521512.1 WATANABE ING LLP

A Limited Liability Law Partnership

J. DOUGLAS ING #1538-0 ROSS T. SHINYAMA #8830-0 SUMMER H. KAIAWE #9599-0

First Hawaiian Center 999 Bishop Street, 23rd Floor Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Telephone No.: (808) 544-8300 Facsimile No.: (808) 544-8399 E-mails: rshinyama@wik.com

Attorneys for

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Kaohe Mauka, Hamakua District, Island of Hawaii, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 OFFICE OF CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS

2016 OCT 19 A 11: 21

NATURAL SESSURERS STATE OF SAWAII

Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

TMT INTERNATIONAL
OBSERVATORY, LLC'S
MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO
KAHEA: THE ENVIRONMENTAL
ALLIANCE'S JOINDER IN TEMPLE OF
LONO'S MOTION TO STRIKE FOR
FAILURE TO SERVE OR EXTENSION
OF TIME AND RESCHEDULING OF
HEARING FILED OCTOBER 12, 2016,
FILED OCTOBER 17, 2016;
DECLARATION OF ROSS T.
SHINYAMA; EXHIBITS 1-6;
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC'S MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO KAHEA: THE ENVIRONMENTAL ALLIANCE'S JOINDER IN TEMPLE OF LONO'S MOTION TO STRIKE FOR FAILURE TO SERVE OR EXTENSION OF TIME AND RESCHEDULING OF HEARING FILED OCTOBER 12, 2016, FILED OCTOBER 17, 2016

COMES NOW, TMT International Observatory, LLC ("TIO"), by and through its counsel, Watanabe Ing LLP, and hereby submits this Memorandum in Opposition to KAHEA: The Environmental Alliance's ("KAHEA") Joinder in Temple of Lono's ("TOL") Motion to Strike for Failure to Serve or Extension of Time and Rescheduling of Hearing, filed October 12, 2016 ("Motion to Strike"), filed October 17, 2016 ("Joinder"). The Joinder should be denied, inasmuch as TIO timely filed its pleadings and timely served those pleadings upon all parties to this proceeding.

I. <u>DISCUSSION</u>

In its Joinder, KAHEA argues that TIO's pleadings should be stricken because TIO failed to serve copies of the pleadings on some of the parties. KAHEA, however, is mistaken. TIO timely filed its pleadings, and timely served all parties in this proceeding.

Pursuant to the deadlines set forth by the Hearing Officer, TIO filed its Final Witness List and Written Direct Testimony of Witnesses, Pre-Hearing Statement, and Exhibit List and Exhibits 1 to 34 on October 11, 2016. The time-stamped copies of each of these pleadings illustrates that they were filed at 3:48 pm, 3:48 pm, and 3:49 pm, respectively, on October 11, 2016. See Exhibits 1, 2, 3, attached hereto.

On October 11, 2016, at 4:56 pm, via email correspondence, TIO served copies of the pleadings upon all parties to this proceeding. See Exhibit 4, attached hereto; Declaration of Ross Shinyama, attached hereto. In that email correspondence, Ellen Yamamoto of the law firm of Watanabe Ing LLP provided a link to each of the parties in this proceeding, which allowed those parties to download the pleadings. Note that the email address of KAHEA's counsel at the time, Richard Naiwieha Wurdeman, is clearly included in this email correspondence, as is KAHEA's representative, Bianca Esaki. Several of the parties downloaded the documents using

the email link, indicating that the email correspondence had been received and the link operational. There was no bounce-back message indicating that this email correspondence failed to reach any of the listed recipients, including KAHEA's counsel.

Additionally, Michael Cain of the Board of Land and Natural Resources accessed the pleadings via the email link provided by Ellen Yamamoto on October 11, 2016. See Exhibit 6. Mr. Cain then placed TIO's pleadings on the DLNR website, so that all of the parties could access the documents. Accordingly, DLNR itself received the October 11, 2016 email correspondence from Ellen Yamamoto, again indicating that service had been successful.

In its Joinder, KAHEA points to email correspondence on October 11, 2016 from Frances Soares of the Watanabe Ing law firm. A copy of this email is attached hereto as Exhibit 5, and was sent inadvertently to all parties in this proceeding. The email from Frances Soares did not contain any information or any indication that its purpose was service of the pleadings on the parties. The email from Frances Soares does not change the fact that on October 11, 2016, at 4:56 pm, TIO (via email correspondence from Ellen Yamamoto) provided an email link to the pleadings, fulfilling its obligations to serve all parties in this proceeding with copies of the relevant documents.

In its Joinder, KAHEA also claims that its new counsel, Yuklin Aluli and Dexter Kaiama, did not receive service of the pleadings. However, the Notice of Appearance of Co-Counsel for those attorneys was not filed until October 11, 2016 and received by counsel for TIO until October 12, 2016, the day after TIO's pre-hearing documents were filed. Consequently, it is disingenuous for KAHEA to argue that service should have been made on counsel who were not yet of record in this proceeding, especially where KAHEA's existing counsel, Richard Naiwieha Wurdeman, and KAHEA's representative, Bianca Esaki, were served.

In light of the foregoing, the Joinder should be denied. TIO timely served all

parties to the proceeding. The actions of TIO in serving the parties in this proceeding were in

accordance with regular business practices, and do not warrant a striking of the pleadings.

Moreover, DLNR itself received the email link and posted all of the pleadings on its website for

the parties to access. Consequently, there has been no prejudice whatsoever to KAHEA. Even if

it had not received the October 11, 2016 email correspondence from Ellen Yamamoto, it clearly

had access to the DLNR website. KAHEA's Joinder is clearly intended to unnecessarily delay

the proceedings, and is without merit.

II. **CONCLUSION**

For the foregoing reasons, and all reasons appearing of record, TIO respectfully

requests that KAHEA's Joinder be denied.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, October 19, 2016.

ROSS T. SHINYAMA SUMMER H. KAIAWE

Attorneys for

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC

4

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Kaohe Mauka, Hamakua District, Island of Hawaii, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

DECLARATION OF ROSS T. SHINYAMA; EXHIBITS 1-6;

DECLARATION OF ROSS T. SHINYAMA

I, ROSS T. SHINYAMA, hereby declare and state as follows:

- 1. I am an attorney licensed to practice law in the State of Hawaii and am one of the attorneys representing TMT International Observatory LLC, a non-profit organization ("TIO") in the above-captioned matter.
- 2. I make this Declaration based upon my personal knowledge and upon reliance of the files and records maintained by my office and in the normal and regular course of business.
- 3. Pursuant to the deadlines set forth by the Hearing Officer, TIO filed its Final Witness List and Written Direct Testimony of Witnesses, Pre-Hearing Statement, and Exhibit List and Exhibits 1 to 34 on October 11, 2016.
- 4. Attached as Exhibits 1, 2, and 3 are true and accurate copies of the time-stamped pages of each of these pleadings, illustrating that they were filed at 3:48 pm, 3:48 pm, and 3:49 pm, respectively, on October 11, 2016.
- 5. Attached as Exhibit 4 is a true and accurate copy of email correspondence, dated October 11, 2016 at 4:56 pm, from Ellen Yamamoto of my law firm, showing that TIO served copies of the pleadings upon all parties to this proceeding. In that email correspondence, Ellen

Yamamoto of my law firm provided a link to each of the parties in this proceeding, which allowed those parties to download the pleadings. Note that the email address of TOL's counsel, Richard Naiwieha Wurdeman, is clearly included in this email correspondence, as is KAHEA's representative, Bianca Esaki. Several of the parties downloaded the documents using the email link, indicating that the email correspondence had been received and the link operational. There was no bounce-back message indicating that this email correspondence failed to reach any of the listed recipients, including KAHEA's counsel.

- 6. Attached hereto as Exhibit 6 is a true and accurate copy of an email notification indicating that Michael Cain of the Board of Land and Natural Resources accessed the pleadings via the email link provided by Ellen Yamamoto on October 11, 2016. With Mr. Cain's receipt of the documents, TIO's pleadings were placed on the DLNR website, so that all of the parties could access the documents. Accordingly, DLNR itself received the October 11, 2016 email correspondence from Ellen Yamamoto, again indicating that service had been successful.
- 7. There was email correspondence on October 11, 2016 from Frances Soares of my law firm sent inadvertently to all parties. A true and accurate copy of this email is attached hereto as Exhibit 5. The email from Frances Soares did not contain any information or any indication that its purpose was service of the pleadings on the parties. The email from Frances Soares does not change the fact that on October 11, 2016, at 4:56 pm, TIO (via email correspondence from Ellen Yamamoto) provided an email link to the pleadings, fulfilling its obligations to serve all parties in this proceeding with copies of the relevant documents.

//

//

//

I, ROSS T. SHINYAMA, declare under penalty of law that the foregoing is true and correct.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, October 19, 2016.

ROSS T. SHINYAMA

521209
WATANABE ING LLP
A Limited Liability Law Partnership

J.DOUGLAS ING #1538-0
ROSS T. SHINYAMA #8830-0
SUMMER H. KAIAWE #9599-0
First Hawaiian Center
999 Bishop Street, 23rd Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Telephone No.: (808) 544-8300 Facsimile No.: (808) 544-8399 E-mails: Douglng@wik.com

Attorneys for Defendant
TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Kaohe Mauka, Hamakua District, Island of Hawaii TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LECTOR FINAL WITNESS LIST and WHITE PROPERTY TESTIMONY OF WITNESSES CERTIFICATED SERVICE

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC's FINAL WITNESS LIST AND WRITTEN DIRECT TESTIMONY OF WITNESSES

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC ("TIO") by and through its attorneys, WATANABE ING, hereby submits its final witness list, including the written direct testimony of each witness, which TIO expects to call at the evidentiary hearing in the above-referenced Contested Case matter.

WATANABE ING LLP A Limited Liability Law Partnership

J. DOUGLAS ING #1538-0 ROSS T. SHINYAMA #8830-0 SUMMER H. KAIAWE #9599-0

First Hawaiian Center 999 Bishop Street, 23rd Floor Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Telephone No.: (808) 544-8300 Facsimile No.: (808) 544-8399 E-mails: rshinyama@wik.com

Attorneys for TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC



2816 OCT 11 P 3 48

MIST OF LAND A RECEDE HENCESES STATE OF NAMED

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmākua District, Island of Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC'S PRE-HEARING STATEMENT; EXHIBIT "1"; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE WATANABE ING LLP
A Limited Liability Law Partnership

RECLIVED
OFFICE OF CONSERVATION
AND COASTAL LANDS

J. DOUGLAS ING

#1538-0

ROSS T. SHINYAMA #8830-0 SUMMER H. KAIAWE #9599-0

First Hawaiian Center 999 Bishop Street, 23rd Floor

Honolulu, Hawaii 96813 Telephone No.: (808) 544-8300

Facsimile No.: (808) 544-8399 E-mails: rshinyama@wik.com DEPT. OF LAND & NATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF HAWAII

2016 OCT 11 P 3: 49

Attorneys for

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Kaohe Mauka, Hamakua District, Island of Hawaii, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

TIMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC'S EXHIBIT LIST and EXHIBITS 1 to 34; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

PARTY: TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC

Exhibit No.	Description	Received Into Evidence
C-1	Testimony of Ed Stone	
C-2	Testimony of Gary Sanders	
C-3	Graphic showing Mitigation Measures Reduce Size and Visibility of TMT	

Ellen A. Yamamoto

From:

Sent: Tuesday, October 11, 2016 4:56 PM

Ellen A. Yamamoto

To: 'michael.cain@hawaii.gov'; 'dlnr.maunakea@hawaii.gov'; 'isandison@carlsmith.com';

'RNWurdeman@RNWLaw.com'; 'akulele@yahoo.com'; 'uhiwai@live.com'; 'kahookahi@gmail.com'; 'kualiic@hotmail.com'; 'lsa@torkildson.com'; 'njc@torkildson.com'; 'leina.ala.s808@gmail.com'; 'maelanilee@yahoo.com'; 'lanny.sinkin@gmail.com'; 's.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net'; 'tiffniekakalia@gmail.com'; 'makakila@gmail.com'; 'brannonk@hawaii.edu'; 'hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com'; 'pohaku7 @yahoo.com'; 'kekaukike@msn.com'; 'tluikwan@carlsmith.com'; 'jpm@carlsmith.com'; 'lmcaneeley@carlsmith.com'; 'ekflores@hawaiiantel.net'; 'kealiikea@yahoo.com';

'keomaivg@gmail.com'; 'puacase@hawaiiantel.net'; 'bianca@kahea.org';

'kahiwaL@cs.com'; 'cordylinecolor@gmail.com'

J. Douglas Ing; Ross T. Shinyama; Summer H. Kaiawe; Denise H. Kameda; Charlene M.

Moriwaki

Subject: TMT/BLNR Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

Attachments: Attachments

All,

Cc:

Attached for your information are the following documents filed on behalf of TMT International Observatory, LLC:

- 1) TIO Prehearing Statement
- 2) TIO Final Witness List and Written Testimonies
- 3) TIO Exhibit List and Exhibits 1 thru 34

Please click on the link below to download the attachments.

ShareFile Attachments	
Title	Size
TIO EXH C-1.pdf	102.3 KB
TIO EXH C-10.pdf	36.2 KB
TIO EXH C-11.pdf	25.1 KB
TIO EXH C-12.pdf	1.2 MB
TIO EXH C-13.pdf	45.4 KB
TIO EXH C-14.pdf	1 MB
TIO EXH C-15.pdf	351.8 KB
TIO EXH C-16.pdf	310.4 KB
TIO EXH C-17.pdf	55.5 KB
TIO EXH C-18.pdf	122.7 KB
TIO EXH C-19.pdf	89.1

	KB
TIO EXH C-2.pdf	1.2 MB
TIO EXH C-20.pdf	100.3 KB
TIO EXH C-21.pdf	102 KB
TIO EXH C-22.pdf	110.9 KB
TIO EXH C-23.pdf	68.6 KB
TIO EXH C-24.pdf	1.6 MB
TIO EXH C-25.pdf	895.5 KB
TIO EXH C-26.pdf	2.7 MB
TIO EXH C-27.pdf	1.7 MB
TIO EXH C-28.pdf	1.2 MB
TIO EXH C-29.pdf	962.9 KB
TIO EXH C-3.pdf	94.4 KB
TIO EXH C-30.pdf	402.1 KB
TIO EXH C-31.pdf	622.8 KB
TIO EXH C-32.pdf	4.6 MB
TIO EXH C-33.pdf	125.6 KB
TIO EXH C-34.pdf	790.5 KB
TIO EXH C-4.pdf	566.6 KB
TIO EXH C-5.pdf	309.6 KB
TIO EXH C-6.pdf	525.9 KB
TIO EXH C-7.pdf	299.9 KB
TIO EXH C-8.pdf	36.4 KB
TIO EXH C-9.pdf	36.3 KB
TIO Exhibit List.pdf	188.1 KB
TIO Final Witness List and Written Testimonies.pdf	
TMT International Observatory, LLC's Pre-Hearing Statement; Exhibit 1; COS.pdf	MB 3.6 MB

Download Affachments

Ellen Yamamoto uses ShareFile to share documents securely. <u>Learn More.</u>

Thank you

Ellen Yamamoto Paralegal Watanabe Ing LLP 999 Bishop Street, 23rd Floor Honolulu, HI 96813-4428

Tel: (808) 544-8300 Fax: (808) 544-8398

Email: eyamamoto@wik.com

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTE: This transmission and the information contained in this transmission is private and confidential and is only intended to be sent to and received and used by the individuals or entities designated above. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that this transmission and its contents are proprietary to and the exclusive property of the sender's company, and that any use, dissemination, distribution, or copy of this transmission is strictly prohibited. If you have received this transmission in error, please immediately notify the sender by e-mail, and return the original transmission to the sender at the address above or destroy or delete said transmission. Thank You!

Frances M. Soares

From: Frances M. Soares

Sent: Tuesday, October 11, 2016 4:27 PM

To: michael.cain@hawaii.gov; dlnr.maunakea@hawaii.gov; isandison@carlsmith.com;

RNWurdeman@RNWLaw.com; akulele@yahoo.com; uhiwai@live.com;

kahookahi@gmail.com; kualiic@hotmail.com; lsa@torkildson.com; njc@torkildson.com;

leina.ala.s808@gmail.com; maelanilee@yahoo.com; lanny.sinkin@gmail.com; s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net; tiffniekakalia@gmail.com; makakila@gmail.com; brannonk@hawaii.edu; hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com; pohaku7@yahoo.com; kekaukike@msn.com; 'tluikwan@carlsmith.com'; 'jpm@carlsmith.com';

'Imcaneeley@carlsmith.com'; 'ekflores@hawaiiantel.net'; 'kealiikea@yahoo.com'; 'keomaivg@gmail.com'; 'puacase@hawaiiantel.net'; 'bianca@kahea.org';

'kahiwaL@cs.com'; 'cordylinecolor@gmail.com'

J. Douglas Ing; Denise H. Kameda; Summer H. Kaiawe; Ross T. Shinyama; Ellen A.

Yamamoto; Charlene M. Moriwaki

Subject: BLNR Contested Case Hearing HA 16-002

Frances Sources

Cc:

Secretary to Michael C. Bird, Esq. & Summer H. Kaiawe, Esq. Watanabe Ing LLP A Limited Liability Law Partnership First Hawaiian Center, 23rd Floor 999 Bishop Street Honolulu, HI 96813

Telephone: (808) 544-8300 Facsimile: (808) 544-8399 e-mail: <u>fsoares@wik.com</u>

The information contained in this e-mail message and/or in the attachment(s) hereto is between attorney and client and, therefore, privileged/confidential. The use of this information is intended for the sole use of the individual and/or entity named as the recipient of this e-mail message. Printing, reproducing, disseminating, or distributing this e-mail message and/or attachment(s) hereto, in any manner whatsoever, is strictly prohibited without the prior approval of the named recipient hereunder. If the reader has received this communication in error, please contact the sender by calling collect at (808) 544-8300. Please also confirm in writing, addressed to the sender at the address listed above, that the e-mail message and/or attachment(s) have been destroyed and have not been printed, reproduced, disseminated, or distributed in any way. Your cooperation is appreciated.

Ellen A. Yamamoto

From:

ShareFile Notifications (No Reply) <noreply@sf-notifications.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, October 12, 2016 1:15 AM

To:

Ellen A. Yamamoto

Subject:

Michael Cain has downloaded files from the folder 'File Box'



Ellen,

Michael Cain downloaded files from a "Send Files" link at 10/12/16 2:15A:

File Box

Name: TIO Final Witness List and Written Testimonies.pd

f

Size: 47.16 MB • Downloaded: 10/12/16 2:14a

User: Michael Cain [michael.cain@hawaii.gov] (State of Hawaii DLNR)

Name: TMT International Observatory, LLC's Pre-Hearing

Statement; Exhibit 1; COS.pdf Size: 3.64 MB • Downloaded: 10/12/16 2:14a

User: Michael Cain [michael.cain@hawaii.gov] (State of Hawaii DLNR)

Dates are displayed in UTC -10

Click here to change how often ShareFile sends emails

Powered By Citrix ShareFile 2016

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE OF HAWAI'I

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 BLNR Contested Case HA-16-002

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that the attached document was served upon the following parties by the means indicated:

Michael Cain
Office of Conservation and Coastal
Lands
1151 Punchbowl, Room 131
Honolulu, HI 96813
michael.cain@hawaii.gov
Custodian of the Records
(ORIGINAL + DIGITAL COPY)

Carlsmith Ball LLP
lan Sandison, Tim Lui-Kwan, John P.
Manaut, Lindsay N. McAneeley
1001 Bishop Street
ASB Tower, Suite 2200
Honolulu, HI 96813
isandison@carlsmith.com
tluikwan@carlsmith.com
jpm@carlsmith.com
lmcaneeley@carlsmith.com
Counsel for the Applicant University
of Hawai'i at Hilo

Torkildson, Katz, Moore,
Hetherington & Harris
Attn: Lincoln S. T. Ashida
120 Pauahi Street, Suite 312
Hilo, HI 96720-3084
Isa@torkildson.com
njc@torkildson.com
Counsel for Perpetuating Unique
Educational Opportunities (PUEO)

Office of Conservation and Coastal Lands dlnr.maunakea@hawaii.gov

Harry Fergerstrom P.O. Box 951 Kurtistown, HI 96760

Lanny Alan Sinkin
P. O. Box 944
Hilo, HI 96721
lanny.sinkin@gmail.com
Representative for The Temple of
Lono

Richard L DeLeon 140 Manino Cir Apt 101 Kihei, HI 96753 kekaukike@msn.com

J. Leina'ala Sleightholm P.O. Box 383035 Waikoloa, HI 96738 leinaala.mauna@gmail.com

Joseph Kualii Lindsey Camara kualiic@hotmail.com

Mehana Kihoi PO Box 393 Honaunau, HI 96726 uhiwai@live.com

C. M. Kaho'okahi Kanuha 77-6504 Maile St Kailua Kona, HI 96740 kahookahi@gmail.com

Maelani Lee PO Box 1054 Waianae, HI 96792 maelanilee@yahoo.com

Kalikolehua Kanaele 4 Spring Street Hilo, HI 96720 akulele@yahoo.com

Stephanie-Malia:Tabbada P O Box 194, Naalehu, HI 96772 s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net

Dwight J. Vicente 2608 Ainaola Drive Hilo, Hawaiian Kingdom Richard N. Wurdeman
Attorney at Law
1003 Bishop Street, Suite 720
Honolulu, HI 96813
RNWurdeman@RNWLaw.com
Counsel for the Petitioners Mauna
Kea Anaina Hou, Clarence
Kukauakahi Ching, Flores-Case
'Ohana, Deborah J. Ward, Paul
K. Neves, and Kahea: The
Environmental Alliance

William Freitas PO Box 4650 Kailua Kona, HI 96745 pohaku7@yahoo.com

Flores-Case 'Ohana E. Kalani Flores ekflores@hawaiiantel.net

Paul K. Neves kealiikea@yahoo.com Brannon Kamahana Kealoha 89-564 Mokiawe Street Nanakuli, HI 96792 brannonk@hawaii.edu

Tiffnie Kakalia 549 E. Kahaopea St. Hilo, HI 96720 tiffniekakalia@gmail.com

Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou keomaivg@gmail.com

B. Pualani Case puacase@hawaiiantel.net

Yuklin Aluli, Esq.

415-C Uluniu Street
Kailua, Hawaii 96734
yuklin@kailualaw.com
Co-Counsel for Petitioner
KAHEA: The Hawaiian
Environmental Alliance, a domestic
non-profit Corporation

Glen Kila 89-530 Mokiawe Street Waianae, HI 96792 makakila@gmail.com

Cindy Freitas PO Box 4650 Kailua Kona, HI 96745 hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com

Clarence Kukauakahi Ching kahiwaL@cs.com

Deborah J. Ward cordylinecolor@gmail.com

Dexter K. Kaiama, Esq. 111 Hekili Street, #A1607 Kailua, Hawaii 96734 cdexk@hotmail.com Co-Counsel for Petitioner KAHEA: The Hawaiian Environmental Alliance, a domestic non-profit Corporation

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, October 19, 2016

J. DOUGLAS ING ROSS T. SHINYAMA
SUMMER H. KAIAWE

Attorneys for TMT International Observatory LLC