

DAVID Y. IGE
GOVERNOR OF
HAWAII



STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION
KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING
601 KAMOKILA BLVD, STE 555
KAPOLEI, HAWAII 96707

SUZANNE D. CASE
CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

ROBERT K. MASUDA
FIRST DEPUTY

JEFFREY T. PEARSON, P.E.
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

MINUTES (FINAL REVISED)
HAWAII HISTORIC PLACES REVIEW BOARD MEETING

DATE: Saturday August 26, 2017
TIME: 9:30AM-4:30PM
PLACE: Pearl City Library
1138 Waimano Home Rd
Pearl City, Hawaii 96782

The following were in attendance:

MEMBERS: Nancy Peacock, AIA CHAIR Ikaika Bantolina
Alton Okinaka Katie Stephens
William Souza Matt McDermott
George Casen

STAFF: Alan S. Downer, Administrator
Megan Borthwick, Architectural Historian

**PUBLIC/ HOMEOWNERS/
NOMINATORS:** Don Hibbard Lacey Kazama Shimabukuro
Barbara Ho Stanley Solamillo
Natalie Besl Wallace Kazama
Kai White

The meeting was called to order at 9:30am pm by Chair Nancy Peacock

Ms. Peacock proposed to defer the Staff report to the end on the meeting.
Ms. Peacock proposed to defer the Completion of Nominations to the end of the meeting.

A motion was made by Ikaika Bantolina to amend the agenda.

Seconded by Katie Stephens

A. AGENDA

Approval of the Thursday August 24, 2017 Limited Meeting

Approval of the Friday August 25, 2017 Limited Meeting

Approval of the Saturday August 26, 2017 Meeting

B. MINUTES

Approval/Amendments of the August 24, 2017 Limited Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **William Souza** to approve minutes.

Seconded: **Matt McDermott**

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, Bantolina, McDermott, Casen). Unanimous Motion Carries

Approval/Amendments of the August 25, 2017 Limited Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **William Souza** to approve minutes.

Seconded: **Matt McDermott**

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, Bantolina, McDermott, Casen). Unanimous Motion Carries

Approval/Amendments of the August 26, 2017 Regular Meeting Minutes

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to approve minutes with changes.

Seconded: **George Casen**

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, Bantolina, McDermott, Casen). Unanimous Motion Carries

C. NOMINATIONS

Carlos & Altha Panfigilo
34 Kaapuni Drive
Kailua, Hawaii 96734
(1) 4-3-013:030

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Questions:

Mr. Casen asked about the columns that were shown. Where is it in relation to the house, is it going to be connected to the house. Is there going to be a first floor on the back of the house?

Mr. Hibbard: It is the rear of the house. They were thinking about putting a 2nd story to the house. They're going to tear it all down. It was all to be torn down, but the husband died away in May.

Mr. Casen then said that before we really pursue this.

Mr. Hibbard said that if this property doesn't go on the register. They are going to tear the house down.

Ms. Peacock stated that Mr. Hibbard comment was inappropriate because its putting pressure on us (Board) to imply that if we don't act it's our fault.

Mr. Hibbard responded you think it's important, does the board think its important?

Ms. Peacock again stated that the comment was inappropriate

Mr. Hibbard stated that he was just letting you know from the other point of view.

Mr. Souza asked do they have plans at the present time?

Mr. Hibbard stated they are waiting to see if it is put on the register. They have a architect in mind. And will pursue it once it gets on.

Mr. Souza stated that his view for the decision making if there was a rough sketch of what was going to be done. It seems like if we don't do it it's going to be torn down. And that's not on my conscience. I just feel kind of strange about it. I really like this site, and i think its worthy of preservation because of its style and location. That's the reason i was asking about sketches or plans.

Mr. Hibbard stated that they've been holding off waiting. He was going to take the wall out but he died. So, the wife is waiting to see about hiring an architect.

Mr. Casen stated that we can always D list it. The whole process will be going through the preservation office.

Ms. Peacock stated that in your written description there are no google maps or site plans. The beach façade is important in terms to the presentation to the public. What you don't see and cannot see unless you've been to the site. Is that there actually a modern house on the Makai side. That blocks the access visually of this house. Not that you could see this house even if there was another house that was put on the Makai side because of the in infrastructure of these columns and the large solid walls that are slicing within a foot or two the of the house. When i looked at the original plan its seems to be a lot of modification to the house in the wing of the house. I guess the owner decided to flip the plan. In the original site, there is a lot of growth in the bedroom wing. They increased the square footage of the house, in the original drawings it's a stager between the garage and the bedroom wing. It doesn't match the architect original drawings. And begs the question was that the architect's intentions. And the entry sequence is different.

Mr. Hibbard stated that its not growth they modified they took out a bathroom.

I think that it was done originally. The walls are original. When they flipped it, the must have done it cause there's no way that's not original. The plans that i have obviously got modified because they flipped it.

Mr. Casen asked Ms. Peacock- you said that there is another house on the Makai side. Is it on the same lot?

Ms. Peacock yes, it's on the same lot. I think a google map, if not a site plan would help. It's hard to see and understand the complexity of what's going on in this site that is not conveyed in any of these photographs.

Ms. Peacock asked why is putting it on the register the reason they would not save the house.

Mr. Hibbard responded it was the only reason they changed their plans because we said this is an important property and should be saved.

Ms. Peacock responded but if they were to remove all this stuff, then come and apply why would that not work?

Mr. Hibbard, I think that they would think that I'm lying to them and that no it's not that important and the state thinks that it's not important.

Ms. Peacock responded that if they were told that the addition that they were going to move was the main problem?

Mr. Hibbard responded no they would go back and rethink it.

Action: A motion was made by **William Souza** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.
Seconded: Alton Okinaka
Criterion: C
Level of Significance: Local
Vote: 3-4; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza,) **Opposed** (Peacock, Bantolina, McDermott, Casen). Motion Does Not Pass

Benjamin P & Nancy Carpenter Residence

1310 A Mokulua Drive
Kailua, Hawaii 96727
(1) 4-3-004:098

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.
Seconded: Alton Okinaka
Criterion: A & C
Level of Significance: Local
Vote: 5-1-1; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott). **Opposed** (Casen) Abstained (Bantolina) Motion Does Not Pass

Richard & Alice Edwards Residence

3138 Noela Drive
Honolulu, Hawaii 96815
(1) 3-1-028:020

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Questions:

Owner was present to give story about the pool and the famous kids that skateboarded in it.

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to list the building to the Hawaii Register.

Seconded: **Ikaika Bantolina**
Criterion: C
Level of Significance: Local
Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

Break 15min

Robert S.C. Ho Residence
3030 Noela Drive
Honolulu, Hawaii 96815
(1) 3-1-028:020

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Questions:

Ms. Peacock asked Ms. Ho if she lives in house.

Ms. Ho yes it was my grandfather dying wish that she buys the house.

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Matt McDermott

Criterion: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

Henry Hattie Residence
3007 Diamond Head Road
Honolulu, Hawaii 96815
(1) 3-1-033:038

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Natalie Besl

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: William Souza

Criterion: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 2-5; **All in favor** (McDermott, Souza) **Opposed** (Stephens, Okinaka, Peacock, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Does Not Pass

3001 Diamond Head Road Residence

3001 Diamond Head Road Residence
Honolulu, Hawaii 96815
(1) 3-1-033:052

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Natalie Besl

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Katie Stephens

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

Chun Residence

808 10th Ave
Honolulu, Hawaii 96816
(1) 3-2-021:001

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Natalie Besl

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: William Souza

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local
Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

Mr. & Mrs. Daniel Ching
517 Analu Street
Honolulu, Hawaii 96817
(1) 3-1-033:052

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.
Seconded: Katie Stephens
Criterion: C
Level of Significance: Local
Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

Lanikihonua Water Tower
Olani Street & Aliinui Drive
Kapolei, Hawaii 96734
No TMK

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.
Seconded: William Souza
Criterion: A & C
Level of Significance: Local
Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

Waimalu Shopping Center *

98-020 Kamehameha Hwy
Honolulu, Hawaii 96701
(1) 9-8-022:074,081

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Stanley Solamillo

Action: A motion was made by **Katie Stephens** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Alton Okinaka

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

2336 Oahu Ave

2336 Oahu Ave
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1) 2-9-005:028

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Natalie Besl

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Alton Okinaka

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: **Deferred**

AG Schnack Residence

3174 Alika Ave.
Honolulu, Hawaii 96817
(1) 2-2-045:083

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Natalie Besl

Action: A motion was made by **Ikaika Bantolina** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Katie Stephens

Criterion: C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

EJ & May Lord Residence

121 Ragsdale Place
Honolulu, Hawaii 96817
(1) 2-2-051:007

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

Action: A motion was made by **Matt McDermott** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

1224 Punahou Street

1224 Punahou Street
Honolulu, Hawaii 96826
(1) 2-4-007:003

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Natalie Besl

Action: A motion was made by **William Souza** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Matt McDermott

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

Yim Quon Building

75 North King Street
Honolulu, Hawaii 96817
(1) 1-7-002:009

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Stanley Solamillo

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: William Souza

Criterion: A & C

Level of Significance: Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

Robert P & Eleanor Wayson Sroat Residence

3663 Alani Drive
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
(1) 2-9-047:031

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Don Hibbard

<u>Action:</u>	A motion was made by Matt McDermott to list the building to the Hawaii Register with further recommendation to the National Register.
<u>Seconded:</u>	Katie Stephens
<u>Criterion:</u>	C
<u>Level of Significance:</u>	Local
<u>Vote:</u>	7-0; All in favor (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

3157 Hayden Street
3157 Hayden Street
Honolulu, Hawaii 96815
(1) 3-1-019:085

This nomination was introduced by Megan Borthwick.

This nomination was presented by Kai White

Questions:

Mr. Bantolina- From the original house to the carport up. Was there 10 ft before the house and the carport or was it extended out?

Ms. White responded they moved it back. And was not sure.

Mr. Casen has the railing been changed on the front steps? Is there any logical reason for the design of the current railing compared to the last one? Did they look at pictures? Was there even a railing there historically at all?

Ms. White the pictures don't really tell. The reason that more slats were added was because of building codes standards.

Action: A motion was made by **George Casen** to list the building to the Hawaii Register with the reduced boundaries removing the back structure, further recommendation to the National Register.

Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina

Criterion: C

Level of Significance:

Local

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

D. 2018 MEETING DATES

March 2, 2018- June 1, 2018- August 24, 2018-November 30, 2018
2018 Meeting dates approved.

E. SUBMITTED NOMINATIONS FOR NOVEMBER MEETING

Action: A motion was made by **Alton Okinaka** to hold a limited meeting on Thursday November 30, 2017 of the Oahu properties. The purpose of the site visits are for privacy, safety, access and liability issues.

Seconded: Ikaika Bantolina

Vote: 7-0; **All in favor** (Stephens, Okinaka, Souza, Peacock, McDermott, Casen, Bantolina) Motion Carries

F. STAFF REPORT

Ms. Borthwick

New Listings to the National Register: Little Makalapa Historic District

Makalapa

Bushnell Residence

Cooper Apartments

Sakata Masaaki Property

Two Brothers Shipwreck

Returned Nominations:

Honokaka United Methodist Church

Yamatsuka Store

Once errors are corrected nominations will be re submitted.

Mr. Downer- The house released the proposed budget. The Historic Preservation Fund Grant was proposed to be cut by 8 million. The house recommended it to be cut by 1million.

This would reduce it back to the same amount last year.

State side the message was that the economy is booming we are expecting a good year.

Jessica Puff has resigned.

G. COMPLETENESS OF NOMINATIONS

Mr. Downer: When policy affects groups of individuals broadly, instead of one or two people then it must be adopted in regulation. A Hawaii administrative rule must be written. Then you have to go through the process. If you make any changes to the draft, as a result of comments you have to start the whole process again. As long as it is a direction to staff then it does not have to be a regulation. See **Chapter 13-198-3: Nomination procedure**. “The preservation officer, or any person or agency may nominate a building, structure, object, district, or site for entry into the Hawaii register. Nominations shall be made on the standard national register nomination forms, available in the office of the preservation officer, in accordance with the technical guidelines for the completion of those forms”. The board agrees that locally submitted nominations will be held to National Standards.

H. MEETING ADJOURNED

Action: A motion was made by Nancy Peacock to adjourn the meeting seconded by

Vote: The Board members voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 3:50pm

Respectfully Submitted,

Chandra Hirotsu
Secretary III
State Historic Preservation Division

FINAL

DRAFT