



**STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION
KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING
601 KAMOKILA BLVD, STE 555
KAPOLEI, HAWAII 96707

**MINUTES
HAWAII HISTORIC PLACES REVIEW BOARD MEETING**

DATE: Friday March 24, 2017
TIME: 9:30 a.m. to 3:30 p.m.
PLACE: Hale Pono'i, Department of Hawai'i Homelands
91-5420 Kapolei Parkway
Kapolei, Hi 96707

The following were in attendance:

MEMBERS: Nancy Peacock, AIA CHAIR Ikaika Bantolina
Alton Okinaka Katie Stephens
Paul Morgan Pat Griffin
Bill Souza

STAFF: Alan S. Downer, Administrator
Megan Borthwick, Architectural Historian
Chandra Hirotsu, Secretary III

**PUBLIC/ HOMEOWNERS/
NOMINATORS:** Don Hibbard Laura Ruby

The meeting was called to order at 9:39 a.m. by Chair Nancy Peacock
The review board members introduced themselves.

A. AGENDA

Approval of the Friday March 24, 2017 Agenda

B. MINUTES

Approval/Amendments of the February 19, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to approve minutes with changes.

Seconded: **Bill Souza**

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

Approval/Amendments of the June 2, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Bill Souza** to approve minutes with changes.

Seconded: **Paul Mogan**

Vote: 6-0-1; **All in favor** (Griffin, Morgan, Okinaka, Peacock, Bantolina, Souza). Abstained (Stephens) Motion carries.

Approval/Amendments of the June 3, 2016 Limited Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to approve minutes with changes.

Seconded: **Bill Souza**

Vote: 6-0-1; **All in favor** (Griffin, Morgan, Okinaka, Peacock, Bantolina, Souza). Abstained (Stephens) Motion carries.

Approval/Amendments of the December 8, 2016 Limited Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Bill Souza** to approve minutes with changes.

Seconded: **Pat Griffin**

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Morgan, Okinaka, Peacock, Bantolina, Souza, Stephens) Motion carries.

Approval/Amendments of the December 9, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Katie Stephens** to approve minutes with changes.

Seconded: **Alton Okinaka**

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Morgan, Okinaka, Peacock, Bantolina, Souza, Stephens) Motion carries.

C. SHPD REPORT

National Register Nominations:

The Barry Resort Home was accepted to the National Register of Historic Places.
The Bushnell Residence: Still working on for National Register of Historic Places.

SHPD Administrative Update:

- Legislative update: There are some reductions and increases in the budget. Some programs lost funding, while others saw an increase. Our budget was not affected. \$500,000 increase to continue and to be used scan and digitize.
- Federal: Trumps budget does not affect SHPD.
- Katie Stephens nomination has been recommended to the senate for approval.
- Review Board Members: 2 are leaving, 1 vacancy. Deadline is the March 31, 2017 by 5pm for Board Members to submit applications.
- Bill HB875HD1sD1: 5 Interns still
- New SHPD Staff: Matthew Barker Farris (Maui Lead Archaeologist) Amy Rubingh (Hawaii Lead Archaeologist) Stephanie Hacker (Oahu Archaeologist) Tanya Gumapac-McGuire (Architectural Historian HDDR)
- Vacant Positions at SHPD: Kauai Lead Archaeologist, Oahu Librarian, Office Assistant III (Oahu) have been posted. Office Assistant III (HDDR) and Archaeologist IV (HDDR)
- Senator Donvan Dela Cruz wants SHPD to do a complete island survey. No funds as of now.

D. DISCUSSION OF COMPLETENESS OF NOMINATIONS

- Nancy Peacock- The board would prefer that the nominations be complete before being put on the agenda or going to the site visits. That all the reports are complete. It wouldn't be our job to decide if they were complete. So, that discussion Dr. Downer felt that we needed to take an official board position. So, that's pretty much why it's on the agenda because we feel maybe it needed an official motion?
- Alan Downer- This is not item for decision making. But we do need for the board to discuss what they want to say, what they want to see. So, we can draft a statement for your review and action form. We have a deadline of **120 days** before a meeting for us to receive draft nominations. Then we review the nomination which can be up to 30 days. If there are incomplete or the criteria is wrong. Then we write back the things that need to be corrected. They have 30 days to get it back to us. At 60 days, out we must notify the mayor. We don't have time to do another review. So sometimes we don't know right until the meeting if the review is complete and by then we are creating the agenda for the next meeting. We have regulatory deadlines that we also need to keep. The 120-day deadline is not regulatory that's administrative on our part. But if the board feels that it doesn't want to see any nomination that's in complete. Then we must push back the 120-day deadline. To give time to set up a 2nd review prior to the 60-day deadline.

- Nancy Peacock- It seems to me that we really lose time as we come in a review it. But if we send it back it's not going to make the next board meeting it missed the deadlines and that's going to hold it up. I notice a lot of the times we send things back we don't get it till the 2nd board meeting.
- Megan Borthwick- Usually that's not about deadlines. It's about the nominators taking time to review their mistakes. If something is deferred to the next meeting. If they want to redo something or if the board wants us to review it again. Then it's going to be 2 more meetings.
- Nancy Peacock- I just think that its putting a lot of burden on the board to be thorough reading the reports (just my opinion) given that we have to invest a lot of time reading the reports. We're not even informed that they are not complete until we get to the board meeting. Then that's are job to find out that it is incomplete. It just seems from the time invested with the board. Incomplete nominations are causing us to be inefficient in our job as volunteers.
- Laura Ruby- Spoke on how the nominations are processed on the big island.
- Nancy Peacock- I think the incentive is that the nominator to improve the nomination to meet your satisfaction. That they can't just can't come to board unless it is complete. As opposed to skipping through. That will just slide it through, And I do believe at times we probably have approved nominations that weren't complete. Because the building was warranting that. Now were ending up forever having an incomplete record.
- Paul Morgan- If there was a requirement to meet with staff ahead of time maybe that might put off some of the problems. At least touch base.
- Megan Borthwick- Whoever wants to meet with me can set up a meeting no problem. As far as completeness HAR 198 has one definition of completeness but might not be up to NPS standards. When we talk about completeness does the board have some guidance on the boards definition of completeness. My opinion would be that all the nominations should be to Park Service standards. We do want to have quality nominations.
- Alan Downer- We cannot impose National Register standards on Hawaii Register nominations. Except by a rule, we would have to amend our regulations.
- Floor plans and site plans are not required by HAR 198.
- Nancy Peacock- Can you draft of something to review.
- Alan Downer- Yes we will draft something for our next meeting.

E. NOMINATIONS

Two Brothers Shipwreck

Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument

French Frigate Shoals

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Susan Lebo

Action: A motion was made by **Paul Morgan** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Katie Stephens

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

Masaaki Sakata Property

45-3577 Mamane Street
Honoka‘a, Hawai‘i 96727
(3) 4-5-007:014

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick

This nomination was presented by Laura Ruby

Action 1: A motion was made by **Bill Souza** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Alton Okinaka

Criteria: A&C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

Kamekichi and Mika Kotake Store Property

45-3620 Mamane Street

Honoka‘a, Hawai‘i 96727

(3) 4-5-016:020

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick

This nomination was presented by Laura Ruby

Action:

A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded:

Ikaika Bantolina

Criterion:

A&C

Level of Significance:

Local

Vote:

6-0-1; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza Peacock) Bantolina abstained. Motion carries.

Honoka‘a United Methodist Church

45-3525 Mamane Street

Honoka‘a, Hawai‘i 96727

(3) 4-5-005:006

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick

This nomination was presented by Laura Ruby

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Bill Souza

Criterion: A&C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in Favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

Teiji Yamatsuka Store

45-3590 Mamane Street
Honoka'a, Hawai'i 96727
(3) 4-5-016:015

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick

This nomination was presented by Laura Ruby

Action: A motion was made by **Bill Souza** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Katie Stephens

Criterion: A&C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 6-0-1; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock) Bantolina abstained. Motion carries.

*Break 11:48am-12:32pm lunch

Cooper Apartments

413 Seaside Avenue

Honolulu, Hawaii 96815

(1) 2-6-021:056

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **Pat Griffin** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Paul Morgan

Criterion: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

Milton Residence

2728 Hillside Avenue

Honolulu, Hawaii 96822

(1) 2-9-015:022

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard.

Action: A motion was made by **Paul Morgan** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Katie Stephens

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Griffin, Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, Bantolina). Motion carries.

Greenly Residence

2386 Līloa Rise

Honolulu, Hawaii 96822

(1) 2-9-006:007

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **Ikaika Bantolina** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Bill Souza

Criteria: A&C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 5-0-2; **All in favor** (Stephens, Morgan, Okinaka, Souza, Bantolina). 2 opposed (Peacock, Griffin). Nomination is not passed

Rice Beach House

Kīpū Road

Līhu'e, Kaua'i 96766

(4) 3-1-001:003

This nomination was removed from the agenda.

Quonset Hut 33

955 Kamehameha Highway

Pearl City, Hawaii 96782

(1) 9-7-023:003

This nomination was removed from the agenda.

F. ADDED AGENDA ITEMS

Ikaika Bantolina had some questions about a statement that was made by the Mayor of Maui County about the recent flood that impacted Iao valley.

Ikaika Bantolina- In regards to what happened on Maui. This only comes up with statements that colleagues ask me to make. I withdraw my statements or comments on this. Are we allowed to make a statement?

Nancy Peacock- Ikaika do you want to say specifically what on Maui?

Bill Souza- Basically big flood that happened in Iao Valley, which is also a famous site of the battle of Kamehameha. Evidently the mayor and his crew (the mayor) took the boulders and grounded them down, and evidently Hawaiians were very concerned about that and wanted an explanation. He was very cavalier with his statements.

Ikaika Bantolina- So from that a colleague wanted an off-record statement. So, in this case when we are put in the position on the record. How do we go about it? Are we allowed to make a statement like that?

Alan Downer- Just because you are on the board that doesn't mean you give up your right as a citizen. So, you can say that this is my view. You have to make it clear that you are representing yourself. You can only say your representing the board if the board has taken an official position.

Bill Souza- So in speaking as an individual. I can't say I'm speaking on behalf of the board. Which brings me to my next question. What did your office do pertaining to these rocks, and the mayor's comments?

Alan Downer- We didn't do anything about the comments, this is the 1st time I'm hearing of them. Now with respect to what's being done in the river itself. We found out that the core of engineers was working on an emergency action. There is a broad interpretation of these individual permits.

Bill Souza- So basically it was handled as a Federal Emergency Project. My concern is that this is Hawaii and we do have history pertaining to that river. My concern is to see that your office is privy or aware so you can make a statement about it. I only heard a slurry of comments. I didn't hear anything official other than the mayor making these tourists unrealistic statements. That only aggravated the situation. To conclude I basically wanted to know if your office had a role in it? Is your office is to notified whenever they, do it? Because by saying...because it was a Federal Emergency kind of thing There is certain criteria involved, therefore the emergency thing supersedes it.

Alan Downer- With respect to both state and federal laws. It doesn't necessarily work perfectly. Neither of the process works very well after the fact. It's no different in Hawaii.

Bill Souza- Do you have a repressive Maui from your office?

Alan Downer- We have our second largest office there.

Bill Souza- Did they get inquiry's about Iao Valley, the reason I ask because the group that was activated was from Maui.

Alan Downer- I don't know if they were contacted, but I did have discussions with them.

Nancy Peacock had some questions regarding the Francis J. Smith apartment building. It was put on the register a couple of years ago. It was an intact art deco building. Even though the owners took off the hardware and removed the windows. But we still put it on the register. What going on now is that there knocking down parts of the original building, stair case. All the window openings are gone it's just a disaster. Isn't staff giving some guidance on how to stabilize it. I don't understand who's monitoring. Don't we have someone that's monitoring. Isn't staff giving some guidance on how to stabilize it. All the architecture charter is continuing to be eroded in a serious way.

Alan Downer- The counties are required to consult with us according to the statutes. If their project has the potential to effect Historic Properties. So, whoever handling the permit decides it something that we don't need to see then we don't see it. We don't see everything we should see.

Nancy Peacock- I'd like to know if SHPD has received anything. Can you give us a report on it?

Alan Downer- We can look into it. I know that they didn't apply for the Federal Tax Credit.

Katie Stephens- Is there some kind of process that's in place that if a building is out on the register. That if your office becomes aware that so much has been done that it is no longer eligible to be on the register?

Megan Borthwick- HAR 198 talks about the rules of the register program. There are 3 reasons that something would be removed from the register. 1) Qualities that had it listed to the register have been lost or destroyed. 2) Upon proof that error in professional judgment has been made. 3) or for failure to follow procedures set forth in these rules. A petition to de-list the property has to be made.

Alan Downer- Our role in the State Register is purely administrative. Only the board can vote to de-list a property.

F. 2017 MEETING DATES

Friday June 2-Friday August 25-Friday December 1-2017

Potential Additional Meeting- the Review Board decided no additional meetings were needed.

Submitted Nominations: The list is subject to change. The August meeting agenda will be will be available on the SHPD website 30 Days prior to the meeting.

G. SUBMITTED NOMINATIONS FOR MARCH 2 MEETING

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to hold a meeting on Thursday June 2, 2017 of the Big Island/Honokaa properties.
Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Peacock, Stephens, Souza, Morgan, Bantolina, Griffin, Okinaka) Motion carries

Action: A motion was made by **Paul Morgan** to hold a **Limited Meeting** on Friday June 2, 2017 of the Big Island/Honokaa properties. The

Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Peacock, Stephens, Souza, Morgan, Bantolina, Griffin, Okinaka) Motion carries

H. MEETING ADJOURNED

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to adjourn the meeting,

Vote: The Board members voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 1:10pm

Respectfully Submitted,

Chandra Hirotsu
Secretary III
State Historic Preservation Division

DRAFT