

TORKILDSON, KATZ, MOORE  
HETHERINGTON & HARRIS  
Attorneys at Law, A Law Corporation

NEWTON J. CHU                    6537-0  
LINCOLN S. T. ASHIDA        4478-0  
120 Pauahi Street, Suite 312  
Hilo, Hawai'i 96720  
Tel. (808) 961-0406  
FAX (808) 961-3815

Attorneys for PERPETUATING UNIQUE EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES, INC.

**BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**  
**FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I**

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation  
District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the  
Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea  
Science Reserve, Kaohe Mauka, Hamakua  
District, Island of Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-  
015:009

Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

**PERPETUATING UNIQUE  
EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES,  
INC.'S MEMORANDUM IN  
OPPOSITION TO MEHANA KIHOI'S  
MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION TO  
DENY THE INTERVENTION OF  
PERPETUATING UNIQUE  
EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES AS A  
PARTY IN THE CONTESTED CASE  
HEARING; CERTIFICATE OF  
SERVICE**

**PERPETUATING UNIQUE EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES, INC.'S  
MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO MEHANA KIHOI'S MOTION FOR  
RECONSIDERATION TO DENY THE INTERVENTION OF PERPETUATING  
UNIQUE EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES AS A PARTY IN  
THE CONTESTED CASE HEARING**

COMES NOW PERPETUATING UNIQUE EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES, INC.  
("PUEO"), by and through its undersigned counsel, and hereby respectfully submits the  
following Memorandum in Opposition to MEHANA KIHOI'S (hereinafter "Kihoi") Motion for  
Reconsideration to Deny the Intervention of Perpetuating Unique Educational Opportunities as a

Party in the Contested Case Hearing.

## **I. BACKGROUND**

As the Hearing Officer knows, PUEO is a Hawai`i non-profit corporation formed by Native Hawai`ians and organized under Hawai`i Revised Statutes Chapter 414D. PUEO was formed: (a) to share the interaction of Hawai`ian culture and science; (b) to research and educate the public on the interaction of Hawai`ian culture and science and to inspire exploration; and (c) to further educational opportunities for the children of Hawai`i in the fields of science, technology, engineering and mathematics.

PUEO's board members and beneficiaries include native Hawai`ians that reside in the Keaukaha-Pane`ewa Hawai`ian Homestead located in Hilo, Hawai`i. PUEO's board members also include native Hawai`ians who seek knowledge and exercise customary and traditional native Hawai`ian rights on Mauna Kea.

In supporting the pursuit of educational opportunities for children of Hawai`i, PUEO supports the building of the Thirty Meter Telescope atop Mauna Kea, as it will greatly enhance the educational opportunities for our children. As stated above, PUEO was formed to, inter alia, share the interaction of Hawai`ian culture and science and to research and educate the public on the interaction of Hawai`ian culture and science and to inspire exploration. More importantly, PUEO's purposes include furthering "educational opportunities for the children of Hawai`i in the fields of science, technology, engineering and mathematics.

On June 17, 2016, PUEO sought admission as a party to the contested case hearing. After a hearing (where any party could timely file opposition), PUEO was admitted as a party, and the Hearing Officer found that "PUEO's participation will substantially assist the Hearing Officer in her decision making." Minute Order No. 13 at page 4.

Kihoi now seeks to have PUEO effectively dismissed as a party. For the reasons stated in this Memorandum, and for the reasons the Hearing Officer found when this request was first heard, Kihoi's motion/request should be DENIED.

## II. LEGAL STANDARD

Hawaii Administrative Rule (hereinafter "HAR") Section 13-1-39 governs "reconsideration" in contested case hearings. That section provides as follows:

Reconsideration. (a) Upon a motion of a party, the board may reconsider a decision it has made on the merits only if the party can show that:

- (1) New information not previously available would affect the result; or
  - (2) A substantial injustice would occur.
- (b) In either case, a motion for reconsideration shall be made not later than five business days after the decision or not less than fourteen days prior to any deadline established by law for the disposition of the subject matter, whichever is earlier.

## III. ARGUMENT

### A. Kihoi's motion contains unsubstantiated allegations that are not supported by fact or the record.

Kihoi basically contends that because Board Member Stanley Roehrig and PUEO President Shadd Keahi Warfield are acquainted, PUEO somehow should not be allowed to participate as a party in the contested case. This position is absurd and not supported by fact or the present record, nor any law in Hawai'i. Hawai'i Island being a small community, it is not unusual for persons sharing similar interests to interact in many different ways. What is important to note here is Messrs. Roehrig and Warfield at the time were supporting a private nonprofit that had everything to do with the education of children, and nothing to do with supporting the thirty meter telescope.

At the onset, it is important to note that among many of Kihoi's factually inaccurate assertions, Warfield and Roehrig have never physically shared the same office space. Although United States mail was delivered to the Aupuni Street address, the mail was later sent to the

Keaukaha address. Based on this erroneous assumption and conclusion, Kehoi goes on to analyze the Hawaii Rules of Professional Conduct, and comes to the conclusion that Mr. Roehrig is in violation of the rules.

Kihoi further makes the erroneous conclusion that Mr. Roehrig and PUEO President Warfield are in a “business relationship”, and cites to federal law<sup>1</sup> to argue that there is a conflict of interest. This argument is not supported by fact or the record. Mr. Roehrig is a former director of Keaukaha One Youth Development Corporation (“KOYD”). KOYD is not a party to this contested case hearing. As a result, the motion should be DENIED.

**B. Kihoi offers no new information that was previously unavailable, and cannot establish that a substantial injustice would occur if PUEO is admitted as a party.**

Kihoi cannot demonstrate that she offers “new information not previously available (that) would affect the result” of the Hearing Officer’s decision. She essentially argues that PUEO should not be granted intervention because Mr. Roehrig and Mr. Warfield are acquainted and Mr. Roehrig was a former board member of KOYD<sup>2</sup>. These are the very same arguments Kihoi made in her initial motion seeking to have PUEO not admitted as a party (DOC 98). Kihoi draws the erroneous conclusion that a party’s acquaintance with a board member summarily means there is a “conflict of interest.” Such a conclusion is incorrect.

Kihoi has offered no new evidence that was previously unavailable. Further, she cannot establish that a substantial injustice would occur if PUEO is admitted as a party, as required by our rules.

After duly considering the motion and hearing argument, this Hearing Officer denied the

---

<sup>1</sup> Kihoi cites to a federal case that is misplaced. Neither Mr. Roehrig or Mr. Warfield are federal employees, and this case does not involve any federal statute.

<sup>2</sup> It is important to note that Mr. Roehrig resigned from the KOYD board *before* he was appointed to the BLNR.

motion and allowed PUEO to remain a party in the contested case. There is no legal or just reason for a different result here.

**IV. CONCLUSION**

Based on the foregoing, Kihoi's motion should be DENIED.

DATED: Hilo, Hawai'i, August 22, 2016.



---

NEWTON J. CHU  
LINCOLN S. T. ASHIDA

Attorneys for  
PERPETUATING UNIQUE EDUCATIONAL  
OPPORTUNITIES

**BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

**FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I**

IN THE MATTER OF

Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Kaohe Mauka, Hamakua District, Island of Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing was served on the following via the manner

listed below:

Michael Cain  
Office of Conservation and Coastal Lands  
1151 Punchbowl, Room 131  
Honolulu, HI 96813  
[michael.cain@hawaii.gov](mailto:michael.cain@hawaii.gov)  
*Custodian of the Records  
(original + digital copy)*

Judge Riki May Amano (Ret.)  
[rma3cc@yahoo.com](mailto:rma3cc@yahoo.com)  
*Hearing Officer*

Julie China, Deputy Attorney General  
[julie.h.china@hawaii.gov](mailto:julie.h.china@hawaii.gov)  
*Counsel for the Board of Land and Natural Resources*

Carlsmith Ball LLP  
Ian Sandison, Tim Lui-Kwan, John P. Manaut, Lindsay N. McAneeley  
1001 Bishop Street  
ASB Tower, Suite 2200  
Honolulu, HI 96813  
[isandison@carlsmith.com](mailto:isandison@carlsmith.com)  
[tluikwan@carlsmith.com](mailto:tluikwan@carlsmith.com)  
[jpm@carlsmith.com](mailto:jpm@carlsmith.com)  
[lmcaneley@carlsmith.com](mailto:lmcaneley@carlsmith.com)  
*Counsel for the Applicant University of Hawai'i at Hilo*

Richard N. Wurdeman  
Attorney at Law  
1003 Bishop Street, Suite 720  
Honolulu, HI 96813  
[RNWurdeman@RNWLaw.com](mailto:RNWurdeman@RNWLaw.com)  
*Counsel for the Petitioners Mauna Kea Anaina Hou, Clarence Kukauakahi Ching, Flores-Case 'Ohana, Deborah J. Ward, Paul K. Neves, and Kahea: The Environmental Alliance*

Watanabe Ing LLP  
J. Douglas Ing, Ross T. Shinyama, Summer H. Kiawe  
First Hawaiian Center 999 Bishop Street, 23<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Honolulu, HI 96813  
[rshinyama@wik.com](mailto:rshinyama@wik.com)  
[douging@wik.com](mailto:douging@wik.com)  
*Counsel for TMT International Observatory, LLC*

Harry Fergerstrom  
P.O. Box 951  
Kurtistown, HI 96760

Richard L DeLeon  
140 Manino Cir Apt 101  
Kihei, HI 96753  
[kekaukike@msn.com](mailto:kekaukike@msn.com)

Mehana Kihoi  
PO Box 393  
Honaunau, HI 96726  
[uhiwai@live.com](mailto:uhiwai@live.com)

C. M. Kaho'okahi Kanuha  
77-6504 Maile St  
Kailua Kona, HI 96740  
[kahookahi@gmail.com](mailto:kahookahi@gmail.com)

Joseph Kualii Lindsey Camara  
[kualiic@hotmail.com](mailto:kualiic@hotmail.com)

Torkildson, Katz, Moore, Hetherington & Harris  
Attn: Lincoln S. T. Ashida  
120 Pauahi Street, Suite 312  
Hilo, HI 96720-3084  
[lsa@torkildson.com](mailto:lsa@torkildson.com)  
[nic@torkildson.com](mailto:nic@torkildson.com)  
*Counsel for Perpetuating Unique Educational Opportunities (PUEO)*

J. Leina'ala Sleightholm  
P.O. Box 383035  
Waikoloa, HI 96738  
[leina.ala.s808@gmail.com](mailto:leina.ala.s808@gmail.com)

Maelani Lee  
PO Box 1054  
Waianae, HI 96792  
[maelanilee@yahoo.com](mailto:maelanilee@yahoo.com)

Lanny Alan Sinkin  
P. O. Box 944  
Hilo, HI 96721  
[lanny.sinkin@gmail.com](mailto:lanny.sinkin@gmail.com)  
*Representative for The Temple of Lono*

Kalikolehua Kanaele  
4 Spring Street  
Hilo, HI 96720  
[akulele@yahoo.com](mailto:akulele@yahoo.com)

Stephanie-Malia:Tabbada  
P O Box 194,  
Naalehu, HI 96772  
[s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net](mailto:s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net)

Tiffnie Kakalia  
549 E. Kahaopea St.  
Hilo, HI 96720  
[tiffniekakalia@gmail.com](mailto:tiffniekakalia@gmail.com)

Glen Kila  
89-530 Mokiawe Street  
Waianae, HI 96792  
[makakila@gmail.com](mailto:makakila@gmail.com)

Dwight J. Vicente  
2608 Ainaola Drive  
Hilo, Hawaiian Kingdom

Brannon Kamahana Kealoha  
89-564 Mokiawe Street  
Nanakuli, HI 96792  
[brannonk@hawaii.edu](mailto:brannonk@hawaii.edu)

Cindy Freitas  
PO Box 4650  
Kailua Kona, HI 96745  
[hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com](mailto:hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com)

William Freitas  
PO Box 4650  
Kailua Kona, HI 96745  
[pohaku7@yahoo.com](mailto:pohaku7@yahoo.com)

DATED: Hilo, Hawai'i, August 22, 2016.



---

NEWTON J. CHU  
LINCOLN S. T. ASHIDA

Attorneys for  
PERPETUATING UNIQUE EDUCATIONAL  
OPPORTUNITIES