

Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

Division of Forestry and Wildlife
Wahiawa Botanical Garden - Multi-Purpose Room
1396 California Ave.
Wahiawa, HI 96786
April 12, 2019

Present: Nicholas Koch (Chair), Janet Britt (Chair-elect), Irene Sprecher (Ex-Officio), Greg Hendrickson, Trae Menard, Jordan Jokiel, Eva Blumenstein, Seana Walsh, J.B. Friday, Rich von Wellsheim, Bart Potter, Michael Constantinides, Olu Campbell

Staff: Marissa Chee, Tanya Rubenstein, Katie Friday

Guests: Eric Horn, Andrew Gordon, Malia Kamisugi, Michael Pietsch, Marc Shlachter

1. Site Visit

Helemano Wilderness Area, Pa‘ala‘a Pūpūkea Uka Road, Wahiawa, HI 96786

2. Call to Order

Meeting was called to order at 12:45pm by Chair Koch.

3. Welcome Members and Guests

4. Review and Approval of January 25, 2019 Meeting Minutes

The Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee (FSAC) reviewed the meeting minutes from the January 25, 2019 meeting and made the following corrections:

- Member Sprecher submitted written comments to staff.

Motion to approve the January 25, 2019 FSAC meeting minutes with corrections.

Moved by Member Britt, seconded by Member Wellsheim.

Approve: Koch, Britt, Sprecher, Hendrickson, Menard, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Walsh, Friday, Wellsheim, Potter, Constantinides, Campbell; Oppose: none; Abstain: none.

Motion Passed.

5. Project Proposals

5.1. Kamananui Ranch Proposal, Waialua District, Honolulu County

- Staff Rubenstein introduced the 869-acre project located in Waialua on O‘ahu. The main goals of the project are to implement fire and soil erosion mitigation, sustainable forestry, and restoration. It is also adjacent to Ka‘ala Ranch.
- Guest Gordon said he and Nick Dudley have been working on the first koa planting test plot. He explained that there are multiple management zones within the property including conservation, forestry, grazing, and agroforestry.
- Member Potter noted that in the existing vegetation description, “calletris” should be spelled “callitris.”

- Member Hendrickson said the existing fence should be shown on the maps.
- Member J. Friday said that the plan should be clear about wood being harvested and sold. Guest Gordon clarified that they do not intend to include agroforestry in the plan. Member Sprecher said the agroforestry component can be included in this plan.
- Member J. Friday asked what the public benefit will be and if they have connected with any community groups. Guest Gordon said it is part of the overall vision, but is still being developed.
- Member Britt asked for clarification regarding the economic diversification benefit that was selected in section 10. She also felt that the estimated costs are on the high end.
- Member Campbell asked if there are any other funding sources identified, besides the sale of agricultural products. Guest Gordon said that the project will be privately funded in the beginning and that they are looking into developing an agritourism aspect to help sustain the project.
- Guest Gordon said that they have access to a Dole ditch for water, and that they plan to drill a well. Member Campbell pointed out that the Wahiawa Hydrological Unit may almost be tapped out, based on research he recently conducted.
- Member Campbell said that the Senator for their district would likely support the project given her support of urban tree planting with native species.
- Member Britt said that captions should be included for all pictures.

Motion to approve the project proposal for the development of a Forest Stewardship Management Plan. Moved by Member Hendrickson; seconded by Member Wellsheim.

Continued discussion:

- Member Constantinides said the map should show the firebreaks, and that the plan should include detail on what the firebreak practice will entail.

Approve: Koch, Britt, Sprecher, Hendrickson, Menard, Jokiell, Blumenstein, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter, Constantinides, Campbell; Oppose: none; Abstain: Friday.

Motion Passed.

Motion to approve 50% cost share support for the total cost of the plan not to exceed \$3,250. Moved by Member Hendrickson; seconded by Member Wellsheim.

Approve: Wellsheim, Hendrickson, Britt, Potter, Blumenstein, Walsh, Sprecher, Constantinides, Menard; Oppose: None; Abstain: Koch, Friday.

Motion Passed.

5.2. Hakalau 'Ulu Agroforestry Project, South Hilo, Hawai'i County

- Staff Chee introduced the 8-acre project in Hakalau on Hawai'i Island. The property is primarily composed of non-native forest and invasive trees. The project goals are to install a diverse multi story agroforestry system with ulu as the primary component. Production of other products is also planned.
- Member J. Friday said that projects must be able to demonstrate anticipated benefits such as improvements to soil microorganisms. He also said the proposed planting list should

specify which species will be produced and sold. Agroforestry projects should demonstrate feasibility and show that there is a market for their products. The species list should also include a variety of species.

- Member Constantinides said the fencing costs are on the high end given that the terrain is relatively flat. He added that site preparation should be taken out of the budget if the landowner is conducting this practice prior to contracting.
- Member Britt felt that the costs for all proposed practices are high. She also felt that the project is small and isolated from other areas with ongoing conservation efforts. The plan should also include detail on the proposed educational component.

Motion to approve the project proposal for the development of a Forest Stewardship Management Plan. Moved by Member Sprecher; seconded by Member Wellsheim.

Continued discussion:

- Member Wellsheim felt the committee should encourage applicants to develop management plans.
- Member Hendrickson was concerned that the project will be an ulu orchard. Staff Rubenstein explained that staff has informed the consultant that orchards are not allowed and provided them with the Natural Resource Conservation Service agroforestry specifications.

Approve: Koch, Sprecher, Hendrickson, Menard, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter, Constantinides, Campbell; Oppose: Britt; Abstain: Friday.

Motion Passed.

Motion to approve 50% cost share support for the total cost of the plan not to exceed \$2,250. Moved by Member Sprecher; seconded by Member Constantinides.

Approve: Wellsheim, Hendrickson, Britt, Potter, Blumenstein, Walsh, Sprecher, Constantinides, Menard, Koch; Oppose: None; Abstain: Friday.

Motion Passed.

6. Forest Stewardship Management Plans

6.1. Ka'ala Ranch Forest Stewardship Management Plan, Waialua, Honolulu County

- Staff Chee introduced the 172-acre project in Waialua that is currently being used primarily for pasture. This project proposes a variety of uses including agroforestry and silvopasture to create financial sustainability, as well as native forest restoration. Proposed actions seek to reduce soil erosion and fire threat.
- Member Britt said the legends on the maps are small and difficult to read.
- Guest Pietsch provided further background on the project, saying they purchased it 3.5 years ago. They are interested in creating a unique demonstration project that utilizes agroforestry, silvopasture, and forestry all on the same land. They have done road improvements and installed a water system.

- Member Menard asked if the cattle will be able to graze on the steep terrain. Guest Pietsch explained that cattle are already grazing there, and that he does not believe it will increase the erosion problem.
- Guest Pietsch said they are utilizing hunters to control ungulate populations. The goal is to make their project area as pig free as possible. Member J. Friday said they will need to utilize other control methods, such as traps, as well.
- Member Sprecher asked if they are doing rat control. Guest Pietsch said rats are not that abundant, but 'iliahi regeneration has been affected. Member Sprecher said they may want to consider rat control, and that Waianae Mountain Watershed Partnership has a rat control program.
- Member Sprecher said that because Spanish cedar has a weed risk assessment score of 7, site conditions should be evaluated to see if it will spread. Chair Koch said they can consider mahogany as another option.
- Member Potter asked if vetiver is fire prone. Member J. Friday said vetiver will not spread much from where it is planted.
- Member Blumenstein said fire response should be included in the plan. Guest Pietsch said they have fire infrastructure in place.
- Member Constantinides was concerned with the shapes of the management units and land uses within units. He felt the fencing along the switchback road is inefficient and that the fencing cost is very high. He recommended they consider ways to reduce the amount of fencing, such as altering the boundaries of the units. Guest Pietsch said it was designed that way to make the native restoration site more accessible. The silvopasture area serves as a buffer from fire and weeds.
- Member Constantinides asked if trees per acre column in table 5 includes shrubs and small trees. Chair Koch said it includes both. Member Constantinides said the density is low, and recommended including a mulching type of species. Chair Koch said the lower stocking rate relates to water considerations.
- Member Constantinides said the maps need to more clearly show where the existing, interior, and proposed fences are.
- Member Constantinides asked if they can consider moving the water tank to the top of the native restoration area to save on access and maintenance costs. Chair Koch said that the erosion control area located above the native area will require a lot of water.
- Member Constantinides felt the plan should have more specific prescriptions. For example, the planting targets should be broken down by species. Guest Pietsch felt landowners should have flexibility in their planting plans. Member Constantinides said that the plans can still be flexible, but proposed amounts should be included in the plan.
- Member Constantinides said that the Natural Resource Conservation Service (NRCS) can help them with forage management and animal planning in the silvopasture areas.
- Member J. Friday asked if they are planting koa or koaia. Guest Pietsch said they are intending to plant both, but have been told koaia would probably be better. Member J. Friday said to specify which species of naupaka they want to plant.
- Member J. Friday said the plan should include more detail on irrigation, such as how long seedlings will be irrigated, and if they will be weaned off slowly. He added that the plan

should describe how many of which species will be planted where. More detail on herbicide usage should also be included.

- Member Campbell asked if they have looked into ways to self-generate funds. Guest Pietsch explained they are in discussions with Patagonia who may purchase agroforestry projects as part of their food sustainability goals.
- Member J. Friday said agroforestry projects should demonstrate feasibility and that there is a market for their products.
- Member Potter recommended planting ‘uhaloa because it grows well in degraded areas.

Motion to approve the management plan, contingent upon inclusion of the committee’s comments. Moved by Member Wellsheim; seconded by Member Campbell.

Approve: Britt, Hendrickson, Menard, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter, Campbell; Oppose: Constantinides, Sprecher; Abstain: Friday, Koch.

Motion Passed.

6.2. Kaupakuea Orchards Management Plan Revision, South Hilo, Hawai‘i County

- Staff Rubenstein explained that this project was enrolled in 2014. The landowner ran into difficulties with their neighbor who opposed the plantings to preserve their sightline. The Hawai‘i Agricultural Research Center (HARC) has established a 2 acre koa seed orchard. The revision proposes to incorporate the HARC planting, and reduce the overall project area from 23.27 acres to 7.25.
- Member J. Friday said seed produced from the orchard should be shared with the state nursery.
- Member Constantinides questioned if the planted areas were adequately done. He felt that in the stream restoration area, planting should be required because the program paid for the fence, but only a small portion was planted.
- Member Sprecher stated that the landowner is interested in entering the maintenance phase and not planting.

Motion to reject the management plan revision and terminate the project. Moved by Member Wellsheim; seconded by Member Britt.

Continued discussion:

- Member Menard asked if staff can request reimbursement for the fence and planting area from the landowner. Member Sprecher said the Division can propose payback for those items, or propose planting elsewhere. Staff will determine what activities were paid for but not adequately completed.

Member Constantinides offered a friendly amendment to have staff negotiate and if the applicant should payback or plant the remaining area. Member Wellsheim accepted; Member Britt seconded.

Approve: Constantinides, Britt, Menard, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Koch, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter, Campbell; Oppose: Hendrickson; Abstain: Sprecher, Friday.

7. Forest Stewardship Project Prioritization

- Staff Rubenstein explained that interest in the program has been growing. DOFAW will be maxing out on funding in the next few years however, so projects will need to be prioritized. The evaluation matrix will need to be updated and utilized to rank management plans.
- Member Sprecher said that staff typically updates the committee once a year on how much funding is available for that fiscal year. The funding limit has not been reached before, but the matrix was established in 2012 in anticipation of the limit being reached in the future.
- Staff K. Friday said the Forest Service is encouraging states to do targeted outreach.
- Member Hendrickson said the committee is currently evaluating projects on a rolling basis. He suggested having 1 or 2 deadlines to rank approved plans at one time. He also suggested targeting projects more strategically, by working with our partners to identify priority projects that build on state initiatives.
- Staff Rubenstein said that the state's Forest Action Plan identifies the states priorities, but is very broad and would not be as helpful in determining strategic projects.
- Member Britt explained that when the Hawai'i Island Land Trust projects are evaluated and scored, they must score a certain amount or they are not considered.
- Chair Koch said that a Permitted Interaction Group was formed in 2012 to discuss program priorities and establish the evaluation matrix. Member Hendrickson said it was challenging to create a matrix that treats all the different types of projects equally. He added that it should only be used as a guide, and the committee should make the final decision.
- Member Jokiel said there should be considerations for qualitative components such as innovation and potential for success. Member Sprecher said the additional points section of the matrix tries to capture that, but the committee should consider revising it.
- Member J. Friday felt there is a value in having geographically dispersed projects. By focusing on a specific area, the pool of quality projects is narrowed.
- Member Campbell said it is valuable to compare projects to each other to potentially approve a greater variety.
- Staff K. Friday said the goal of the projects should match goals of program and state initiatives, and not only be awarded based on a high score. She suggested creating specific geographic priority areas for multiple goals.

8. Forest Stewardship Priority Lands

- Discussion on this item was postponed to a future meeting.

9. Ho'oumau Ranch Conservation Easement:

- Staff Rubenstein explained that Ho'oumau Forest Legacy Project (FLP) was awarded funding from the Forest Service in fiscal year 2017, and Division is in the process of raising funding to move the project forward. In 2018, The Nature Conservancy (TNC) received a 135-acre donation from Dr. Akina. They are willing to include the donated parcel in the FLP project as a cost-share tract. The tract is located near the other parcels

and consists of early successional ‘ōhia forest. This donation will allow for the purchase of the Martin Paddock. The committee is being asked to approve the inclusion of the donated parcel as part of the FLP project area.

**Motion to approve the amendment to the Ho‘omau Ranch Forest Legacy Project.
Moved by Member Wellsheim, seconded by Member Britt.**

Approve: Constantinides, Britt, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Koch, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter, Campbell, Sprecher; Oppose: None; Abstain: Friday, Hendrickson, Menard.

10. Ongoing Forest Legacy Project Updates

- Discussion on this item was postponed to a future meeting.

11. Announcements and Travel

- The next meeting is scheduled for July 19th.

12. Adjournment

- The meeting adjourned at 4:00pm.