KAUA'I HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION



JODI A. HIGUCHI SAYEGUSA, CLERK OF COMMISION

October 23, 2023

Chair Katie Stephens Hawai'i Historic Places Review Board State Historic Preservation Division Kakuhihewa Building 601 Kamokila Blvd., Ste. 555 Kapolei, Hawai'i 96707 GERALD IDA, CHAIR SUSAN REMOALDO, VICE CHAIR LEE GATELY, MEMBER KATHLEEN KIKUCHI-SAMONTE, MEMBER CAROLYN LARSON, MEMBER STEPHEN LONG, MEMBER SANDI QUINSAAT, MEMBER AUBREY SUMMERS, MEMBER VICTORIA WICHMAN, MEMBER

Subject: KHPRC Recommendation Letter for: Nomination to the State Historic Register Matsumoto Residence Property Address: 2257 Kuai Road Tax Map Keys: (4) 2-8-018:031 Poʻipū, Hawaiʻi

Dear Chair Stephens,

This letter memorializes the action taken by the Kaua'i Historic Preservation Review Commission at its meeting on <u>October 19, 2023</u> concerning the consideration of a single-family residence to the State Register of Historic Places.

The Commission voted to support the nomination to the State Register with the following comment/ condition as suggested by the Director's Report:

The Planning Department recommends that the Kaua'i Historic Preservation Review Commission support the proposed nomination for the single-family residence and the shade house to be listed onto the Hawai'i Register of Historic Places. In addition, the Department encourages the Applicant, in coordination with other neighboring property owners, to explore pursuing a separate nomination of the ahupua'a wall, and other pre-contact features in the proximity, that may be eligible for listing to the National or State Historic Register of Places.

In addition, please find attached a copy of the Director's Report for the Board's transmittal.

Please be aware that the meeting minutes of the October 19, 2023 discussion may not be available in time for the November 17, 2023 Hawai'i Historic Places Review Board meeting. If you have any further questions regarding this matter, please contact planner Marisa Valenciano of my staff at (808) 241-4050.

Sincerely,

)odi Higuchi Sayegusa

Jodi A. Higuchi Sayegusa Clerk, Kaua'i Historic Preservation Review Commission

4444 Rice Street, Suite A473 • Līhu'e, Hawai'i 96766 • (808) 241-4050 (b) An Equal Opportunity Employer



DEREK S.K. KAWAKAMI, MAYOR REIKO MATSUYAMA, MANAGING DIRECTOR

Kaua'i County Historic Preservation Review Commission (KHPRC)

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

I. SUMMARY

Action Required by KHPRC:

A recommendation to the Hawai'i Historic Places Review Board concerning the consideration of a single-family residence for nomination to the Hawai'i Register of Historic Places.

KHPRC action may include the following:

- Support for the nomination;
- Opposition to the nomination;
- Deferred action on the nomination; or
- Receival for the record and with no comment

II. PROJECT INFORMATION

Permit Numbers	HPRC-2024-2			
Parcel Location:	2257 Kuai Road Poʻipū, Kauaʻi			
Tax Map Key(s):	(4) 2-8-018:031	Area:	15,676 sq. ft./ 0.3599 acres	
LAND USE DESIGNATIONS & VALUES				
Zoning:	R-4, Special Management Area (SMA), and Visitor Destination Area (VDA)			
State Land Use District:	Urban			
General Plan Designation:	Resort			
Owner(s)/ Applicant:	Matthew Chun Trust Sylvia Griswold Trust			

III. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The Applicants, Matthew Chun and Sylvia Griswold, are the owners of the subject property and have initiated the process to nominate their single-family residence

for listing onto the Hawai'i Register of Historic Places. As represented, the Applicants have identified 1 contributing building, the single-family residence, and 1 contributing structure, a detached shade house, as part of the resources within the property. The Applicants assert that the contributing buildings are eligible for listing based on Criteria C and have retained its integrity.

The subject property is located within a residential subdivision near Po'ipū Beach Park and borders the Kāneiolouma heiau complex at the rear property line. The single-family residence, constructed in 1950, is a one-story, 3 bedroom and 1 bathroom house with a living area of approximately 980 square feet. The bungalow style design also includes an attached garage and laundry room as well as access to the detached shade house.

In addition to the buildings, the subject property has lava rock walls that border the side and front property lines; lava rock foundations in the back of the property for a former shade house and hot house that have since been removed; and a lava rock wall, that may be an ahupua'a wall that traverses through the rear of the property. In conversations with the Applicants' representative, it has been clarified that the lava rock feature, which may have pre-contact significance, is not included in the nomination and that the contributing buildings are the focus of this review.

The Department will evaluate the contributing buildings in keeping with the Applicants' nomination form but acknowledges that further research may be needed to determine the historical significance of the pre-contact feature. In addition, the property owner, in coordination with other neighboring properties owners, may want to pursue a separate nomination form.

IV. TRIGGER FOR KHPRC REVIEW

Hawai'i Revised Statutes (HRS) §6E-2 defines "Historic property" as "any building, structure, object, district, area, or site, including heiau and underwater site, which is over fifty years old."

Hawai'i Administrative Rules Title 13 defines "Significant Historic Property" as "any historic property that meets the criteria" for listing on the Hawai'i Register of Historic Places under HAR 275-6(b) or HAR 2846(b).

a. The single-family residence is at least 50 years old and is by law defined as a "historic property." There are no records to verify the exact age of the detached shade house so it is unknown whether the structure is considered historic.

b. The subject property <u>IS</u> included on the KHPRC Inventory List.

c. As part of the nomination process, KHPRC can provide comments on the nomination for transmittal to the Hawai'i Historic Places Review Board. The board at its meeting on November 17, 2023 will make the official determination on whether the property is eligible for listing.

V. CRITERIA FOR NOMINATIONS TO THE HAWAI'I REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES

Pursuant to HAR Section 13-198-8, in deciding whether a property should be entered and ordered into the Hawai'i register, the review board shall evaluate whether the property meets or possesses, individually or in combination, the following criteria or characteristics.

(1) The quality of significance in Hawaiian history, architecture, archeology, and culture, which is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects of State and local importance that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:

(A) That are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to broad patterns of our American or Hawaiian history.

<u>Applicants' Position:</u> The Applicants did not identify Criteria A as a point of eligibility.

<u>Department's Evaluation:</u> The Department concurs with the Applicants' position on Criteria A.

(B) That are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.

<u>Applicants' Position:</u> The Applicants did not identify Criteria B as a point of eligibility.

<u>Department's Evaluation:</u> The Department concurs with the Applicants' position on Criteria B.

(C) That embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic value, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

Applicants' Position:

As represented in the nomination form, the Applicants assert that the subject property is historically significant in a local context under Criteria Cembodying the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction. The single-family residence, which is architecturally significant, is a late example of a bungalow constructed on Kauai during the post WWII period.

Department's Evaluation:

According to the National Register Bulletin #15 on "How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation," to be eligible under Criteria C, a property must meet <u>at least one</u> of the following requirements:

- 1) embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction;
- 2) represent the work of a master;
- 3) possess high artistic value; or
- 4) represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

As provided in the Historic Hawaii Foundation's, "Guidelines for Maintaining Hawaii's Traditional Houses" (2023)¹, the Matsumoto residence has character defining features that are consistent with the plantation style homes constructed around the 1940s (see Table 1 below). Although the Applicants assert that this is a bungalow style home, the dwelling appears to be a bungalow home with plantation-style features such as the single wall construction, corrugated iron roof, lava rock materials, exterior girts, and original double hung windows. In addition to the exterior, the dwelling also retains character defining features in the interior such as the original cabinetry and fixtures as well as the interior girt as structural support. Even though the dwelling was constructed in the post WWII era, it may still be representative of homes that were built around this time.

<u>Therefore, the Department finds that the subject property is likely to</u> <u>qualify under Criteria C as embodying the distinctive characteristics of</u> <u>a type, period, or method of construction.</u>

¹ Historic Hawaii Foundation. "Guidelines for Maintaining Hawaii's Traditional Houses." 2023. <u>hhf_vintage-home-maintenance-brochure-2023.weblr.fnl.pdf (kauai.gov)</u>

 Table 1. Comparison of Character Defining Features

Character Defining Historic Hawaii Foundation Matsumoto Residence			
Feature	Single Family Dwelling, c. 1940 Building Type	(1950)	
Roof Type	Hipped Roof	Hipped Roof	
Roof Material	Wood Shingles or Corrugated Metal	Corrugated Metal	
Roof Eaves	Open eaves with fascia or closed eaves with screened ventilation ports	Open, overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails.	
Exterior Siding Material	Single wall construction of 1x10 or 1x12 tongue and groove boards reinforced with one or two courses of 1x3 wood girts mid-height	Single wall construction with 7" tongue and groove boards with an exterior girt	
Lanai	Open lanai with exposed 4x4 wood post, 2x3 wood framed railing and decking of 1x12 spaced boards	No Lanai. The back of the house is an attached single-car garage and a laundry room.	
Frontage	Concrete steps with lava rock knee (aka pony) wall or concrete block with stone cap	Lava rock porch with concrete steps	
Doors	Flush or single-panel exterior doors with flat wood casing	Single panel screen doors and single panel doors	
Windows	Boxed wood double-hung, sliding or casement windows with flat wood casing, often paired	Wooden double hung sash windows and six- pane sliding windows.	
Foundation	Wood post and knee braced foundation resting on stone or concrete footings (aka tofu blocks); foundation screened by 1x1 lath skirting, horizontal or vertical	Lattice approach runs around the foundation.	

(D) That have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

<u>Applicants' Position:</u> The Applicants did not identify Criteria D as a point of eligibility.

<u>Department's Evaluation:</u> The Department concurs with the Applicants' position on Criteria D.

(2) Environmental impact, i.e., whether the preservation of the building, site, structure, district, or object significantly enhances the environmental quality of the State.

The preservation of the buildings <u>will continue</u> to enhance the environmental quality of the State.

(3) The social, cultural, educational, and recreational value of the building, site, structure, district, or object, when preserved, presented, or interpreted, contributes significantly to the understanding and enjoyment of the history and culture of Hawai'i, the pacific area, or the nation.

The contributing buildings <u>may</u> contribute significantly to the understanding and enjoyment of the history and culture of Hawai'i, the pacific area, or the nation.

VI. PROJECT HISTORY AND BACKGROUND

a. Zoning Permit History

The Department does not maintain any zoning permits or construction plans for the subject property.

VII. EVALUATION OF HISTORIC INTEGRITY

a. Aspects of Historic Integrity

Integrity is defined as the ability of a property to convey its significance. The Applicants assert that the buildings are in excellent condition and have retained its historic integrity in terms of its location, setting, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. In 1973, the County of Kaua'i Real Property tax assessment records show that the dwelling maintained the following character defining features: T&G exterior wall, corrugated iron metal roof, hip roof design, canec ceilings, and pine flooring. Although there are no zoning permits on record to verify the construction and alteration of each structure, the Applicants have stated that minor modifications were done after Hurricane Iniki to rewire the house and to replace the ceiling and roof with in-

kind materials. The Applicants have also replaced jalousie windows with wooden, double hung windows to restore what would have been original to the home. Finally, the nomination form states that some interior renovations were done to the kitchen and the bathrooms. Despite some of these minor modifications, the structures appear to retain their integrity with much of the original design and materials intact. The overall integrity continues to be recognizable and representative of a bungalow home, with plantation style elements and materials.

VIII. RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing evaluation, the Planning Department recommends that the Kaua'i Historic Preservation Review Commission **SUPPORT** the proposed nomination for the single family residence and the shade house to be listed onto the Hawai'i Register of Historic Places. In addition, the Department **encourages** the Applicant, in coordination with other neighboring property owners, to explore pursuing a separate nomination of the ahupua'a wall, and other pre-contact features in the proximity, that may be eligible for listing to the National or State Historic Register of Places.

The Commission is further advised that this report does not represent the Planning Department's final recommendation in view of the forthcoming public hearing process whereby the entire record should be considered prior to decision making. The entire record includes but is not limited to:

- a. Government agency comments;
- b. Testimony from the general public and interested others; and
- c. The land owner's response.

By _____ Marisa Valenciano

MARISA VALENCIANO Planner

Approved & Recommended to Commission:

Jodi Higuchi Sayegusa JODI A. HIGUCHI SAYAGUSA

⁶JODI A. HIGUCHI SAYAGUSA Deputy Director of Planning Date: 10-11-2023