

DAVID Y. IGE  
GOVERNOR OF HAWAII



**STATE OF HAWAII  
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION  
KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING  
601 KAMOKILA BLVD, STE 555  
KAPOLEI, HAWAII 96707

SUZANNE D. CASE  
CHAIRPERSON  
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

KEKOA KALUHIWA  
FIRST DEPUTY

JEFFREY T. PEARSON  
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES  
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION  
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT  
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS  
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT  
ENGINEERING  
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION  
LAND  
STATE PARKS

**MINUTES  
HAWAII HISTORIC PLACES REVIEW BOARD Meeting**

**DATE:** FRIDAY, November 13, 2015  
**TIME:** 9:30 a.m. to 3:30 p.m.  
**PLACE:** Hawaii Community Development Authority (HCDA)  
Community Room  
547 Queen Street  
Honolulu HI 96813

The following were in attendance:

**MEMBERS:** William Chapman Nancy Peacock, AIA  
William Souza George Casen  
Matt McDermott Ikaika Bantolina  
Alton Okinaka Patricia Griffin

**STAFF:** Alan S. Downer, Administrator  
Kaiwi Yoon, Architecture Branch Chief  
Susan Lebo, Archaeology Branch Chief  
Megan Borthwick, Architectural Historian  
Anna Broverman, Architectural Historian  
Jessica Puff, Architectural Historian  
Kaahiki Solis, Cultural Historian  
Garnet Clark, Archaeology Assistant  
Kimi Matsushima, Oahu Archaeologist  
Alexandra Kosik, Architectural Historian  
Cicely Lorenzo-Ganir, Secretary III

**GUESTS:** Valeria VanderVeer Tanya Gumapac-McGuire  
Sarah Love Benjamin Torigue  
Don Hibbard Michael K. Lee  
John Bond Daniel Martineze  
Lorraine Minatoishi Michele Y. Matsuo  
Daniel Susott Denny Miyasato  
Jeff Watanabe Lynn Watanabe  
Ernie Endrina Shirley Yamada  
Kiersten Faulkner

The meeting started at 9:34 a.m. when Kaiwi Yoon called upon Kaahiki Solis to do an opening pule.

## A. AGENDA

### **Approval of the Friday August 28 Agenda**

The final approval for the rearranged order of presentations at the August 28, 2015, meeting was not reflected in the meeting minutes.

### **Approval of the Friday November 13 Agenda**

The Smith Apartments nomination has been withdrawn due to the owner being unable to add additional information that was required.

The Little Makalapa Navy Housing Historic District and Big Makalapa Navy Housing District was withdrawn.

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to approve the agenda as amended (to approve the order of presentations at the Friday, August 28, 2015, meeting; and to remove the Little Makalapa Navy Housing Historic District, the Big Makalapa Navy Housing Historic District, and the Smith Apartment from today's agenda), seconded by William Souza.

Vote: 6-0; All in favor (Okinaka, Souza, McDermott, Chapman, Peacock, Casen). Motion carries.

## B. MINUTES

### **Approval of the May 2, 2015 Minutes**

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to approve the May 2, 2015 meeting minutes with amendments, seconded by Matt McDermott.

Vote: 6-0; All in favor (Okinaka, Souza, McDermott, Chapman, Peacock, Casen). Motion carries.

Peacock suggested that amendments to the meeting minutes be put in italics so that they are easier to identify.

### **Approval of the August 28, 2015 Minutes**

Casen noted that in regards to Hibiscus Place, he was questioning Polly Tice about the ground level of the home, and inquiring if the empty space may have been a basement or a crawl space. In regards to the site visit options, he was asking a rhetorical question about the Attorney General being on the site visit.

Peacock, in regards to the Kalama Beach Clubhouse, wants noted in the comments section that the landscape be considered in the site holistically because it is not just about the building. She mentioned the amazing open sand dunes that created a sense of continuity. Chair Chapman agreed that it is good to have this on record.

Peacock, in regards to the Johnny Walker Beach House, noted that Bantolina asked about a tomb. She cites that Section 8 Page 8 needs clarification and can be expanded more. Neither Administrator Downer, nor Chair Chapman recall the mention of a tomb with this nomination. It was suggested that maybe Bantolina was referring to the Royal Mausoleum. Further clarification into this needs to be done.

Peacock, in regards to the Francis J. Smith comments section, wants it noted that she said that all the windows and all the metal work had been removed from the site.

Action: A motion was made by William Souza to approve the minutes as amended, seconded by Alton Okinaka.

\*At 9:45 a.m. Patricia Griffin joined the meeting; and introduced herself after the vote was taken.

Vote: 6 in favor (Okinaka, Souza, McDermott, Chapman, Peacock, Casen); 1 no vote (Griffin). Motion carries.

#### **C. STAFF PRESENTATION AND BOARD ORIENTATION**

Megan Borthwick presented to the Board.

Comments were made by Administrator Downer.

Peacock wants the owner/nominators to know from SHPD that Board Members might be making site visits.

The Board had a problem with SHPD making a “determination” on the eligibility of the properties being reviewed and felt that it is the Board’s job to make the actual determination. SHPD should only “advise” not “determine”.

#### **D. DEFERRED NOMINATIONS**

**Collier Residence**  
3645 Woodlawn Terrace  
Honolulu HI 96822  
(1) 2-9-059:062

Don Hibbard requested to move this to the end of the agenda.

Action: A motion was made by Peacock to postpone this nomination until the end of the agenda, seconded by XX.

Vote: All in favor. Motion carries.

\*At 12:32 p.m. this nomination was presented by Megan Borthwick.

Staff thought this was a well-written nomination. Staff recommends to list to the State Register under criteria "A" for community development and criteria "C" for Modern Style Architecture. It recommends it to the National Register.

Don Hibbard provided two extra photos that he wanted the Board to see. All Board members, except Griffin, were able to see the property.

Bantolina wished that the rest of the property was 50 years and over. While reading the nomination, it didn't "click" until he saw it person; only then did he realize that he had taken lessons on the property five years ago.

Chair Chapman confirms that seeing the property was essential to understanding the property. Experience is the better measure sometimes.

Casen thought the key point was how the architect wanted to bridge nature and the design. The huge tree is part of his whole design, and it strengthens the nomination. He also thought the addition at the back of the house, which the designer separated with a lanai, did not detract from the integrity of the main house. The non-contributing tree house was fascinating and a great experience.

Chair Chapman also felt the experience of the neighborhood, and other houses in their varying levels of preservation, gave it context to understanding to what degree of preservation this house is in.

Souza really like this property because it had a blend of the island-way of living. He thought the first portion of the facade was extremely beautiful, especially the whole element of how it embraces the area.

Discussion:

Chair Chapman got clarification that the roof of the lanai was continuous with rest of the property. Hibbard confirmed that the lanai was always under the roof, they just moved one wall.

McDermott thought there was a lot of material covering the original house, which you can see is still there. He is taking the lead from the architectural historians on how much that detracts from conveying the significance of the house, and if that is sufficient enough to subtract enough for this property to be not eligible.

Chair Chapman was concerned about the public impression if the property is listed.

Peacock has an issue with the percentage of the house versus the amount of square footage of the entire property. The residence is a very small part of the whole property. There is too much other stuff on this property – the house is diminished by all the other stuff. It is dominated by other buildings in terms of square footage.

Souza got the impression that he was in two different worlds, and that they were two separate entities. He concentrated on the house. He thinks the house maintains its integrity.

Casen asked about limiting the boundaries for the National Register to just the house, the area around it, and the carport.

Chair Chapman added that the NPS recommends the legal boundaries.

Hibbard commented that is it about the relationship between the outdoors and the indoors.

Casen thought there was so much in the legal boundaries that detract from the initial design of the house.

Hibbard points out that the house is built on an extremely sloping lot.

Chair Chapman thought the rest of the addition seems so ephemeral that they did not have much of an impact on the main building.

Griffin talked about the seven aspects of integrity. The location and setting is important and does contribute. In the past, the boundaries were the footprint of the structure. It has changed to protect the *entire* property. She serves on the Kauai Historic Preservation Review Commission, and there have been times where there have been big changes to the tax map key site that would really affect the National Register property. If only the building has been registered, it is difficult to protect the site from that type of intrusion. It is appropriate to register the entire property boundaries.

<u>Action:</u>	A motion was made by William Souza to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.
<u>Seconded:</u>	Ikaika Bantolina
<u>Criterion:</u>	A and C
<u>Level of Significance:</u>	Local
<u>Vote:</u>	7-1 in favor (Okinaka, Souza, McDermott, Chapman, Casen, Griffin, Bantolina); Peacock opposed. Motion carries.

---

**Smith Apartments**

2240 Waikolu Way  
Honolulu HI 96815  
(1) 2-6-019:005

This nomination was removed from the agenda.

---

**E. NOMINATIONS**

**Giffard Residence**

62 Puiwa Road  
Honolulu, HI 96817  
(1) 2-2-044:027

This nomination was presented by Megan Borthwick.

Staff recommends to list to the State Register. The nomination is not ready for the National Register.

Peacock recused herself due to the owners being past clients.

Chairman Chapman's commented about wanting to elevate the State Register over the National Register.

<u>Action:</u>	A motion was made by Matt McDermott to nominate the residence to the State Register.
<u>Seconded:</u>	William Souza
<u>Criterion:</u>	C
<u>Level of Significance:</u>	Local
<u>Vote:</u>	6-0 in favor (Okinaka, Souza, McDermott, Chapman, Casen, Griffin). Motion carries.

---

**Olund Residence**

72 Dowsett Avenue  
Honolulu, HI 96817  
(1) 2-2-044:003

This nomination was presented by Megan Borthwick.

Staff recommends to list to the State Register under criteria "A" for community development and criteria "C" for Spanish Revival Style Architecture. It recommends it to the National Register.

The au wai on the property prompted much discussion. It was noted as an interesting feature and important in terms of archaeology. Could be included in the nomination as a site structure and contributing to criteria "A". William Souza asked for the date of construction.

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.  
Seconded: Matt McDermott  
Criteria: A and C  
Level of Significance: Local  
Vote: 7-0; All in favor (Okinaka, Souza, McDermott, Chapman, Peacock, Casen, Griffin). Motion carries.

---

**Abel Residence**  
1699 Walea Street  
Wahiawa, HI 96786  
(1) 7-5-001:001

This nomination was presented by Megan Borthwick.

Staff recommends that the property is eligible for the State Register, but the nomination is weak. Nominator originally had it nominated under criteria "A" and "C" but the board thought it should only be nominated under "A".

Nancy Peacock states this house is significant despite the alterations.

Chairman Chapman impressed with the site, even though it has lost some of its materials and workmanship, it still has good site and location.

Megan Borthwick recommended tweaking the nomination. The Board asked that the development history be fleshed out. Megan Borthwick suggested listing the house on the State Register with amendments and it can be looked at again once changes have been made.

Alan Downer suggests listing with the understanding that changes will be made or withdraw motion and make a motion to defer.

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to nominate the residence to the State Register.  
Seconded: Alton Okinaka  
Criterion: A  
Level of Significance: Local

Peacock withdrew her motion.

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to defer the residence.

Seconded: Matt McDermott  
Vote: 7-0; All in favor (Okinaka, Souza, McDermott, Chapman, Peacock, Casen, Griffin). Motion carries.

---

**Little Makalapa Navy Housing Historic District**

Palmyra Street and Tarawa Drive  
Honolulu, HI 96818  
(1) 9-9-002:004

This nomination was withdrawn.

---

**Big Makalapa Navy Housing Historic District**

Kamehameha Highway and Radford Drive  
Honolulu, HI 96818  
(1) 9-9-002:004

This nomination was withdrawn.

---

**Ewa Plain Battlefield**

Partially bounded by Roosevelt and Essex Road  
Kalaeloa, HI 96707  
(1) 9-1-013, 096, 099, 043 (portions)

This nomination was presented by Administrator Downer.

He mentions the Keeper has determined Ewa Plain Battlefield National Register eligible.

Staff recommends to list on the State Register and nominate to the National Register. Forty-three (43) letters were submitted as testimony. Five minutes each was given to people wishing to testify in front of the Board.

Malory Vanderbier testified as a citizen of Ewa Beach. She has been closely involved in the Section 106 process regarding this site and has been working with the American Battlefield protection program to nominate this site. She mentions a grant awarded to the Ewa Battlefield project. She was pro-nomination.

Sarah Love represented Kailoa Ventures as an attorney. She asked the Board to reconsider the boundary of the battlefield. Her clients believe that parts of the nomination have no bearing to December 7<sup>th</sup> 1941 and some areas do not retain integrity. She requests that the board defer the nomination until they can visit the site and take some time to review the integrity. Love mentions the written testimony submitted. SHPD staff commented that written testimony was never received. It was allowed to be presented during testimony despite some confusion about submittal dates. Copies were made and passed among the Board. Nancy Peacock believed the



site still retains integrity and asked for specifics on the areas Kailoa Ventures thought should be excluded from the nomination. Chairman Chapman dismissed overgrown vegetation as an issue to reading the site, to which Love responds that there is still a lack of integrity. It was pointed out that the site was being nominated under criteria "C" which pertains to a historic district.

Michael K. Lee testified as a member of the Kanehili Hui. He mentions a 1640 chant from his Grandpa that talks about people eating limu in the area. He is a recognized lineal descendant. The area is associated with a leina; the area is sacred to Native Hawaiians. He does not dismiss the Dec. 7<sup>th</sup> occurrences. He is pro-nomination.

Souza inquired if SHPD received comments from DHHL (Hawaiian Home Lands) or the Office of Hawaiian Affairs (OHA). Administrator Downer confirms that SHPD did not receive documentation from OHA

\*At 11:25 a.m. Ikaika Bantolina joined the meeting.

John Bond presented PowerPoint slides and distributed printouts to members of the Board and Administrator Downer. Bond states that Hunt is purely profit-driven. The Japanese main force came through Pearl Harbor, then headed Ewa to Ewa Field. He shows a map with the effects of the plane crashes. He has interviewed an Army Veteran about that day and Ewa Field.

Michele Y. Matsuo testified for the 442<sup>nd</sup> in support of Ewa Battlefield. Technical difficulties resulted in SHPD receiving only the second page of that letter of support. Administrator Downer will make sure the Board receives the complete letter. According to Matsuo, many veterans are interested in supporting WWII and the Ewa Battlefield. A past 442<sup>nd</sup> President maintained the field by cutting the brush and digging up trees. Many Japanese make a pilgrimage to the site to say prayers for the fallen. The carnage of that day is still fresh in their memory that they cry at the site. Many come to the battlefield one last time to pay their respects. She thinks it is a very important site.

Casen inquired about the boundaries' integrity and how to deal with overgrowth.

Chair Chapman inquired if the SHPD staff has edited the nomination. SHPD has not.

Chair Chapman suggested an appendix or supplemental document to the nomination.

Peacock commented on the redundancy in the presentation, but noted that it is better to have too much, rather than not enough.

Administrator Downer pointed out that the National Park Service (NPS) is in favor of briefer nominations; noting that they specifically advised SHPD that our nominations are too long.

Chair Chapman noted that the boundaries, although overgrown, are still very legible.

Peacock cited page 12, Section 7 and 8; adding that it is pretty evident what was there and what the boundaries were.

McDermott added that boundaries are always different for archaeological sites. He feels this nomination has a good record, with all kinds of integrity of where the boundaries are.

Action: A motion was made by Matt McDermott to nominate the battlefield to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.  
Seconded: William Souza  
Criteria: A and D  
Level of Significance: National  
Vote: 8-0; All in favor (Okinaka, Souza, McDermott, Chapman, Peacock, Casen, Griffin, Bantolina). Motion carries.

---

\*\* The Board took a break from 11:49 a.m. until 12:32 p.m.

---

## **F. 2015 MEETING DATES**

Upcoming 2016 meeting dates were discussed.

Borthwick will follow-up and email a list of 2016 dates.

Chair Chapman commented on the Board Meetings getting smoother and smoother.

Administrator Downer mentioned all the positive press about the Review Board:

- The Press Release for the Honoka'a Theater, Honoka'a Hotel Club, and the Ferreira Building
- The Hawaii Register being featured in a KHON news story
- The National Register being featured in the Big Island newspapers

Peacock inquired about the 10<sup>th</sup> Board Member. Borthwick disclosed that the Oath of Office is in SHPD's possession, and that the member will be here for the February 2016 meeting.

SHPD is also looking into a new location for the meetings. Administrator Downer mentioned that the Board expressed interest into different venues for the meetings, and the possibility of a neighbor island venue if there are a lot of nominations from that island.

## **G. MEETING ADJOURNED**

Action: A motion was made by Patricia Griffin to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Nancy Peacock.

Vote: The Board members voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting (8-0).

13 Nov 2015  
Hawaii Historic Places Review Board Meeting

The meeting adjourned at 12:53 p.m.

---

Respectfully Submitted with assistance from Anna Broverman and Alexandra Kosik,

Cicely Lorenzo-Ganir  
Secretary III  
State Historic Preservation Division