498793.1

WATANABE ING LLP A Limited Liability Law Partnership

GECEIVED OFFICE OF CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS

J. DOUGLAS ING #1538-0 BRIAN A. KANG #6495-0 ROSS T. SHINYAMA #8830-0

2017 MAY -3 A II: 50

SUMMER H. KAIAWE #9599-0

DEPT. OF LAND & MATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF HAWAII

First Hawaiian Center 999 Bishop Street, 23rd Floor Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Telephone No.: (808) 544-8300 Facsimile No.: (808) 544-8399 E-mails: rshinyama@wik.com

Attorneys for

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC'S STATEMENT OF POSITION AND OPPOSITION TO HARRY FERGERSTROM'S MOTION TO RECONSIDER (DOC 553, MINUTE ORDER 44); MOTION TO INCLUDE WDT AND PRE-HEARING STATEMENT INTO EVIDENCE; et al., FILED 4/26/17 [DOC. NO. 566]; EXHIBIT "1"; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC'S STATEMENT OF POSITION AND OPPOSITION TO HARRY FERGERSTROM'S MOTION TO RECONSIDER (DOC 553, MINUTE ORDER 44); MOTION TO INCLUDE WDT AND PRE-HEARING STATEMENT INTO EVIDENCE; et al., FILED 4/26/17 [DOC. NO. 566]

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC ("TIO"), by and through its

undersigned counsel, hereby submits its Statement of Position and Opposition to Harry

Fergerstrom's Motion to Reconsider (Doc 553, Minute Order 44); Motion to Include WDT and

Pre-Hearing Statement Into Evidence; et al. ("Motion"), which was uploaded to the Documents Library on April 26, 2017 as Doc. No. 566.

I. <u>DISCUSSION</u>

1. <u>Harry Fergerstrom's Written Direct Testimony, dated November 14, 2016</u> ("Fergerstrom WDT").

Mr. Fergerstrom filed an earlier motion for reconsideration of Minute Order No. 44 [Doc. No. 554] seeking the untimely admission of the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence. TIO hereby incorporates by this reference its Statement of Position to Mr. Fergerstrom's first motion for reconsideration [Doc. No. 588]. For the Hearing Officer's convenience, TIO's Statement of Position is attached hereto as Exhibit "1". TIO does not object to the admission of the Fergerstrom WDT for the reasons stated therein.

2. Pre-Hearing Statement

Mr. Fergerstrom seeks admission of his Pre-Hearing Statement into evidence. Like the Fergerstrom WDT, Mr. Fergerstrom did not move his Pre-Hearing Statement into evidence as part of his "Motion to move all documents in evidentiary hearing submittals, identified by letter 'D' into evidence" on March 6, 2017 [Doc. No. 494] ("March 6 Motion"). In his Motion, Mr. Fergerstrom does not establish sufficient "good cause" to reasonably excuse his failure to timely move his Pre-Hearing Statement into evidence.

In Minute Order No. 44 [Doc. No. 553], the Hearing Officer ordered the following regarding pre-hearing statements:

Pre-hearing statements were denied as they are not evidence **except** where movant had no written direct testimony filed in the Documents Library and the movant's hearing testimony was

¹ Mr. Fergerstrom did identify his Pre-Hearing Statement in his untimely "Clarification of items identified as evidentiary submittals under the letter 'D' to be moved into evidence (Doc 494)" [Doc. No. 515] ("Clarification").

reflected in his/her pre-hearing statement; in those cases, the Hearing Officer will discern testimony from argument when reviewing the pre-hearing statement received into evidence and determine the application and weight to be given the evidence, if any.

Id. at 7 (emphasis in original).

Mr. Fergerstrom did submit written direct testimony and therefore his Pre-Hearing Statement would technically be excluded under the above order. However, TIO submits that select pages of Mr. Fergerstrom's Pre-Hearing Statement - e.g., pages 4-5 of Pre-Hearing Statement² – could be considered written direct testimony of Mr. Fergerstrom. Given the foregoing and the fact that the Pre-Hearing Statement appears to have been submitted and uploaded to the Documents Library before the close of the testimony portion of the contested case hearing on March 2, 2017, and was referred to by Mr. Fergerstrom during his oral testimony, and in consideration of the "considerably more relaxed" evidentiary standard that applies to administrative hearings, TIO respectfully submits that it does not object to the admission of Mr. Fergerstrom's Pre-Hearing Statement under the condition set forth in Minute Order No. $44 - \underline{i.e.}$, that "the Hearing Officer will discern testimony from argument when reviewing the pre-hearing statement received into evidence and determine the application and weight to be given the evidence, if any." Id.

3. Professor Williamson Chang's Written Direct Testimony ("Chang WDT") [Exhibit D-2]

Professor Chang was prohibited from testifying at the contested case hearing because the Hearing Officer correctly ruled that his testimony was not material to the relevant issues as detailed in Minute Order No. 19 [Doc. No. 281]. His testimony was instead related to the issues

² Mr. Fergerstrom's Pre-Hearing Statement is not paginated. The page numbers referenced herein were arrived at by manually counting the pages in his Pre-Hearing Statement.

that the Hearing Officer specifically excluded from this contested case pursuant to Minute Order No. 19. Consistent with these rulings, Mr. Fergerstrom did not move the Chang WDT into evidence as part of his March 6 Motion or his Clarification.

Though not entirely clear, Mr. Fergerstrom now apparently seeks to have the Hearing Officer receive the Chang WDT into evidence, but not weigh it as evidence. This is nonsensical. TIO opposes any belated attempt by Mr. Fergerstrom to move or have the Chang WDT received into evidence. The Chang WDT is not relevant to the issues in this contested case hearing as detailed in Minute Order No. 19.

The Chang WDT is already marked as an exhibit in the record and the Hearing Officer's ruling on the admissibility of said exhibit is also already in the record. The Hearing Officer does not need to receive said exhibit into evidence for Mr. Fergerstrom to raise the exclusion of Mr. Chang and the Chang WDT on appeal. The Motion should be denied insofar and to the extent Mr. Fergerstrom seeks to have the Hearing Officer belatedly admit or receive into evidence the Chang WDT.

//
//

//

[INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK – SEE NEXT PAGE]

//

//

//

//

//

//

III. CONCLUSION

Based on the foregoing, TIO respectfully submits that it does not object to the admission into evidence of the Fergerstrom WDT or his Pre-Hearing Statement under the condition set forth in Minute Order No. 44. However, TIO opposes any attempt by Mr. Fergerstrom to belatedly admit or receive the Chang WDT into evidence and opposes the Motion on those grounds.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, May 3, 2017.

J. DOUGLASING

BRIAN A. KANG

ROSS T. SHINYAMA SUMMER H. KAIAWE

Attorneys for TMT INTERNATIONAL

OBSERVATORY LLC

498194.1.3 WATANABE ING LLP A Limited Liability Law Partnership

J. DOUGLAS ING #1538-0 BRIAN A. KANG #6495-0 ROSS T. SHINYAMA #8830-0 SUMMER H. KAIAWE #9599-0

First Hawaiian Center 999 Bishop Street, 23rd Floor

Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Telephone No.: (808) 544-8300 Facsimile No.: (808) 544-8399 E-mails: rshinyama@wik.com TUGETVED OFFICE OF CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LAMES

2017 APR 28 A 11:58

DEPT. OF LAND A MATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF MARKET

Attorneys for

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY LLC'S STATEMENT OF POSITION RE: HARRY FERGERSTROM'S MOTION TO RECONSIDER (DOC 553, MINUTE ORDER 44); et al., FILED 4/23/2017 [Doc. No. 554]; EXHIBIT "1"; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY LLC'S STATEMENT OF POSITION RE: HARRY FERGERSTROM'S MOTION TO RECONSIDER (DOC 553, MINUTE ORDER 44); et al., FILED 4/23/2017 [Doc. No. 554]

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC ("TIO"), by and through its undersigned counsel, hereby submits its Statement of Position Re: Harry Fergerstrom's Motion to Reconsider (Doc 553, minute order 44); et al. ("Position Statement"), which was uploaded to

the Documents Library on Sunday, April 23, 2017 as Doc. No. 554. Harry Fergerstrom's own neglect, as detailed <u>infra</u>, is to blame for his Written Direct Testimony, dated November 14, 2016 ("Fergerstrom WDT") not being admitted into evidence. Mr. Fergerstrom has also failed to establish sufficient "good cause" to reasonably excuse his failure to timely move the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence. Nevertheless, given that the Fergerstrom WDT appears to have been submitted and uploaded to the Documents Library before the close of the testimony portion of the contested case hearing on March 2, 2017, and was referred to by Mr. Fergerstrom during his oral testimony on January 23, 2017, and in consideration of the "considerably more relaxed" evidentiary standard that applies to administrative hearings, TIO respectfully submits that it does not object to the admission of the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence as part of this contested case.

Preliminarily, in his Motion, Mr. Fergerstrom complains that the Fergerstrom WDT was not uploaded to the Documents Library. Mr. Fergerstrom is incorrect. The Fergerstrom WDT can be found in the Documents Library under the "Evidentiary Hearing Submittals" tab. The Fergerstrom WDT was uploaded to the Documents Library on November 15, 2016. See Exhibit "1" attached hetero, which is a screenshot of the Fergerstrom WDT in the Documents Library.

Mr. Fergerstrom also complains in his Motion that the Fergerstrom WDT was not admitted into evidence by the Hearing Officer. The Hearing Officer did not admit the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence because it was not timely moved into evidence by Mr. Fergerstrom. Mr. Fergerstrom filed his "Motion to move all documents in evidentiary hearing submittals, identified by letter 'D' in to evidence" on March 6, 2017 [Doc. No. 494] ("March 6

¹ Mr. Fergerstrom filed a second motion to reconsider, <u>inter alia</u>, Minute Order No. 44, on April 26, 2017 [Doc. No. 566]. The second motion to reconsider raises similar arguments to those raised in the instant Motion. Nevertheless, for clarity of the record, TIO will submit a separate response to Mr. Fergerstrom's second motion to reconsider by the deadline to do so.

Motion"). Notably, Mr. Fergerstrom failed to move the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence as part of his motion. See generally March 6 Motion.

Likely aware of his own neglect, Mr. Fergerstrom later filed his "Clarification of items identified as evidentiary submittals under letter 'D' to be moved into evidence (Doc 494)" on March 18, 2017 [Doc. No. 515] ("Clarification"). Mr. Fergerstrom's Clarification identified the Fergerstrom WDT as one of the exhibits he was moving into evidence. His Clarification, however, was untimely because it was filed eleven days after the March 9, 2017 deadline to move exhibits into evidence. The Hearing Officer, as a result of its untimeliness and as was well within her discretion, did not review or consider Mr. Fergerstrom's Clarification in issuing Minute Order No. 44 [Doc. No. 553]. See Minute Order No. 44 at 6; see also Hawaii Administrative Rules § 13-1-32(c) (providing that the Hearing Officer has the "power to . . . fix times for submitting documents, briefs, and dispose of other matters that normally and properly arise in the course of a hearing authorized by law that are necessary for the orderly and just conduct of a hearing"). Because it was not timely moved upon, Minute Order No. 44 did not admit the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence.

Mr. Fergerstrom recognizes in his Motion that he "ha[s] a responsibility to submit documents in a timely manner." Motion at 2. In contravention of his recognized responsibility, Mr. Fergerstrom did not timely move into evidence the Fergerstrom WDT. In his Motion, Mr. Fergerstrom does not provide any explanation to reasonably excuse his own failure to move the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence as part of his March 6 Motion. The only "good cause" explanation Mr. Fergerstrom provides in the Motion to excuse his failure is that the Fergerstrom WDT was not uploaded to the Documents Library. That claim is incorrect as detailed supra.

Simply stated, Mr. Fergerstrom has not established "good cause" to reasonably excuse his own failure to timely move the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence.

Notwithstanding the foregoing, given that the Fergerstrom WDT appears to have been submitted and uploaded to the Documents Library before the close of the testimony portion of the contested case hearing on March 2, 2017, and was referred to by Mr. Fergerstrom during his oral testimony on January 23, 2017, and in consideration of the "considerably more relaxed" standard that applies to administrative hearings², TIO respectfully submits that it does not object to the admission of the Fergerstrom WDT into evidence as part of this contested case.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, April 28, 2017.

J. DOUGLAS ING BRIAN A. KANG

ROSS T. SHINYAMA

SUMMER H. KAIAWE

Attorneys for TMT INTERNATIONAL

OBSERVATORY LLC

² <u>See Price v. Zoning Bd. of Appeals</u>, 77 Hawaii 168, 176 n. 8, 883 P.2d 629, 637 n. 8 (1994) (citing 4 J. Stein, G. Mitchell & B. Mezines, Administrative Law § 22.01 (1994)).

	Ŷ	Weeking Next		Search:				Fergerstrom opposition to University of Hawaii confirmation of exhibits and direct written testimonies of witnesses to be entered into evidence; Memorandum of support; Motion to recall Mr. Peiry White; COS	C Previous Next		Search:			
Discoveries (October 3, 2016)	Testimony of David M. Callies	ιά			Full title:	Amendments to exhibits of Michael Lee	Written direct testimony of Harry Fergerstrom	Fergerstrom opposition to University of Hawaii confirmation of exhibits and dir into evidence; Memorandum of support, Motion to recall Mr. Perry White, COS	S		And the state of t	♦ Fullinde	List of exhibits.	antal Second supplemental exhibit list
manden millem termina program men kanan yang menan pengan pengan pengan pengan pengan pengan pengan pengan pen	10/11/2016 5-6	Showing 1 to 10 of 66 entries	Harry Forgoretrom (Coring O)	Show 10 • entries	0 #	11/15/2016 Amendments in to exhibits	11/15/2016 Written v direct	12/7/2016 <u>Opposition</u> F	Showing 11 to 13 of 13 entries	Mehana Kihoi (Series F)	Show 10 • entries	Date	19/11/2016 <u>Exhibit list</u>	10/24/2016 <u>Second Supplemental</u> exhibit list

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE OF HAWAI'I

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 BLNR Contested Case HA-16-002

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that the attached document was served upon the following parties by the means indicated:

Michael Cain
Office of Conservation and Coastal
Lands
1151 Punchbowl, Room 131
Honolulu, HI 96813
michael.cain@hawaii.gov
Custodian of the Records
(ORIGINAL + DIGITAL COPY)

Carlsmith Ball LLP
Ian Sandison, Tim Lui-Kwan, John P.
Manaut, Lindsay N. McAneeley
1001 Bishop Street
ASB Tower, Suite 2200
Honolulu, HI 96813
isandison@carlsmith.com
tluikwan@carlsmith.com
jpm@carlsmith.com
Imcaneeley@carlsmith.com
Counsel for the Applicant University
of Hawai'i at Hilo

Torkildson, Katz, Moore,
Hetherington & Harris
Attn: Lincoln S. T. Ashida
120 Pauahi Street, Suite 312
Hilo, HI 96720-3084
Isa@torkildson.com
njc@torkildson.com
Counsel for Perpetuating Unique
Educational Opportunities (PUEO)

Office of Conservation and Coastal Lands dlnr.maunakea@hawaii.gov

Harry Fergerstrom P.O. Box 951 Kurtistown, HI 96760 hankhawaiian@yahoo.com (via email & U.S. mail)

Lanny Alan Sinkin
P. O. Bóx 944
Hilo, HI 96721
lanny.sinkin@gmail.com
Representative for The Temple of
Lono

J. Leina'ala Sleightholm P.O. Box 383035 Waikoloa, HI 96738 leinaala.mauna@gmail.com

Dwight J. Vicente 2608 Ainaola Drive Hilo, Hawaiian Kingdom dwightjvicente@gmail.com (via email & U.S. mail)

Brannon Kamahana Kealoha 89-564 Mokiawe Street Nanakuli, HI 96792 brannonk@hawaii.edu Mehana Kihoi PO Box 393 Honaunau, HI 96726 uhiwai@live.com

C. M. Kaho'okahi Kanuha 77-6504 Maile St Kailua Kona, HI 96740 Kahookahi.kukiaimauna@gmail.com

Maelani Lee PO Box 1054 Waianae, HI 96792 maelanilee@yahoo.com

Kalikolehua Kanaele 4 Spring Street Hilo, HI 96720 akulele@yahoo.com

Stephanie-Malia:Tabbada P O Box 194, Naalehu, HI 96772 s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net

Joseph Kualii Lindsey Camara kualiic@hotmail.com William Freitas PO Box 4650 Kailua Kona, HI 96745 pohaku7@yahoo.com

Flores-Case 'Ohana E. Kalani Flores ekflores@hawaiiantel.net

Tiffnie Kakalia 549 E. Kahaopea St. Hilo, HI 96720 tiffniekakalia@gmail.com

Paul K. Neves kealiikea@yahoo.com

Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou keomaivg@gmail.com

Deborah J. Ward cordylinecolor@gmail.com

Crystal F. West P.O. Box 193 Kapaau, Hawaii 96755 crystalinx@yahoo.com Cindy Freitas PO Box 4650 Kailua Kona, HI 96745 hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com

Glen Kila 89-530 Mokiawe Street Waianae, HI 96792 makakila@gmail.com

B. Pualani Case puacase@hawaiiantel.net

Clarence Kukauakahi Ching kahiwaL@cs.com

Yuklin Aluli, Esq.
415-C Uluniu Street
Kailua, Hawaii 96734
yuklin@kailualaw.com
Co-Counsel for Petitioner
KAHEA: The Hawaiian
Environmental Alliance, a domestic
non-profit Corporation

Wilma H. Holi
P.O. Box 368
Hanapepe, HI 96716
Witness for the Hearing Officer
w_holi@hotmail.com

lvy McIntosh 67-1236 Panale'a Street Kamuela, Hawaii 96743 3popoki@gmail.com Witness for the Hearing Office

Moses Kealamakia Jr. 1059 Puku Street Hilo, Hawaii 96720 mkealama@yahoo.com Witness for the Hearing Officer

Patricia P. Ikeda pheakeanila@gmail.com Witness for the Hearing Officer

Dexter K. Kaiama, Esq. 111 Hekili Street, #A1607 Kailua, Hawaii 96734 cdexk@hotmail.com Co-Counsel for Petitioner KAHEA: The Hawaiian Environmental Alliance, a domestic

non-profit Corporation

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, April 28, 2017.

J. DOUGLAS ING BRIAN A. KANG ROSS T. SHINYAMA SUMMER H. KAIAWE

Attorneys for TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY LLC

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE OF HAWAI'I

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 BLNR Contested Case HA-16-002

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that the attached document was served upon the following parties by the means indicated:

Michael Cain
Office of Conservation and Coastal
Lands
1151 Punchbowl, Room 131
Honolulu, HI 96813
michael.cain@hawaii.gov
Custodian of the Records
(ORIGINAL + DIGITAL COPY)

lan Sandison, Tim Lui-Kwan, John P.

Manaut, Lindsay N. McAneeley

Carlsmith Ball LLP

1001 Bishop Street

Honolulu, HI 96813

jpm@carlsmith.com

of Hawai'i at Hilo

ASB Tower, Suite 2200

isandison@carlsmith.com tluikwan@carlsmith.com

Imcaneeley@carlsmith.com

Counsel for the Applicant University

Office of Conservation and Coastal Lands dlnr.maunakea@hawaii.gov

Harry Fergerstrom P.O. Box 951 Kurtistown, HI 96760 hankhawaiian@yahoo.com (via email & U.S. mail)

Lanny Alan Sinkin
P. O. Box 944
Hilo, HI 96721
lanny.sinkin@gmail.com
Representative for The Temple of
Lono

J. Leina'ala Sleightholm P.O. Box 383035 Waikoloa, HI 96738 leinaala.mauna@gmail.com

Torkildson, Katz, Moore, Hetherington & Harris Attn: Lincoln S. T. Ashida 120 Pauahi Street, Suite 312 Hilo, HI 96720-3084 Isa@torkildson.com njc@torkildson.com Counsel for Perpetuating Unique Educational Opportunities (PUEO) Dwight J. Vicente 2608 Ainaola Drive Hilo, Hawaiian Kingdom dwightjvicente@gmail.com (via email & U.S. mail)

Brannon Kamahana Kealoha 89-564 Mokiawe Street Nanakuli, HI 96792 brannonk@hawaii.edu Mehana Kihoi PO Box 393 Honaunau, HI 96726 uhiwai@live.com

C. M. Kaho'okahi Kanuha 77-6504 Maile St Kailua Kona, HI 96740 Kahookahi.kukiaimauna@gmail.com

Maelani Lee PO Box 1054 Waianae, HI 96792 maelanilee@yahoo.com

Kalikolehua Kanaele 4 Spring Street Hilo, HI 96720 akulele@yahoo.com

Stephanie-Malia:Tabbada P O Box 194, Naalehu, HI 96772 s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net

Joseph Kualii Lindsey Camara kualiic@hotmail.com

William Freitas PO Box 4650 Kailua Kona, HI 96745 pohaku7@yahoo.com

Flores-Case 'Ohana E. Kalani Flores ekflores@hawaiiantel.net

Tiffnie Kakalia 549 E. Kahaopea St. Hilo, HI 96720 tiffniekakalia@gmail.com

Paul K. Neves kealiikea@yahoo.com

Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou keomaivg@gmail.com

Deborah J. Ward cordylinecolor@gmail.com

Crystal F. West P.O. Box 193 Kapaau, Hawaii 96755 crystalinx@yahoo.com Cindy Freitas PO Box 4650 Kailua Kona, HI 96745 hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com

Glen Kila 89-530 Mokiawe Street Waianae, HI 96792 makakila@gmail.com

B. Pualani Case puacase@hawaiiantel.net

Clarence Kukauakahi Ching kahiwaL@cs.com

Yuklin Aluli, Esq.
415-C Uluniu Street
Kailua, Hawaii 96734
yuklin@kailualaw.com
Co-Counsel for Petitioner
KAHEA: The Hawaiian
Environmental Alliance, a domestic

Environmental Alliance, a domesti non-profit Corporation

Wilma H. Holi P.O. Box 368 Hanapepe, HI 96716 Witness for the Hearing Officer

w_holi@hotmail.com

Ivy McIntosh 67-1236 Panale'a Street Kamuela, Hawaii 96743 3popoki@gmail.com Witness for the Hearing Officer

Moses Kealamakia Jr. 1059 Puku Street Hilo, Hawaii 96720 mkealama@yahoo.com Witness for the Hearing Officer

Patricia P. Ikeda pheakeanila@gmail.com Witness for the Hearing Officer

Dexter K. Kaiama, Esq. 111 Hekili Street, #A1607 Kailua, Hawaii 96734 cdexk@hotmail.com Co-Counsel for Petitioner KAHEA: The Hawaiian

Environmental Alliance, a domestic

non-profit Corporation

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, May 3, 2017.

J.DOUGLAS ING BRIAN A. KANG

ROSS T. SHINYAMA

SUMMER H. KAIAWE

Attorneys for TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY LLC