

Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

Amy Greenwell Botanical Garden
Conference Room
82-6160 Hawaii Belt Rd
Captain Cook, HI 96704
October 4th, 2019

Present: Nicholas Koch (Chair), Janet Britt (Chair-elect), Irene Sprecher (Ex-Officio), Greg Hendrickson, Trae Menard, Jordan Jokiel, Eva Blumenstein, Seana Walsh, Rich von Wellsheim, Bart Potter, Michael Constantinides

Guests: Andrea Buckman (Kaupo Ranch project & Leeward Haleakala Watershed Restoration Partnership)

Staff: Marissa Chee, Tanya Rubenstein, Katie Friday (U.S. Forest Service), Jade Rhodes

1. Site Visit

Amy Greenwell Botanical Garden Tour. Committee was provided with an update on the acquisition and planning process for the Amy Greenwell Community Forest.

2. Call to Order

Meeting was called to order at 10:30am by Chair Koch.

3. Welcome Members and Guests

4. Review and Approval of April 12, 2019 Meeting Minutes

The Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee (FSAC) reviewed the meeting minutes from the April 12, 2019 meeting.

Motion to approve the April 12, 2019 FSAC meeting minutes. Moved by Chair Koch; seconded by Member Britt.

Approve: Koch, Britt, Sprecher, Hendrickson, Menard, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter, Constantinides; Oppose: none; Abstain: none.

Motion Passed.

Forest Stewardship Program

5. Project Proposals

5.1. Kaupō Ranch Management Plan, Hāna District, Maui County

- Staff Rubenstein introduced the 6,000 acre project located in Hāna District on Maui. The main goals and challenges include weed control, animal control of hooved animals such as deer, and maintaining the integrity of the land's endemic biodiversity.

- Guest Buckman noted the historic and ecological implications and its close proximity to Haleakala National Park and participation in the Leeward Haleakala Watershed Partnership. Plans include retrofitting for fencing, planting koa and halapepe, and developing a seed bank. Guest Buckman also remarked that the western side of the property will incorporate cattle grazing for weed management and to prevent herbicide use.
- Member Hendrickson said the challenge with this plan is the timeline for the project considering the diverse elements.
- Guest Buckman proposed a potential break down of east and west on the property in the revised plan. Member Sprecher expressed her concern with the proposed timeline as well and asks about internal fencing on the site.
- Guest Buckman added that internal fencing is to be immediately integrated with hogwire/ mesh fencing.
- Member Jokiel explained more in depth about hogwire fencing practices on Haleakala Ranch. Member Menard asks if 15-20 acres would be too difficult for hogwire implementation and management. Member Jokiel responds that the difficulty will depend on the size of the herds and animals that are on the site area.
- Member Britt asked Guest Buckman about the meaning of “substantial costs”.
- Member Sprecher asked about clarity regarding how many seeds per acre will be needed. More understanding about what goes into those costs is needed.
- Guest Buckman said that better seedling cost information will be included in their revision.
- Chair Koch asked about other forms of funding listed in plan and asks about \$6000 road costs and installing a new reservoir within fencing to address irrigation.

Motion to defer the management plan and encourage the applicant resubmit with the committee’s comments incorporated. Moved by Member Britt; Seconded by Chair Koch.

Approve: Koch, Britt, Sprecher, Hendrickson, Menard, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter; Oppose: none; Abstain: Constantinides.

Motion Passed.

6. Forest Stewardship Program (FSP) Project Funding

- Staff Rubenstein introduced the draft timeline and budget overview for FSP projects. \$300,000 a year has been the most provided and the maximum allotted. She noted there is only enough funding for approximately one project.
- Staff Friday expressed her concern with delayed projects and tied up funds. Staff Rubenstein remarked most projects are delayed for one year.
- Staff Friday inquired if more projects could be selected with partial funding
- Member Menard asked if additional funding becomes available when other funding methods are found.

- Member Wellsheim agreed with an idea of approving management plans separate from the budget and then proceed with ranking.
- Member Hendrickson remarked that there needs to be transition from what we want to do and focus on what makes it compete with other projects.

7. **Forest Stewardship Plan Prioritization** (Matrix)

- Staff Chee introduced priority matrix for voting on projects.

Staff ranking:

1. Waiawa Forest Stewardship Management Plan, Ewa District, Honolulu County
2. Keauhou Bird Conservation Center (KBCC) Kau District, Hawaii County
3. Paniolo Tonewoods, Hamakua District, Hawaii County
4. Kaala Ranch, Waialua District, Honolulu County

- Member Koch remarked that conservation scoring has many nuances.
- Member Sprecher added that production projects seem to rank lower.
- Member Walsh was concerned about production and commercial value (outsourcing, growing capacity, supporting local economy).
- Member Hendrickson said it gives timber industry function as an economic value.
- Member Jokiel proposed to provide the matrix criteria to applicants to be more transparent.
- Member Britt said the matrix weighs conservation over production.
- Member Jokiel asked about wetland being a viable criteria.

Project ranking results:

- Member Britt commented that because we cannot consider Waiawa and KBCC due to their inability to enter into a contract, that the ranking should be as follows:
 - 1) Paniolo Tonewoods
 - 2) Kaala Ranch

Motion to approve the ranking results. Moved by Member Britt; seconded by member Hendrickson.

Approve: Britt, Sprecher, Hendrickson, Menard, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter, Constantinides; Oppose: none; Abstain: Jokiel, Koch

Motion Passed.

8. FY21 Forest Legacy Projects

8.1 Kealakekua, South Kona, Hawaii County

- Member Sprecher mentioned that the inholding (1000 acres) was subdivided out of the parcel and is available for sale. This site is also a sandalwood area which would be a great addition to the Forestry Reserve System as a timber

management area.

- Member Potter concerned with Rapid Ohia Death.

8.2 Na Wai Eha, Wailuku, Maui County

- Member Rubenstein explained that the project is located on a large part of west Maui and is a critical water source. She continued that the county is interested, but has not committed to funding and was a previous legacy land applicant; however, the landowner pulled out in 2007.
- Member Blumenstein remarked on fencing and drinking water resources.

8.3 Hawaii Koa Forest, North Hilo, Hawaii County

- Member Koch added that the site has timber and long standing water and gets requests for logging.
- Member Constantinides remarks that physical conditions are difficult/impossible to access.
- Member Hendrickson said projecting timber inventory as the basis of their evaluation makes investors say no. There is one undeveloped access point. He added there is a potential spread of ROD and that the site includes very unique ecosystems.

SCORE AND VOTING

Kealakekua

FSAC Member	Score
Rich W	84
Nick K.	70
Greg H.	57
Janet B.	79
Michael C.	51
Jordan J.	66
Bart P.	45
Eva B.	77
Seana W.	73
Trae M.	76
JB	46
Irene S.	68
TOTAL	792
Avg	66.00

Koa Forest

FSAC Member	Score
Rich W	80
Nick K.	60
Greg H.	54
Janet B.	62
Michael C.	50

Jordan J.	62
Bart P.	85
Eva B.	81
Seana W.	81
Trae M.	74
JB	41
Irene S.	70
TOTAL	800
Avg	66.67

Na Wai Eha

FSAC Member	Score
Rich W	80
Nick K.	70
Greg H.	58
Janet B.	77
Michael C.	61
Jordan J.	76
Bart P.	90
Eva B.	51
Seana W.	81
Trae M.	80
JB	68
Irene S.	67
TOTAL	859
Avg	71.58

Project	Average score	Ranking
Na Wai Eha	71.58	1
Koa Forest	66.67	2
Kealakekua	66	3

Motion to submit all three projects without preference. Moved by Member Britt; seconded by Member Wellsheim.

Approve: Britt, Sprecher, Menard, Jokiel, Blumenstein, Walsh, Wellsheim, Potter, Constantinides, Koch; Oppose: none; Abstain: Hendrickson

Motion Carries.

Continued discussion:

- Member Jokiel remarked that new management may be controversial. Member

Hendrickson said there are few funding vehicles for landscapes, governmental acquisitions vs conservation acquisition and support comes from community feedback.

9. Report from Permitted Interaction Group on Agroforestry for FSP Program

- Member Constantinides reported findings and definitions as written in the report. Section 2 provides orchard definitions and specifications because it was of importance in discussion. Orchard is defined as cropping and commercial uses and is not considered a forestry. Section 3 looks at mixed agroforestry. The included guidelines on the diversity of species along with a native species component which is recommended but not required. There must be at least 4 overstory species, and 4 understory species – each species shall comprise a minimum of 5% of total plants within their respective overstory/understory category.
- Member Sprecher asked is it specifically for one type of cropping or all of them.
- Member Constantinides replied that this is specifically for multistory criteria. He continued that FSP wants to make sure a forest is established and not lawn mowed open space areas. There must be at least 150 trees/acre are understory and overstory and at least 25 overstory trees/acre out of minimum 150 total. The PIG recommended that arrangement be left up to landowner management.
- FSP can fund trees but not vegetable crops and could support 100% fruit trees and understory plants. Plans also need to state upfront if there is an economic component.

10. Natural Area Reserve Commission and Forest Stewardship Advisory Committee Joint Consultation Meeting

- DOFAW presented program budget information at the Joint Consultation meeting. Member Constantinides commented that the meeting was more aligned with a briefing than formal decision making.
- Member Menard asked how to find synergy, provide priority, and understanding each other. Member Constantinides responded that the meeting's function was to provide input on prioritization.
- Member Menard commented that native ecosystem interest is the top priority of the Natural Area Reserve Commission, and other interests that are not aligned with their views creates a gap in funding.

11. Ongoing Forest Legacy Projects Update

FY17 Helemano, Waialua, Honolulu

- Staff Rubenstein reported that Helemano had closed recently. A multiuser management plan will be developed and scoping will begin. She continued that this will be an opportunity for committee members to provide input.

FY17 Hoomau, South Kona, Hawaii County

- Staff Rubenstein reported that there is a need for confirmation on conservation easement from Greg Hendrickson. Rubenstein continued that there is intensive feedback for easement and CIP is secured.

FY18 Haloa Aina, South Kona, Hawaii County

- Staff Rubenstein said that they are still gathering funding for Haloa Aina; it was unsuccessful in obtaining funding from Legacy Land, but was the number two priority on the PONC list. She continued that there are pending federal funds and commitment from Hawaii Island Land Trust.
- FY18 Kamehamehenui Forest, Kula, Maui County
 - Staff Rubenstein reported that there was petroleum contamination and survey issues on site.

12. 2020 Legislative Proposals Affecting Forest Management – Committee will be updated on the current 2020 legislative proposals.

- Member Sprecher reported that no new bills were submitted for the upcoming session. The Forest Stewardship Bill is currently stuck in the House (Water and Land). They are pushing budget, and operational requests for tree planting long with public land tree planting for climate change mitigation.
- She continued that urban and community forest working with small grants committee (funding limits) and quantifying carbon decrease is of discussion.

13. Announcements and Travel.

- The committee discussed potential meeting dates for 2020. Potential dates include February 7th, May 15th, and September 18th.

14. Adjournment

- Meeting adjourned at 2:59pm.

Committee Members: Nicholas Koch (Chair), Janet Britt (Chair-Elect), Greg Hendrickson, M. Irene Sprecher (Ex-Officio), Michael Constantinides, J.B. Friday, Trae Menard, Rich von Wellsheim, Bart Potter, Seana Walsh, Eva Blumstein, Jordan Jokiel

Staff: Marissa Chee, Tanya Rubenstein, Katie Friday (U.S. Forest Service), Jade Rhodes

Guests: Andrea Buckman (Kaupo Ranch project & Leeward Haleakala Watershed Restoration Partnership)