

## **Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes**

Division of Forestry and Wildlife  
Hui No'eau Visual Arts Center  
2841 Baldwin Avenue  
Makawao, HI 96768  
April 20, 2018

**Present:** Greg Hendrickson (Chair), Trae Menard, 'Olu Campbell, Rich von Wellsheim, Bart Potter, Gregory Koob, J.B. Friday, Michael Constantinides, Janet Britt, Hank Oppenheimer

**Staff:** Malia Nanbara, Marissa Chee, Irene Sprecher, Tanya Rubinstein, Jessica Idle

**Guests:** Katie Friday (U.S. Forest Service), Adam Laeha, Debra Laeha, Marc Shlacter, Kimiko Shlacter

### **1. Site Visit**

Hökū Nui Forest Stewardship Project, 186 Pi'iholo Road, Makawao, HI 96768

### **2. Call to Order**

Meeting was called to order at 12:02pm by Chair Hendrickson.

### **3. Welcome Members and Guests**

### **4. Review and Approval of January 19, 2018 Meeting Minutes**

The Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee (FSAC) reviewed the meeting minutes from the January 19, 2018 meeting and had no corrections.

**Motion to approve the January 19, 2018 FSAC meeting minutes. Moved by Member Wellsheim; seconded by Member Campbell.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Hendrickson, Campbell, Potter, Koob, Constantinides, Oppenheimer; Oppose: None; Abstain: Friday, Menard.**

**Motion Passed.**

### **5. Forest Stewardship Program/Forest Legacy Program US Forest Service Review**

- Guest K. Friday explained that the Forest Service is doing a review of the Forest Stewardship Program (FSP), Forest Legacy Program (FLP), and the Community Forest and Open Space Program (CFP) which is not yet active in Hawaii. CFP is similar to FLP, and is geared toward land with community involvement. Funding is capped at \$600,000 per project.
- Member Wellsheim commented that the state has been very successful in FLP, and liked that the program can be tailored to Hawaii's specific needs through the review and revision of the Assessment of Needs.
- Member Hendrickson felt that FSP can benefit from being more strategic by identifying and cultivating interest from landowners that can fill important gaps in forest restoration and management. Regarding FLP, he felt that because the national budget was not

finalized until much later than usual, it was very disruptive for many landowners who had to wait for the ranking list.

- Member Britt commented that the Amy Greenwell property would be a good candidate for CFP. She added that the Hawaii Islands Land Trust is a willing and able partner to manage conservation easements or help facilitate projects that can go through FLP.

## **6. Evaluation of Past Project Funds**

- Staff Nanbara summarized and compared program statistics from fiscal year (FY) 13 and 18. In FY18, more management plans were approved and going to contract, and the cost per acre was less. Although no projects were contracted in FY 18, staff anticipates that multiple will be contracted at the beginning of FY 19. Staff Idle explained that many of the projects used in the FY 18 cost per acre statistic are within the first five years of their contract. This created a less than an accurate representation because the cost per acre was calculated using the amount of money they have received so far rather than the amount they were approved for. The FSAC commented that it might be valuable to see how many plans and acres are approved every year, as well as the change in cost over time.
- Staff Idle presented the cost per acre values for site preparation and weed control for all contracted projects. The costs vary by project, but most projects fall within the allowable cost share range for site preparation. Several projects were above the range for weed control.
- Member Hendrickson commented that the combined site preparation and weed control graph shows that high weed control costs pull the total for both practices together above the allowable range.
- Member J.B. Friday recommended doing more intensive site preparation to help lower the cost of weed control after planting. Staff Nanbara noted that it appears many projects could be doing more site preparation since they are not receiving the highest amount allowed. Chair Hendrickson added that having this analysis done for mulching would show if it potentially decreases weed control costs. Member Oppenheimer commented that disturbance from more intensive site preparation may facilitate invasion of weeds.

## **7. Forest Stewardship Program (FSP) Project Proposals**

### **7.1 Paniolo Tonewoods proposal, Hāmākua District, Hawai‘i County**

- Staff Nanbara introduced the 550-acre project on former Parker Ranch land that is composed of mostly pasture with some existing exotic timber stands. The proposal seeks to establish plantation style koa timber production and native restoration along the slopes of the project area.
- Member Koob said that the scientific names should be included in the proposed plant list.
- Member J.B. Friday noted that the scientific name of the turpentine tree should be *Syncarpia glomulifera*.
- The FSAC was concerned about the tropical ash stand, as it would be a perennial weed source and with the cattle removed, would likely spread. They recommended it be harvested immediately.
- Member J.B. Friday felt the elevation is too low for elepaio and ‘i‘iwi. Member Oppenheimer noted their presence is possible, as he has seen both birds at a similar

elevation. Member J.B. Friday commented that a plan for bat management should be included in the plan.

- Member J.B. Friday suggested that the landowner apply for a tree farm designation through the county because the land is being converted from pasture to forest.
- Staff Nanbara noted that to be eligible for the native forest tax rate, the property must be planted with 60% native plants but not necessarily have a forest established.
- Staff Nanbara provided the committee with quotes for the development of the management plan ranging from \$3,993 to \$8,500.

**Motion to approve the project proposal for the development of a Forest Stewardship management plan with 50% cost-share support for the total cost of the management plan not to exceed \$2,000. Moved by Member Wellsheim; seconded by Member Constantinides.**

**Approve: Constantinides, Hendrickson, Koob, Wellsheim, Oppenheimer, Potter, Campbell; Oppose: None; Abstain: J.B. Friday, Menard.**

**Motion passed.**

## **8. Forest Stewardship Program (FSP) Management Plans**

### **8.1 Kahula Lio Farm project, Ko‘olaupoko District, Honolulu County**

- Guest Laeha stated that the project budget was reduced by about 40% based on feedback provided from the committee last meeting.
- Member Oppenheimer asked if the committee can be provided with a redline version of revised management plans so that it is easier to see what edits were made.
- Member Koob cautioned using Bayer insecticide because it can kill bees. Member J.B. Friday recommended using it on non-flowering trees or saplings only. He also commented that the active ingredient and approved uses as listed on the label should be detailed in the plan.
- Member Koob felt that the statement on page 6 regarding native plants not being adapted to nutrients produced by invasive plants is not entirely true. In many cases, native plants do not respond negatively to foreign nutrients, but rather to competition from invasive plants.
- Member Britt noted that \$20,000 per acre still seems somewhat high.
- Member Constantinides asked why mulching will be implemented for all 10 years. Guest Adam Laeha said he felt that consistent mulching would be necessary to keep weeds down.
- Member Constantinides noted that the ground cover acreage should equal 5.1 instead of 8.2 in the budget. He also noted that the Natural Resource Conservation Service (NRCS) only funds 3 years of mulching, but that NRCS programs can fund more than 2 inches of mulch at a time.
- Guest K. Friday asked what will be done about the adolescent albizia, and if they budgeted for removing it later. Guest Adam Laeha explained that young albizia will be pulled by hand before they become too large to pull. Guest. K Friday said that must be

quantified in the plan. She added that the landowner should be aware that mature albizia take 3-4 years to break apart when left standing after treatment.

- The committee discussed the use of hau to control Dillenia. Member Constantinides felt uncomfortable with its use because it is so invasive, while Guest K. Friday noted that it is widely used in Micronesia for shading out grasses but requires close management. Member Wellsheim felt that hau would be effective in controlling dillenia. Member Koob commented that to using hau to kill small shrubs would require it to be used at a large scale for an extended amount of time, making it difficult to remove later.
- Member J.B. Friday commented that the landowner should be prepared to lose a high percentage of koa. Guest Laeha stated that the HARC low elevation koa has been successful so far, and that other species are being planted in case koa does not do well.
- Member J.B. Friday asked why the cost per seedling is so high, and if they obtained multiple seedling bids. Guest Laeha said that the cost of koa is higher because they are from HARC, and that the \$6.50 per seedling cost was the average of multiple plant species.
- Member J.B. Friday asked how the public will benefit from the project. Guest Laeha explained that in addition to improved watershed function, they intend to increase the availability of seeds by storing seeds and making them available for future lowland koa forestry projects. Member J.B. Friday asked for clarification on how the community will be involved and if there are letters of intent from community organizations who will work with them. Guest Laeha noted that a list of community organizations is included in the Kaalaea Koa Farm management plan.
- Member J.B. Friday asked what the scale of food production would be and if the food production would be for profit or personal enjoyment. Guest Laeha clarified that food production would be small scale to create an alternate source of funding, and is a secondary goal.
- Member Campbell asked if there are other sources of funding for the project. Guest Adam Laeha said that the landowner is committed to paying for the entire project. Some of the other areas that are not being used could be converted for other agricultural uses.
- Guest K. Friday suggested being experimental in their control of Dillenia by doing small trials to determine which method works the best could benefit the public since it will increasingly be an issue in lowland areas.
- Guest Laeha clarified that the property owners are very invested in this project, and though it is small scale, they have the tools and machinery that is required to complete the project. The goal of the project is reforestation with an emphasis on native plants.
- Member Constantinides noted that the mulching budget is approximately one-third of the total cost. He suggested spending more on planting upfront rather than mulching throughout the 10 years.

**Motion to approve the management plan, contingent upon hau being removed from the plant list, the groundcover acreage being corrected, and the land manager working with staff to improve mulching and planting budget ratios, and other committee comments being addressed. Moved by Member Constantinides; seconded by Member Campbell.**

*Continued Discussion:*

- Member Menard asked if the list of herbicides is complete, and if the land manager can deviate or add to the list. Guest Laeha responded that he can add other herbicides if there are things that work well on Dillenia.
- Member Campbell asked if the plan can be reevaluated in the future should things change prior to the completion of the project. Staff Nanbara clarified that at year five, the Division of Forestry and Wildlife (DOFAW) works with the landowner to review their plan, and any changes to the plan or budget will then be resubmitted to the committee for approval.

**Approve: Constantinides, Koob, Potter, Campbell, Hendrickson; Oppose: Wellsheim, Oppenheimer; Abstain: J.B. Friday, Menard.**

**Motion approved.**

8.2 Kaalaea Koa Farm project, Ko'olaupoko District, Honolulu County

- Member Constantinides noted that most of his comments for this project are similar to the previous one. Given that pigs are the only pressure, he recommended that a 30-inch fence be considered as it is easier and cheaper to build, and is as equally effective as a larger fence. He added that skirting should be on the outside of the fence.
- Member Campbell stated that considerations for traditional and customary practices should be included in management plans. There are native Hawaiians living in area, so a process to allow cultural practitioners to collect resources on or near the property should be developed.
- Member J.B. Friday cautioned that before the koa seeds are banked, the landowner should ensure that they have a legal agreement to use the germplasm, and to plan in advance for who gets what seeds.
- Member Oppenheimer liked that one of the public benefits will be figuring out how to control Dillenia. He suggested experimenting with different methods in multiple areas at the same time to determine which works best. He also asked how Guest Adam Laeha came to the conclusion that Dillenia does not have a long seed life. Guest Adam Laeha responded that the Dillenia seeds are big and fleshy and are spread by birds.
- Member Koob cautioned against stating that akia is hemi-parasitic given that it is just based on observation and not actual experimentation.
- Member J.B. Friday asked if letters of support from the community are required to be included management plans. Staff Nanbara stated that this has not been required in management plans unless it is a key part of a project.
- Member J.B. Friday asked how vetiver was working. Guest Laeha said it is being effective and seems to like bacteria in the soil.

**Motion to approve the management plan, contingent upon comments from the committee being addressed. Moved by Member Koob; seconded by Member Constantinides.**

**Approve: Constantinides, Hendrickson, Potter, Wellsheim, Oppenheimer, Campbell, Koob; Oppose: None; Abstain: J.B. Friday, Menard.**

**Motion approved.**

8.3 Shlacter Native Forest project, Puna District, Hawai'i County

- Staff Nanbara presented the 9.7 acre project located in Puna, on Hawai'i Island. The area has a fairly intact native overstory and a weedy understory making the forest difficult to traverse. The project goals are to install a perimeter fence, implement weed control, and diversify and expand the canopy. The landowners are working with Forest Solutions on the plan and for implementation.
- Member Britt asked how accessible the property will be for the public. Guest M. Shlacter responded that they plan to include a loop trail that will be open to the public so the project can be viewed as an example of a native forest.
- Member Oppenheimer asked what the nearest protected area or managed private land is. Guest M. Shlacter responded that his property abuts Wao Kele O Puna, but there is no management taking place on that property in the area adjacent to his property.
- Member J.B. Friday suggested that the landowner contact Laura Brezinsky whose property is within Kopua Farm Lots. Laura's project incorporates community volunteers and volunteer days to provide access. Member J.B Friday advised against providing open public access, and suggested a more regulated way of allowing people to see the project. He also suggested inviting neighbors in the area to view the project after practices are implemented.
- Member Menard suggested that Warata fencing be used to mitigate the negative effects of vog. He also noted that since there are many lava tubes, fencing may be difficult as pigs can often find ways to get through the tubes. He suggested potentially setting traps and snares to control pigs that come inside the fence through the tubes.
- Member Koob noted that the rainfall amount on page 12 should be in millimeters.
- Member Constantinides suggested using 2.5-foot fencing rather than 4-foot fencing because it is equally as effective in keeping pigs out and is less expensive.
- Member Campbell said there has some talk about connecting the project to the Wao Kele o Puna for accessibility purposes since there is only one main access point currently for Wao Kele o Puna. He added that neighboring landowners can enter Wao Kele o Puna through their properties.
- Member Britt asked what figure 6 on page 11 is showing. Staff Nanbara clarified that it is for rainfall, and that it should be updated to be clearer.
- Member J.B. Friday recommended planting 'ohe mauka. He also suggested that all precautions be taken to avoid injuring 'ōhi'a trees since rapid 'ōhi'a death (ROD) is in the area. He suggested that if the tree is damaged, have the entire tree removed, or if small pruning is required, applying pruning sealer to pruned branches.
- Member Oppenheimer suggested that cattle panels rather than hogwire be considered for fencing in tight areas so that trees do not have to be cut down.

**Motion to approve the management plan, contingent upon comments from the committee being addressed. Moved by Member Oppenheimer; seconded by Member Potter.**

**Approve: Oppenheimer, Wellsheim, Constantinides, Hendrickson, Potter, Koob, Campbell; Oppose: None; Abstain: J.B. Friday, Menard.**

**Motion approved.**

8.4 John and Gussie Pace Demonstration Forest project, South Kona District, Hawai'i County

- Chair Hendrickson noted that this project was previously approved by the committee. The project needs to be re-approved because the acreage has decreased from what was in the original management plan, and some minor changes were made to address the committee's comments from the previous review.
- Member J.B. Friday commented that there are a lot of loose animals in the area, so the fence must be completely animal proof.
- Member J.B. Friday noted that according to the soil survey, about one-third of property is lava rock. He recommended that planting only be done in areas known to have soil, but added that the ownership boundaries may complicate that. Properties that have a mix of deep soil and lava should take that into consideration when planning management actions.
- Member Oppenheimer asked for clarification as to how they will be extending the height of the fence. Chair Hendrickson said that their current plan is to spot weld on to the existing posts.
- Member Koob felt that the diversity of tree species to be planted should be increased or the vision of having a healthy forest stocked with native trees should be modified since only three trees are being proposed. He also stated that despite there being no bat habitat, the bats may still be in the area.
- Chair Hendrickson commented that the group of landowners want to be experimental in how they approach koa reestablishment. Their goal is to later collect data and share it with others.
- Member J.B. Friday felt that the price and volume estimates for the first harvest were somewhat high. He recommended being more conservative in their economic projections by using a lower price per board foot for the first commercial harvest to reflect the younger age of the trees. Member J.B. Friday added that the recommended rotation age for koa is 55 years.

**Motion to approve the management plan, contingent upon comments from the committee being addressed. Moved by Member Wellsheim; seconded by Member Koob.**

**Approve: Oppenheimer, Wellsheim, Constantinides, Potter, Koob, Campbell;  
Oppose: None; Abstain: J.B. Friday, Menard, Hendrickson.**

**9. Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee Guidelines**

- Staff Nanbara presented comments made by the Office of Information Practices (OIP) to regarding the FSAC Guidelines. Alternates for committee members must be set ahead of time should a member be unable to attend. One option is having set alternates for each member.

- Staff Sprecher asked when an alternate would be called to attend. Staff Nanbara said an alternate could be called before the agenda needs to be posted if the number of members that can attend is close to quorum.
- Guest K. Friday noted that designating an alternate from the same agency would be a good option. Non-agency associated members could designate an alternate that has a similar field of expertise. Member Wellsheim suggested having past board members as alternates.
- Staff Nanbara said that telecommunication options will be discussed with OIP.
- Member Constantinides suggested that the requirement for membership good-standing should be updated to a member being present at two of the last three committee meetings.
- Staff Nanbara clarified that if quorum is not met at the start time for the meeting, then no meeting can take place.
- Guest K. Friday also suggested clarifying that new members of the committee start in good standing and can vote immediately. She also asked if the attendance of a members designated alternate would keep the member in good standing, and if the alternate would be able to vote.
- Member Wellsheim suggested that the FSAC guidelines be updated to say calendar year, rather than state fiscal year.
- Guest K. Friday noted that she would send Staff Nanbara additional FSAC duties to include in the guidelines. This includes having a previously approved Forest Legacy project that changes in scope be reapproved by the committee.
- Member Campbell suggested that the FSAC guidelines and member application forms be clearer regarding if they are representing their agency or themselves in a personal capacity.

#### **10. Forest Legacy Program update**

- Staff Sprecher updated the committee on the status of Forest Legacy Program (FLP) projects. The Helemano project received \$5 million from FLP and is very close to closing with only two outstanding items. The Ho'omau project applied for Legacy Land funding but did not score high enough to receive funding. There have been discussions with Hawaiian Islands Land Trust (HILT) about being a private donor for Ho'omau. The Kamehamenui project received \$4 million from FLP. A \$3 million request has been made to the legislature as a Capitol Improvement Project, and a \$2 million request was made to Maui County. The Haloa 'Āina project received \$1.5 million from FLP.
- Guest K. Friday noted that congress is concerned about giving funds to projects that do not succeed. This may result in tightened qualifications for states if they have outstanding funding.

#### **11. Announcements and Travel**

- The next meeting is scheduled for Friday, July 20<sup>th</sup>.

#### **12. Adjournment**

- The meeting adjourned at 4:07pm.