



STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION
KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING
601 KAMOKILA BLVD STE 555
KAPOLEI HI 96707

ESTHER KIA'AINA
FIRST DEPUTY
WILLIAM M. TAM
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER
AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

MINUTES
HAWAII HISTORIC PLACES REVIEW BOARD Meeting

DATE: SATURDAY, April 6, 2013
TIME: 1:00 p.m.
PLACE: Kalanimoku Building
1151 Punchbowl Street Room 132
Honolulu HI 96809

The following were in attendance:

MEMBERS: George Casen Thomas Lim
Jeffery Dodge Julie Taomia
James (Kimo) Guequierre Lorraine Minatoishi
William Chapman

STAFF: Puaalaokalani Aiu, State Historic Preservation Division Administrator
Angie Westfall, Architecture Branch Chief
Ross Stephenson, Architectural Historian
Cicely Lorenzo-Ganir, Secretary III

GUESTS: William Souza Stanley Solamillo
Roger Ulveling Margi Ulveling
Carol Stevenson Jennifer Carvalho
Don Hibbard Monica Bacon
Anna Grune Janis Turner
Millie Okada-Miura Eric Miura
Glenn Mason Lynette Kotake
Joan Harper

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by William Chapman at 1:08 p.m. Seven members were present. Board Member Gerald DeMello did not attend because he injured himself.

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Board Member Casen requested two changes be made to the 10 November 2012 Hawaii Historic Places Review Board Meeting Minutes:

- (1) Minor typo under the Mendonca Beach House section: “Casen” instead of “Casem”
- (2) Under Egholm Kiele Avenue House: change “resembles” to “maintains”

ACTION: *A motion was made by Chairman William Chapman to approve the November 10, 2012, minutes, seconded by Thomas Lim.*

VOTE: *The Board members voted unanimously to approve the November 10, 2012, minutes. Motion carries.*

III. RESIGNATION OF ROB IOPA

Ross Stephenson announced that Rob Iopa is no longer on the Hawaii Historic Places Review Board. There are new appointees. Bill Souza’s hearing is on Tuesday. He would be able to fill the Hawaiian Consultant slot. Also, Nancy Peacock, whose hearing has not yet been scheduled, would be able to fill an architect slot.

Stephenson also mentioned that this will be James (Kimo) Guequierre’s last meeting as a Board Member, after having served on the Board for 8 years.

There was discussion about the Board having to fill one person in each category (Hawaiian Consultant, Archaeology, Architecture, etc.).

Laura Schuster also expressed interest in coming back to the Board.

Stephenson mentioned that there is an on-line application to fill out.

IV. NPS CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN

Pua Aiu, State Historic Preservation Division’s Administrator, updated the Board members on the National Park Service Corrective Action Plan (NPS CAP).

Completed Items:

Review and Compliance

Staff training

Coordinate letters

National Park Service

 Implement review standards (on web)

 Tracking logs

 Annual Training for Review Board

 Consult with Native Hawaiian Organizations on NR Nominations

CLG

Develop standard procedures
Certify CLGs

State Plan

Is completed and a copy will be mailed out to Review Board members that request a hardcopy.

Staffing:

Filled Positions:

GIS Specialist
IT Specialist
Oahu Lead Archaeologist
Hawaii Lead Archaeologist
Hawaii Assistant Archaeologist

Not filled:

Maui Lead Archaeologist (advertised)
Kauai Archaeologist (no funds)
Architectural Historian (no funds)
Librarian (limited funds due to sequestration)
CLG Specialist (no funds, federal)

Positions that were filled prior to March 2010:

Architectural Branch Chief
Archaeology Branch Chief
Architectural Historian
Oahu Assistant Archaeologist

Maui Assistant Archaeologist

Other outstanding items:

Revisions to standard operating procedures for Survey and Inventory and Review and Compliance – turned in Feb 1
Finalize Survey Standards – being worked on right now, will continue to be a work in progress.
Division is focusing efforts on doing surveys:
 Kauai
 Kahuku
Update GIS -- in progress
 all Oahu staff have access to GIS
 Hawaii Island has access to GIS
 Maui is waiting for equipment
Strategic Plan draft is done

V. SHPD OFFICE REPORT/BUDGET REPORT

Pua Aiu, State Historic Preservation Division's Administrator, updated the Board on SHPD's budget for FY 2014 and FY 2015.

+ Update GIS/ESRI Licenses, Computers and DocuShare Equipment
FY 2014 \$62,400/ FY 2015 \$44,900

+ Change method of funding for 2 special funded positions (Kauai Archaeologist and Architectural Historian) to general funds = \$142,448

House kept these in but eliminated on Cultural Historian Position.

+ Senate changed equipment request to special funds and decreased the request for staffing to \$122,448.

When asked why the staffing request was reduced by \$20,000 Aiu could not recall at the time, but relayed that the requested \$20,000 was for raises and that was deleted.

Vice-Chair Minatoishi inquired about SB 1171.

Administrator Aiu clarified that this is an administrative bill that was brought up after the rail case said that SHPD violated its own rules about phasing projects. In the Federal law, phasing is allowed. But in the State law, phasing is not allowed. Department of Transportation (D.O.T.) Highways are most affected by this bill because they do their projects in phases. The Attorney General says that without SB 1171, the D.O.T. Highways are vulnerable. The bill is a D.O.T. issue, limited to linear projects and certain large projects. For example, Malu Ulukai -- The Royal Compound -- in Lahaina, Maui. This was a Section 106 project, where the archaeology was done in phases.

Vice-Chair Minatoishi inquired about the E.I.S. (Environmental Impact Statement) process. Aiu stated that once an E.I.S. is done, can do an Archaeological Inventory Survey (A.I.S.) with the E.I.S. and that no A.I.S. is done on all the different routes -- this is not normally done. The A.I.S. can be done afterwards or on the preferred route.

Aiu clarified that SB 1171 will allow for phasing of only D.O.T. projects at this time.

Taomia inquired about how the bill will be implemented; mentioning that there is a federal term for phasing of certain projects -- that involves splitting up the project into little/tiny pieces. Architecture Branch Chief Westfall identified this term as "segmentation." Aiu clarified that the E.I.S. is the consideration of the whole project -- that involves knowing where the whole route is going and phasing the A.I.S. along that chosen route.

VI. ARCHITECTURE STYLES TALK BY DR. WILLIAM CHAPMAN

*** This information was presented while Vice-Chair Minatoishi stepped out at 1:35 p.m.*

“Architectural Styles: Your Old House in Hawaii.”

Chair Chapman presented 65 slides showing U.S. Mainland and Hawaii examples of the following:

- Federal Style c. 1780 – 1840
- Greek Revival 1825 – 1860
- Gothic Revival 1840 – 1880
- Italianate Style 1840 – 1900
- Second Empire 1860 – 1900
- Stick Style 1860 – 1900
- Queen Anne 1880 – 1910
- Shingle Style 1880 – 1900
- Colonial Revival 1880 – 1955
- Neoclassical Revival 1895 – 1950
- Tudor 1890 – 1940
- Storybook Style 1920 – 1940
- Italian Renaissance Revival 1890 – 1935
- Mission Style 1900 – 1930
- Spanish Eclectic 1915 – 1940
- Monterey Style 1925 – 1955
- Craftsman 1905 – 1940
- Prairie 1900 – 1930
- Modernistic 1920 – 1940
- Mid-Century Modern
- International Style 1925 – 1960

The presentation ended at 2:20 p.m.

Chair Chapman called for a break at 2:21 p.m.

Chair Chapman called the meeting back to order at 2:34 p.m.

VII. NOMINATIONS

*** This section of the agenda was addressed after the return of Vice-Chair Minatoishi at 2:42 p.m.*

A. City and County of Honolulu (1)

Name: **Kunia Camp**
Address: Area bounded by Kunia and Puu Drives, Paani and Lua Wai Streets and Kunia Road
TMK: (1) 9-2-005:023
Owners: Kunia Village Title Holding Company
Presenter: Glenn Mason, AIA

This nomination was presented by Ross Stephenson. He requested SHPD and the Board to consider making a thematic study of plantation architecture. Kunia shows the evolution of plantation camps, and what happens when camps start consolidating. In the first part, you notice 1920s style structures. Farther in, there are 1930 style structures. In the front of the camp, the newer section, the design is like a small town. Stephenson believes this is a unique opportunity to study the different types of buildings, especially since the camp is all under one owner.

ACTION: *A motion was made by George Casen to nominate the property to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C, seconded by Thomas Lim.*

Discussion

At this time, Glenn Mason and Monica Bacon answered questions from the Board.

Mason and Bacon want to include as many buildings as possible to the nomination. They were unable to confirm the number of buildings that were moved from other camps, as there are no records. Non-contributing buildings can be demolished. They want to maintain the neighborhood feel. The project has come a long way; the original owner wanted to demolish everything.

Bacon clarified that there are 12 houses (whose address is in the 800 range), making up 10% of the buildings, that are non-contributing.

Per Board Member Taomia's inquiry and Chair Chapman's point about relating to the internal cohesion of the narrative, Mason and Bacon will change to periods of significance to 1972.

Bacon will also check the UTM coordinates, per Taomia's inquiry.

Mason will also include more in the narrative (page 18, Section 9, third paragraph, second sentence) about what is in the district – what those types are.

Vice-Chair Minatoishi thought the drawings were nice, but asked about including dimensions.

Mason and Bacon can add the dimensions. Mason clarified that some house types have square footage measurements available – but these may be inaccurate. They have noticed floor plan and size disparities. Others will have to be measured, to create plans from scratch. Due to some of the houses being occupied, getting the dimensions will be a continual process (taking anywhere from six months to one year) to gather all the floor plans.

Vice-Chair Minatoishi and Taomia will review the updated narrative and floor plan dimensions once they are complete.

Mason also clarified that the owner specifically wants the property on the National Register.

VOTE: *The Board members voted unanimously in favor of listing the camp on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C. Motion carries.*

Furthermore:

ACTION: *A motion was made by Lorraine Minatoishi to recommend the property be nominated to the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C, seconded by Kimo Guequierre.*

VOTE: *The Board members voted unanimously in favor of recommending the camp be nominated to the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C. Motion carries.*

Mason post-script: The one thing that makes this camp really special is that it is so isolated. It really has the "camp" feeling. There is no encroaching suburban development. This owner also owns agricultural land around the camp, and the camp will stay this way -- which is a huge advantage.

Name: **Eichelberger Family Residence**
Address: 1556 Mokulua Drive (Lanikai)
TMK: (1) 4-3-003:067
Owner: Margaret Ulveling Trust
Presenter: Anna Grune

Anna Grune presented four slides of the house.

Chair Chapman inquired about the original roof (that lasted until Hurricane Iniki). Grune answered that the original roof was a wood shingle. The roof on the lanai and garage are asphalt.

Chair Chapman and Taomia inquired about the period of significance. Taomia pointed out that the significant dates tie into the period of significance. Chair Chapman suggested expanding the period of significance. Solamillo clarified for the Board that the period of significance is a date range, not one specific date.

Vice-Chair Minatoishi thought there were nice interior things about the house. She also had a problem with the roof – stating that colors, textures, and materials matter.

Casen commented on Lanikai being a potential district.

Angie Westfall, Architecture Branch Chief, was asked to comment on behalf of the State. She thinks this residence is definitely eligible for the Hawaii Register. In context, the site is intact. The exterior and interior reflect Mid-Century Modern (1960), and there are no additions to the house. The roof is 30 years old, and the owner's have committed to changing the roof back to one that is appropriate for the time period. This residence is an excellent candidate.

ACTION: ***A motion was made by Jeff Dodge to nominate the property to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C, seconded by Thomas Lim.***

Discussion

Chair Chapman found the roof to be problematic. He references a tile roof that imitates the shingle.

Dodge had a problem with the texture and character of the roof. The early roof was very simplistic.

Taomia and Casen questioned the level of association to Cooke.

Guequierre liked the new 30 year old roof, better than the original roof shingles that were painted white. Grune points out that the new roof is actually gray-colored, not blue – the reflection of the sky makes it look blue at certain angles.

Casen and Chair Chapman pointed out that the nomination should emphasize Eichelberger, and mention evidence of Cooke.

VOTE: ***The Board members voted. 6 members were in favor of listing the residence on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C. There was 1 opposition (Minatoishi). Motion carries.***

Name: **William H. and Lina Getz Residence**
Address: 2756 Pacific Heights Road
TMK: (1) 2-2-030:011
Owner(s): Eric Miura and Mildred Okada Trusts
Presenter: Don Hibbard, Ph.D.

Don Hibbard presented five slides of the house.

Guequierre inquired about the period of significance.

Hibbard clarified that some interior changes were done in the 1980s.

ACTION: *A motion was made by George Casen to nominate the property to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C, seconded by Thomas Lim.*

Discussion

Chair Chapman commented on how the basic “bones” and “guts” of the structure are there.

Vice-Chair Minatoishi inquired about the stair detail being original. Hibbard clarified that it was original.

Aiu pointed out that in most of the nomination, Lila Getz (not Lina) was referenced. Hibbard clarified that it should be Lina, and he will make the corrections to the nomination.

Lim liked the residence.

Dodge pointed out that some finishes have been altered, that detract from the building. He mentioned sensitivity in replacement of materials. Hibbard clarified that floors were changed, and there were also changes made to minor sections of the house (such as the bathroom).

Chair Chapman and Vice-Chair Minatoishi pointed out the exterior railing above the sun porch that was added in 1980. Hibbard considered it a secondary feature, while Minatoishi thought it was prominent in the façade of the structure.

Guequierre and Vice-Chair Minatoishi commented on the second floor awnings.

Hibbard pointed out that there are no historic photos of this house. He even researched write-ups in old newspapers, but there were none.

Chair Chapman complimented Hibbard’s excellent work on the nomination.

Casen had issue with further changes made to the residence once it is on the State Register. Chair Chapman pointed out that when the owner goes to get a permit, SHPD will make suggestions at that time. Dodge inquired about records on file for this property that would make it easier to flag if changes are going to be made. Aiu stated that in 10 years when the tax exemption needs to be updated, the property should be flagged at the City and County level.

Casen questioned a threshold or checklist to determine if a structure is significant.

Lim pointed out that it is difficult to have a threshold when some houses are a mixture of “this and that.” He also stated that styles are arbitrary, ad-hoc.

Chair Chapman noted that some houses are a mixture of things that balance out.

Casen made reference to the importance of restoration architects, to SHPD being more proactive, and emphasized the importance of education.

VOTE: *The Board members voted. 6 members were in favor of listing the residence on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C. There was 1 opposition (Guequierre). Motion carries.*

**After discussion with the owners after the vote, Hibbard informed the Board that the owners will change the railing on the sun porch to not detract from the façade of the structure.

Name: **Dr. A. Clifford Braly House**
Address: 2608 Ferdinand Avenue (Manoa)
TMK: (1) 2-9-009:016
Owner: Peggy Martin Trust
Presenter: Don Hibbard, Ph.D.

Don Hibbard presented five slides of the house.

ACTION: *A motion was made by James Kimo Guequierre to nominate the property to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criterion C, seconded by Thomas Lim.*

Discussion

Taomia questioned the period of significance, pointing out that it does not have to be exactly 50 years. The period should expand to 1935.

VOTE: *The Board members voted unanimously in favor of listing the residence on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criterion C. Motion carries.*

Name:
Address: **931 14th Avenue** (Kaimuki)
TMK: (1) 3-2-047:014
Owners: Lynette and Mervyn Kotake
Presenter: Joan Harper

Joan Harper presented five slides of the house.

Chair Chapman commented on Harper's excellent job on the nomination.

Dodge commented on the rapidly changing area. He hopes getting this house on the State Register can stop the trend, and encourage others houses in the area to get on the State Register, too.

ACTION: *A motion was made by Julie Taomia to nominate the property to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criterion C, seconded by Lorraine Minatoishi.*

There was no need for discussion on this property

VOTE: *The Board members voted unanimously in favor of listing the residence on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criterion C. Motion carries.*

At 4:07 p.m. James Kimo Guequierre left the meeting to catch his flight. From this point on, there are six Board Members present at the meeting.

Name: **Daniel and Gertrude Balch Residence**
Address: 3031 Diamond Head Road
TMK: (1) 3-1-033:042
Owners: David Larson and Janis Turner
Presenter: Don Hibbard, Ph.D.

Don Hibbard presented five slides of the house.

Janis Turner noted that the owner, her father, re-did the roof himself. At the time, there were no other alternatives and no one else was willing to do it in the same style.

ACTION: *A motion was made by Thomas Lim to nominate the property to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C, seconded by Jeffery Dodge.*

Discussion

Chair Chapman commented on certain features of the house being outstanding. However, he is not pleased with the beam on the front of the house.

Dodge commented on many features of the house being changed in the 1980s to new materials. The visual impressions of the changes do not provide enough clues and keys to keep it in the period of significance. He mentioned creating a list of detracting features for the owners, so that they have a better respect and understanding of what to preserve.

Hibbard mentioned that at a distance, the changes do not detract from the visual view.

VOTE: *The Board members voted. 5 members were in favor of listing the residence on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C. There was 1 opposition (Dodge).*

Vote must be retaken per Attorney General's office because only five members were present and action requires a minimum of six members.

B. Maui County (2)

Name: **Honolua Store**
Address: 502 Office Road (Kapalua)
TMK: (2)
Owners: Maui Land and Pineapple/ABC Stores
Presenter: Stanley Solamillo

Stanley Solamillo presented five slides of this building.

He mentioned the importance of this structure because it is all that is left of the original Honolua Plantation. It survived, and it was documented by Mason Architects.

Taomia questioned the period of significance. Solamillo will change the period of significance to reflect the property of this store and reference in the narrative an earlier store that was on a different property.

ACTION: *A motion was made by Julie Taomia to nominate the property to the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A, B, and C, seconded by Lorraine Minatoishi.*

Discussion

Chair Chapman and Casen commended Solamillo on his excellent nomination.

VOTE: *The Board members voted unanimously in favor of listing the store on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places under Criteria A, B, and C. Motion carries.*

Furthermore:

ACTION: *A motion was made by George Casen to recommend the property be nominated to the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A, B, and C, seconded by Julie Taomia.*

VOTE: *The Board members voted unanimously in favor of recommending the store be nominated to the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A, B, and C. Motion carries.*

C. Hawaii County (3)
None

D. Kauai (4)
None

VIII. FORWARDING TO THE NATIONAL REGISTER

Kilauea Lodge

Stephenson notified the Board that the owner has asked that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register.

Chairman Chapman provided clarification on how criteria for the State Register and criteria for the National Register correspond to each other. A property can be locally significant and listed on the National Register, if the owner wants it listed on the National Register.

Before action was taken, Chairman Chapman pointed out that more National Register nominations are good for the State Program, from the federal point of view. Also, that a lot of states do not have a very active State Register. Three states he has worked with nominate to the National Register and these properties are automatically listed on the State Register.

Aiu stated that we need to look at the law. If it is changed so that properties have to be on the National Register in order to be on the State Register, this may be hard.

Most agreed that many properties are put on the State Register for the local tax benefits. Many stay clear of the federal system.

Stephenson mentioned that many properties are failing to be listed on the State Register and National Register because these are facilities that do not have budgets to pay for the cost of a private party to complete the nomination. The only alternative is if the state provides that funding budget for the Registers.

Chairman Chapman knows of some states that provide funding for survey and planning to non-profit organizations that do the nomination.

Solamillo stated that it is unfortunate that only people with money can put their property on the Register.

*** This information was presented after Chairman Chapman's Presentation, while waiting for the return of the seventh Board Member, Vice-Chair Minatoishi.*

Vice-Chair Minatoishi returned at 2:42 p.m.

A motion was made, and a vote was taken before the close of the meeting, with six members present, at 4:33 p.m.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Lorraine Minatoishi to recommend the property be nominated to the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C, seconded by Thomas Lim.

VOTE:

The Board members voted unanimously in favor of recommending the store be nominated to the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A and C pending suggested revisions and changes to the nomination. Motion carries.

IX. UPCOMING PROJECTS

*** This information was presented while awaiting the return of the Vice-Chair Minatoishi.*

A. Hanapepe Bridge

1911 bridge on the south side of Kauai. It has a 1926 extension -- a ramp for fishing on the Hanapepe River. SHPD is talking to the County of Kauai about the bridge, and they have not objected to listing it on the State Register. The community wrote the nomination. This nomination needs to be worked on some more before it is presented to the Board.

B. Honokaa

This nomination is still in the process of being finished up. One major challenge in setting up the district is that 51% of the owners have to agree. (Conversely, over 50% have to disagree to not be on the State Register.) There is a lot of misinformation that needs to be overcome. Honokaa is the largest collection of commercial vernacular architecture left in Hawaii.

C. Keakealani School (Volcano)

This building is from the first decade of the 20th century. It has a beautiful interior with huge double-hung windows from period schoolhouses.

D. Lanai City Nomination

SHPD is talking with Ellison, the owner. He is much more willing to put the area around Dole Park into the district. SHPD hopes to move forward and work together with the owner.

E. Marine Air Base Ewa Battlefield Grant

The community decided three months ago to seek a Federal Battlefield Commission Grant to get better documentation of the Marine base that was being built in Ewa at the time the war happened. If nothing is done to preserve this area, the site will be obliterated by development. There are bullet holes on the runway from Dec. 7th, there are markings on the ground where planes burned, etc.

F. Moiliili Japanese Cemetery

Community volunteers are very active in this nomination. The cemetery was founded in 1908 when the Japanese were moving off the plantation camps. This cemetery was not connected to any temple. There are different types of architecture

that show the assimilation of the Japanese into the greater community – although there are mainly Buddhist structures, there are also other influences. You can see regional differences in funerary architecture: Okinawan vs. Japanese. One of the historic people in the cemetery is Myles Fukunaga, of the Massey Case. He is known for being hung during the territorial period when racial injustice was rampant.

G. Volcano Japanese Language School

The gentleman that lives next door to this property acquired the building because he wanted to save it and kept it intact. The building has been used as an educational facility ever since it was acquired. This building is another great example of an institution, while similar ones have been torn down or demolished because of the war or because of time.

X. ADJOURNMENT

ACTION: *A motion was made by Julie Taomia to adjourn the meeting, and was seconded by Thomas Lim.*

VOTE: *The Board members voted all in favor. Motion carries.*

The meeting adjourned at 4:35 p.m.

Next Meeting Date: July 2013

Respectfully Submitted,

Cicely Lorenzo-Ganir
Secretary III
State Historic Preservation Division