

GAME MANAGEMENT ADVISORY COMMISSION MEETING

DATE: August 20, 2018
TIME: 10:00 AM
PLACE: Room 322, Kalanimoku Building, 1151 Punchbowl Street, Honolulu, HI 96813
PURPOSE: Game Management Advisory Commission Meeting (#7)

MINUTES

ITEM 1. Call to order, introductions of members, staff, and visitors; request for move-ups on the agenda.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

Lori Buchanan—Molokai (Vice Chair)
Robert Cremer—Kauai
Josiah Jury—Oahu
Ryan Kohatsu—East Hawaii
Robert Masuda—Representative of the Chair of DLNR
Stanley Ruidas—Lanai

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:

Jefferey DeRego—Maui
Nancy Timko—Oahu

STAFF (DOFAW):

Jim Cogswell
Shane DeMattos
Dr. Shaya Honarvar
Lindsey Ibara
Thomas Kaiakapu
John Medeiros
Joey Mello
Jason Misaki
Dietra Myers-Tremblay
Jason Omick
Ryan Peralta
Kanal Sproat
Nicholas Vargas
Michael Walker
Sarah Way

VISITORS:

Pooya Motlagh, Waianae Hunters Association
James K Manaku, Sr
Meeke Breault, for Representative Tupola
Ben Gates, for Representative Gates
State Senator Maile Shimabukuro
Representative Ryan Yamane

Commissioner Masuda: In talking to Lori this morning, I suggested that since Jon is not here this morning and he was the Chair, that instead of our trying to work through and hustling an election today, we should work on filling this commission first. Which means we'll get someone on the West Hawaii position, the Maui representative has not been, I understand, known for attendance, so we will work on maybe working with that person to resign and filling that position with someone who can attend regularly. Since I'm representing the Chair, I'm going to take the prerogative of working with the vice chair and we both co facilitate today's meeting, just work through the agenda and have it more as a discussion so that we can get everything on the table, hear from all of the people that have concerns, and we're graced today by one of the senators I respect the most in the Senate from ten years ago when you were a representative, Maile I know you worked so hard for Waianae. I've always respected you and love your work in the Senate, so thank you for joining us today. I know you have serious concerns and we want to hear all these things. So, I come from a background of not being an expert in this field, I will lay that right out there. The only wildlife I know is all the wildlife I love running around Big Island or when I go Kauai or Maui, wherever. And so we have experts in the room, all of our wildlife staff and our headquarters wildlife staff are here. Both Jim and Shaya are here. They have the academic and experiential background. And my good friends from the field are here, including from Waimea and Hilo. And Dave Smith has a pre-assigned meeting today, he sends his regrets. Dave is a longtime confidant and colleague of mine who I've worked with since 2005 and while I was with the Forest Service as senior advisor. Dave will be attending all the meetings on a regular basis, today he has the four district managers from the four districts meeting on a pre-set meeting, so he has to go there first. And his role will be as my key advisor on wildlife since he administers DOFAW and the commission relates to DOFAW. And Jim and Shaya who work with Dave on the wildlife section will be our go-to people in regards to specific technicalities and experiences and scientific background, and all of that kind of stuff. My hope is that we can, as a full team with all the representatives from all the islands here, work on moving some of this stuff that I know I'm going to hear about today. We do have minutes that were sent out? Lori, you want to call for approval of the minutes?

Commissioner Buchanan: Sure, I can do that. Aloha everybody, welcome Senator, thank you, nice to see you. Before we do the minutes, I wanted to ask the commissioners if they have any amendments to the agenda, any requests for move ups in the agenda. Okay, Josiah, seeing none, we can move on.

ITEM 2. Action Required: Approval of minutes from May 31, 2018 GMAC meeting.

Commissioner Buchanan: Commissioners, are there any corrections to the minutes? Did everyone get the minutes?

All commissioners respond that they received the May 31, 2018 minutes.

Commissioner Buchanan: There was a lot of discussion, and I wanted to thank staff for the verbatim minutes, I appreciate that, I always do. It's very telling. If there are no corrections or amendments, do I have a motion to accept the draft minutes that were submitted.

Commissioner Cremer: Motion to accept.

Commissioner Masuda: Seconded.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you. Any discussion?

Commissioner Cremer: I'd like everybody to reflect on the section where Senate President Kouchi referred to how things are going as far as this commission. I think we're still running into a roadblock. I hope Bob can help us sitting here next to us. But, I think Jon would be sitting at this table today if we weren't hitting our heads against a wall. He'd make room to do things and be on this board. I just think we need to work together and until now I see none of that, and Senator Kouchi sees that, and he and I work well together. We don't want it to go to where he has to put things in legislation, and I talked to him again and he said he will. So I just hope we can work together and come to common ground. I don't want it all on our side, the hunters and the gatherers and all those people. I'd just like us to come together and collaborate on common ground, and I'd like you guys to reflect on what Senator Kouchi said, because I think what he said at the meeting on Kauai is important. That's all I've got to say.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you Commissioner Cremer. So paying special attention to a portion within the minutes. Any more discussion from members? Okay, seeing none, there's a motion on the floor, all those in favor raise their right hand.

Commissioner Kohatsu: Do I have to vote on that, because I wasn't at the meeting.

Commissioner Masuda: As long as you read the minutes...

Commissioner Buchanan: Are you familiar with the minutes?

Commissioner Masuda: I read the minutes, so I feel like a member of the commission with the right to vote as did anyone else who was absent. I think the responsible thing is to have read the minutes, and the vote is to determine whether you agree with the minutes or not, not whether you were present or not. So if you're calling for the vote, I'm ready to vote.

Commissioner Buchanan: Commissioner Kohatsu, you can decline, but thank you for being forward on the record saying that you were not present at the meeting on Kauai. And so it's your prerogative to vote or not vote or abstain. Abstain vote is a vote in favor, or is a yes vote, and a no vote is a no vote. So the motion on the floor is to accept the minutes of the May 31st meeting on Kauai, all those in favor raise their right hand...

All vote in favor.

Commissioner Buchanan: Unanimous, motion carried. Thank you. Moving on to ITEM 3, we're going to table item number three, per request from the Chair's office, and you heard the discussion earlier. So we're going to table ITEM 3, selection of a new commission Chair. Any commissioner, since it's on the agenda, do you guys have feedback on ITEM 3? Anyone opposed to tabling that discussion?

Commissioner Ruidas: I've got a question. Commissioner Ruidas. We're going to table that, how fast can we get those slots filled?

Commissioner Masuda: Probably at least two or three weeks, I think, would be fast, but clearly before the next meeting. This meeting is held, I understand, every other month?

Commissioner Ruidas: Yeah, somewhat. The reason why I ask is because, you know, some things take six months.

Commissioner Masuda: Let me put it this way. You can judge me on my performance by the next meeting. I will tell you that I will make it a priority to have the two unfilled positions filled, and then we can have a full commission. I'm not going to waste my time coming here unless we're going to get some work done.

Commissioner Ruidas: Yes, thank you. Because the Maui guys, they always tell me something and I cannot...

Commissioner Masuda: We can judge by their performance. And I would also, in responding to you, say that I appreciated you commenting on Senate President Kouchi's comments. I read them very carefully, I understand how things work, I think. I think I'm old enough to understand how things work. And I appreciate their interest in the work of this commission, because that's what I read it as, an interest. I don't like to read threats, so I don't take it as a threat, I take it as a point of sincere interest on the part of the senate to help those who are interested in game management and the field to have the support of the senate, and I consider that a wonderful thing. We move on from there, and we hope that as a commission we can work together and make things happen. So I'm kind of where you're coming from on that.

Commissioner Cremer: Thank you.

Commissioner Masuda: Just for the record. And Lori and I get along very well, we've worked together...

Commissioner Buchanan: We serve on other commissions together, other alliances. But on ITEM 3, the selection of a new commission chair, you heard Deputy Masuda say on the record that he would want that selection pending the

filling of the vacant seats, which is the Kona seat and also the Maui seat. That seat will be filled immediately by an interim position, so I would encourage anyone who thinks that they would be great representation from Kona side and from Maui to please urge this commission to put their name forward, or else call the Deputy's office.

Commissioner Masuda: Yes, and if anyone is interested they need to fill out an application, which can be found online. We cannot move any commission approval forward until they fill out the application, so we're encouraging anybody who's interested to complete the application.

Commissioner Buchanan: And don't sit on it, because you heard Bob say it's going to be for the next meeting.

Commissioner Cremer: Question. So it's safe to say that I can make a motion that if we don't have people involved by then we can select a Chair then?

Commissioner Masuda: I would think so.

Commissioner Cremer: Even if those positions aren't filled?

Commissioner Masuda: Yeah, we're just tabling the action of having an election until the next meeting to give us time to fill the two vacancies, that's all.

Commissioner Cremer: And if the result is that those two positions are not filled by the next meeting, which is in October...

Commissioner Masuda: Well the motion is simply to table the action until the next meeting, which then means that the action is effective the next meeting.

Commissioner Cremer: Okay, thank you.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay, thank you. Any more discussion on ITEM 3?

Commissioner Masuda: I'd like to interrupt, Madam Vice Chair, to acknowledge Representative Yamane's presence, we appreciate him joining us this morning, thank you.

Commissioner Jury: With that, could we take some time for introductions for everybody to say who they are, where they're from, who they're representing?

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay, hang on. Just for the record, we are tabling ITEM 3 and there's no more discussion on ITEM 3.

All present introduce themselves.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you very much. Thank you for coming, people, we really appreciate it. So, moving on to ITEM 4.

ITEM 4. Update on the letter that was submitted to the Board of Land and Natural Resources regarding the Commission's advice on the Wai'anae mountains aerial shooting for the control of feral goats.

Commissioner Buchanan: Shaya, do you have an official update?

Commissioner Masuda: If I might? We reviewed the letter, I understand that our staff and concerned people from Waianae had a chance to work out the elements in the letter. Josiah, you want to talk about what you guys did to resolve the concerns expressed in the letter?

Commissioner Jury: Well, I think at this point, all the people and the Senator and representatives want an update on the letter. We all worked toward it, so we just want to know where we stand with it at this point.

Commissioner Masuda: Okay, in response, if you want a written response, I guess I will go back to the office and write a written response. My understanding, and our response to the letter, is that our staff has worked with the people who were concerned about the issue and that the resolution has taken place on the ground.

Commissioner Jury: That's not totally true. I think this commission has pointed out, and we have voted, and we just wanted to allow the letter to be heard by the BLNR, and it states within the letter what the feelings are and the directive of what the hunting community would like to see, and there is an ongoing proposal with the Waianae Hunting Association and the Oahu DOFAW, but this letter is a totally separate framework and paperwork.

Commissioner Masuda: Okay. On behalf of the Chair's office, I would say that I've read the letter in consultation with our DOFAW administration, and from what I've understood to have taken place I am satisfied that the concerns expressed in the letter were addressed.

Commissioner Jury: I'd just like to say that the main focus of the letter was trying to get a proper game management plan for the goats in the Waianae mountain range, especially those on top of the public hunting area, and I think this concern came up through every agenda on this GMAC and has been one of the foremost issues that we've had. I'm grateful for the rest of the representatives for being patient, because this has been on every agenda. At the end of the day, we want to have our concern heard by the BLNR and it's been over six months back and forth of at least the letter being voted on and moving forward. So myself as the Oahu commissioner, I thought we went up the right avenue to get the letter on the Board of Land and Natural Resources' agenda to be heard, and we're just looking for the update that we've been asking for for the last three meetings.

Commissioner Masuda: Okay, in reviewing the letter with the Chair, we felt that it was more important for us to respond to the concerns and address the concerns, and given that the concerns had to do with how the game management process was dealt with on this commission and having the Chair's office be involved actively with this... Because if it goes to the Board and is heard by the Board, the action still has to be taken operationally within the Department. And I agreed with the Chair that probably the best thing to do was to take action directly, and that if she agreed, I would be willing to serve on this commission as the Chair's office representative, which means that you now have a response directly from the Chair's office, in having the Chair's office directly represented here to work on developing an appropriate game management plan and listening to the concerns from the public and from the representatives involved, and take action. So my role here is first, to listen to everybody and to work with all of you, and since I have a direct responsibility for supervision for all the divisions, that I can work directly with our divisions and with the commission in making sure we can move forward with appropriate action to deal with the concerns. So that is already taking action rather than just having another hearing. So our response to your letter is to have the First Deputy of the Department engage in the direct actions of the Game Management Advisory Commission, and work with you in coming up with a plan to deal with our game management concerns. We read in the letter the concern that game management plans have been delayed for a long time, and so our response is—as I discussed with the Hilo folks and Ryan can share with you later—to responsibly take action in working directly with the commission and the hunter community in coming up with game management plans. So if that's not what you want, you can tell me that, I am happy not to be here and just to hear the letter at the Board and have the Board take whatever action it might want to take. We thought that you might be happy with the Chair's office being involved in working directly with you in advancing game management plans. If that's not the case, then tell me.

Commissioner Buchanan: Deputy, if I can interject? This game commission started over a year ago back in June, and I believe every discussion on this commission had two things. One was game management plans were an issue, and I'm speaking and taking into consideration that I did see an email from wildlife biologist Ryan Peralta. And in that letter they did try to address two things, and I appreciate the Chair's office being involved, I really do, but what I saw—and there's multiple issues—was the Department trying to help the Waianae community and Commissioner Jury by first saying that they would put a moratorium on aerial shooting. The moratorium on aerial shooting in the letter is just that, and there was an end date of I believe January 2019, where I guess at that point in time there would be a reconsideration. The letter to the Board of Land and Natural Resources addressed a larger issue, which was using aerial shooting as a management tool. This commission, and I have to go back and look, but I believe that this commission took a stand that

aerial shooting from a helicopter was not a management tool that we were in support of. So that is the issue that we wanted to take up with the Board, and the Board action that this commission wanted to see was that the Department of Land and Natural Resources would not use aerial shooting as a tool. So I sit here as the cultural seat, and I have testified earlier on this board, and I didn't want to be the cultural seat but I guess they put us in here, we needed one—and I look at Mr. Manaku is sitting here and he was sitting here in June, and he's been at the Oahu meetings, and he asked us a great question. That question went into the legislative report last year. The question was: If the Department continues to eradicate his wild resources that he uses for subsistence, what would the Department do to make up that loss for him? Because we would be regulating his practice as a subsistence gatherer out of existence, which is adverse to the law. And the Department has never answered that question, and there's never been a population assessment out of the Waianae aerial shooting plan. And so if you don't know how much game you have, how can you tell Mr. Manaku, how are we going to ensure his practice in perpetuity? So that was the bigger overarching question for the Board, because this commission already took a stance that we were not in support of aerial shooting as a tool. So you can see how Mr. Peralta's email to the Waianae Board is in conflict. So the conflict is that there's no resolution saying that aerial shooting will not be used as a tool, and if it's not going to be used as a tool then I believe this commission wants confirmation as to the scientific protocol other than using sign-in stations as a valid scientific response to measure population density within his ahupua'a where he lives. So that has been one year, and that question has never been answered, nor has that question been vetted other than within this commission right here, and it remains a real concern. I am not a recreational hunter, I'm a subsistence gatherer, there's a difference. I sit here with many recreational hunters; I am not a recreational hunter, so for me, that is a very important issue. So that is one issue which should be addressed by a game management plan, and so that's the building blocks. We wanted to make sure that the Board was aware of it. Now that the Chair's office is here, the Chair's office can be aware of it. There can be some resolution at least for Waianae, but we still have to answer that question statewide. Because it is an issue in East and West Hawaii. My understanding from the goat eradication on Mauna Kea to Watershed Partnerships—which we all support by the way, and it could be an issue of prioritization, I don't know what it is—it stemmed from us giving priority to the Waianae watershed in our discussion starting with this commission back in June, and it still has not been resolved. So that's where I believe we are, I can see some headway, but Josiah, if anything I said is adverse to what you believe to be the current situation, I don't think that's the resolution we were looking for, just a moratorium. Which is good, because we're not going to have aerial shooting for two months, but what's going to happen at the end of those two months? Nobody set a schedule of meetings, we tried to get a schedule of meetings set between the Waianae community and the Department where they could have somebody facilitating to come up with a resolution of what management tools where, and then there were issues with the Board of Water Supply... There was an issue that there was not a fence, that aerial shooting was occurring in open areas, so that's another issue. And then, again, what is the population count? There were multiple issues. Josiah, do you have anything to add?

Commissioner Jury: No, I totally agree, Representative Lori, and I think addressing those issues comes back down to yes, there is some consensus being made that has been worked toward by our own legislators that have been in support of this commission, but in terms of the big picture, it is the proper game management plan that we've been pushing, and if the Department or the Chair's office has been informed about what's going on, we would really welcome you to come out and talk more story with me or the Waianae Hunting Association and being more involved, but at the end of the day, our capacity as a commission is to advise the BLNR and that's what we've been trying to do for a while now with this letter. So when we come to the update on the letter, it's for the hunting community, the leeward coast, and the people who have seen this and put trust in this commission. A lot of frustration has been coming up over the last year over it, but I think they believe in this commission and allowing this commission to do its work and the process it takes, but we'd really like the letter to be heard.

Commissioner Masuda: Is there an Oahu game management commission?

Commissioner Jury: There is no Oahu game management commission. There's a coalition of associations and clubs that come together, but as for an Oahu game management commission, no.

Commissioner Masuda: Because I know there is a game management commission for Hawaii County. Is there one for Maui or Kauai? No? Okay, so only Hawaii County has one.

Commissioner Jury: Just to bring the level to our standard, we have multiple town hall meetings and neighborhood board meetings, close to a dozen, and DLNR, and they're addressing those concerns, but again it comes back down to sustainable yield and understanding that there is going to be a population for the future.

Commissioner Masuda: So what I'm hearing you say, Commissioner Josiah, is that the priority for this commission is to work on, establish, and have agreed on an approved game management plan for statewide that helps to help give direction so that there is a wildlife management plan for birds or game or whatever.

Commissioner Jury: I think that's definitely the issue and I think that's definitely a concern of the hunters in general across the state, but in Waianae specifically, the hunting community wants to assist and want to help manage the population there, but they need this proper game management plan as a baseline to start contributing, you know?

Commissioner Masuda: Okay, I understand the need for plans, needs to be worked out, but I also understand that you as a representative for Waianae, along with Mr. Peralta, have met and have worked on a temporary agreement on how to resolve the past situation so that it gives us a couple of months to work on something.

Commissioner Jury: Yeah, I think Ryan and myself, the Oahu DOFAW have been working together on what we were able to conclude and move forward on at that level, but in terms of the letter, it's at the level of the BLNR, and that's their directive and what they want to give. So I think at the Oahu branch level we're definitely there, we're talking all the time, and we're seeing what kind of stuff we can give and take with the hunting community, but it all comes back down to this letter.

Commissioner Masuda: Well, in reading the letter, both Chair Case and I determined that what you guys were really looking for is some action on working on developing a game management plan. So rather than taking it through a Board of Land and Natural Resources hearing process and all that, we decided that we'd work with you on developing a game management plan, and to help make that happen, the Chair and I decided that I would be appointed to represent the Chair's office directly in this Game Management Advisory Commission to help make that happen, and that's why I'm here. The Chair felt that the action has been waiting for a long time, this issue has been ongoing for a period of time, and we wanted to respond to it actively, so that's why I'm here.

Commissioner Jury: So would it be fair to say that you spoke with the Chair and discussed this issue, and you felt no further action of aerial control would be done in this particular area until we conclude about the game management plan.

Commissioner Masuda: Until we have a chance to work with you and others in Waianae, along with our Oahu district folks, taking a look at what you might recommend to this commission...

Commissioner Jury: Before we move forward to any other DLNR project...

Commissioner Masuda: I'd like to see whatever you guys recommend be considered by this commission, discussed as a commission with folks that are interested, and come up with a plan of action that could be incorporated as part of a state-wide game management plan. And that begins to move the idea of having a game management plan forward. The Chair and I felt that you guys deserve a push to us having some action, and that's why I'm here.

Commissioner Cremer: The reason this commission came about is for collaboration throughout the islands and the state, because we have been barking, screaming, yelling, pulling hair and teeth to have a game management plan that is sustainable for our state. Every island will need to have a different plan, every island is different, we can't have one general plan for the whole state, it's got to be separate. Every island is different in climate, game population, critical habitat, birds, plants, whatever it is. And we all came to the state capitol for several years and lobbied and lobbied. He was one of the main guys with Ron Kouchi and the other guys, Senator Rhoads, whoever else was there. I remember going door to door, because for me, I'm 52, I've lived off of game meat all my life—lots of times there wouldn't have been food on the table if my dad never hunted. Lots of times there wouldn't be fish on the table if my dad never hunted, because there was a trade. My grandkids still eat the same way. Every year, at least a thousand pounds of game meat go on the table of everybody, whether it be smoked meat for parties, somebody need a fat pig for kalua; this is home for

me. Being able to have a sustainable game management plan, that's the reason this commission came about. Ryan can tell you, they've been trying to get a game management plan for over 10 years, it's been sitting in DLNR and Wildlife, never took place. That's the reason we want to go in front of the Land Board. It hurts me inside, because I worry about what Hawaii will be like as far as being sustainable. During a hurricane, we never had food on Kauai at the beginning. I go down to the beach, I spot [indiscernible], I tell a guy. Guys get pig meat, we trade, we share in our neighborhood. We never have freezers or coolers in the beginning, but it's about sustainability, and this is really home for me as far as getting a game management plan. And I hope, if you guys are going to make that promise—and I never met you before, and I don't know what you're like, but I've dealt with administration before and I've got a sour taste in my mouth to be truthful...

Commissioner Masuda: I hope I can make it sweet again.

Commissioner Cremer: I appreciate that. I'm done.

Commissioner Masuda: May I respond? I've heard your feelings and I share the fact that what you've been able to—and I've heard this, because I've worked with hunters on the island of Hawaii from the Forest Service point of view, in terms of working together on how we can maintain our forests and our wildlife and all of that together. I'm a local boy, I have no problem with eating all the stuff that my friends, since I don't hunt anymore and can't, I'm too out of shape for that and for diving, but all my life for over 60 years I've hunted and fished too. So I appreciate and I can empathize, I can feel what you feel. And because of our concern for your sustainable practices and the fact that sustainable hunting and fishing on my island home on Hawaii is a very important thing, and we care about this. That's part of the reason why I volunteered to take on this assignment very willingly. I don't feel like it's fair to have a rhetorical plan for 10 years, I think that's enough. Chair Case and I both feel that it's time that we begin to move on this, and I plan to move on this. All of my wildlife folks here all feel like I do, and we will work together, our wildlife staff and hunting community will work together, it's not a question. And we're going to come up with some draft plans that hopefully all of you... and as commissioners from each island, I hope you take an active leadership role on each island, in each county, to come up with county drafts that can together make up a statewide plan. At this point, from this meeting forward, I can talk with you about what we do or what we don't do. My history is not with managing make believe things, I don't like that. I can tell you that my professional career has been clearly, I think, one of getting things done, and our governor and our Chair have a Sustainable Hawaii plan, we believe that hunting and gathering rights are an important part of the whole plan, and I'm here to work with you and with our hunting community and DOFAW staff together to work out a clear, well-thought out plan. That's what I can promise you from today forward. I won't even begin to argue our history with you, because I've not been part of it, and it would be BS for me to do that. I don't want to get involved in BS stuff. So I can promise you that we will work forward to get a game management plan done. I think we can get going with a wildlife plan for birds, we can get going after that with a wildlife plan for ungulates, in the meanwhile, I hope you will all agree with me that water and watershed is also important, and how we deal with things that prohibit the protection of our watershed is also important. From what I understand from reading all of the material, the control of the further destruction of any forest in Waianae by ungulates is part of the concern, so I want to hear and get your guidance on this too, because I think we would agree that the forest to return to Waianae, because as we get the forest back to Waianae, hopefully the rain will also come and gather around the forest. So all I can say Ryan is that we have to work together on this.

Commissioner Cremer: As far as making a game management plan, I don't think we should start with birds. Birds don't feed people like goats and pigs and deer. I think we should start with ungulates first for the wildlife management plan, because how many people eat birds versus how many people eat deer, pigs, and goats? Just my suggestion to the...

Commissioner Masuda: Why don't we hold on our own opinions until we begin to have a working opportunity and a working session to gather all of your thoughts and begin to organize it so that we can move together in formulating a plan.

Commissioner Cremer: That sounds good.

Commissioner Masuda: A good plan is not just a product of a bunch of people writing to each other, whether it's from the administration or the users themselves. A good plan is a product of deliberate work done by all the participants and those who are interested. And I'm here to make sure that those who have an interest—especially including our representatives and senators because we need your support in making this stuff happen, and we're delighted that both of our key people are here today... but we will work together. And in fact, Shaya, I'd like to make sure that whenever we have a working group meeting with our commissioners and hunters and staff, that we let both Senator Shimabukuro and Representative Yamane know, so if they want to come they can get in.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you deputy. Anyone else have anything on that?

Commissioner Masuda: You know, we need some time to get to know each other, because you don't know me and I don't know you. I know Lori some, because we've worked together on some critical issues, and I know her brother very well because we're good friends and believe in the same kinds of things on justice, so I'm good for pau hana time too, and I like smoked meat...

Commissioner Buchanan: We need animals to smoke meat.

Commissioner Masuda: Just off the top of my head, I can tell you that the amount of goats I see on my way to the airport from Waimea to Kona all the time, I hope you guys will help to get rid of some of these goats, because I hate for another car accident to happen because of the tons of goats we have. You know, the department doesn't have a problem with you guys harvesting a lot of goats, I don't think. Jim, are we protecting goats?

James Manaku Sr.: There is a limit to what we can take. If we take more than that limit we get arrested.

Commissioner Masuda: Maybe we need to address this kind of stuff. If there is a state regulation that says you can only take half a goat or whatever...

James Manaku Sr.: One goat.

Commissioner Buchanan: It's called bag limit.

Commissioner Masuda: If there's a bag limit on goats then we need to talk about this.

James Manaku Sr.: You make a lot of people happy.

Commissioner Masuda: Well I'm not saying that to make you happy, I'm saying that to look at whatever I think is reasonable.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you, Deputy. Every time we talk about game management, I see all the DLNR staff start squirming, because they know and I know that there is a state forestry plan, every forestry has a plan, ever forest reserve has a plan, there are plans on top of plans. And then you have the NARS, so Natural Area Reserve comes in with their own jurisdiction and their own needs and protection, and we all know how funding goes, whether it's through the Farm Bill or USDA and those types of relationships within the Department, and birds, because guess what? All the money comes from the Feds for birds, so that's why birds have a priority—I'll just say that straight up—within those management plans, because that's the purse strings. So having a plan is not the issue, we have plans. How those plans affect each other is an issue within the Department. There is a disconnect between Forestry and NARS. There is a disconnect between jurisdiction. There is money wasted when you don't have a fence and you do open aerial shooting. From the maka'ainana's perspective, from the outside looking in, you know everybody tends to scratch their heads because they cannot figure out what the Department is doing, because it's totally in conflict with common sense kind of stuff. Being that we've been here a year, we really appreciate that we can be on the fast track now to coming up with a resolution. And with credit to Administrator Smith, in every meeting he did say "meet with your representatives, meet with your wildlife biologist, that's where you start," so I give him credit for that. So each commissioner has to take the kuleana to go the extra mile, to organize on their own islands.

Commissioner Masuda: And have those meetings been going on? I know Ryan has met with Josiah.

Commissioner Buchanan: Well, ITEM 7, the report by commissioners should cover that, because they're encouraged to meet with their biologists. We did request that the NARS people also be privy to these meetings, because sometimes those jurisdictions and those management mandates overlap. And the hunters get caught in the middle.

Commissioner Masuda: May I just say that starting today with my joining you as a commissioner for game management—I don't know if this is going to be for the first time, but—I am also going to continue my service as a commissioner on the NARS commission, so I will be serving on both and there will be a connection with both. So it's not an issue of trees and guns, or trees and wildlife, or trees and pigs, or whatever, it's going to be a work together to preserve our natural and cultural resources.

Commissioner Buchanan: Yeah, and it could just come down to where you put a fence or where you don't put a fence.

Commissioner Masuda: That's why Chair Case and I look forward to working with you, because we depend on... you need to know what's going on on the ground if you want to have a statewide leadership and statewide planning. We count on people on the ground, whether you're fishing or hunting. And I can assure you that I have a lot of relationships with people on the ground on my own, but I'd like to, in the formal state process, work with all of you who officially represent people on the ground.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you deputy. Commissioners, do you guys have any discussion on ITEM 4 before I open it up to members of the public, because it is an agenda item? Okay, seeing none, are there any members of the public wishing to testify on ITEM 4? State your name for the record, thank you.

James Manaku Sr.: Hello, thank you, and before I state my name I'd just like to make a disclaimer, I'm not here to represent people that don't want to subsist from game animals, I support them. In saying that, aloha, my name is James Manaku Sr., concerned parent, grandparent, great grandparent, cultural subsistence practitioner. My concern is that, first of all, I'd like to make a correction—the people that are going to make the decision across the street don't do that. Because let me share history with you folks. Everybody knows what they call Indians, yeah? But you know the Indians, when they first were conquered they promised them this today. The problem is tomorrow. You folks aren't going to be sitting here, so the concern and compassion that you have now may not carry on to the next people. I like his idea of better management so that the future generations can all have that opportunity, and not only a subsistence practitioner. I have nothing against anybody who's not Hawaiian going into the mountain and getting food, I'm not against that. I'm against commercialism, I think we need to look into that. Because you get people shooting our game, our pigs, and then... before they never used to give them away, but now I heard they're trying to give them away to homeless people. So my concern is, again, the ungulates are not the problem. To give you an example: they're going to make this enclosure at Kuaokala, they're going to gather all the snails they can find and put them inside there. Not one pig, not one goat, not one deer got into the enclosure, and guess what? They've got the Jackson's chameleon, they're pets! You go in Nu'uaniu and there are choke chameleons all over the forest. You look in this Jackson chameleon's mouth, he had two snails in there. You guys spend money on the ungulates but you guys don't spend money on the pests that come out of our pet shops. You know the birds, guess what they eat? The same thing all birds eat, they compete. Nobody's shooting them. Have you seen all the parrots we have in the mountain? They attack our birds. How come there's no concern for that? Why are we shooting the meat that we need to put on our table but let all of these things happen right in front of us? I know you guys don't go in the mountain, but I go there so much, and they're so prevalent—this is what's happening! It's not the people who are there, it's all of these things coming out of our pet shops that people feel sorry for and let loose. You folks need to address pet problems. And like we were saying, there is a bag limit, and we could have prevented this if you would allow us to go beyond that, because I have a lot of friends that I give smoked meat to that don't hunt. My neighbors, they get something and they always share. That was the way it was in the old days. If I had more than what I needed I gave it out. But I'm worried about what's happening, I'm worried that we're going to allow commercialism, and that's probably going to kill the game. Hikers, people on bicycles, they're going to infiltrate our mountain. They don't want to be run over by our dogs, they don't want to bang into pigs, they don't want to be hit by goats running away from us, and if you're going to go hunting you know goats are not [indiscernible], you have to worry about them, because if you wound a goat, especially a big one, they're probably going

to sneak up on you. And what he's going to try to do is take you with him. You know, that's what they do. But anyway, I'm asking you guys as a concerned parent, grandparent, and great grandparent of our future generations—have you guys seen my picture? I brought a picture to our board meeting one time, I'm blessed with five children, I have 26 grandchildren and now 5 great grandchildren—what's going to happen to them? And please don't say you guys are going to make a decision, like they'll give us something, no need. Just leave the animals there, we'll go get them ourselves. Nobody has to pay anything. So I'm not sure what you guys are going to do, I'm not sure how you're going to do it, but I'm a hunter, and I can tell you, when you shoot nine goats in one spot, something is wrong. You guys know that? When I shoot one round, and I have 1,000 goats in front of me, "bang!" and they all run. I cannot shoot nine at one time. So something is happening up in the mountains, and I'm worried, because when I walked up there, I don't know what they're doing and you cannot hear what they're doing. And I'm not sure if it's you guys or the military, but I know both of you guys are doing eradication in Makua on both sides of the mountain. So please help us make it safe for our future generations. And you know, look at me—I'm not pure Hawaiian, I'm Portuguese, Irish as well, and all of us are mixed, I'm not looking at one of us, I'm looking at all of us, and I'm looking at the old ways. If you get more than what you need, share with your neighbors, because when they get something, they'll share with us. So thank you very much for allowing me to speak.

Commissioner Masuda: Thank you. I've heard you speak in the legislature and I've always respected your tenaciousness. And I remember when we used to gather limu or fish or whatever, we'd always got to the old folks first, but you know what, nobody came to my apartment yet...

Commissioner Buchanan: Are there any questions for the testifier, commissioners? Okay, seeing none, is anyone else in the public wishing to testify on this item? Please come up and state your name for the record.

Pooya Motlagh: Aloha everyone, my name is Pooya Motlagh, and I'm the president of the Waianae Hunting Association. I believe it's critical that the Waianae Hunting Association helps out in the management that we're seeking right now. And also, the Waianae Hunting Association doesn't want to be part of an eradication process. We want to keep it sustainable for our future generations. And we also came up with a proposal for the DLNR, and in a nutshell, it's: we need a game management plan, and we need access to these areas. It's super simple, very easy, and it will save them a lot of taxpayers' money. That's all.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you. Any questions for the testifier? I have a question if nobody has a question. How often do you think your association could meet with Department staff, and maybe the Chair's office and Deputy, in order to try and expedite where you're going with all your requests?

Pooya Motlagh: When do you need us there? That fast.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay, awesome. Thank you very much. If there are no other questions, is there anyone else in the public wishing to testify on this item? Senator.

Senator Shimabukuro: I'm very pleased with what Deputy Director Masuda has said. Two things I just wanted to raise though is the timeline for the game management plan. I heard you say that you want to try to beat the January 2019 deadline, because the temporary agreement that was reached exempts all of Kamaile'Unu and Makaha from the aerial shooting until January 2019, and the Waianae Hunting Association and the community are very happy to hear that. However that's fast approaching, so I guess I'd like to propose that if the plan can come out before January, great, and if the plan can not come out before then, would it be possible to extend the moratorium for at least those two areas, maybe until the plan comes out? Because I just already foresee what's going to happen in January if there's no plan and the shooting starts up again, I can see the community getting concerned. The other concern I had was what's going to be the process? Because I can imagine that the key stakeholders here that are going to be trying to come up with this plan would be the hunters, you folks, and then DOFAW. There's a big divide between you on certain issues, and so I'm just wondering how we're going to deal with that. Should there be a body that is the arbitrator, perhaps, or it sounds like what you were saying is that you'd rather keep BLNR out of this, or I'm not sure, so I don't know whether GMAC should be the arbitrator if DOFAW and the hunters can't come to an agreement, or should it be BLNR, or there might need to be... speaking from my perspective, that's often the seat that Representative Yamane and I are dealing with, often a bill

will come up and we have two people on polar opposites testifying, “we oppose,” “we support,” and that’s where the legislature has to come in and try to come up with a bill that’s a compromise between the two sides. And then the Governor has the right to veto, and that’s a whole process, so there might need to be some process, a miniature version of that, for this plan to be finalized. Because having sat in on some of these, I already know...

Commissioner Masuda: I’ll be happy to answer when you’re done.

Senator Shimabukuro: Those are the two things: the timeline, and also the process if there are any kind of points where it’s a dead heat and they just can’t, there’s a wall.

Commissioner Masuda: If I might take a moment to answer? The January timeline is in reference to the Waianae concerns.

Senator Shimabukuro: Yeah, it’s just Waianae.

Commissioner Masuda: Good, because I hope you’re not telling me to get the statewide plan done by January!

Senator Shimabukuro: Oh no, no, no!

Commissioner Masuda: Because the statewide plan will have to respect the concerns and plans from all four districts. And even for Oahu, Waianae is one area, we need to get the other areas on Oahu involved. The way I would envision this is that each of the commissioners here in respect to any planning and any activity and meeting within their island or district would be involved. They would represent the commission. And I will be present at all of those meetings kind of as a facilitator, if you will. I see my role in this center more as a facilitator than as a promoter of a particular point of view. I would count on my wildlife scientists and managers and DOFAW staff people to represent the point of view of science, of what the facts are, and what the DOFAW position is, I would count on them to be advocates of that. And that’s their duty. I would count on the representatives like Josiah for Waianae and some of the hunter friends that he has who are from Waianae to represent that point of view. And then the process would include us getting together, and I know reasonable people exist everywhere. Unreasonable people are everywhere also, but hopefully we can get reasonable people together and make a plan. Representative Yamane, do you have anything you want to add to that?

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you Senator.

Representative Yamane: Glad to be here, nice to see you. I just want to go back into the intent of why the game commission was started, because this was a collaboration that was done at the request of DLNR to bring in the community to work together, not only on the gaming commission but also to address the issue of aerial shooting. So the reason why aerial shooting passed, and we can look into law to make sure it’s very clear, is that we were concerned about the safety and well-being of DOFAW staff that were doing the aerial shooting. So the agreement with them and the previous deputy—we can subpoena him if necessary to make sure that the agreement still stood—was that the hunting community was willing to come in partnership with DLNR, and this has been sitting on the table within this administration for two years now. My understanding at the time, Kauai was up there in regards to having a management plan that could potentially be a template to be used in other communities, however we have seen no movement on it. So what we would like to highlight to everyone here is that during the next legislative session, if there needs to be a re-discussion about game management plans and putting in a timeline, as well as the issue of the validity of aerial shooting, that can also be put on the table, as well as if DLNR does come up with proposed plans and management and needs resources, I would be a strong advocate for that. I believe in the people that work, in the line level staff that goes out there—that’s why we pushed the issue of aerial shooting, to make sure that they’re safe. However, we need those accurate numbers and resources if we want to put it in that direction. The concern that we have is the fact that the hunting community, who wants to be part of addressing this issue, is not consistently being requested. So we’ve heard before from the administration that we’ll get to a plan by 2019. Our concern is, you mentioned the Governor’s Sustainability food plan, which is supposed to be done by 2020, and so you’re saying verbally that that’s part of the process, having food meat sustainability by having that partnership with the hunters. Well, we’re still waiting for that to be fully and validly brought out, so as the administration moves forward into 2019, 2020, or judging from which

administration, the legislature would like to be an active partner. And we encourage all of the groups, we've met with Oahu Pig Hunters several times, so we hear from them because that's part of our jobs as Senators and Representatives to hear from our people in our community. And so what they say loudly is that when they come to this administration it goes into a black hole. And so we would like to see movement forward to put some of these plans into place, because the hunters are a great resource and there are a lot of people committed to making the community and protecting the watershed, so it doesn't have to be a watershed or fence versus that. In the Waianae coast there is very good management, I think people with more resources could expand that management and be a model not only for Hawaii but to the nation. But if we only continue to focus on tree growth and those things... I think it needs to be a combination. Any questions?

Commissioner Cremer: No, thank you very much.

Commissioner Masuda: I want to thank you too.

Representative Yamane: Nice to see you! I haven't seen the Director since the middle of 2017, I don't think I saw you since March of this year... Oh, I saw you on the sidewalk... But I would encourage, bring it up. I don't think it should be hidden. Bring issues like this up to BLNR, that's what BLNR was intended for, that's what the legislature's intent was. Bring up these issues. The game management commission was sat on for I think over ten years. That issue, and I think the timing was right two years ago when we brokered negotiations and compromise at the legislature. And so we at the legislature are asking the DLNR to fulfill their agreement by not only having the ability to do the aerial shooting, but making sure that these management plans are developed, and by our understanding, this is already overdue. Because my understanding when we brokered this two years ago was that the Department promised we would have at least one plan within one year. Now it's two plus years later and we haven't moved forward. So again, if need be, I think that the legislature would entertain that to help push resources and push the priorities of the Department, however we would like it to be where the Department is fully inclusive of the community and that you use this commission, that's why we established it.

Commissioner Masuda: We will come to you in January as a fully included group. And after this meeting, Ryan, you, Josiah, Shaya, and I are going to stay a minute and set a date for when we're going to get together. And let both Representative Yamane and Senator Shimabukuro know every time we have a meeting and where.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you Representative Yamane, thank you for the reminders, because sometimes we have to go back to the intent and where we were, and in good faith, everybody who did make representations at that time should stick to what they said they would do, so I really appreciate that, thank you for bringing that up.

Representative Yamane: Thank you guys, you guys brought out tons of people to come out and work with us on coming up with language, and that's why we're here today: one is to protect our state employees, that was a priority of mine, as well as hearing the voices of you, that's why we're here today.

Commissioner Buchanan: We look forward to seeing you again on Water/Land.

Representative Yamane: We'll see.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you so much. Anyone else in the public wishing to testify?

Ben Gates: My name is Ben Gates, my brother is the state representative for the Waianae coast, and although he's not here today, I'd just like to give his support for the Oahu game commissioner as well as the Waianae Hunting Association. And as Senator Shimabukuro mentioned earlier, the stop fly for aerial shooting ends in January, so if we can have that plan together, please include us, invite in the emails and he'll definitely be a strong advocate on top of gathering any type of resources within the legislature.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you for coming, send our kind regards to your brother. Do you guys have any questions for Ben? Okay, thank you. Anyone in the public wishing to testify on this agenda item?

James Manaku Sr.: I just wanted to bring up some things. First of all, this concern is not only for Oahu, this is for all islands, because I go gather on every islands and we all have family on other islands, so I just wanted to bring that to your attention. Also, when you put up fences like how they did in Kahuku ranch, what happened was that the goats eat what is there, so what was there was Ohia trees. Without that they would just roam around root the grasses from all over. Second of all, the Supreme Court in 2003 when the verdict came out on the Robinson & Gay Property on Kauai, they made a rule—it was our way of life to go up and do these things. Also, this is in the state constitution by which you folks have to abide. So I just wanted to let you folks know that in the constitution it gives us this right, so please protect it. Thank you.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you very much. Any questions for him?

Commissioner Masuda: Yeah, I have one request of Mr. Manaku. The next time we meet, I hope you're here. I'm going to buy enough sushi for everybody, but I'd like you and all my fellow commissioners over here who hunt—I want to taste all of your smoked meats. We're going to get a smoked meat pig out, okay? And I want to taste Ryan Peralta's product too. So are we going to try it? At our next meeting can we schedule this? I'll personally pay for all the side dishes, but you guys bring the smoked meat. I want to taste it from every district.

James Manaku Sr.: I'll bring smoked meat.

Commissioner Cremer: I'll bring sausage.

Commissioner Kohatsu: I'll bring sheep, as soon as you stop eradicating them.

Commissioner Masuda: Okay, good! Now this is just a sidebar, but I believe in working hard, but I don't have a problem with us having fun while we're doing it, because we're going to have to learn to work together. And one good way I learned about working together is that we can eat together.

Commissioner Buchanan: Commissioner Jury, do you have something?

Commissioner Jury: No, at this time I just want to say a big mahalo to our district representative, our senator, Representative Yamane. They've all been working hard, they've been in the community and hearing from the hunters and just being a part of organizing these emails, and we appreciate you guys on behalf of the GMAC and the Waianae Hunting Association and all of the hunters on that side, we're really grateful that you guys can heed our concerns and bring it to the table, and also address us and steer us in the right direction, so I appreciate you guys.

Commissioner Buchanan: Ditto, thank you very much. Okay, Commission, hearing nothing else we're going to close public testimony on that agenda item and before we go into ITEM 5 we need a five minute break.

RECESS

ITEM 5. Updates on the current efforts made to renew Unit A Lease on Kauai Island.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay, we have quorum, welcome back from our recess. We're calling this meeting back from recess and it's in session. We're on agenda ITEM 5. Staff?

Thomas Kaiakapu: Good morning, my name is Thomas Kaiakapu, I'm a wildlife manager for Kauai DOFAW. The last update for the Kekaha Game Management Area, which is Department of Hawaiian Homelands: I sent out an email to Deputy Chair William Aila last week, he responded by email. I'm just gonna go ahead and read this out, and after that I'll talk about the history and their purchase of the Kekaha Game Management Area. It says here: "Aloha Thomas, I feel comfortable in committing to you for this year's hunting season, will not be impacted by the general license agreement. Jobie and I will be meeting with the Attorney Generals of both Departments. Assume that the license will be reissued for a minimum of a year and longer if negotiations are successful." Our last sit-down meeting with Hawaiian Homelands was back in February, 2018, and with that meeting, we're discussing a twenty year license agreement with Hawaiian Homelands for the continued use of the game management area. The Kekaha Game Management Area, we have been

working with Hawaiian Homelands since 1959 for the lease of that area. The Kekaha Game Management Area is 15,000 acres, we have a very good working relationship with the Department over the years— we've had 15 years of property agreements, the last 15 years ended in 2015, and since 2015 Hawaiian Homelands has been issuing us a one year extension up to now. The current extension ends this month, at the end of this month, so we're going to go ahead with our upcoming Black-tailed deer hunting season which starts September 1st, so after that I'm not sure what DHHL will want after the deer hunting season, that's where it is right now, but I wanted to reemphasize the importance of this hunting area because it is considered the most important hunting area on Kauai, more game are harvested on this unit than any other unit on Kauai, it is managed on a sustained yield basis. We have a four month feral pig season, three month feral goat season, two month deer season, and the rest is game bird, so it's open year round on weekends, Saturday, Sunday, and some state holidays, so that's the way it's being managed right now. With Hawaiian Homelands, when we were talking about this new agreement, they were wanting to allow their beneficiaries to hunt on first weekends, opening weekends, things like that, but our Attorney General said that would be considered unconstitutional, so now they came back and said can we hunt on non-hunting days. Right now we have the public hunts on Saturdays and Sundays and so they talked about hunting on non-hunting days such as Tuesdays, Wednesdays, Thursdays. Our response was, if you're going to allow beneficiaries to hunt on non-hunting days, then the hunters will become unsustainable, the area won't be sustainable anymore, because you're going to be bringing a bunch of new hunters into the area, which changes everything, because we manage at a level where... So what we had suggested was allowing DHHL beneficiaries to hunt in the safety zones, which is a fairly large area, and currently right now, during hunting season the game runs into those, there's lots of game in there. So we said "if you hunt in safety zones, you folks can manage it because it's under your area and you can manage the way you want, so there won't be any issues with the public hunting side, and the safety zone side," so they can manage the area the way they want it. So, they said okay, they're going to go back to their commission and then discuss this, so that was in February of this year. Since then they haven't really sat down with us yet, I've been sending Aila lot of emails asking what's going on, any update he can provide to us, and this is the last email he sent me. I'm hopeful that we'll get a new hunting agreement with Hawaiian Homelands, and I hope to hear from them soon, and that's where it is right now.

Commissioner Masuda: Is there anything we can do to help? You want to send me the email, the last one?

Thomas Kaiakapu: I think at this level, it could be at your level and their level.

Commissioner Masuda: I'm happy to request that they get on it.

Thomas Kaiakapu: I don't want to rock the boat. They're saying they're close to getting the final negotiation with their Attorney Generals, that's the problem. I don't want to rock the boat with them and be impatient, but our agreement ends this month, so of course I'm getting nervous.

Commissioner Masuda: You've got only eleven more days. So, why don't you respond to the email and say that you get three more days, because you need one week to get your stuff organized to allow the hunters to know ahead of time, right? You cannot get permission from them on the 31st and let everybody know on the 1st. Write them back, tell them you have three more working days to get you to your deadline, so that you have a week to inform the hunting community, and then send me a copy.

Thomas Kaiakapu: Okay, will do. I can do that.

Commissioner Masuda: And if we've got to hussle the Deputy AGs to get it together, then we'll do that. My job is a facilitator, your job is to tell me what to do.

Commissioner Cremer: So Thomas, are you telling me that all this time it's only you trying to work on that lease?

Thomas Kaiakapu: All this time since February, we've been patiently waiting...

Commissioner Cremer: But since 2015 to now, it's only been you trying to negotiate the lease, and not upper management?

Thomas Kaiakapu: Yes, it's been a slow process.

Commissioner Cremer: It bothers me to hear that, when it's something so important to our island and our state—I'm gonna tell you guys right now, a vast majority of license people on the island of Kauai have their license for that section, you know how much money you guys are going to lose in revenue, stamps, lottery hunts, whatever it is, you're looking at a big amount of money and revenue, because I would say that 80% of hunters on our island get their hunter license to hunt on Unit A, 80%.

Commissioner Masuda: I think Thomas gets the message.

Commissioner Cremer: No, no, I'm not—this is something really passionate for me, don't take me how I'm talking, I don't hunt very often in that area, but I know who is going to be affected by it, and it hurts my heart. So you look at black-tail, pig, 2015, 2018, September 1st is the first weekend, we don't even have an agreement that guarantees the hunt can go on. You're affecting not only our island people, there's many outer island people that come and out-of-state people that come to hunt on this land. And I'm glad you say you're going to work with us, Bob, but I'm just going to share my—how can we invest money as a state into a lease that is only year to year, whether it's trail improvement, road improvement signs? You cannot, it's like running into a rock wall, every single year, boom, oh we're not going to spend that \$10,000 on road improvement now, because are we going to get the lease next year? Or we're not going to spend \$5,000 in safety zone signs and all that, because we don't know if we're going to get our lease next year.

Commissioner Masuda: Can I ask a question? How many thousand acres is it?

Commissioner Cremer: 15,000 acres.

Thomas Kaiakapu: Part of it is the safety zone.

Commissioner Cremer: Safety because of agriculture.

Thomas Kaiakapu: An area where there's a lessee up there, some sugarcane land that has been discontinued...

Commissioner Masuda: So there's a safety zone of no hunting. So how are the beneficiaries going to hunt there if there's no hunting? You said earlier that you recommended the beneficiaries hunt in the safety zone.

Thomas Kaiakapu: Yeah, that safety zone is about 3,000 acres in size, it's adjacent to...

Commissioner Masuda: I'm trying to understand, Thomas, if it's a safety zone, then why would the beneficiaries be allowed to hunt in there?

Thomas Kaiakapu: Okay, it was a safety zone created when Kekaha Sugar Company had the lease for sugarcane farming since 2001, so that area was created so the hunters don't go into the sugarcane fields to hunt, and at that request of Kekaha Sugar, they didn't want any hunters hunting in the sugarcane fields. Sugar went out, Kekaha Sugar left, and that area is still left as a safety zone, it's former sugarcane lands that are not being used currently.

Commissioner Masuda: So it's not a safety issue anymore? Okay, I understand, thanks.

Commissioner Cremer: Let the record show that, it's not aggression I'm showing towards Thomas, me and Thomas are close, we form a little team— my dad and his dad went to school together... It's just a passionate thing, and I don't feel that as an island wildlife guy, he should be negotiating a lease that is so important to our island and our community.

Commissioner Masuda: May I ask another thing, Thomas? Is this 15,000 acres designed or planned for some other use in the near future?

Thomas Kaiakapu: As far as for the GMA, it's restricted game management, but Hawaiian Homelands has a long-term vision of their own— part of it is to put farmers on the land where the sugarcane fields used to be, they also talked about possible homesteading in the area adjacent to the major GMA section.

Commissioner Masuda: So they have plans for that area.

Thomas Kaiakapu: They have the plans, but it's all conceptual.

Commissioner Masuda: So it's not immediate.

Thomas Kaiakapu: They talked about another five years, and here's the other big project that's happening there: Hawaiian Homelands has been looking at water energy, and they're currently working with KIUC, the local utility company, to start a water storage pump project, taking irrigation water that's coming from DLNR lands and doing a pump storage project, you know what that is?

Commissioner Masuda: I know.

Thomas Kaiakapu: But the GMA is up higher, about 2,000 feet elevation, and the water would be taken down...

Commissioner Masuda: They're using turbine-generated energy.

Thomas Kaiakapu: ...And pump it back up. So they're currently working with KIUC and our Department, because the water is coming from our land, and the irrigation ditch passes through the forest reserve to get to DHHL, so we're part of this. So they're working up a plan for this new system, and at the same time, we're hoping to get a new copy of the agreement with them for hunting rights there, that's hard, and I think that's why it stalled, because they're trying to work up this plan with KIUC and us for their pump water and irrigation system.

Commissioner Masuda: Okay, so who they working with on our side?

Thomas Kaiakapu: On our side, that would be folks in CWRM office, and of course our branch manager, Sheri Mann, and then Dave Smith from this side. A tour was involved because the Water Resources Management...

Commissioner Masuda: Yeah, I know, I'm working with DHHL on three major water things on Big Island, and we are helping them.

Thomas Kaiakapu: This is another one that's really important to them.

Commissioner Masuda: Okay, so I would suggest you communicate right away, and I don't know how could it go, the problem, I'm sure we'll do.

Thomas Kaiakapu: One thing I wanted to mention, because at Kekaha Game Management Area, all of the hunting units on Kauai are managed through a certain level of management system to control ungulates, a sustained yield hunting area is where we can maintain game at a certain high level of recreational hunting. Kekaha Game Management area can fit that because there's no endangered species in that area, whereas some of our other areas are more liberal hunting because we have endangered plants, endangered wildlife, habitat. So if you look at the area on Kauai, the majority of areas that we manage under the forest reserve system, public hunting, natural area reserve, are mostly liberal hunting. So our hunting regime for those areas are: the seasons are longer, the bag limits are higher, and so we allow hunters to go in to keep ungulates at a low level. Kekaha Game Management Area on the other hand would be considered the only area on Kauai, meaning that if we were to lose the GMA, that would be a huge blow to the public hunting program on

Kauai, the game management side, where we can manage game for the recreational basis. We have another game area, but it's so tiny it's insignificant.

Commissioner Masuda: But since it's not DLNR land, we have no way to control the long-term use.

Thomas Kaiakapu: Exactly.

Commissioner Masuda: So that's not comfortable. But we are concerned about the immediate or short-term use. Two years, three years. So, can you work with Mr. Cremer in coming up with a little short paper that helps us understand what the issues are for this particular area? Just what you told me just now: this is DHHL, this is how many acres, we have no control over what is going on month to month, it's an important game management place, why it's important. What we want to know out of this is, how long into the future can we assure a public hunting capability for this particular land, and if so, can we get a lease agreement arrangement going, and we'd be happy to push this after I get what you want with his involvement with you in a written way. I think part of what I'm sensing is a lot of frustration is my colleagues here, I'm quickly learning, is they're frustrated because they're putting things on hold, and we need to get things in action. I'm not blaming you guys, you guys are just as much the victims of us, administration, bureaucracy, whatever you want to call it. So I think what we're trying to do is work together to at least know what we can expect. I would want to know if I'm hunting, how much longer can I legitimately expect the use of this area, and if not, what are we going to do to push these animals onto another area where they can have that kind of hunting or whatever, and where is that other area. I mean, this is what is planning, thinking ahead. So if you two guys can work on that, when you finish it, send it to me and Shaya and Jim.

Commissioner Cremer: Bob, I'd like to say there's nothing really we need to work on. From June last year I talked to these guys about that, from 2015 prior, when the thing happened, we talked about it. I think the problem is lack of support from administration to these guys.

Commissioner Masuda: Well I'm trying to offset...

Commissioner Cremer: I know, I know, in the past. Lack of support, first of all. And second of all, I have a long-term solution: a land trade with DHHL, for better land that is leased to cattle people where [indiscernible] are going to hurt somebody to make everybody happy in the hunting community.

Commissioner Masuda: Well, when I ask him to give me a little plan...

Commissioner Cremer: That is part of it

Commissioner Masuda: Yeah.

Commissioner Cremer: Okay. That's what I like to hear.

Commissioner Masuda: And be specific. This area is a good place to trade or whatever, because I don't know where it is, you two guys work on it, work with whoever your Kauai person is, who needs to know, I don't want you getting in trouble over there. I need this kind of information if I'm going to deal from Department to Department. It seems like this is an instance where if we have the right information, it's a good idea to begin for Suzanne and I to start talking with Jobie and William and say "hey, this area is such a primo hunting area, this RP or this GL is gonna be up in so many years, are you possibly interested in trading?" In my opinion, I'm not a lifetime bureaucrat, but I'm here and I was hired by the Governor and Suzanne because they know what my track record is, I like to get things done, I don't like to suck thumb, and I don't like to kiss a**, I like to just get it done fairly, okay? And so, this sounds like one of those good opportunities where we can play win-win with DHHL. So let's see, our company, I need you guys to do the work so I get the accurate message, as long as I get honest, well-done, clear, rational, well-thought-out messages I will love you. If you set me up for a blindside, I will not love you. I'm a simple person. I'm done. I think we can approach this, and Mr. Cremer can help.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay, I'm not gonna argue as a beneficiary on this point, but commissioner Jury has a question for the testifier.

Commissioner Jury: All right, well I just wanted to make a comment, first of all, thank you to all the wildlife people. We addressed the issue right now on the short term but on the long-term we're going to fall into this same... I know speaking with Oahu branch that they're in the final process of hiring a statewide access and acquisition person, which I would see being a big part of this had we had somebody like this when the job first went vacant, we just came up short. Our wildlife managers on every island in every district are fielding all these concerns and fortunately they've taken upon this role as well where I believe if we had a proper access and acquisition position it would help mitigate a lot of these concerns

Commissioner Masuda: But we are getting that.

Commissioner Jury: I know, I'm saying that is the long-term goal. But maybe, however we can help as a commission to give the tools to succeed to our wildlife or forestry manager. Because we're helping to advise on the experience of hunting as well and yes, in the current situation we need the ongoing access, so you know, I just wanted to say that everybody's working hard at wildlife, and we look forward to seeing that individual start and they're going to have a lot on their plate statewide, it's definitely one of the first concerns they're going to be a part of.

Commissioner Masuda: And I want you to know that I read what the enabling legislation is for this commission, and I see a whole bunch of things that you guys supposed to do and have to do and are doing, and I'm going to use it so you guys are gonna work harder with me here than you ever have, but I hope you'll be happier in the process.

Commissioner Cremer: As long as there's accomplishments.

Commissioner Masuda: There will be, there will be, I guarantee you. I believe in democracy, but my kind of a democracy is a directive democracy.

Commissioner Buchanan: Is that still a democracy? No, I'm just being argumentative. Thank you, Deputy. I cannot really guess from your report, Thomas, because I'm trying to think ahead, and I don't know if it's because I— I'm not speaking for the Department of Hawaiian Homelands, of course— but I think there is no hunting on DHHL lands, statutorily, and the wildlife biologist would know this because within the Hawaiian Homestead Act and within their administrative rules, there is no hunting. So you can lease and run a game management under the Department of Land and Natural Resources, but not under DHHL, and I think that's why they're asking if they can come and hunt and make provisions like that, it is trying to cover them legally, because beneficiaries are not allowed to hunt on Hawaiian Homestead lands, albeit through permit by the Department, either on your hunting license, or number two, if you get a wildlife control permit, which is also issued by the Department, so that's the Department of Hawaiian Homelands on the whole. So we're back to square one again about go ahead and manage. Now the whole energy part of energy storage and generation, very little land is required for that, and you talk about 15,000 acres, again it's back to drawing lines on a map as to how you're going to manage that, and then of course Native Hawaiians have gathering rights, so even if they got caught, they have constitutional rights, that's why there's a bunch of different layers, and I think from a DHHL perspective they've tried to cover themselves.

Commissioner Masuda: It's very confusing, because if you have a right, why would you be getting caught?

Commissioner Buchanan: Because DHHL is an act of congress, they cannot as the commissioners cannot say we allowed, unless they do rule promegation, I believe.

Commissioner Masuda: I think the idea of looking at a land trade... It's possible.

Commissioner Buchanan: Yeah, lucky I don't live on Kauai, I would probably be the first beneficiary in line to say I'm adverse to that request, because I get all my animals inside here, but that's just me, but that's something you can watch for, yeah.

Commissioner Masuda: We want to do what's good for them as well as what's for the hunting public.

Commissioner Buchanan: Yeah. Awesome. Thank you, Thomas, for your hard work, I appreciate it.

Commissioner Masuda: Thanks, Thomas. Hey, one of these days, I gotta come, maybe Robert can come with us too, and you guys show me the area.

Commissioner Cremer: You need a helicopter. The most important section, you need a helicopter to see it unless you want to walk.

Commissioner Masuda: Remember, you're dealing with a very old senior citizen and not just a senior citizen. Okay, yeah yeah. I want to see some of these things, if I've gotta deal with it, I want to see it, Jim and Shaya and I can go look around. Have you guys seen housing there? Not really, eh? Not all? Okay, well.

Commissioner Buchanan: Jim has no excuse, he's been there forever already, he has no excuse. No, just playing. While we have a staff report on the update, commissioners, are there any questions about ITEM 5 on the update? We already heard from Commissioner Cremer. Do we have any more? No? Is there anyone in the public wishing to testify on ITEM 5? Okay, if not.

Commissioner Cremer: I've got something. Since we get Bob on board, I'm looking forward to working towards the process of the lease. And, like I said and I always say, not necessarily everything going to happen in my favor, or what I like, but I'm going to fight til the end when there's something passionate for me, so I'm just letting you guys be aware of that, and sometimes when I talk you guys think I stay mad, but I'm not, it's passion, for me it's passion, it's something that I love, it's something I grew up, my father grew up, his uncles, his grandfathers, that's how it was. And I'm fortunate to be kanaka, but I kinda grew up that kind of way, where the land and the ocean and everything is important, and respect of what we can get and what we can take care of is important to me.

Commissioner Masuda: You might not be kanaka maoli, but you are clearly kanaka manou.

Commissioner Cremer: Yeah.

Commissioner Masuda: I'm kanaka manou, I took my DNA test so I know. I was hoping, but it didn't work out. I thought guaranteed I had Hawaiian or Portagee, but I'm no more of either.

Commissioner Cremer: You sure?

Commissioner Masuda: Yeah, I checked, I took my DNA.

Commissioner Cremer: I'm talking about the Portagee, now.

Commissioner Masuda: That's the learned part.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay, thank you Commissioner Cremer. If there's no more questions or public testimony, then we're going to close public testimony, and move on to ITEM 6.

ITEM 6. Discussion on changes to Chapters 13-122, 13-123, and 13-124, Hawaii Administrative Rules, process, requirements and time frame.

Commissioner Buchanan: I believe Commissioner Jury, you were raising the question on discussion on ITEM 6? Or you need staff to report?

Commissioner Jury: No, it wasn't exactly worded like it is on the agenda, as a discussion of changes. It was just to bring up... I felt like us as a commission, because we kind of advise in this area if we had questions or the community had questions, that's the thing about it. So I'll open discussion.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay.

Commissioner Cremer: So this is kind of setting us in the direction that we need to go, is what this is about. Is there anyway, since we have more funding, that we can have some sort of class instead of having it at the commission meeting, so we'd learn and talk about the process instead of having it on the agenda?

Dietra Myers-Tremblay: I'm Dietra Myers-Tremblay and I'm a planner for DOFAW, and I can help out with that, as long as it goes through Jim or Shaya.

Commissioner Cremer: I think that would go much better instead of sitting through it at these meetings, in my opinion.

Dietra Myers-Tremblay: But I put that together to get... It was in word format, and it was more of a list, and I just thought this was a little easier to digest, but I can sit down one-on-one...

Commissioner Cremer: Maybe we can digest it on paper, look at it, and then kind of have a class to get us better informed as how we need to do things. I think is real important, and Senator Kouchi kind of said that we needed to do that, and I think we truly need to do that as a commission.

Commissioner Masuda: May I suggest to my colleagues that maybe we come one hour early to the next meeting, and we set aside one hour for a session on administrative rules process, if we want an example how we would do it, and any other kind of stuff.

Dietra Myers-Tremblay: How does that work with the Sunshine laws? I thought you could only have two people.

Shaya Honarvar: No no, this is a class.

Commissioner Masuda: This is like when the Board has a presentation on a project or something they can have a special session, and so you can check out the sunshine laws thing, but just plan it in conjunction with a meeting so we don't have to come another time.

Shaya Honarvar: It's just an informative session, it's not a commission, it's just "this is how we do it..."

Commissioner Jury: That's how it went, it wasn't a discussion of the changes, it just kind of focusing on...

Commissioner Masuda: I think it would be good for the wildlife staff to sit in on this thing, so the people who have to work together, listening to the thing. My way of work is going to be, every time we get an issue, I'm matching out the commissioner with the district person whose speciality it is, and they're gonna have to work together, two parts of the same coin, like we have heads and tails. So we should do things together like that.

Commissioner Buchanan: All right. Commissioners, is there any other discussion on ITEM 6? Hearing the Deputy suggesting that we have set aside time to have an informal type of training workshop on the process, and thank you, Commissioner Cremer, for bringing up Senator Kouchi's concerns, because really just looking quickly at the paper— thank you for making it so pretty, like text bubbles— but at least I can understand it. I see on the first bubble, it says "Division outlines intended rule changes and then submits a memo to the Chairperson for approval to start the rule-making process", and that's kind of the process that exists now, at least that you can make heads or tails of... so Deputy, the concern was that this commission felt that we went through this process in order to be put on the agenda at the BLNR, but then we heard later that there was an internal process that is unbeknownst to us that just occurs within the Department amongst general different divisions and groups and agencies, and it kinda trickles down, goes to the Chair, maybe the Deputy, and then back to the Administrator. So that was the questionable part, and I think that is why the commissioner brought this subject up, and being in respect of the process, I think that's why the agenda item was in

there by the Oahu commissioner, and the other commissioners, I guess. So if we're going to have that, that would be great for me, because I also serve on other issues within DLNR, and I would like to see what was the best way to get it to the forefront. So I appreciate that.

Commissioner Masuda: Yeah, so a good addition too would be—Dietra? Would you work through your chain of command and have our Deputy AG who advises DOFAW look through this, make sure that our Deputy AG signs off on anything that is being proposed to be a legal process, just make sure they're okay with it. If they have any suggestions that this maybe is not quite kosher and might be needed to be changed, then you make the change, just run it through them, because this is the way you go and deal with their rule change.

Dietra Myers-Tremblay: That might be a good idea because there might be something different when you're dealing with a commission.

Commissioner Masuda: So, run it through the Deputy AG so you know we have our legal base covered, and you're not saying something to commissioners that is not legal. And then, if you find something, make the change, change the date on this and send it out by email, and then we can proceed with a bill, okay?

Commissioner Ruidas: I got a question. Dietra? So this paper here, the changes, so you wrote that?

Commissioner Buchanan: No, it's statute.

Commissioner Ruidas: So the bold letters are the one that is in the statute, and the other one is the changes?

Shaya Honarvar: So there was a bill that was submitted and then it became statute, right? So if you go online right now and put in 183D 4.5 which is the statute for GMAC, that's what comes up, in exact format. I didn't make anything bold or change the font of anything, I literally copied and pasted it into there, so this is the statute.

Commissioner Ruidas: Okay, so this is the statute as it stands right now.

Shaya Honarvar: Yeah.

Dietra Myers-Tremblay: Was your question about, there's a little bit different format on that, right? I don't know why that happens online, but sometimes the fonts are different online...

Commissioner Ruidas: I was just wondering because usually changes are in different formats.

Dietra Myers-Tremblay: Yeah. I've noticed that too.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you for pointing that out, because I was on another page. I was thinking, Deputy, that we were looking at the administrative rule changing process, versus other processes which could be just legislative.

Commissioner Masuda: I was talking about this thing.

Commissioner Buchanan: Yeah. Okay, I think we're all good. No matter what, I think this commission wants to know how we can make changes to the law. How's that?

Dietra Myers-Tremblay: This is for administrative rule changes.

Commissioner Masuda: Just run it through and then you can present a powerpoint workshop so we know, and we can talk about what this really means in action. These are the words, this is how we make the words real. That kind of workshop.

Commissioner Buchanan: So deputy, in all fairness, can option two also be presented and option two is the legislative process where somebody just introduces a bill and then it gets a reading past committee, everything, boom, bam, bam,

and then signed into law, which is next to impossible? Just so we know there is another process for administrative rule change.

Commissioner Masuda: I'm assuming you're saying if this commission, as a commission, wants to propose a particular piece of legislation, how would we do that? So, run that to the Deputy AG, so we make sure we get their comment in terms of legally, how would a commission do such a thing, as a commission. Not on behalf of the Department, but on the behalf of itself. And if it cannot do so on behalf of itself, find out how the commission would go through what steps to do it, recommended by the commission on behalf of the Department. Okay? Cover all business.

Commissioner Buchanan: That would be Dietra's process. Thank you very much. Yeah, that's what we like.

Commissioner Masuda: I'm listening. I've got hearing aid now so I can hear you.

Commissioner Buchanan: I need one pretty soon. Commissioner Jury, do you have any last discussion on this item?

Commissioner Jury: No, I'm just looking forward to the training.

Commissioner Buchanan: You're good, okay? All right. Any member of the public wishing to testify on ITEM 6? If not, we're going to close public testimony and move straight into ITEM 7. We're going to start with Commissioner Jury.

ITEM 7. A short report by each commissioner summarizing their meetings with DOFAW staff on the island that they represent.

Commissioner Jury: Okay, real quick, so it's been a good few months in terms of what we've been working on together with the Oahu DOFAW, I'm going to read some off of this paper. Of course our status is still pending with the letter to the BLNR, that is always a concern of the public at this point but we addressed that earlier. There was additional permitted hunter access through Poamoho area which would allow more hunting days per year from a different avenue, and we've got some people that are going for that, it's completed already, and people are just beginning to know about it. And there's also one additional hunting check-in station at the Waianae Public Hunting Area, and it's to address the concerns of the community of hunters in the area for the feral goat, to assure that the check-in station can be used for data purposes to show the take because in Waianae there's only one, there was a request that was made, and that's come full circle and that's completed as well. Number four, an additional wildlife control permit given to organizations for the Honouliuli forest reserve, and it was always a big concern for the bow hunters on Oahu because of a certain area that's only dedicated to bow hunting in Nu'uaniu I believe, so Oahu DOFAW gave out another permit for a hunting organization to do bow hunting only in the Waimanalo Forest Reserve, so in general, this has helped to support the commission, and helped to increase hunter access inside certain areas. Of course, we know the long-term effort is to open up a PHA, but the Oahu DOFAW does understand that it's a whole long process, so in the meantime, looking for a way we can work together with the community, and they've demonstrated that inside a lot of these areas. Additional DOFAW highlights, particularly with the Waianae feral goat concerns is that the forestry manager was working with the Board of Water Supply in Makaha to allow permitted hunting for the hunters to gain access to the area. They're currently working on the land lease, and it's always been ongoing and I'm always in the loop through the forestry manager. They're also waiting the revision for the Waianae Hunting Association proposal, which I heard was completed today, they also invited me to do a helicopter ride with them, to do a survey of the goat population with them so there was transparency across the board with the community, so as soon as they schedule a date, probably be up in the helicopter with them just to kind of be that liaison, and then of course they extended the no-shoot area until January 2019 to address these type of concerns, so in a nutshell that's kind of what we've been doing, working together, kind of allowing more access to certain areas to help more hunters into... You know, Oahu's so populated, there's so many people in the mountains, it's a good step in the direction and then also addressing the Waianae things.

Commissioner Masuda: Might be good if you and Ryan can arrange to have a good camera, take some pictures so we can see what you saw.

Commissioner Jury: Sure. And that's pretty much it, all you get, Oahu. So some stuff that's coming up is we're just going to be continuing for worker grind them, but the issues down in Waianae, and then we're continuing to work the Oahu DOFAW staff as they have other areas that they're looking into to give permitted access especially for the different demographics on the island. That's all. Thank you.

Commissioner Buchanan: Thank you Commissioner Jury. I've got a question for you. We were handed this one page by the Waianae Hunting Association as they left, you have a copy of that. You work together with them to generate this, because I see that they're making representations, they said that the "Waianae Hunting Association will," and then they have two points, and that "the Department will," and then they have two points. You guys have had discussions about this two items?

Commissioner Jury: I think this past Friday the check-in station was completed and then they re-drafted this proposal, so there's not been any discussion with the state yet, with DOFAW staff yet about it. But I'll look at them and I'm sure we'll have an answer in the coming weeks, our commission will have... We'll see where we go from there. But I did have a chance to look at it, and of course, on behalf of the hunting community that we represent there, of course they'll want to be a part of it, they want to help co-manage the land and their two requests outlined there of what they need to be successful in it.

Shaya Honarvar: Lori? So this is not in the public folder, right? So I'm not really sure you can really discuss any details?

Commissioner Buchanan: Well, they should've sent you one, too bad. Okay. Then I won't discuss this, but.

Commissioner Masuda: It can be received, yeah?

Shaya Honarvar: So would you like me to add it in the... I don't think I can even do that.

Commissioner Buchanan: Well, they gave it to us, I don't think they realized what the process for submissions was, so, yeah. Please do that. And then Josiah, you said that they're doing aerial surveys for population?

Commissioner Buchanan: Yeah, there's going to be a coming aerial survey, I think just a general, maybe the wildlife manager can speak on the upcoming survey and then just kind of in general do a survey and maybe invite me on in the aerial.

Jason Misaki: Yeah, we have regular survey schedules. We don't have a specific date on it.

Commissioner Buchanan: I'm sorry, I know you're Jason Misaki, but you can come up and state your name for the record.

Jason Misaki: My name is Jason Misaki with Oahu Division of Forestry and Wildlife and we do have regular surveys scheduled both for the aerial shooting and for game management in general so we've been working with Josiah on scheduling a ride-along.

Commissioner Buchanan: I'm sorry, can I just ask, what are the aerial surveys for?

Jason Misaki: For goats in Waianae Kai and Makua Keaau.

Commissioner Buchanan: To determine what?

Jason Misaki: We have one that's part of our Pittman-Robertson grant that we do general population surveys and then we have one survey that's being done to accompany the aerial shoot operations that were previously going on in Waianae.

Commissioner Masuda: To provide answers to the questions to better understand—

Jason Misaki: We did a start to get a baseline for what's happening, what the population was, and we did follow-up surveys for each of the treatments that we've done.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay. Not to belabor the—I think maybe we need to have a second, a separate discussion about that. I think I'm concerned because I never heard up to this point that you guys are doing aerial surveys, so that's something new then, right?

Jason Misaki: No, I believe it's in the aerial shoot or ungulate plan that we produced as justification for our operations.

Commissioner Buchanan: So you guys did population surveys within that area in order to get the money you needed from Pittman-Robinson in order to conduct the aerial surveys? No.

Jason Misaki: Could you restate the question please?

Commissioner Buchanan: I see the back is going no. So, aerial surveys within the Waianae area of question, survey for population, right? How long has that been going on? The surveys for population?

Jason Misaki: The surveys for population. Are you talking about for the aerial shoot project?

Commissioner Buchanan: No. Well, obviously it's been...

Commissioner Masuda: Has the department been doing aerial surveys previously?

Jason Misaki: Yes.

Commissioner Masuda: How long has that been going on?

Jason Misaki: We do it every year.

Commissioner Masuda: So, it's an annual aerial survey?

Jason Misaki: So, there's two separate projects, yeah? There's a P-R project that basically helps us to manage the public hunting areas to get a gauge on our population of goats. And there's an aerial shoot project which has specific parameters that they look for in terms of the survey, how many goats are in areas, both non public hunting areas and non public hunting areas, and follow up surveys to track the population after treatments and after each of the operations. So it's two separate surveys that we're doing.

Commissioner Masuda: One is an annual department survey, a DOFAW survey, another was in conjunction with Pittman-Robertson funding.

Jason Misaki: No, the other way around. The annual survey is done as part of our Pittman-Robinson game management program. The aerial shoot surveys are done specifically for the aerial shoot project, it has different parameters, it as different areas that they're monitoring.

Commissioner Buchanan: So I guess my question is since when, what year did you guys start the aerial surveys for the first part, just for population?

Jason Misaki: For Pittman-Robinson? We've done it as far back as I can remember. We haven't done aerial surveys for maybe the last two or three years because of the aerial shoot project, we had surveys going, so we had data from before, and then because the aerial shoot project, we did not survey right away.

Commissioner Buchanan: So that data was used then to justify the aerial shoot, then?

Jason Misaki: Just before the aerial shoot, we did a separate survey that covered the entire Waianae mountains, I can't remember what year it was done, but then we subsequently followed up with the same program,

Commissioner Buchanan: So that information was available to commissioner jury and the Waianae hunting club?

Jason Misaki: If I'm not mistaken, it's in the aerial shoot project and we also have the files available.

Commissioner Buchanan: So that would read in 1981 we had 15 goats within the area, whatever you call it, the Waianae whatever?

Jason Misaki: Yeah, but not in 1981.

Commissioner Buchanan: That's why I ask you when it started.

Jason Misaki: It was a while, I can't recall the actual date, it was...

Commissioner Buchanan: So every year I would see a number on a spreadsheet that says 15 goats, 20 goats, right, you're doing the same transects? I only ask because I'm familiar with population assessments, so that's how come again, Mr. Manaku, I get back to answering his questions about... because I hear for sustainability and other kinds of stuff I get really 'eh' about, when we start talking about sustainability population counts and stuff like that, if we're good we're good, I just wanted to know the process. I see Kanalu is smiling, because he used to be the wildlife person in charge of the deer management working group on Maui, so I know he knows about population assessments and all of the issues we had about population assessments. I wasn't aware of this, and that's why it sparked my interest, and Deputy, I hope the Association and the Oahu commissioner would see what numbers you guys are talking about here within what areas, so that might be helpful, too. But that's okay, thank you. I would request that information, data for a future meeting.

Commissioner Masuda: Can we move on?

Commissioner Buchanan: Yeah. Thank you, Jason.

Commissioner Jury: Let me say that they have expressed to the community and stuff like that about the information.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay. Good job. Sorry, Ryan?

Commissioner Kohatsu: Yeah, so on August 3rd, East Hawaii we had five hunters come over and Bob and everything, Joey DLNR representatives, we had a meeting with some of the Hawaii County game management commission that's under the county, not the state. I attended as far as on the state side for the commission and basically it was just Bob expressing his interest in wanting to work with this group and move things forward because we've been stagnant at first, but I wish I had something as fancy as Josiah did, I don't. The Hawaii Island community gets it, they get it down pretty simple, and the simple thing is they want resources that we use to be taken care of as much as the ones we don't use, so we each eat goats, pigs, deer, fish in the ocean, whatever it is, yet that stakeholder community sees the endangered species, watershed and all this other stuff getting far more money, far more attention and far more policy control over the public lands that you would think all public stakeholders should have policy-making say in. So basically, I don't have a whole lot of, there are concerns as far as little things as far as how people hunt and administrative rules or whatever, but the overarching thing I just want to state for the East Hawaii community, is they understand that there's a dual mandate for endangered species and watershed and the dual mandate is controlling the policy, whether we can keep game mammals in our public areas or not, and until someone in a leadership role says these game mammals are as important as these other things, that arbitration talk that Senator Shimabukuro gave about how do we come to this agreement, how do we make plans that other people agree on, and they probably won't, but how do we move forward, and that's the deadlock. So I don't have an answer for that as of yet, but it is what it is and there are, I don't want to go into details, but there are things that have been in the works for many years and as long as hunters and the people that care about game mammals have to keep asking for permission from the endangered species and watershed people to keep animals that they should at least have some say over keeping, they're going to get nothing, they'll continue to lose, so.

Commissioner Masuda: May I add? Just underscoring what Ryan reported, is clearly a contentious issue, bubbling issue, that shooters and hunters have their sense of a “competition”, between trees and pigs or whatever way you want to put it. That’s just my way of describing it. The issue between watershed and forestry management and wildlife management and all of that, the sense that I got at that meeting was there is a clear feeling of those present representing hunting and shooting that their community was not getting the same attention and same support as watershed and forestry. I can tell you that watershed and forestry is not getting the support it needs to sustain our water needs for our state population, and only last year did we get a significant amount of support. The two previous years, watershed got zero, which I thought was incredulous to me as a person who formerly worked in this area coming back to learn that. So the perception may be that trees are getting all the support, but it’s not necessarily an accurate perception over the last three years. Therefore, I want to put that for the record. For the record I also want to say that while I totally am sympathetic with always expressing East Hawaii like what is being expressed today, there clearly is a need for all of us to work together and my appeal then would be for all of us whether you’re hunter, shooter, subsistence gatherer, tree-hugger, or watershed management advocate, that we need to work together a lot more closely and we certainly need to communicate with each other in a way that both can be sustainable at the same time, we need both. Not one over the other. And we’ve been playing win-lose, and ending up with lose-lose for many years and our goal is to play win-win over the next several years. So I appreciate, Ryan, you guys gathering there in Hilo, and the Governor’s representative Dennis Onishi was the one who put that meeting together, so we appreciate that, and we’ll continue to respond to those requests. And Joey, thanks for your help in all of that. Kanalu was out fighting fires, they had to pull Joey off the firefighter line.

Commissioner Kohatsu: I just want to put it on the record too, for some of the constituents that I serve, they’re very well aware of environmentally sensitive areas and maybe areas that aren’t so environmentally sensitive, highly modified landscapes and stuff like that. I think for their sake they would want to express that even in areas that are highly modified or of low environmental sensitivity, hunters aren’t able to manage animals in those areas as well, due to the overarching policy as priority of leadership of DLNR has set. And that needs to be visited. That’s not for me, I think my constituents would want that expressed, because they’re not trying to step on somebody else’s toes, these are areas that maybe shouldn’t matter to the other side of the spectrum, but they’re still running into roadblocks, there’s some reasonability that needs to be addressed.

Commissioner Masuda: And I think, Ryan, what was being expressed there, I follow up myself with the idea that besides working with all our wildlife people who are here today, it might be worthwhile for us to plan a retreat or get-together between the tree-huggers and the game management people, and begin to talk about how as staff we might work together in addressing both sides’ anxieties and concerns and the realities of work with both sides. And we can make that happen, so, you guys think about those things.

Commissioner Cremer: I’m going to go with what Ryan said, the biggest fear in my hunting community and the people are out there gathering is right now it’s just land grabs to fence, and keep taking, and keep taking, because federal funding. Taking away the hunting areas, keep grabbing and fencing them, without even managing them to a sustainable critical habitat area, they’re just grabbing, taking, fence them, going to eradicate, and let them there. Weeds, everything, taking over the whole place. That is our biggest fear, when is this going to stop, is what everybody’s coming to me and saying, when is this going to stop when it’s all said and done, that is our biggest fear, and everybody else on my island and the state that I talk to, I hunt [indiscernible] road, all those areas, in the past, in the 70’s when I went with my cousins, the place is totally fenced off, it was a nice forest before, now since they fenced it and killed everything inside, it’s miserable. The closer parcels that they had fenced are taken care of because people who are donating time and community people working, but realistically, staff can’t take care of all of the land area that you guys are grabbing, you know what I mean? So when is this going to stop? I just got word that they’re going to start fencing up Honopu, another designated hunting area that people go hunt every year, when’s it going to stop? That’s our fear.

Commissioner Masuda: Let me just share with you that, that’s why we need to talk together, because a lot of what we fear may not be with clear communication or with accurate facts, and a lot of what needs to be done is to make sure that we are dealing with clarity, with facts, and all that, because I can tell you that the water capacity of our state is way diminished in comparison to the current demand, and on this island in particular, it’s scary. I don’t have to worry as

much personally because I live in Waimea and Kanalu and I we know we're getting the best water and lots of it, and we're not as worried, but if I was living on Oahu, I'd be really worried, and so we need to share all of this kind of stuff so everyone can come together, but I appreciate it.

Commissioner Cremer: That's why I said, a game management plan is for each island, we have no problem with water on Kauai right now, we're abundant with water. But you cannot have a watershed or forest follows the rains, whatever it is, for every single island that's going to be the same thing, and now we've got to protect this watershed, and the thing is abundant with water, we're the wettest spot almost on earth. I'm Portagee. At a tough one, I'd swim.

Commissioner Masuda: And I'm honorary. Together we're dangerous, we're eating up the time. Okay.

Commissioner Buchanan: Commissioner Ruidas?

Commissioner Ruidas: Oh, for real? So my report for Lanai, I've been talking to Shane and John and all that, actually, we have a meeting scheduled for October, that's for the DOFAW meeting, but I have a meeting scheduled with the hunters tomorrow night, which results we're going to bring up to the October meeting, and the other thing is, besides four people in this room, everyone knows about my speech about the Lanai lease. If we don't have a lease by 2021, we're going to lose that lease for the whole island, which is 25,000 acres of GMA hunting. And I don't know what your background is, Bob, so maybe I should ask you what you know about Lanai?

Commissioner Masuda: Well, I've visited Lanai. I've gone there on behalf of the forest service, so I understand what the water issues are, but I'm not... I've had great lanai venison, so. But other than that, I have a lot to learn, and as far as leases are concerned, I'm not a land management agent, so I have to go find out. But I'm welcome to receive emails about any of this.

Commissioner Ruidas: Okay, so going back to that lease, you know, it would be a shame if we lose that land, so talking to Pulama Lanai, which is the landowner of Lanai, who controls the lease, that lease is through the state, they said that if the wildlife management plan was completed in three years, which is now two years because you've gotta add whatever, then they'll lease for another ten years, so it's like a no-brainer: do it, or lose it. So from your power, we need your support to see this through, because I would say only five percent of hunters that come to Hawaii that hunt in Lanai are nonresidents to the state. 95% are from the state, so that money that they spend in Hawaii just stays in Hawaii, and that's good for the culture, and we've got three generations of people hunting in the same day; I had a guy, 80-something years old, last year, he shot a doe and he had his son and his grandson, his first time taking his grandson. So we had guys coming like 40 or 50 years, so it'll be a shame if we lose it.

Commissioner Masuda: Can I just ask, you to do the same thing with whoever is our...

Shaya Honarvar: Shane and John and myself are working on the lease.

Commissioner Masuda: Okay, can you guys keep me posted if there's anything we can do. You can rag whoever the Lanai person is on the wildlife staff.

Commissioner Ruidas: I always get Shane and John on, I can call them right away.

Commissioner Masuda: You can rag John all you like, just send me a copy

Commissioner Ruidas: So that's where Lanai is at on the lease. Thank you.

Commissioner Masuda: Okay. The point is, keep communication more than less, especially on this kind of stuff that needs time. Time is not a friend when you're chasing it. Thank you.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay, go ahead, Commissioner Cremer.

Commissioner Cremer: My report, I'm going to start with the Sleeping Giant archery program that we're fortunate that Thomas and Lindsey put into place, I've been bugging them a long time to get an archery places and they know that, they've been trying to work it out, tried to do things on Sleeping Giant before and it never worked out, but now we've got the archery going: a six month trial period. Right now we had 44 hunter trips, in the 44 hunter trips, besides the papers being missing in July, we've got 4 boars and 3 sows that were taken out. There's no hiker or neighborhood complaints, so it looks like that pilot neighborhood program is good and we might be moving out as far as making it a regular thing. I get reports, and maybe you guys can answer me, got reports of aerial shooting on Kauai during the month of June, then I did an investigation, found out who was there, what was done. They said it was an aerial shooting from what my investigation was, that it was helicopter used to go in the area to go shooting, but my question is, why wasn't there any public announcement made, first of all? Second of all, why were the weapons carried on their shoulders going into the transportation if it was a ground shoot, and why wasn't it carried in cases to the ground area? You guys know anything about this, Thomas? Lindsey? I want to see people who can guarantee verify it, they'd be willing to come and testify.

Lindsey Ibara: That was through the NARS program. We weren't even informed about that.

Commissioner Cremer: Oh, it was NARS. Yeah, Nick was part of the crew with the rifle on his shoulder, from NARS.

Commissioner Buchanan: Maybe you can get Deputy or else James as the DOFAW Administrator to find out from the NARS, I guess if it's impacting and the hunters are asking, because, hello? He's on the Board of NARS.

Commissioner Masuda: I'm listening.

Commissioner Cremer: I'm just wandering, why wasn't there a public announcement, for one, because that's the process? Second is, they made statements to somebody who questioned them that no aerial shooting was done, they did ground shooting, and they knew that because they're going to be there, that they're going to get blamed for aerial shooting, because they used a helicopter. My question is, why were the firearms on their shoulders instead of in cases going into the ground area to do the ground shooting?

Shaya Honarvar: Where was this, exactly?

Commissioner Cremer: According to what I heard, Na Pali. The site they took off was from Kokee.

Commissioner Buchanan: Are you concerned that it's a safety issue for community who might be in the area?

Commissioner Cremer: Yeah, that is a problem.

Commissioner Masuda: On behalf of the administration, I want to thank you for this report, and I will assure you that we will follow up and find out what the answers are to this, and if there is or has been a violation of safety protocol, whomever is the violator will be noticed and reprimanded for violating any safety policy.

Commissioner Cremer: Okay, thank you. I'm going to move on.

Commissioner Masuda: But when they do good things, I want to hear too, now.

Commissioner Cremer: Of course, guarantee. I'll tell you right now, the staff right here, I cannot complain about them, whenever I talk with them, we work together. Camp Ten road has been repaired—you weren't in the loop at the time, you weren't here—we were having problems with the road being eroded beyond where they worked, but there still needs to be more work done, according to what the hunters have been telling me, materials, maybe more. I get the sense that the island manager's not making her priorities right as far as trails and roadways because it's been kind of getting bad, the trails and the roadways, I don't know if she concentrated in other projects or what, I could be wrong, but it's just my feeling, and from what I get. Maybe you guys can reach out and ask what it is and what is the protocol, it took so long for that road to get repaired and it's still not up to standard for me, I get guys who go hunting there every

weekend and they report to me, so I stay on Lindsey's case. And then there's other things we're working on, where we'll be able to get a key to open up trailheads where there's a roadway through lease land to go to hunting areas instead of walking two miles like we discussed about things, Lindsey's going to be working on that next week or two maybe with the land lessee. That's about it.

Commissioner Masuda: Can you type this out and send it in too?

Commissioner Cremer: Oh this? Definitely. I'll email it to Shaya.

Commissioner Masuda: Anything in writing, I can put on the computer and make sure it's on my to do list. Until it gets done, it stays on my to do list. I've got to get a bigger computer, it sounds like.

Shaya Honarvar: Please do copy me on any to do items.

Commissioner Masuda: Shaya is my staff person for this commission, so if you want me not to forget, make sure she knows.

Commissioner Buchanan: Okay, that's it. Anyone have questions for Commissioner Cremer? Okay, thank you. Molokai, no more hunting. You know, we don't have any paid public hunting like Lanai, we've been like that for several years because the community felt that they didn't want it, so DLNR doesn't have any...

Commissioner Masuda: So you have private hunting?

Commissioner Buchanan: We just have run and shoot. There might be now, I haven't the website, they do paid hunts on ranch lands, but other than that we don't have any. We have commercial harvest of deer through permit with USDA and DOFAW, but other than those activities, we probably have the lowest paid hunting.

Commissioner Masuda: So the local people are keeping the game population in control?

Commissioner Buchanan: No, not in private areas where you have gentlemen's estates and ag. lots, no, those are out of control. But we just had a meeting and the Molokai Lanai Soil Water Conservation District people, under USDA, called a meeting on behalf of the farmers. So the farmers in the farming belt in central Molokai being impacted by deer for multiple reasons now: The cut-off of cattle and water resources way out are no longer available, which draws the deer inland to where people have water. Big large tracts of acreage by Monsanto and Mycogen being deer-fenced as I think a federal mandate to keep their federally protected crops from being impacted by deer. So those large tracts of fencing are inadvertently funneling the deer into places where they haven't been in the past. So now you have additional impacts to farmers that didn't exist prior to changing conditions. So that's prompted the USDA Soil Water Conservation District to convene a working group. I think part of it is because USDA is no longer providing funds for deer fencing, so I think that is prompting all these concerns now. Because it used to be that you could go get deer fencing and have it paid for by USDA, and I think something changed and you can no longer do that. So there's a lot of discussion going back and forth. They did a good thing, they invited practitioners and industry people and business people into this working group, and I told them don't reinvent the wheel, they can follow what the Maui deer working group did before, because Kanalu did really good work coming into that position some years ago. But it's definitely different, and it's just the beginning, and we also have a draft community plan that is at the County Council right now, and within that plan, under economic development— I always say that Molokai has two economies: one is a for-profit money economy, and the second is a subsistence economy where we rely heavily on our feral species to supplement our total proteins, and in 2008, the Governor's task force paid for a study, and at that point it came back at just under 40% of the total proteins by the people on Molokai were from feral species, whether terrestrial or marine. So that count on Molokai, with Native Hawaiians still being the predominant demographic race on the island, really does feed into supporting that second economy. So with that in mind, this working group— and I'm a part of this working group— is trying to come to some short term remediation for the impacts to the farmers, and then a long term, and that might be a game management or wildlife plan. So we're not just sitting still and crying to the DLNR to save our life. We're taking a proactive stance and we're now into a second Maui Community College class where the goal is to write a management plan. So there's

multiple subjects being taught within this, and what spurred this was the sale of Molokai ranch. So when one third of your island is for sale, the one third, way over fifty percent of your deer population, it becomes a very significant impact that the new buyer has to be on board with the community and our second economy. So with that, we are being proactive in getting not only this class and training up future generations to be thinking proactively and in perpetuity, we're also getting resources. So we've been able to obtain private resources close to \$100,000 in funding in order to help not only... The wildlife portion is only a part of this plan. The greater portion is long term sustainability taking into account climate change, restoration of degraded environment, we're trying to sell it to Kamehameha Schools and all the Hawaiian trust fund entities, we're trying to sell it to private entities such as Ecotrust and the broader world community, bringing in people that are very well versed in permaculture and other disciplines in order to help us get there. So we're not just trying to sit down and "yah, yah, yah, DLNR save my life," we're really trying to take a proactive step to protect our resources and find balance. When I listen to my commissioners and to Ryan, I know exactly what they're talking about, because I'm a tree-hugger, but I'm a pig-hugger too. So I totally understand what balance needs to be in there, because I'm hugging both at the same time and they both need to coexist. And I see sometimes the thing the DLNR has to take is the low hanging fruit because a landowner with, I don't want to say mediocre land, but probably not pristine, intact native environment which would be extremely high priority for DOFAW as well as NARS, but sometimes because it is low hanging fruit, and it might not be high priority but a low priority, but it's doable, it leads to the public perception of land grabbing. "Oh just take it while you can." Me, if I can get land, I'm just going to take it, save it, you know? Eight years on Conservation Land Commission, I think that's the best commission this state has ever had, because we buy lands in fee or through conservation easement to save for generations to come. And that's what it's all about, the hunters understand that, they're just trying to cover their niche. When push comes to shove within that spacial drawing on that map of what they see as degraded lands versus high-priority lands, they totally get it. I think it's that middle row where the low hanging fruit through the watershed initiative or elsewhere, you have all of this conflict occurring. And more so on some islands because of their resources versus other resources. And while water is important to save, you're always going to have community feedback as to "okay, let's save all this water," and then have the Commission on Water Resources give it all away. At what point does carrying capacity come into it then? Like you cannot build more Ho'opili then, if there's no more water, stop it! We just had a conversation on the phone about Rapid Ohia Death, the statewide conversation, and in Kalopa State Park on the Big Island they found the first trees that are being impacted there. Joey, maybe you or Kanalu know, if I say anything wrong just stop me, because I go to too many meetings. One thought is that people hanging hammocks on the trees and wounding the trees was causing that. Of course, you can always say hunters and whoever... The point is, at some certain point we cannot keep on accommodating whether it's tourism or recreation when it clearly is hurting the resources. So at that point I think hunters are supportive, and I hope we can get there in finding that balance and prioritizing where we're really going to throw down and save, and where we're not. Okay, that's it, on Molokai we're trying and working on it, and then we're going to give it to you guys and you can Xerox it for everybody!

Commissioner Masuda: I totally agree with you on the last part, finding where the limits are, but I think we need to move on if you're pau.

ITEM 8. Set future meeting schedule and potential Agenda items.

What I really would like to do is ask if we could schedule the meetings for the year ahead. Like if today is the third Monday, do you normally meet on a third Monday?

Commissioner Cremer: We do a consensus amongst the commissioners at the end of the meeting to discuss which is the best day so we have the most people there.

Commissioner Masuda: Could we consider having a particular date so we can plan ahead?

Commissioner Buchanan: How about we just schedule to the end of the year?

Discussion ensues about date of future meetings. Next meetings potentially set for Monday September 24th, November 26th.

ITEM 9. Announcements.

Commissioner Buchanan: So another thing floating out in space is the legislative report. We like to include the meetings from the prior year in the legislative report, it's not a must, but it's helpful. So the legislative report that staff is supposed to be doing is due now, really soon, a draft is supposed to be circulating, but if the commission does the report like we did last year, then we pretty much get all the way to the end of December. We don't want to wait all the way to the end, because it's due the first day of session...

ITEM 10. Adjournment.