

## **Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes**

Division of Forestry and Wildlife  
Waimea Valley- Proud Peacock Room  
59-864 Kamehameha Hwy  
Haleiwa, HI 9671  
October 12, 2018

**Present:** Greg Hendrickson (Chair), Nicholas Koch (Chair- Elect), Irene Sprecher (Ex-Officio), Gregory Koob, Janet Britt, Kip Dunbar, Hank Oppenheimer, J.B. Friday, Rich von Wellsheim, Bart Potter

**Staff:** Malia Nanbara, Marissa Chee, Tanya Rubenstein

**Guests:** Dana Shapiro, Bob Rose, Neil Hannahs

### **1. Site Visit**

Waimea Valley Forest Stewardship Project, 59-864 Kamehameha Hwy, Haleiwa, HI 96712

### **2. Call to Order**

Meeting was called to order at 1:03pm by Chair Hendrickson.

### **3. Welcome Members and Guests**

### **4. Review and Approval of January 19, 2018 Meeting Minutes**

The Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee (FSAC) reviewed the meeting minutes from the April 20, 2018 meeting and had no corrections.

**Motion to approve the April 20, 2018 FSAC meeting minutes. Moved by Member Britt; seconded by Member Wellsheim.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Hendrickson, Britt, Potter, Koob, Sprecher, Friday, Oppenheimer; Oppose: None; Abstain: Koch, Dunbar.**

**Motion Passed.**

### **5. Past Forest Legacy Projects Update**

- Staff Rubenstein provided updates on existing Forest Legacy projects. Helemano was approved by the Land Board in September, and is estimated to close in the next few weeks. Due diligence activities are ongoing for Kamehamenui and the state is hoping to close in early 2019. The conservation easement for Ho‘omau Ranch is in the process of being drafted with the landowner and landowner representative. A Legacy Land Conservation Program (LLCP) proposal is also being submitted for Ho‘omau Ranch for matching funds and The Nature Conservancy donation. The state was also successful in obtaining funding for the Amy Greenwell Community Forest through the Forest Service’s Community Forest Program.

## **6. FY20 Forest Legacy Projects**

### **6.1. FY20 Haloa 'Āina**

- In FY19, \$3M was requested for Haloa 'Āina, but was only awarded \$1.5M so the state is resubmitting the application for FY20 asking for \$1.5M. A proposal is also being submitted to the LLCP.
- Staff Nanbara explained that this project has been submitted multiple times and feedback from the national review committees is mixed. They recommended strengthening the threat section by being more specific, and to make the project seem more unique.
- Member Britt recommended including more on how the area is significant culturally.
- Member Friday suggested including language about how this project is developing a sustainable model for neighboring landowners.
- Member Potter expressed concerns about the project's sustainability. Staff Nanbara explained that regeneration from root coppicing has been successful. Member Hendrickson added that a conservation easement will help protect the resources and influence management. A management plan is required by the Forest Legacy Program, and must be approved by the FSAC.

**Motion to recommend Haloa 'Āina for submission to the Forest Legacy Program for Federal Fiscal Year 2020 funding. Moved by Member Wellsheim; seconded by member Britt.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Britt, Potter, Koob, Sprecher, Oppenheimer, Koch, Dunbar;  
Oppose: None; Abstain: Friday, Hendrickson.**

### **Motion Passed.**

*Continued discussion:*

- Member Hendrickson suggested being more strategic to generate more proposals rather than opportunistic, by approaching landowners and targeting outreach in priority areas.

## **7. Forest Stewardship Program (FSP) Project Proposals**

### **7.1 Rick Evans proposal, North Kohala District, Hawai'i County**

- Staff Rubenstein introduced the project as a 30-acre agroforestry project in Kapa'au in the North Kohala District on Hawai'i Island. This project is focused on establishing a breadfruit agroforestry system on what is currently degraded pasture land.
- Guest Shapiro explained that the parcel is 88 acres and is being managed in three phases. The first phase was the installation of a breadfruit orchard with a more conventional approach. The FSP proposal is for the second phase, in which the goal is to establish a diversified agroforestry system. The third phase will be influenced by how the second phase goes. Other marketable crops such as mamaki, sweet potato, papaya, and ginger will be grown in the understory.
- Member Koob pointed out that wildlife habitat is selected as a goal, but endangered species is not selected as a concern. He felt that the wildlife habitat goal should be removed since it is not a wildlife project.
- Member Friday noted that mature breadfruit trees produce a lot of shade, making it difficult to grow crops underneath. Guest Shapiro said that breadfruit does need to be

pruned and they are considering experimenting with doing heavy pruning every few years and growing crops in between.

- Member Friday commented that bamboo is expensive, and other cheaper windbreak alternatives are available. Member Sprecher said they have not funded bamboo in the past, but the committee has the option to. Member Friday also felt the elevation may be too high for kou and coconut.
- Member Oppenheimer recommended against planting laua'e fern because it is not native and known to be invasive.
- Member Sprecher said the plan should detail how the educational outreach and forest recreation components will be implemented. Guest Shapiro explained that the educational component may involve inviting school groups and having a dormitory for students.
- Member Britt said the property should be outlined on the maps.
- Member Sprecher said the committee should be clear on which species they are willing to cost share. Member Friday said breadfruit should be funded within the cost share rate.
- Member Friday felt that if the project has a production component, an economic analysis should be done. Member Hendrickson asked if analysis had to be done for each crop, or just the ones the committee will fund. Guest Shapiro said it would be beneficial for the landowner to do an analysis on the system as a whole so they can understand the economic potential of the whole system.
- Staff Nanbara clarified that the payback provision in the rules only apply to timber projects.
- Member Wellsheim said he would like to see an analysis that shows the system will be viable. He added that it would not need to be extremely detailed.

**Motion to approve the project proposal for the development of a Forest Stewardship management plan that must include a general economic analysis and comments from the committee. Moved by Member Koch; seconded by Member Sprecher.**

Continued discussion:

- Member Sprecher added that the comments from the committee should be passed on to the applicant.
- Staff Nanbara provided the committee with quotes ranging from \$5,000 through \$6,500.

**Approve: Wellsheim, Britt, Potter, Koob, Sprecher, Oppenheimer, Koch, Hendrickson**

**Oppose: Dunbar; Abstain: Friday.**

**Motion passed.**

**Motion to approve 50% cost share support for the total cost of the plan not to exceed \$2,750. Moved by Member Koch; seconded by Member Wellsheim.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Britt, Potter, Koob, Oppenheimer, Koch, Hendrickson; Oppose: Sprecher, Dunbar; Abstain: Friday.**

**Motion passed.**

## 7.2 Ka'ala Ranch proposal, Waialua District, Hawai'i County

- Staff Chee introduced the 170-acre project located in Waialua on O'ahu. The property is comprised of 2 parcels that total 350 acres, and is adjacent to Mokulē'ia Forest Reserve and Ka'ala Natural Area Reserve. Most of lower parcel and part of upper parcel are being grazed, while the upper parcel has some native species. There are several gulches throughout the property. The goals are to minimize erosion, remove invasive species, plant native species, native timber production, and possibly silvopasture. The landowners are new to land management and are in need of guidance to achieve their goals.
- Staff Nanbara clarified the planting list included in the proposal was developed from a Natural Resources Conservation Service (NRCS) program that generates a list of native plants that could be grown based on elevation and rainfall. Member Oppenheimer pointed out that *Canavalia cathartica* is invasive and should not be on the list
- Member Friday felt that the applicants need to flesh out their vision more and recommended they come back with a more detailed proposal.
- Member Potter said that the site will be challenging, but removing the guinea grass and fire prone fuels will be beneficial in reducing fire threat.
- Staff Nanbara provided the committee with quotes for the development of the management plan ranging from \$8,500 to \$32,158.

**Motion to defer the proposal and have the applicant resubmit with the committee's comments incorporated. Motion by Member Bart; seconded by Member Wellsheim.**

Continued discussion:

- Member Sprecher felt that the applicant would benefit more from professional planning assistance while developing the management plan rather than having them revise the proposal. The committee should provide them access to experts.
- Member Wellsheim felt they should seek professional help at this point in the planning process to get a better idea of what they want to do first. Member Friday suggested they talk with NRCS, Waianae Mountains Watershed Partnership, neighbors, and woodworkers. Staff Nanbara said they have talked with some people and are seeking guidance from the committee.
- Member Koch felt that their vision is ambitious given the size of the property. Member Friday suggested starting with a smaller less challenging area.

**Approve: Wellsheim, Britt, Potter, Dunbar, Oppenheimer; Oppose: Koch, Hendrickson, Sprecher, Koob; Abstain: Friday.**

**Motion passed.**

## **8. Forest Stewardship Program (FSP) Management Plans**

### 8.1 Paniolo Forestry Project, Hāmākua District, Hawai'i County

- Member Koch recused himself.
- Staff Nanbara introduced the 552.8-acre project in the Hāmākua District on Hawai'i Island. The project seeks to establish a koa timber plantation as well as native forest restoration in the steeper sloped areas. The property is currently in pasture, and they intend to slowly remove the cattle.

- Guest Rose explained the intent of the project is to establish a sustainable supply of koa to produce instrument grade woods for Taylor Guitars. They have been working with HARC and Haleakala Ranch to obtain planting material.
- Member Dunbar asked if they tried scarification. Guest Rose said it is unlikely the seedbank is still viable after the property has been grazed for over 100 years. He added that their project is experimental.
- Member Oppenheim asked if any trials on killing ash have been done. Member Koch said they used Imazapyr in Hōnaunau. The ash trees are intended to serve as a windbreak until being harvested in year eight. Member Potter added that there is some demand for ash.
- Guest Rose stated they have submitted an application to the State Historic Preservation Division to build a small saw mill.
- Member Sprecher said a discussion on koa wilt should be included even though the property is just outside of the range. Guest Rose said that 25% of each planting is intended to be koa wilt resistant stock, based on supply.
- Member Oppenheimer added they should take precautions regarding Rapid ‘Ōhi‘a Death since it has been found in Kalōpā.
- Member Sprecher commented that there is no Weed Risk Assessment for Chinese fir, so an analysis should be done before planting. Member Friday said Chuck Chimmer could do the analysis.
- Member Hendrickson said the financial analysis is well done.

**Motion to approve the management plan, contingent upon committee comments being addressed. Moved by Member Britt; seconded by Member Dunbar.**

**Approve: Constantinides, Koob, Potter, Campbell, Menard, Hendrickson Wellsheim, Oppenheimer; Oppose: none; Abstain: J.B. Friday, Koch.**

**Motion approved.**

## **9. Discussion on Agroforestry**

- Staff Rubenstein explained that the interest in agroforestry projects has been increasing, however the FSP handbook does not have specific information on how agroforestry practices fit into the program. Member Sprecher added that so far, the committee has been willing to fund the forestry components of agroforestry projects.
- Regarding agroforestry criteria, Member Sprecher recommended that there should be additional benefits like wildlife habitat or timber production. Member Hendrickson asked how the committee is defining agroforestry, and what criteria or conditions need to be met for the committee to consider the project.
- Guest Shapiro suggested focusing on outcomes such as soil retention and habitat rather than practices because there is so much diversity in agroforestry systems. Creating specifications may limit applicants on what they can do. Member Hendrickson asked the FSAC if they would be able to evaluate that. He felt that the committee needs to determine what they want to see from agroforestry projects.
- Member Friday felt that project should be cautious when making watershed level claims depending on their project area and practices.

- Chair Hendrickson expressed concerns about how projects are being reviewed. Similar projects have received different levels of critique in the past. Applicants should be better advised as to what type of projects the committee will support at the proposal phase. Member Friday said that the FSP handbook should be revised to include an agroforestry section.
- Chair Hendrickson suggested the creation of a PIG to discuss agroforestry projects, as well as all types that the committee supports. The committee and applicants would benefit from more guidelines.

**Motion to establish a Permitted Interaction Group to discuss agroforestry and to amend the FSP handbook to include a section on agroforestry. Moved by Member Friday, seconded by Member Wellsheim.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Britt, Potter, Koob, Sprecher, Oppenheimer, Koch, Dunbar, Friday, Hendrickson; Oppose: None; Abstain: None.**

**Motion Passed.**

**Motion to approve Member Wellsheim, Member Friday, and Member Koch as members of the Permitted Interaction Group, with Member Constantinides as a potential member should he be interested. Moved by Member Britt, seconded by Member Dunbar.**

**Approve: Wellsheim, Britt, Potter, Koob, Sprecher, Oppenheimer, Koch, Dunbar, Friday, Hendrickson; Oppose: None; Abstain: None.**

**Motion Passed.**

#### **10. Announcements and Travel**

- The committee decided on meeting dates for 2019: January 25<sup>th</sup>, April 12<sup>th</sup>, July 19<sup>th</sup>, and October 11<sup>th</sup>.

#### **11. Adjournment**

- The meeting adjourned at 3:49pm.