

Auwahi Wind FY2023 Annual Report Comment Matrix							
Comment Number	Commenting Agency	Comment Date	Document Section	PDF Page	Highlighted Text	Question/Comment	Response
1							
2	Note that in multiple places in the document both DOFAW and PIFWO highlighted text but did not attach any comments. Those instances are not tracked in this matrix. Only actual comments are tracked.						
3	PIFWO	9/13/2023	1.0	1	TE64153A-0	reminder that with the amendment it's -1 (as stated in the note on the page above)	Document number was revised to TE64153A-1
4	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.2	2	Table 2-1. Eurasian skylark	can Auwahi resend this one? It's not in our records.	Yes, AW will provide
5	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.2	3	Table 2-1	confirming Auwahi only sends notifications/reports on covered and MBTA species.	Yes
6	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.3	3	Conducted during FY 2023	quarterly? How often?	Text edited. Quarterly.
7	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.3	3	Table 2-2. Carcass persistence	What does the predator/scavenging trapping look like at Auwahi this FY?	AW traps to ensure a high probability that carcasses persist until the next search. Carcass persistence probabilities remain high for bats and birds.
8	DOFAW	9/28/2023	2.4	4	Sixty-four SEEF trials were conducted during FY 2023 (	Delete extra space	Edit completed
9	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.4	4	Searcher efficiency was 100% for both bats and large birds.	Good to hear	Comment noted
10	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.5.2.1	8	Indirect take was estimated as 7.73 adults	85 total	Correct. 77 bats estimated through direct take plus 8 estimated through indirect take.
11	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.5.2.2	9	(observed take of 2 adults during the breeding season * 0.63 average reproductive success) or 0.38 adults (1.26 juveniles * 0.3 surviving to adulthood)	Total 3	Three is the cumulative total direct take for Hawaiian petrel. One is the cumulative estimated indirect take for Hawaiian Petrel. The total cumulative take (direct plus indirect) is four.
12	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.6	9	Median take projection	as a reminder agency guidance is at the 80% UCL. Is this value projected under the 80% or 50%?	The projection is the median estimate for the 80% UCL at the end of the permit
13	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.6	9	as 143 bats	additional	Comment not clear. Discuss at agency meeting.
14	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.6	9	additional minimization measures	is there anything in the works?	Added reference to AMP.
15	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.8.1	10	2.8.1 Hawaiian hoary bat (section header)	Did Auwahi met with USGS to discuss modifying the frequency of the deterrents and see if that could reduce take?	George met with them. Comments included in AMP. Frequency modification as a means of increasing the efficacy of deterrents on Hawaiian hoary bats has not been studied to date.
16	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.8.1	10	In addition to LWSC, Auwahi Wind installed NRG ultrasonic acoustic deterrents at all Project turbines in June of 2020	how many detectors/units per turbine?	Each turbine has a deterrent system comprised of 6 deterrent units and 1 deterrent unit controller. Detectors are not deployed at the turbines.
17	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.8.1	10	Thermal cameras were set up to document bat behavior at the met tower prior to demolition.	has this measure been considered for turbines where deterrents are installed?	Added reference to work summarized in Section 4.1.
18	PIFWO	9/13/2023	2.8.2	10	The presences of BSM was detected during the monthly survys at the Project in FY 2023	every month? how frequently?	Monthly, as stated in previous sentence.
19	DOFAW	9/28/2023	2.8.2	10	The presences of BSM was detected during the monthly survys at the Project in FY 2023	How many individuals were detected?	One adult moth.
20	DOFAW	9/28/2023	3.1	11	3.1 Hawaiian Petrel Mitigation (section heading)	Please add a table summarizing the results of petrel monitoring and predator control for each breeding season from the start of implementation of this mitigation plan to now.	FY 2021 report provides details of achievement of net benefit and fulfillment of mitigation requirements. AW has committed to implement conservation measures through the remainder of the permit. Discuss at agency meeting. Substantial lift. Mitigation requirements for HAPE have been met as described in the FY 2021 annual report.
21	PIFWO	9/13/2023	3.1	11	2022 management season, 78 burrows were protected, and 15 Hawaiian petrel chicks successfully fledged from the Kahikinui Petrel Management Area (PMA)	how is fledgling success defined? Is Auwahi conducting the work?	Yes, AW is conducting the work. Fledgling success is defined by chicks fledged. The Hawaiian Petrel Mitigation Strategy provides specific details.
22	DOFAW	9/28/2023	3.1.1	11	Monthly visits to monitor burrow activity began on January 20, 2022	Clarify that this is for FY 2023	Clarifying text added.
23	PIFWO	9/13/2023	3.1.1	11	December 16, 2022	for the purpose of the 2022 breeding season, this is counted for FY 2023, correct?	Correct. Clarifying text added.
24	PIFWO	9/13/2023	3.1.1	11	78	are there searches for additional/new burrows in the area not previously identified?	Nothing formal, but are always looking for new burrows when in the field. Have found new burrows using this approach in the past.
25	DOFAW	9/28/2023	3.1.1	11	34 showed signs of activity during the breeding season, and 28 burrows were active throughout the breeding season	This is a confusing. Please clarify the difference between a burrow showing activity during breeding season vs. showing activity throughout the breeding season.	Added reference for definitions.
26	PIFWO	9/13/2023	3.1.1	11	15 burrows	why do you think only 15 of the 28 active burrows were successful? predators?	Above average for site. Methods are different from other sites (game cameras vs. toothpicks). Specific causes of nest failure are sometimes unknown. Goats are present at mitigation site.
27	PIFWO	9/13/2023	3.1.1	11	monitored	can Auwahi provide a table with the number of successful fledglings per year of monitoring and how it's equivalent to number of adult birds/required mitigation offset?	Mitigation offset demonstrated in FY 2021 report.
28	PIFWO	9/13/2023	3.2.2.1	14	native plants	any roosting activity? or just foraging?	Nothing confirmed in USGS review of thermal imagery associated with Tier 1 outplantings.
29	PIFWO	9/13/2023	4.1	15	Wildlife Imaging Systems subsequently analyzed data collected in FY 2023 and found one possible fatality detected via thermal camera.	was this reported	Yes, was reported. Fatality on 10/31/2022.
30	PIFWO	9/13/2023	4.1	15	Wildlife Imaging Systems subsequently analyzed data collected in FY 2023 and found one possible fatality detected via thermal camera.	would be interesting to note in downed wildlife report. which one was this? Any unusual conditions?	10/31/2022; appeared to have occurred in bottom half of RSA.
31	PIFWO	9/13/2023	4.1	15	Based on the small data set of bat activity analyzed, the deterrent system may be contributing to a decrease in bat activity in the rotor-swept area.	Decreasing bat activity in rotor-swept area but fatality rate still increased?	Small data set. Can't draw robust conclusions. Removed sentence to avoid confusion.

Comment Number	Commenting Agency	Comment Date	Document Section	PDF Page	Highlighted Text	Question/Comment	Response
32	PIFWO	9/13/2023	4.2	15	4.2 Minimization (section heading)	any other options Auwahi is exploring if deterrents continue not to be effective at the site?	Additional minimization measures are listed in the attached Adaptive Management Plan (Attachment 3).
					Auwahi Wind has not seen a reduction in the fatality rate of Hawaiian hoary bats as a result of installing acoustic deterrents. Contrary to expectation, Hawaiian hoary bat fatalities have been observed in months where no fatalities have been recorded previously after installing acoustic deterrents. Auwahi Wind has used thermal monitoring to attempt to elucidate patterns of behavior that would indicate that deterrents are working, however thermal monitoring shows bats continuing to utilize the rotor-swept zone despite deterrents being active.	Contradicts statement above that deterrent system may be contributing to a decrease in bat activity in the rotor-swept area.	Removed sentence to avoid confusion. Measurement against threshold value for fatality rate is used as trigger for adaptive management actions.
33	PIFWO	9/13/2023	4.2	15			
34	PIFWO	9/13/2023	6.0	16	6.0 Auwahi Wind Community Involvement (section heading)	This was additional work not tied to any mitigation required by Auwahi?	Yes
35	PIFWO	9/13/2023	6.0	16	Supported Leeward Haleakala Watershed Partnership	What does Auwahi's support look like in these capacities	Funding and staff support.
36	PIFWO	9/13/2023	6.0	16	Continued to loan DOFAW bat acoustic detectors and	where	Some are still in place from Leeward Haleakala Study others at Maui Baseyard. Lance DeSilva has current information.
37	DOFAW	9/28/2023	6.0	16	Continued to loan DOFAW bat acoustic detectors and	Detectors were loaned to DOFAW?	Yes, DOFAW Maui (Lance DeSilva) has monitors DOFAW is using to support bat monitoring on Maui.
38	DOFAW	9/28/2023	Attachment 3	1	Adaptive Management Plan 2022	Should it be 2023	Yes, update AMP title throughout the document.
39	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 3	2	Effective Date: 3/6/2023	Should this be called the 2023 adaptive management plan then?	Yes.
40	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 3	2	Due September 1st	August 1st according to 2019 ITP	Noted.
41	DOFAW	9/28/2023	Attachment 3	2	Due September 1st	Also, given that the Endangered Species Report to the Legislature is due around September, we have informed Auwahi and other ITL holders to submit reports by August 1st.	Noted.
42	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 3, Table 1	2	AMP Review	TBD October/Fall 2023	Noted.
43	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 3, Section 2.3	3	report provided to USFWS and DOFAW in August	Due August 1st	Noted.
44	PIFWO	9/23/2023	Attachment 3, Section 2.3	3	annual meeting	to be scheduled fall 2023	Scheduled for December 18, 2023
45	DOFAW	9/28/2023	Attachment 3, Table 4	7	Re-evaluate BFR in July 2022	No follow-up in 2023?	Table 4 to be updated.
46	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 3, Section 3.1.3	11	no actionable minimization measures.	anything new on the horizon	Continue exploration of other options.
47	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 3, Section 3.2	11	BFR exceeds the TV	isn't this the case?	Yes, text in AMP need to be edited.
48	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 3, 3.2.1	12	The presence of water troughs at Turbines 1 and 6, which have water available when cattle are present, may modify bat activity at the Project.	Worth investigating considering that turbines 1 & 6 were identified as 2 out 3 turbines having a high portion of bat fatalities compared to the rest of the turbines. Could additional acoustic monitors be set at these locations?	Noted.
49	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 5, Table 1	3	N/A	Does N/A mean that area wasn't sampled?	Correct, N/A indicates no sample was taken during this period.
50	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 5, Section 4.0	4	Results will continued to be compared to the baseline...	is it too early into the project to see a significant increase?	This is not the goal of the monitoring. It will be used to help determine adaptive management, if needed. No changes are needed at this point.
51	DOFAW	9/28/2023	Attachment 7	11	General comment	When can we expect to see a new draft of the SSMIP? The Project has already triggered planning for Tier 6 but still does not have an approved Tier 5 plan.	Draft SSMIP submitted October 6 and comment matrix submitted October 20, 2023.
52	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 7	11	General comment	DOFAW would also like to add that since Auwahi trigger the Tier 6 planning phase, funding assurances are to be provided within 90 days of triggering planning for this tier in accordance with the HCP.	Tier 6 triggering has not yet occurred. On October 14 2023, DOFAW agreed with Auwahi's interpretation of Tier 6 being triggered at 106 bats. Funding assurance obligations will be needed within 90 days after reaching 106 bats, not 86 bats
53	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 8, Page 3	3	A detector-night was defined as one detector operating for one full night	Does this mean constant detection from sunset to sunrise?	This means that the bat detector functioned normally for the entire night. Does not have anything to do with bat detections. You can have a detector night with no detections.
54	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 8, Figure 2	4	Figure 2	What is the significance for those two sites? Why were they chosen?	Pre-trigger Baseline Monitoring sites selected based for logistical reasons. Separated far enough apart to be independent and collect data relevant to the proposed Mitigation Area.
55	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 9 Title page		General comment	this shows FY 2024 proposed timeline, correct? what is planned to occur in the next year.	Correct. Attachment 9 Title should be FY 2024.
56	PIFWO	9/13/2023	Attachment 9 Workplan table		Workplan table	this timeline may need to be shifted	Noted.
57							
58							
59							