

DAVID Y. IGE
GOVERNOR OF
HAWAII



SUZANNE D. CASE
CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

KEKOA KALUHIWA
FIRST DEPUTY

JEFFREY T. PEARSON, P.E.
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

**STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION
KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING
601 KAMOKILA BLVD, STE 555
KAPOLEI, HAWAII 96707

**MINUTES
HAWAII HISTORIC PLACES REVIEW BOARD MEETING**

DATE: Friday December 9, 2016
TIME: 9:30 a.m. to 3:30 p.m.
PLACE: Kakuhihewa Building
601 Kamokila Blvd
1st Floor Room 111A-111B
Kapolei, Hawaii 96797

The following were in attendance:

MEMBERS: Nancy Peacock, AIA CHAIR Ikaika Bantolina
Matt McDermott Patricia Griffin
Alton Okinaka Katie Stephens
Paul Morgan

STAFF: Alan S. Downer, Administrator
Megan Borthwick, Architectural Historian
Anna Broverman, Architectural Historian
Alexandra Kosik, Architectural Historian
Chandra Hirotsu, Secretary III

**PUBLIC/ HOMEOWNERS/
NOMINATORS:**

Tanya Gumapac-McGuire Kai White
Brenda Lam Joan Harper
Don Hibbard Wennie Wang
Claire Cooper Peter Lee
Susan Fujimoto Jack Gillmar

The meeting was called to order at 9:34 a.m. by Chair Nancy Peacock
The review board members introduced themselves.

A. AGENDA

Approval of the Friday December 9, 2016 Agenda

B. MINUTES

Approval/Amendments of the August 25, 2016 Limited Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to approve minutes with changes.

Seconded: **Pat Griffin**

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

Approval/Amendments of the August 25, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to approve minutes with changes.

Seconded: **Pat Griffin**

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

C. SHPD REPORT

New Board Member Katie Stephens (Architect)

National Register Nominations:

Review Board SOP Manual:

- Megan is in the process of working on a SOP Manual for the review board. It will include training information, including the Sunshine and Ethics Laws. The commission should have a draft copy by the next meeting.

SHPD Administrative Update:

- SHPD currently has 5 vacancies (4 Archaeology, 2 Administrative). 1-2 Archaeologists will be hired in January, the 3rd will start at an undetermined date.
- Interviews for Cicely's position start next week, and the Information Technologist starts January 3.
- Due to the change in national administration, the status of SHPD's federal funds is currently unknown.
- The state budget is currently being reviewed by the governor. The current budget will most likely stay the same.

- SHPD currently is unaware of any legislative bills that would affect the division.
- SHPD is still under the CAP. The audit identified 3 administrative findings and one financial finding. SHPD will be under the CAP until the audit comes back clean, and SHPD produces a data management report.

SHPD is still waiting for our FY16 HPF agreement. Consequently the division has to rethink how the mandatory state plan will be done.

Missing Minutes: SHPD was unable to recover the minutes.

Consequently, the division will be sending the board members an agenda for the meeting and requesting their comments. All comments should be sent to Dr. Downer.

E. NOMINATIONS

Marie Heilman Beach Cottage

4935 Kalanianaʻole Highway

Honolulu, Hawaii 96821

(1) 3-5-022:014

This nomination was introduced by Alexandra Kosik.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to list the building to the Hawaii Register under Criterion C at the local level.

Seconded: Alton Okinaka

Criterion: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

3157 Hayden Street

3157 Hayden Street

Honolulu, Hawaii 96815

(1) 3-1-019:035

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Kai White

Questions: Nancy asked where the owners park. The Nominator explained that a 1950's carport was recently demolished and a two-story garage apartment was constructed.

Ikaika suggested that the nominator add information about the IWI and include historic maps to clarify the argument under Criterion A.

Action 1: A motion was made by **Pat Griffin** to list the residence under C local level for the Hawaii Register.

Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Discussion: The board has concerns about the integrity of the house, due to construction of the two-story carport.

The board suggested that the nominator revise the nomination boundary, remove criterion A and add more information about the history of the subdivision and to provide a site plan.

Pat Griffin rescinded her motion.

Ikaika Bantolina seconded.

Action 2: Dr. Alton Okinaka moved to defer the nomination until a site plan is submitted.

Vote: 6-1; **In favor** Nomination was deferred. (Yes: Griffin, Stephens, Okinaka, McDermott Peacock, Bantolina). (NO: Morgan) (Motion carries).

Honolulu Zoo Entry
151 Kapahulu Ave.
Honolulu, Hawaii 96815
(1)3-1-043:001

This nomination was introduced by Alexandra Kosik.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Questions: Nancy asked if the interior office space was intact.

The nominator replied no, it has been changed.

Action: A motion was made by **Paul Morgan** to list the residence under Criterion C at the local level and recommend it to the National Register.
Seconded: Patt Griffin
Criterion: C
Level of Significance: Local
Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

CMV Foster Residence
2456 Oahu Avenue
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1)2-9-011:006

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Joan Harper

Action: A motion was made by **Ikaika Bantolina** to list the residence under Criterion C at the local level and recommend it to the National Register.
Seconded: Paul Morgan
Criterion: C
Level of Significance: Local
Vote: 7-0; **All in Favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

Mist Residence
2433 Ferdinand Avenue
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1)2-9-008:003

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick

This nomination was presented by Joan Harper

Questions: Ikaika pointed out on pg. 7 second paragraph, to either change Territory of Hawaii to Kingdom, Territory and State, or just say Hawaii.

Action: A motion was made by **Pat Griffin** to list the residence to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criterion C at the local level and further recommend it to the National Register.

Seconded: Matt McDermott

Criterion: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

John & Julie Doherty Residence
1661 Pensacola Street
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1)2-4-030:045

This nomination was introduced by Alexandra Kosik.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to list the residence to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criterion C at the local level and further recommend it to the National Register.

Seconded: Paul Morgan

Criterion: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

George & Helen Hiraoka Residence
3229 Allan Place
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1)2-9-017:002

This nomination was introduced by Alexandra Kosik.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Questions: Nancy asked about the doorway on the site plan that didn't seem to exist. Don Hibbard noted that the site plan was incorrect. Ikaika asked if the auwai predated the construction of the house. Don Hibbard said yes. Nancy stated that more than half of the house was not built in a style that reflected Ossipoff (large 2 story addition)

Action: A motion was made by **Paul Morgan** to list the residence to the Hawaii Register under Criterion C and recommend to the National Register

Seconded: Pat Griffin

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 3-4; **3 In favor** (Okinaka, Bantolina, Morgan) **4 Against** (Peacock, Stephens, Griffin, McDermott) This property was not listed.

Albert B & Altha Clark Residence
111 Dowsett Avenue
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1)2-2-045:005

This nomination was introduced by Alexandra Kosik.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Action: A motion was made by **Katie Stephens** to list the residence to the Hawaii Register under Criterion C and recommend to the National Register

Seconded: Matt McDermott

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

*Break 11:55am-12:15pm working lunch

Medcalf Residence
2614 Oahu Avenue
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1)2-9-015:097

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Joan Harper

Questions: The review board asked which parts of the house were new. Joan Harper clarified that it was the rear wall, lanai and garage.

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to list the property to the Hawaii Register, with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Paul Morgan

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Action: 3-3; **3 In favor** (Morgan, McDermott, Okinaka) **3 Against** (Peacock, Griffin Bantolina) **1 Abstained** (Stephens) the property was not listed.

Hartwood Residence
2512 Manoa Road
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1)2-9-009:042

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Brenda Lam

Action: A motion was made by **Paul Morgan** the nomination is eligible for the Hawaii and National Registers under Criterion C at the local level.

Seconded: Pat Griffin

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 6-1; **All in favor** (Griffin, Morgan, Okinaka, McDermott Peacock, Bantolina). **1 Abstained** (Stephens) Motion carries.

F. 2017 MEETING DATES

Friday March 3-Friday June 2-Friday August 25-Friday December 1-
Potential Additional Meeting- the Review Board decided no additional meetings were needed.
Submitted Nominations: The list is subject to change. The March meeting agenda will be will be available on the SHPD website 30 Days prior to the meeting.

G. SUBMITTED NOMINATIONS FOR MARCH 2 MEETING

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to hold a limited meeting on Thursday March 2, 2017 of the Oahu properties. The purpose of the site visits are for privacy, safety, access and liability issues.

Seconded: Paul Morgan

Vote: 6-1; **All in favor** (Peacock, Stephens, McDermott, Morgan, Bantolina, Griffin) Okinaka (Abstained)

H. MEETING ADJOURNED

Action: A motion was made by Dr. Alton Okinaka to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Pat Griffin.

Vote: The Board members voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 1:50pm

Respectfully Submitted,

Chandra Hirotsu
Secretary III
State Historic Preservation Division

DRAFT