

DAVID Y. IGE  
GOVERNOR OF HAWAII



SUZANNE D. CASE  
CHAIRPERSON  
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

KEKOA KALUHIWA  
FIRST DEPUTY

W. ROY HARDY  
ACTING DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES  
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION  
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT  
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS  
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT  
ENGINEERING  
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION  
LAND  
STATE PARKS

**STATE OF HAWAII  
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION  
KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING  
601 KAMOKILA BLVD, STE 555  
KAPOLEI, HAWAII 96707

**MINUTES  
HAWAII HISTORIC PLACES REVIEW BOARD Meeting**

**DATE:** Friday, August 28, 2015  
**TIME:** 9:00 a.m. to 3:30 p.m.  
**PLACE:** Hawaii Community Development Authority  
Community Room  
547 Queen Street  
Honolulu HI 96813

The following were in attendance:

**MEMBERS:** William Chapman Alton Okinaka  
Thomas Lim Ikaika Bantolina  
Nancy Peacock, AIA George Casen  
William Souza Matt McDermott

**STAFF:** Alan S. Downer, Administrator  
Kaiwi Yoon, Architecture Branch Chief  
Megan Borthwick, Architectural Historian  
Jessica Puff, Architectural Historian  
Anna Broverman, Architectural Historian  
Lexi Kosick, Volunteer

**GUESTS:** Paul Miguel Don Hibbard  
Polly Tice Jeremy Sosner  
Lesleigh Jones Daniel Susott  
Lorraine Minatoishi Nik Butterbaugh  
John B. Williams Lisa Eveleth  
Janet Hulick Eamon Jordan  
Lono Lyman

The meeting was called to order at 9:02 a.m. by Chair William Chapman.

**A. AGENDA**

Approval of the August 28, 2015 Agenda

A suggestion was made by William Chapman to move the discussion of site visits to the end of the meeting after the approval of the minutes.

## **B. MINUTES**

Approval of the May 2, 2015 Minutes

William Chapman asked for suggestions on the minutes.

Nancy Peacock asked that amendments to minutes be noted in the future.

Megan Borthwick confirmed that staff can note amendments in the final minutes.

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to approve the amended May 2, 2015 meeting minutes, with the addition of amendments being included. Seconded by Thomas Lim.

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

## C. SHPD REPORT

### **Status of the CAP**

Alan Downer, SHPD Administrator, provided an update. SHPD will remain on high risk status until a clean report is produced and an inventory of our physical property is completed. There were no financial findings. We are part of the single audit for this single year.

SHPD's data management plan is undergoing final review and will be submitted to the National Park Service (NPS) next week.

### **2015 Legislative Session**

HB 830/Act 224: The governor signed the act. SHPD hasn't seen a huge drop in number of submissions, but will in future. The register and list of nominated properties is on our website. SHPD is working with counties to clarify the meaning of the act.

SB 504: Provided \$100,000 per year for two year funding to do an Architectural Survey and \$150,000 per year for two years for the data management plan. SHPD has a scope of work for contractors and will be put in a request for proposals. Will be put out for bid when funds are deposited.

### **Statewide Plan**

SHPD's statewide plan expires in about 18 months. SHPD is in the process of redoing this. Have to go to the Board of Land and Natural Resources (BLNR) for approval of contract. Contractor will do outreach and identification of issues and prepare report, and SHPD will prepare the plan. Will focus on having a plan that can be implemented. Hawaii Historic Places Review Board will be consulted regarding the plan.

## D. NOMINATIONS

### **George R. Ward House**

2438 Ferdinand Avenue

Honolulu, HI 96822

Tax Map Key (1) 2-9-008:030

This nomination was presented by Lesleigh Jones.

#### Comments:

Ikaika Bantolina noted that Manoa was the ahupuaa name in pre-contact times, not Waikiki.

Nancy Peacock would like the nomination to include the property's side as a contributing feature.

Alan Downer noted that pictures board members took during personal site visits may be shared as long as they are filed with the nomination after its acceptance.

Matt McDermott suggested removing the word "great" before mahele.

William Chapman asked how these changes would be made to the nominations.

Megan Borthwick stated that SHPD will make the changes before the nomination is officially entered onto the register.

#### Action:

A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

#### Seconded:

Thomas Lim

#### Criteria:

A and C

#### Level of Significance:

Local

#### Discussion:

Nancy Peacock stated that the entire site is still intact but she does not see this noted in the nomination.

Polly Tice suggested the site be added to the nomination as a contributing feature.

#### Vote:

All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**Kalama Beach Clubhouse**

280 N Kalaheo Avenue  
Kailua, HI 96734  
Tax Map Key (1) 4-3-016:006

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Comments: Thomas Lim asked if the property had been used by the military.

Nik Butterbaugh confirmed that it had been.

Action: A motion was made by George Casen to nominate the clubhouse to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Thomas Lim

Criteria: A and C

Level of Significance: Local

Discussion: Nancy Peacock added that the site was significant and should be reflected in the nomination.

William Souza asked for the long range plans of the owner.

Nik Butterbaugh said that the owners want to preserve and that the nomination is supported by the community.

Vote: 7 in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Okinaka); 1 abstain (Bantolina)

**Charles J. and Louisa Henderson Residence**

3965 Noela Place  
Honolulu, HI 96815  
Tax Map Key (1) 3-1-029:034

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Comments: Nancy Peacock and Thomas Lim commented that an important part of the property’s design was its manipulation of the landscape to capture scenic views.

Ikaika Bantolina requested correct diacriticals be used in nominations at the state and local level.

William Chapman asked if there are standards for the state.

Alan Downer mentioned that the board could make house rules.

Action: A motion was made by Matt McDermott to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.  
Seconded: William Souza  
Criteria: C  
Level of Significance: Local  
Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**James T and Helene Farr Residence**

2356 Makanani Drive  
Honolulu, HI 96817  
Tax Map Key (1) 1-6-018:048

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Action: A motion was made by Thomas Lim to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.  
Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina  
Criterion: C  
Level of Significance: Local  
Discussion: William Souza commented that he was happy to see a house in Kalihi be listed.  
Ikaika Bantolina asked where the rocks for the lava rock foundation came from. There used to be a holua slide in the vicinity.  
William Chapman noted that there was also a quarry in the area.  
Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**Virginia and Roy Collier Residence**

3645 Woodlawn Terrace Place  
Honolulu, HI 96822  
Tax Map Key (1) 2-9-059:062

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Comments: Matt McDermott asked if the dwelling's 1970 addition affects its historic integrity?  
Don Hibbard said no since it is on the rear and terraced portion of

the property.

Thomas Lim noted that there is a large tree house on the rear of the property.

Action: A motion was made by Thomas Lim to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: William Souza

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local

Discussion: Nancy Peacock noted that there are several structures on the property that are not mentioned in the nomination. She questions the integrity of the main dwelling.

Thomas Lim thinks a site visit is necessary for everyone to make a determination on the property's eligibility.

Nancy Peacock and Ikaika Bantolina do not think the nomination has enough documentation to make a determination.

Action: A motion was made by Thomas Lim to defer the nomination of the site until the board has made a site visit.

Seconded: William Souza

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

The Chair called for a 10 minute bathroom break at 10:54 A.M

### **John Walker Beach House**

876 Mokulua Drive

Kailua, HI 96734

Tax Map Key (1) 4-3-008:093

This nomination was presented by Lesleigh Jones.

Action: A motion was made by Alton Okinaka to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Comments: Lesleigh Jones clarified that the garage is a noncontributing feature for Nancy Peacock.

Ikaika Bantolina asked which tomb the nomination talks about in Section 8, page 8.

Seconded: Thomas Lim  
Criteria: A, B and C  
Level of Significance: Local  
Discussion: William Chapman suggested the period of significance be changed.

Ikaika Bantolina thanked the nominator for using Lanikai's original name and reminded everyone to be consistent with diacriticals.

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**Walter Irving Henderson House**

75-5944 Alii Drive  
Kailua Kona, Hawaii 96740  
Tax Map Key (3) 7-5-019:018

This nomination was presented by Lesleigh Jones.

Action: A motion was made by Matt McDermott to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Alton Okinaka

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: State

Discussion: Ikaika Bantolina noted that there was a misspelling in Section 8, page 8. Change Kau to Ka'u.

Alton Okinaka explained that in the late 1800s the Catholic Church abandoned many of their stone structures and moved into cheaper, wooden structures. Down the street is Keauhou church, which probably replaced the old stone church.

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)



**Malama Manor**

2501 Malama Place  
Honolulu, HI 96822  
Tax Map Key (1) 2-9-012:008

This nomination was presented by Jessica Puff.

Comments: William Chapman asked if the house was frame or double board construction. He noted that the floors are probably Douglas Fir rather than Maple, and that the house was a combined colonial revival and craftsman style.

Action: A motion was made by Ikaika Bantolina to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: William Souza

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local and State

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**Francis J. Smith Apartment Building**

2240 Waikolu Way  
Honolulu, HI 96815  
Tax Map Key (1) 2-6-019:005

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Comments: The board asked several questions about the future plans of the building owner.

Alan Downer clarified that the board should be asking whether the building is eligible for listing on the register.

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to defer voting on the nomination until the project is complete and the board has seen pre-construction documentation.

Seconded: Thomas Lim

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**Hibiscus Place**

2927 Hibiscus Place  
Honolulu, HI 96815  
Tax Map Key (1) 3-1-034:007

This nomination was presented by Polly Tice.

Comments: George Casen asked whether the first floor was original or if had been altered.

Polly Tice clarified that the first floor is completely modified, but she is unsure when the changes took place. The changes likely happened in stages.

Polly Tice commented that all the front façade windows are original and there are a few replacement windows on the rear.

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Thomas Lim

Criteria: A and C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7 in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Okinaka); 1 abstain (Bantolina)

**JB Guard House**

305 A Portlock Avenue  
Honolulu, HI 96825  
Tax Map Key (1) 3-9-003:004

This nomination was presented by Angie Westfall.

Comments: William Chapman asked if the roof originally had wood shingles or split shakes.

The owner stated rough shakes

Action: A motion was made by Matt McDermott to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: William Souza

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**Franklin Dexter House**  
815 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue  
Honolulu, HI 96816  
Tax Map Key (1) 3-2-022:023

This nomination was presented by Lorraine Minatoishi

Comments: SHPD needs to correct the property's address on the agenda.

Action: William Chapman asked if the house was double board or frame construction.  
A motion was made by Ikaika Bantolina to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: George Casen

Criteria: A and C

Level of Significance: Local and State

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**Henry and Eva Frandsen Residence**

1921 Makiki Street  
Honolulu, HI 96822  
Tax Map Key (1) 2-5-001:013

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Action: A motion was made by Thomas Lim to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Discussion: Nancy Peacock noted that urns removed from the dwelling were character defining features.

William Souza asked what style the dwelling was.

Don Hibbard clarified that it was Mediterranean Revival Style.

Vote: All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**Granville Abbott Jr. Residence**

4774 Aukai Avenue  
Honolulu, HI 96816  
Tax Map Key (1) 3-5-034:014

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

<u>Action:</u>	A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to nominate the residence to the State Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.
<u>Seconded:</u>	Thomas Lim
<u>Criteria:</u>	C
<u>Level of Significance:</u>	Local
<u>Vote:</u>	All in favor (Peacock, Chapman, Casen, Souza, Lim, McDermott, Bantolina, Okinaka)

**E. DISCUSSION OF SITE VISIT OPTIONS**

Chair Chapman started the conversation on site visits

Alan Downer says as long as people go individually or in groups of two and don't discuss voting, its ok.

Thomas lim – Too difficult to coordinate all the site visits individually.

Chair Chapman – If we do as a committee, have to do three meetings. The idea of calling a meeting on site seems imposible.

George Casen – Can the board just not have the attorney general on site?

Alan Downer – You have to either have a meeting on site with ADA and public accessibility and the staff has to vido record and meet all notification requirements. The board could have a limited meeting on site but the director of OIP has to agree to it and it must meet certain conditions.

WilliamChapman promises to do more individual site visits.

The board would like to propose legislation that would allow them to visit sites.

Alan Downer reminds the board that they have to talk both the Attorney General's office and the Office of Information Practices. The board has independent authority to write to the governor, OIP or SHPD, but we are bound by the law.

Nancy Peacock requests agendas be posted earlier so she can arrange site visits earlier.

Megan Borthwick affirmed that agendas will be posted earlier than previously done.

## 2015 MEETING DATES

Going forward SHPD will schedule meetings on weekdays.

The next meeting date is Friday November 13<sup>th</sup>

George Casen volunteered to be on a committee to write legislators about site visits. Nancy Peacock also volunteered.

William Chapman added that the board cannot create a committee at this meeting, it would have to be agenzized for a later date. If anyone knows legislators, talk to them and report back at a later meeting.

George Casen reminded staff that we might not make quorum next meeting.

Megan Borthwick stated that SHPD is actively finding people to fill vacant spots on the board.

Alan Downer added that SHPD is looking for neighbor island professionals. SHPD cannot put people on the board though, they can only suggest people apply.

### F. MEETING ADJOURNED

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Ikaika Bantolina.

Vote: The Board members voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 3:15 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Anna Broverman  
Architectural Historian  
State Historic Preservation Divisi