meeting and made the following corrections:

- Member Gagné and Member Conant provided staff with written corrections.

**Motion to approve the November 13, 2015 FSAC meeting minutes as corrected. Moved by Member Dunbar, seconded by Member Gagné.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Dunbar, Koch, Warner, Kyono, Oppenheimer; Oppose: none; Abstain: none.**

**Motion passed.**

### **4. Forest Stewardship Program (FSP) Project Proposals**

#### **4.1 MDHE Forest Stewardship project proposal, Ko‘olaupoko District, Honolulu County**

- Staff Sprecher introduced the project as a 6 acre project in Kailua on O‘ahu. They will be focusing on a smaller portion of the property to start.

- Guest D. Horn said the entire property is 36 acres. Their neighbors include 81 residential homes, Bellows Air Force Station, and a horse ranch. The property was ranched for over 100 years and abused by neighbor’s activities and causing erosion. They want to start the process of restoring it to a dryland native forest, and have connected with the dryland forest hui. The vegetation consists mostly of guinea grass and koa haole, and only 3% is native. They want to start with a 6 acre piece, and hopefully expand to manage the other 30 acres in the future.

- Guest D. Horn said that the area is dry but can get muddy during the rainy season. They hope to create a natural rain garden to prevent runoff.

- Member Conant asked if they talked to anyone about growing koa. Guest D. Horn said they will probably have success with koaia, but may be able to sustain koa at higher elevations. Formosan koa is present at the site. Member Conant commented that HARC has

been breeding fusarium resistant koa. Guest D. Horn said Rick Barbosa from Hui Ku Maoli Ola Nursery is guiding and assisting them with getting seeds.

- Guest D. Horn said they intend to plant pohinahina and other species as ground cover. They also intend to establish subsistence plantings of ulu around the edges of the dry forest restoration area. They would like to plant the ulu they have growing at home in pots and support research being done by the Breadfruit Institute. Member Conant added that the sooner they can get the canopy established, the more successful they will be. Guest D. Horn said they also want to plant wiliwili.
- Member Constantinides referred to the practices map and asked where brush management work will occur. Guest D. Horn said they will be doing brush management along the drainage ditch through the Soil Water Conservation District to keep the grass away from the ditch. Staff Nanbara clarified that brush management will also be done in the project area. Member Constantinides added that woody residue treatment would be beneficial.
- Member Constantinides felt that the density of 240 seedlings for 6 acres is low. Guest D. Horn said they have 240 potted trees, and that there will be additional seedlings planted as well. Staff Sprecher said the potted plants should be included in the seedling count and that seedling density will be determined during the development of the management plan.
- Member Oppenheimer recommended sourcing the seeds from O‘ahu.
- Member Koch recused himself.

**Motion to approve the project proposal for the development of a Forest Stewardship management plan. Moved by Member Constantinides, seconded by Member Ching.**

*Continued discussion:*

- Quotes for the development of the management plan ranged from \$3,958-\$10,000, an average of \$6,400. MDHE would like to work with one of the two lower quotes.
- Member Britt asked what the average cost per acre is for FSP projects. Staff Sprecher said the cost varies and depends on the size and complexity. Staff can try putting that information together for a future meeting.
- Member Constantinides asked if the committee should continue making motions on cost share. Staff Sprecher felt that it is a good discussion to have. We have the ability to not select the lowest quote. Landowners talk to 3 people so they understand the cost and we want them to work with person that fits best. The committee is allowed to be involved in setting amount if they want. If not, DOFAW will provide 50% of the chosen amount given that it is reasonable.

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Dunbar, Warner, Kyono, Oppenheimer; Oppose: none; Abstain: Koch.**

**Motion passed.**

#### 4.2 Mokio Forest Stewardship project proposal, Moloka‘i, Maui County

- Staff Nanbara introduced the project with Molokai Land Trust. They have an existing management plan that is expiring in 2017, so they are looking to update their management activities through FSP. The acreage to be enrolled in the program is still being decided. Work in the lowland areas is being done through EQIP and WHIP. They are also looking at possibly doing 5 acres through CREP. The landowner is looking at enrolling areas around Mokio point. The site is shrubby and there is a significant number of deer. They have existing plastic deer

fencing. The management plan will be for the larger property, and focused management will be in the FSP area.

- Member Dunbar said plastic fencing will work if the deer are not encouraged to get into the site. Gates are considered weak points where deer try to get under or punch through. If they do not have a lot of water in the project area or if they put troughs outside, it should be successful. He added that the regeneration of native species has been good when the kiawe is removed, however 2/3 of the estimated budget is for seedlings.
- Staff Nanbara reminded the committee that the specifications for the fence will be in the management plan.
- Member Koch felt that the resource map is unclear.
- Guest Fretz asked how they plan to handle unexploded ordinances and felt it would be a good opportunity to collaborate. Staff Nanbara said they worked with the State Historic Preservation Division; a round was found in the restoration site but was determined to be a practice round. Ilio point has been surveyed by Army Corps.
- Staff Nanbara clarified that subsistence uses refer to fishing.
- Member Dunbar asked if any road improvements have been done. Staff Nanbara says that is included under trail construction. Member Dunbar feels it is too expensive.

**Motion to approve the project proposal for the development of a Forest Stewardship management plan. Moved by Member Gagné, seconded by Member Britt.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Dunbar, Warner, Kyono, Oppenheimer, Koch; Oppose: none; Abstain: none.**

**Motion passed.**

#### 4.3 Honomalino Forest Stewardship project proposal, South Kona, Hawai'i County

- Staff Chee introduced the project with the Nature Conservancy (TNC) at Honomalino. The project area is the 4000 acre Honomalino unit of the Kona Hema preserve. The unit has a mostly closed 'ōhia dominated canopy with non-native plants on the edge of the preserve. They intend to do weed control, planting of loulou, and sustainable selective salvage of koa.
- Member Oppenheimer asked why they have not applied for NAPP funds. Staff Sprecher said it is a nice native forest and they have done a lot of scarification work. The overstory is nice, but the understory is missing in some places. Their long term vision includes doing production, which NAPP could preclude them from doing.
- Staff Sprecher clarified that forest health and protection is a newer practice that has broad components. It can include tree tubes, biological control, and should be described in the management plan.
- Member Oppenheimer asked if there is rapid 'ōhia death (ROD) in this area. Staff Sprecher said ROD has been confirmed in south Kona, but has missed this area for some reason, but they are actively monitoring for it. Guest Friday said that part of forest health may cover monitoring. Staff Sprecher clarified that rapid response would be forest health while monitoring covers things such as checking fencing and plantings.
- Member Koch recused himself.

- Member Koch asked if the budget for FSP was set up for several small projects or a few large ones. Staff Sprecher said TNC is aware of the limitations on cost share support we can provide which is no more than \$75,000/year, and is working within those limitations.
- Member Hendrickson said a lot work has been done on this site already.
- The FSAC felt that more clarity is needed in terms of what has already been accomplished, and what actions will be done going forward. Member Conant asked if the applicants are planning on expanding their management to other areas on the property. Staff Sprecher said they have a conservation easement (CE), and their management plan has just expired. They are looking at renewing their plan under the easement and doing more active management. There is only 1 person that works at the preserve.
- Member Koch said they scarified 5-10 years ago, so the koa is dense now. One prescription they want to look at is thinning to favor other species and promote better growth.
- Member Constantinides said seems like a lot of resources have gone into the plan. The budget table reads like it is primarily a maintenance operation and we want to make sure they give us cost effective quotes. If they are planning to come for NRCS funding, NRCS would need to ask them to prepare a fairly detailed map of what management activities have happened over the last 20 years. It was not clear if the three miles of fencing is existing or new.
- Member Warner commented that there may be some collateral from koa salvage. Staff Sprecher said we are not providing financial support for that, but they would be doing salvage of trees that have fallen across road or that are hazardous. They may want to do that in the scarified areas in the future.
- Member Constantinides said that they should be taking the next step in management and possibly look at larger scale enrichment plantings.
- Guest Friday said they are required to have a plan under the Forest Legacy Program (FLP). Staff Sprecher added that they would like to do FSP on 4,000 acres. We may want to look at implications of ROD in other plans.
- TNC would like to develop the management plan, but will consult with others in areas they do not have expertise in. The quotes range from \$5000-\$8500, and TNC prefers to work with the lowest quote of \$5,000.

**Motion to approve the project proposal for the development of a Forest Stewardship management plan. Moved by Member Kyono, seconded by Member Dunbar.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Dunbar, Warner, Kyono, Oppenheimer; Oppose: none; Abstain: Koch.**

**Motion passed.**

## **5. Forest Stewardship Program (FSP) Management Plans**

### **5.1 Ukulele Native Forest Restoration Plan:**

- Guest Jokiel from Haleakala Ranch introduced the project as a 100 acre area. There is greater than 50% canopy in the eastern section. They intend to remove animals, invasive plants and pests, and outplant. The entire area is already fenced, but some areas need to be reinforced. Seed scatter will be done in the understory, and targeted grazing will be done with domestic livestock for site preparation.
- Member Britt asked what the Allan Savory method is. Guest Jokiel explained that the Allan Savory method includes a holistic management of grazing animals with bulls-eye monitoring

as a means to restore. Greg Friel has experience with this process and is involved in this project.

- Member Warner was concerned that if goats are brought in from other sites, invasive species would spread through their manure. Guest Jokiel said the herd is a local resident herd specifically brought to manage gorse. The goats clear around the gorse allowing them to get to it and treat it chemically. Member Warner felt that if the animals are brought in and monitored closely, it can be successful.
- Guest Jokiel explained that there are existing koa in the area from which they will collect seeds to grow in the nursery.
- Member Warner asked if they will bring goats or sheep back in once the units are fenced and they start outplanting koa. Guest Jokiel said after they run the goats, they will follow with chemical and mechanical treatment, outplant, and never graze again. If they do not do seed scatter or if it does not work, they would let it rest until the canopy trees get big enough and then graze it again. They will not graze if the trees are not big enough.
- Staff Nanbara said they discussed whether they will need the internal fencing if they do not bring the goats back in.
- Member Hendrickson said he likes the experimental nature of this project so it would be good to have the internal fences to treat one area one way and another area a different way. This would allow them compare methods and find the most successful one. Member Dunbar said he would leave the decision to the land managers working on the ground. Guest Jokiel added that an internal hard fence provides the ability to subdivide that with an electric fence.
- Member Ching said the committee should not limit the project to one method over another. He did feel they should establish standard operating procedures if more than one method is being used. Guest Jokiel said they will track costs and metric units.
- Member Hendrickson commented that if they have a situation where they start to see damage from grazing, they should note the residual dry matter at that time so they know the point where animals start to damage trees.
- Guest Fretz was concerned that Plant Extinction and Prevention Program species in the area may be affected by the proposed grazing. Member Oppenheimer said he has been to the site and the gulch areas are intact. The slopes where they planted are steep, so he is not concerned about the PEPP species being grazed.
- Member Koch felt that the budget of \$4,000/ac is on the low side. He asked if a safe harbor agreement is needed after endangered species are planted. Guest Fretz said they could get a safe harbor agreement if they want. Guest Jokiel said they would work closely with PEPP. Member Koob said they do not need a safe harbor agreement for plants. Because the project is on private land, the take would be under state law. They would have to know what the state law is regarding experimental plantings.
- Member Koch said the agencies that will be involved in terms of contributions is unclear, and that partner interaction and commitments are not well articulated. Guest Jokiel said that nothing is written in writing yet regarding partnerships, however a lot of support has been expressed during meetings. Haleakala Ranch is recognized as a potential site by the watershed partnerships.
- Member Koch commented that the prescription for planting density is the same across all units despite variations in existing vegetation. Guest Jokiel said it was written that way for

simplicity's sake in the management plan, but the decision would be made onsite. The total number is correct, but the distribution would vary.

- Guest Jokiell explained that they have several ongoing projects, but chose only to submit Ukulele at this time. They do see a lot of potential for other FSP projects in the future.

**Motion to approve plan the management plan contingent on addressing the comments from the committee. Moved by Member Dunbar, seconded by Member Kyono.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Dunbar, Warner, Kyono, Oppenheimer, Koch; Oppose: none; Abstain: none.**

**Motion passed.**

### **5.2 Ola‘a Forest Stewardship Management Plan, Puna District, Hawai‘i County**

- The property is 48 acres in Puna, 46 of which would be enrolled in FSP. The existing ‘ōhia over story is intact with a few weedy species in the understory of one portion of the property. Another portion has dense strawberry guava. They want to preserve native over story, clean up native understory, particularly in denser areas, and turn part of it into an agroforestry project. They are going to enroll the riparian buffer section in CREP.

- Member Conant asked if the owners are doing all the work themselves. Staff Sprecher said they intend to, but they may contract some practices out and use volunteers. They run a nursery and landscaping business.

- Member Gagné commented that the project is adjacent to Pu‘u Maka‘ala Natural Area Reserve, and DOFAW would be happy to work with them.

- Member Conant asked if they can operate on this schedule if they are doing the work manually. Staff Sprecher said yes in some areas. Member Conant recommended they talk to James Leary about basal bark application of garlon 4 on strawberry guava. They also can look into getting the strawberry guava scale. Member Conant also wanted clarification on if they are using chemicals to treat palm grass.

- Guest Oppenheimer said that *Huperzia nutans* is endemic to O‘ahu and critically endangered.

- Member Conant commented that if you have bare ground and there are enough hapu‘u spores blowing around, they should come up.

- Regarding the proposed planting list, Member Koob said that *Bacopa* is listed as non-native but it is actually native. He also said the area is probably too wet for sweet potato.

- Member Constantinides felt that because the project is at the management plan stage, plant surveys should have already been done. He also felt that establishing over 4 miles of trails and roads would create too much disturbance and allow weeds to come in.

- Member Conant recommended doing weed control more frequently than every 6 months.

- Member Oppenheimer was concerned about bringing rhizobium species that are not naturally present in the area to inoculate legume species.

- Member Koch said that although the concepts are there, the plan needs more specific details. He also felt that \$1,300/acre seems high for a closed forest.

- Member Conant felt that the mulching cost is high and should be justified.

- Member Constantinides asked what will be mulched. Member Warner said they may be thinking of tearing out dead strawberry guava and that they have a skid steer. Member Dunbar added they may have trouble pulling big strawberry guava out of the ground.
- Member Britt was concerned about opening the forest to walkers and bikers. She asked if they would be installing facilities and how they are handling the risk of ROD.
- Member Oppenheimer asked if there is a written policy about sanitation regarding nursery stock that is provided from elsewhere. Staff Sprecher said there is some discussion about protocols for sanitation in the FSP handbook. That type of information should be included in the management plan if it is a high concern.
- Member Hendrickson asked if the cost of fencing is supposed to be \$14/foot because it is listed as \$7/ foot in the implementation schedule.
- Member Koch asked if any plants will come from other nurseries. If so, the nurseries should be identified along with their costs.
- Written comments were provided to staff by Member Conant and Member Constantinides.
- Member Oppenheimer said it would be good if the applicants can attend the next meeting.

**Motion for the management plan to be deferred, sent back to the applicant with comments, and resubmitted to the committee for approval. Moved by Member Warner, seconded by Member Britt.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Dunbar, Warner, Kyono, Oppenheimer, Koch; Oppose: none; Abstain: none.**

**Motion approved.**

### 5.3 Ahualoa Homesteads Forest Stewardship management plan revision, Hamakua, Hawai'i County

- Staff Nanbara explained that this project is with Alan Everson and his plan was approved in January 2014. He also has a Hawai'i CREP project. All of the outplanting has been completed, but fencing has not because the cost that was approved in the plan was not high enough, and the area to be fenced increased by 500ft. Everson was approved for \$7/foot cost share, however that cost was not high enough, so he is requesting \$9/foot to reflect actual costs. The increase in cost is a result of the amount of clearing that needs to be done. There is a significant amount of black wattle and old fencing that needs to be removed.
- Staff Sprecher said that possible termination of the FSP contract was discussed with Everson if the budget amendment is not approved. Member Constantinides felt it is not a significant increase to the state share.
- Staff Sprecher said that landowners are not required to get quotes for fencing. It may be helpful to make this a requirement so they can determine footage and cost beforehand. Member Hendrickson added that it might be beneficial for landowners to get quotes on other practices such as mulching as well.

**Motion to approve the revised management plan. Moved by Member Hendrickson, seconded by Member Britt.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Warner, Kyono, Oppenheimer, Koch; Oppose: Dunbar; Abstain: none.**

#### **5.4 Honoula Wao Kele, Maui Land and Pineapple Forest Stewardship Management Plan Revision, West Maui, Maui County**

- Staff Chee explained that this is an existing project with Maui Land and Pineapple, who has two years left on their contract. Due to changes in rainfall and the wet season, they have had to change the way they implement some of their practices. They initially planned to plant 30 acres, and have planted 16 acres to date. Given the inconsistent rains, they have reduced the total acres to be planted to 22.7 acres. They are going back to areas that were already planted to fill in gaps caused by mortality with a‘ali‘i and koaia. In the remaining 6.7 acres, they are going to do a hydro-mulch test plot. In 5.7 of those acres, they will plant a mix of a‘ali‘i, ‘iliahi, and apply hydro-mulch within the area. In the final 1 acre, they are going to do hydro-mulch only. For weed control, pineapple plants were initially left in place to serve as a ground cover. The grass has become problematic due to the rains and limited accessibility, they are going back into the planted areas to treat the grass. Formosan koa and ironwood trees growing around the project area were left in place as a windbreak. Some have begun growing in the project area however, so future management may include removal of the windbreak. Drip lines have been installed in newly planted areas due to the inconsistent rain.
- Staff Sprecher said they have not been as actively engaged in implementation over the past 3 years, so some money has been left over that they have not been able to access. They are requesting to utilize some of the existing funds that were already approved for their project.
- Staff clarified that they are hoping the hydro-mulch is successful and may potentially use it in the hardpan areas.
- Member Oppenheimer pointed out that some of the species in the proposed planting list are endangered. Staff Sprecher said it is probably just leftover from previous plan, and they are really only planting a‘ali‘i, koaia, and ‘iliahi.
- Member Oppenheimer said the Maui Botanical Garden Contact needs to be updated.

**Motion to approve the management plan revision. Moved by Member Kyono, seconded by Member Koch.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Warner, Kyono, Koch; Oppose: Dunbar; Abstain: Oppenheimer.**

**Motion approved.**

#### **6. Forest Stewardship Template for Project Proposals and Management Plan updates**

- Staff will send the updated proposal and plan templates to the committee via email. The committee will be asked to provide feedback on the updated templates.

#### **7. Chapter 195F, HRS, 2017 Legislative Proposal**

- DOCARE has requested that misdemeanor be an option for forest reserve (FR) violations so there is a less severe option than a criminal offense. DOFAW reviewed the administrative penalties for theft of trees from FR's. It is currently a \$10,000 fine per koa, and \$2,000 for other trees. The value of timber resources have increased over the last few years. We want to consider market values as well as the cost of replacement to be considered in the fine.
- Member Warner asked if maile pickers who cultivate patches in the FR will be held liable. Staff Sprecher said as long as they have a permit, they are permitted to pick maile.



- Member Hendrickson recommended implementing a treble damages provision, which triples the value of the tree when assessing a fine. Requiring someone to pay triple the value of a tree acts as a stronger deterrent. The same rule applies to any timber trespass.
- Member Constantinides felt that the current rule does not capture the value of species such as sandalwood.
- Member Oppenheimer asked if there is language regarding the forfeiture of timber. Member Hendrickson said it depends on where enforcement happens. If it is already sold, they will be charged the value of the tree. Member Kyono said unless they are caught removing the log from the forest, it is difficult to prove.
- Regarding the forest stewardship bill, Member Koch felt it is good to get away from the 1991 limitation.
- Chair Wellsheim said the increase to 75% is important and should be easy for the legislature to understand.
- Staff Sprecher added that we are not requesting additional money.
- Chair Wellsheim asked if changing the 1991 provision is worth pursuing since it may be difficult to translate to legislators. Staff Sprecher said it would allow for projects interested in doing native forest production. Changing the requirement of owning land to managing land allows for projects leasing state land.
- Staff Sprecher said we will need substantial support from the legislature to get this to pass.

**Motion to approve the Forest Stewardship bill and for it to go forward to the legislature, moved by Member Hendrickson, seconded by Member Dunbar.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Warner, Kyono, Koch, Dunbar, Oppenheimer; Oppose: none; Abstain: none.**

## **8. Forest Legacy FY18 project approval**

- The FSAC was given time to review and score proposals based only on the application. The proposals will be re-scored after further discussion in order to capture how changes to the applications might affect their scores.
- Member Conant asked why Haloa ‘Āina had a mineral determination but Kamehamenui did not. Staff Sprecher said there are different requirements for different types of projects. For easements, a mineral determination is required. In Hawai‘i, the state maintains mineral rights.

### **8.1 FY18 Haloa ‘Āina, South Kona, Hawai‘i County**

- This is the 3<sup>rd</sup> time this proposal has come to the FSAC for review.
- Guest Friday asked if anything in the application has changed over the last year. Staff Sprecher said there are currently 5 students studying there. Guest Friday said the threatened section is the weakest section and would benefit from updated information.
- Staff Sprecher explained that all of the regeneration is from root suckering which has shown to be successful. They take dead and dying trees and pull up the root ball which stimulates coppicing. They also do outplanting in other areas.
- Staff Sprecher said they have finished harvesting the site and that the management plan should be coming to us soon. They have agreements in place to access neighboring properties.
- Chair Wellsheim liked the project because of the job creation, revenue generation and the example it sets for Kamehameha Schools.

- Member Koch added that Forest Solutions is a supporting party and he believes this is the best prescription for the site.

## **8.2 FY18 Kamehamenui Forest Project, Upcountry, Maui County**

- This project is a fee acquisition of 3,000 acres. DOFAW would purchase the property and add it to Kula FR. Haleakala National Park is also actively seeking to acquire it as well through though the Land and Water Conservation Fund Program.
- Member Oppenheimer asked what DOFAW would do with the agricultural zoned portion of property. Guest De Silva explained that the upper area is critical habitat and the area below would continue the mauna lei, the large forested area circling Haleakala summit, with koa and ‘ōhia. Below that would be possible small scale production. Kamehamenui is a gap in the mauna lei and that including it would be very valuable. Most of the property is covered in kikuyu grass up to the alpine shrubland. There is eucalyptus in the gulches, and black wattle could cross into Kula if nothing is done. The landowner is willing to donate a portion.
- Member Warner asked if the two other parcels are going to be landlocked. Staff Sprecher said there would be an easement if one does not exist already.
- Staff Sprecher said that forest cover over the whole property is estimated to be 30%.
- Guest Friday asked if DOFAW would rather just have access to critical habitat section. Guest De Silva said they would want the entire area since it would be too difficult to manage with someone below.
- Member Koch felt that the application would be stronger if it detailed the pathway of what we are thinking of doing, which partners would be involved, and how we are going to do it or how we have accomplished it in the past. Staff Sprecher said DOFAW is looking at different options such as a possible carbon project. DOFAW and other partners have been successful on other parts of the mountain. Guest Friday suggested citing these past successes.
- Member Oppenheimer commented that it seems time is of the essence given that the property could be sold at any time.
- Staff Sprecher said we could take a look at all of the areas that have been restored over time and put it on a map to show the scale of restoration.
- Staff Sprecher said that DOFAW is actively talking with the landowner about the situation regarding funding and time. The landowner can issue a letter of intent, similar to Helemano.
- Guest De Silva added that there is a road that leads to the property. This will reduce costs for management because crews will not have to be flown in.
- Member Ching asked what the timeline is in the FL process. Guest Friday said if it scores above the threshold, the earliest funding would be awarded is 1.5 years from now. Staff Sprecher explained that DOFAW would have conversations with the landowner regarding where we are in raising the funds.
- Member Britt asked if funds could be provided to the landowner to give a set time to get funds. Staff Sprecher said the state cannot but if HILT is interested, we can have that discussion in the future.
- Staff Sprecher added that the county would be an excellent partner if they are willing to provide some funds to purchase the property.
- Staff Sprecher explained that if the parcel was split between DOFAW and the National Park, it would be down the center because both are interested in the upper and lower regions.

Guest De Silva said this would complicate management because of different regulations. The community would be more supportive of the state who could provide hunting.

- Staff Sprecher said that TNC is interested, but is not actively pursuing it at this point. Member Britt said that it might be good to discuss this with the new TNC director. Staff Sprecher said Trust for Public land was approached since they helped with Helemano.
- Member Britt asked if the value of the property would be lower and more affordable if the current owner did a CE. Staff Sprecher said the state would have to work with the landowner to come up with funds for a CE. Guest Friday said they would not have enough forest cover.
- Staff Sprecher clarified that they receive an automatic readiness point for having a management plan because fee acquisitions do not require plans. We would want a management plan in the future when it becomes forest reserve.
- Chair Wellsheim asked if there were any issues with state funds for these projects. Staff Sprecher said that there is a lot of support from state for this. Guest De Silva said Polipoli has 2000-2500 cars a month, so there is a lot of support from community.
- FSAC members submitted their re-scores for each project to staff.

**Haloa ‘Āina**

FSAC Member	Importance	Threatened	Strategic	Total
Alvin Kyono	25	20	25	70
Betsy Gagné	30	20	30	80
Michael Constantinides	22	17	27	66
Greg Hendrickson	25	12	22	59
Rich von Wellsheim	28	19	28	75
Kip Dunbar	15	20	15	50
Jonathan Ching	22	18	28	68
Gregory Koob	15	15	12	42
Patrick Conant	15	20	30	65
Nicholas Koch	25	20	30	75
Janet Britt	30	20	30	80
Hank Oppenheimer	20	20	20	60
Jay Warner	15	10	15	40
<b>Total</b>	<b>287 out of 390 (possible)</b>	<b>231 out of 260 (possible)</b>	<b>312 out of 390 (possible)</b>	<b>830 out of 1040 (possible)</b>

**Kamehamenui**

FSAC Member	Importance	Threatened	Strategic	Total
Alvin Kyono	10	15	20	45
Betsy Gagné	30	20	30	80
Michael Constantinides	24	20	26	70
Greg Hendrickson	21	17	27	65
Rich von Wellsheim	27	15	27	69
Kip Dunbar	30	20	30	80
Jonathan Ching	21	18	28	67

Gregory Koob	25	17	30	72
Patrick Conant	24	20	30	74
Nicholas Koch	30	5	30	65
Janet Britt	30	20	30	80
Hank Oppenheimer	30	20	30	80
Jay Warner	30	20	20	70
<b>Total</b>	<b>332 out of 390 (possible)</b>	<b>227 out of 260 (possible)</b>	<b>358 out of 390 (possible)</b>	<b>917 out of 1040</b>

Project	Average	Ranking
Kamehamenui	70.5	1
Haloa 'Āina	63.84	2

**Motion to approve and submit Kamehamenui to the Forest Legacy Program for Federal Fiscal Year 2018 funding. Moved by Member Britt, seconded by Member Conant.**

**Friendly amendment to submit both Kamehamenui and Haloa 'Āina to the Forest Legacy Program for Federal Fiscal Year 2018 funding, with Kamehamenui ranked above Haloa 'Āina. Moved by Member Britt, seconded by Member Conant.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Gagné, Constantinides, Koob, Conant, Hendrickson, Ching, Britt, Dunbar, Warner, Kyono, Oppenheimer, Koch; Oppose: none; Abstain: none.**

**Motion approved.**

#### **9. Forest Legacy Project Updates**

- Ho'omau Ranch was ranked 6<sup>th</sup> in the nation for FY17. TNC is still committed to the project to find match for the cost-share parcel. The management plan was reviewed at the last FSAC meeting.
- Helemano was awarded \$3M in FY16. It was submitted again in FY17 because we were unsure we were going to get the funds for FY16. We were offered the \$3M from FY16 and \$2M for FY17. We have an application in for a habitat conservation plan acquisition grant for the hoary bats on the property. Some of the wind farm companies in the area who need to do mitigation activities are interested in offering \$2M. We may also get some funding from the Navy. We submitted a budgetary request to the legislature to cover any shortfall if needed.

#### **10. Forest Legacy Assessment of Needs**

- DOFAW has developed a scope of work and put it out for bid. We received two bids so we are going through the procurement process and should have contractor within the next month or so. The contractor would reach out to the land trust, set priorities, and update components identified by the committee. They will present their work to the committee at a future meeting.

#### **11. Announcements and travel**

- The next meeting is tentatively scheduled for Friday January 20<sup>th</sup>, 2017 in Hilo.

#### **12. Site visit to Waihe'e Coastal Dunes and Wetland Refuge**

#### **13. Meeting adjourned at 3:35pm**