

JOSH GREEN, M.D.
GOVERNOR | KE KIA'ĀINA

SYLVIA LUKE
LIEUTENANT GOVERNOR | KA HOPE KIA'ĀINA



STATE OF HAWAII | KA MOKU'ĀINA 'O HAWAII'
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
KA 'OIHANA KUMUWAIWAI 'ĀINA

DIVISION OF FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
1151 PUNCHBOWL STREET, ROOM 325
HONOLULU, HAWAII 96813

DAWN N.S. CHANG
CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE
MANAGEMENT

RYAN K.P. KANAKA'OLE
FIRST DEPUTY

CIARA W.K. KAHAHANE
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE
MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES
ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

ENDANGERED SPECIES RECOVERY COMMITTEE (ESRC) PUBLIC MEETING

DATE: March 6th, 2025

TIME: 9:00 AM HST

LOCATION: DLNR – DOFAW Main Conference, Kalanimoku Building 1151
Punchbowl St, Room #325., Honolulu, Hawai'i
Online via Zoom; and Livestream via YouTube recorded at
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dSDMy4iKJmQ>

MEMBERS

Jason Omick
Michelle Bogardus
Melissa Price
Lisa Spain

Kawika Winter
Karen Courtot
Lindsay Young

STAFF

Jesse Adams—DOFAW

Kinsley McEachern—DOFAW

OTHERS

Tiffany Agostini—TetraTech
Madeline Damon—TetraTech
Molly Stephenson—TerraForm Power
Troy Rahmig—TetraTech
Priya Kumar—AES
Corinne Lytle Bonine—AES
Jason Collins—Invenergy

Jacob Dutton—TetraTech
Jesse Fernandez—Kawailoa Wind LLC
Jenny Taylor—TetraTech
Chrisopher Todd—TetraTech
Daniel Bostian—AES
Julia Hoeh—Invenergy
George Akau—Invenergy

03.6.2025 08:39/[00:00:05](#)

ITEM 1. CALL TO ORDER AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Jason Omick called the meeting to order and asked all participants to not use the comments feature in Zoom but rather send them to the DOFAW HCP e-mail address. He then asked the HCP staff to introduce themselves followed by the Committee members. Mr. Omick then

announced the agenda for the meeting and reminded presenters to stay within their allotted presentation time.

03.06.2025 08:44/[00:04:46](#)

ITEM 2. Approval Of Draft Meeting Minutes for The Following ESRC Public Meetings:

February 1st & 2nd, 2024

- There were no comments from the ESRC or the public.

03.06.2025 08:45/[00:05:49](#)

MOTION TO APPROVE MEETING MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 1ST AND 2ND, 2024

Jason makes a motion to approve the meeting minutes.

- Melissa: Second.
- Motion passes unanimously.

March 11th, 2024

- There were no comments from the ESRC or the public.

03.06.2025 08:47

Karen Courtot Enters Meeting

03.06.2025 08:48/[00:09:39](#)

MOTION TO APPROVE MEETING MINUTES FOR MARCH 11TH, 2024

Jason makes a motion to approve the meeting minutes.

- Melissa: Second
- Motion passes unanimously.

December 6th, 2024

- There were no comments from the ESRC or the public.

03.06.2025 08:50/[00:10:42](#)

MOTION TO APPROVE MEETING MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 6TH, 2024

Jason makes a motion to approve the meeting minutes.

- Karen: Second
- Motion passes unanimously

February 21st, 2025

- There were no comments from the ESRC or the public.

03.06.2025 08:52/[00:13:01](#)

MOTION TO APPROVE MEETING MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 6TH, 2024

Melissa makes a motion to approve the meeting minutes.

- Lindsay: Second

- Motion passes unanimously

03.06.2025 08:55

Lisa Spain Enters Meeting

03.06.2025 08:56/[00:16:55](#)

ITEM 3. INCIDENTAL TAKE LICENSE COVERED SPECIES STATUS UPDATES

Kinsley McEachern and Jesse Adams presented, on behalf of the Division of Forestry and Wildlife HCP Section, an update on the status of all incidental take license (ITL) covered species.

03.06.2025 09:39/[00:58:28](#)

Questions and Comments from the ESRC Members

Kawika commented that this presentation is exactly what the Committee needed to make informed decisions, and that DOFAW staff did a great job with this. Melissa also appreciated the presentation. She also commented that there were pueo fatalities on Maui. Melissa then asked if mitigation is counted as one = one for fledglings and how the projects are counting fledglings. Kinsley mentioned that she thought it was one = one. Tiffany clarified that it is not for Kawaihoa. Melissa would like to see these ratios included in the presentation at the next annual review. Additionally, she shared there is high mortality until they fledge from the wetland. Finally, she commented that she may have data for survivorship of ae'o and 'alae 'ula.

03.06.2025 09:47/[01:06:32](#)

Kawika discussed concerns he has with the Public Utility Commission (PUC) and Power Purchase Agreements (PPAs) in relation to mitigation measures included in HCPs and wind energy projects.

03.06.2025 09:49/[01:08:15](#)

Questions and Comments from the Public

There were no questions or comments from the public.

03.06.2025 09:50/[01:09:08](#)

ITEM 4. Status of the Kawaihoa Wind Farm Habitat Conservation Plan, O'ahu

Tiffany Agostini presented, on behalf of Kawaihoa Wind LLC, an update on the status of their incidental take license and their compensatory mitigation actions.

03.06.2025 10:11/[01:30:40](#)

Questions and Comments from the ESRC Members

Melissa asked for Kawaihoa's definition of fledgling. Jacob provided the answer of 51 days for the Hawaiian gallinule. He also commented it is difficult to determine the fate of the fledglings

after they leave the mitigation area. Melissa then asked for more information about surveys, which both Jacob and Tiffany answered. Melissa wanted to note for HCP staff that determining what is a fledgling could vary by island and project location.

Kawika then asked a clarifying question for Tier 5 bat mitigation. Tiffany answered that the project does not anticipate entering this tier due to deterrent installation. Projections indicate that 109 bats will be taken by the of the permit term and Tier 5 is not reach until 115 bats have been taken. Kawailoa will therefore be closely monitoring their take.

Kawika then asked about if the visual and acoustic monitoring was still occurring. Tiffany clarified that activity rates have not declined at the site or 'Uko'a Pond, also there is no thermal monitoring because deterrents have been installed on all turbines. Kawailoa is concerned about additional take if they turn off deterrents to study their efficacy.

Karen mentioned that technology has improved for monitoring. Jacob commented that the same equipment is being used so this data contributes to the same, on-going data set. Karen then talked about the change in Rho Value for this project and its implementation. Kinsley then commented that USFWS did approve the Rho Value and shared other information about this topic and efficacy of deterrents.

03.06.2025 10:30/[01:49:50](#)

Karen then asked clarifying questions about searcher efficacy and other factors that influence Evidence of Absence (EoA). Jacob addressed these questions and provided information about searcher efficiency and carcass retention. Madeline then spoke to Rho Values and other parameters in the EOA, and how the Rho Value is used for determining risk by year.

Melissa then clarified that the searcher area at potentially other sites was called into question due to changes in turbine blade size. Karen commented on the need to use the new ballistic model. Lisa commented that accepting a new Rho Value would require the Service's staff input. **Melissa asked that the US Fish and Wildlife Service present on their process for accepting this new Rho Value at a future meeting.** Jason agreed that this is a good idea.

03.06.2025 10:47/[02:06:15](#)

Questions and Comments from the Public

There were no questions or comments from the public.

03.06.2025 10:48/[02:07:14](#)

Continuation of ITEM 4. Status of the Kawailoa Wind Farm Habitat Conservation Plan, O'ahu

Jesse Adams presented, on behalf of DOFAW, an overview on the status of the licensee's incidental take license, their compensatory mitigation actions, and DOFAW's concerns & recommendations.

03.06.2025 10:53/[02:12:06](#)

Questions and Comments from the ESRC Members

Melissa commented that mitigation at State managed sites can prove to be difficult since it is troublesome to tease apart net benefit for the species since multiple entities are affecting conservation change. She advocated for non-government managed sites. Melissa then asked about Tier 5 bat mitigation, to which Tiffany clarified that it is not projected that they will enter this mitigation tier during the permit/license term. Melissa then asked about if the project plans on renewing their permit/license. Jesse Fernandez spoke to this and commented that there are no formal plans; however, they are starting to work on this internally. Melissa then asked what would happen if the project was going to stop operations. Jesse Fernandez commented that there would be decommissioning, which is included in the current HCP.

Lisa encourages DOFAW to investigate developing their administrative rules for the HCP Program.

**03.06.2025 11:04/[02:23:42](#)
BREAK**

**03.06.2025 11:14/[02:33:34](#)
RETURN FROM BREAK and General Recommendations from the ESRC**

Karen and Melissa asked for specifics on the bat deterrents to be included in reports. There was dialogue on this topic with the licensee. General recommendations were provided to HCP Section staff, and it should be noted that additional recommendations were added to this list throughout the meeting.

**03.06.2025 11:33/[02:52:45](#)
Recommendations from the ESRC to Kawaihoa Wind LLC**

There was dialogue between the ESRC, HCP staff, and the licensee regarding recommendations. The following recommendations were provided to the licensee: **1)** share specifications for deterrents in annual report, and **2)** by Q4 2025, Kawaihoa will present to the ESRC a timeline and plan for lowering the take request and present options for alternative coot mitigation sites.

**03.06.2025 11:52/[03:11:14](#)
MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS**

Melissa noted that this is an unofficial vote and moved to approve the recommendation, the motion passed unanimously.

**03.06.2025 11:53/[03:11:57](#)
ITEM 5. Status of the Kahuku Wind Farm Habitat Conservation Plan, O'ahu**

Molly Stephenson presented, on behalf of Kahuku Wind Power LLC, an update on the status of their incidental take license and their compensatory mitigation actions.

03.06.2025 12:10/03:28:47

Continuation of ITEM 5. Status of the Kahuku Wind Farm Habitat Conservation Plan, O'ahu

Kinsley McEachern presented, on behalf of DOFAW, an overview on the status of the licensee's incidental take license, their compensatory conservation actions, and DOFAW's concerns & recommendations.

03.06.2025 12:15/03:33:02

Questions and Comments from the ESRC Members

Lindsay had questions about why certain trees were left in the middle of the Helemano bat corridors. Molly answered that they are species know to be roost trees. Lindsay then asked about predator control in the area. Molly answered that there is no predator control measures in management plan. Jenny added that there are adaptive management opportunities, and that predator control could fall into that. Lindsay is concerned that predators will be attracted to these trees. Melissa mentioned that she has brought this up before with the licensee. She then asked about what happens now that take limits have been exceeded. Molly commented this is part of the amend they are working on. Kinsley confirmed this. Molly added that the project is adding deterrents to decrease any take in the interim.

Melissa stated that the effective population size of for the Hawaiian hoary bat on O'ahu is 200, and that the totals for the permits issued to date for projects on island already exceeds this. She is concerned that this project is in excess of their current take limit. Molly confirmed that deterrents are ordered and on the way. **Melissa asked for the ESRC to receive an update on the amendment that the project is currently working on for the Hawaiian hoary bat.**

Christopher spoke to the papers on bat predation that Melissa provided to be uploaded to the ESRC site. He did not agree that these papers reflected what is happening since the studies did not occur in Hawai'i. Melissa reminded Christopher that using literature like this is common practice since there are few studies on predation of this species in Hawai'i.

03.06.2025 12:33/03:51:08

Jenny commented that they are working towards deploying thermal monitoring and game cameras. Melissa is looking forward to a strong plan, and Jason is looking forward to the inclusion of predator control.

03.06.2025 12:35/03:53:27

Questions and Comments from the Public

There were no questions or comments from the public.

03.06.2025 12:35/03:53:59

Recommendations from the ESRC to Kakuku Wind Power LLC

There was dialogue between the ESRC, HCP staff, and the licensee regarding recommendations. The following recommendations were provided to the licensee: **1)** share specifications for deterrents in annual report, and **2)** request an update on the license amendment to increase bat take that is taking place (present a proposal for mitigation and adaptive management to minimize take) to show how the licensee will address excess take.

03.06.2025 12:38

Lindsay Young Leaves Meeting

03.06.2025 12:44/[04:02:29](#)

BREAK

03.06.2025 13:20/[04:38:24](#)

RETURN FROM BREAK and Transition to ITEM 6. Status of the Nā Pua Makani Power Partners Habitat Conservation

Troy Rahmig presented, on behalf of Nā Pua Makani Power Partners, an update on the status of their incidental take license and their compensatory mitigation actions.

03.06.2025 13:41/[04:59:13](#)

Continuation of ITEM 6. Status of the Nā Pua Makani Power Partners Habitat Conservation

Jesse Adams presented, on behalf of DOFAW, an overview on the status of the licensee's incidental take license, their compensatory mitigation actions, and DOFAW's concerns & recommendations.

03.06.2025 13:45/[05:02:45](#)

Questions and Comments from the ESRC Members

Melissa asked a clarifying question regarding searcher efficiency since there are both humans and dogs working at this site. Troy mentioned they differentiate based on human, dog, and landscape type. Jenny confirmed this and walked the Committee through the Evidence of Absence (EoA) process for this project. Jenny mentioned that there are targeted areas where only humans search. Melissa pointed out that the loose dogs present at this site would reduce carcass persistence. Troy felt this was reflected in the model.

Karen wanted to know which turbines has Hawaiian hoary bat fatalities. Troy commented that three of the fatalities were at turbines with deterrents and one was at a turbine with no deterrent. Fatalities prior to the ones mentioned in this presentation occurred in 2021.

Lisa wanted to know more about the Hawaiian petrel take, specifically if the three putative birds will need to be mitigated for, or if mitigation only factors into birds taken after the amendment is approved. Troy commented that all take will be mitigated for. Jesse commented that opportunities for mitigation on Maui and Hawai'i have been identified, and HCP staff are working with Branch staff to pull together proposals.

03.06.2025 14:00/05:17:34

Melissa stated again that she advocates for sites that do not have funding already or are not at carrying capacity. Lisa commented that some of this is outlined in the Bat Guidance Document. Perhaps this is needed for other species. HCP staff confirmed that they keep these concerns in mind when selecting sites. These concerns were listed in the general recommendations to DOFAW staff.

03.06.2025 14:10/05:27:41

Questions and Comments from the Public

There were no questions or comments from the public.

03.06.2025 14:11

Lindsay Young Enters Meeting

03.06.2025 14:11/05:28:15

Recommendations from the ESRC to Nā Pua Makani Power Partners

There was dialogue between the ESRC, HCP staff, and the licensee regarding recommendations. The following recommendations were provided to the licensee: **1)** share specifications for deterrents in annual report.

03.06.2025 14:12/05:29:40

MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS

Note this is an unofficial vote and moved to approve the recommendation. Jason moved for a vote on the recommendations and the motion passed unanimously.

03.06.2025 14:13/05:30:58

Recommendations from the ESRC to Kakuku Windpower LLC

There was additional dialogue on the recommendations between Melissa and Lindsay. Lindsay suggested that a single game camera be placed to monitor the tree. Karen shared that the Montoya-Aiona et al. paper has some information on predation and roost trees. The recommendations for the licensee were updated to: **1)** share specifications for deterrents in annual report; **2)** request an update on the license amendment to increase bat take that is taking place; **3)** use trail cameras to monitor predators at mitigation site and then follow adaptive management of predator control actions if triggered; and **4)** present a proposal to show how the licensee will address excess take at the wind farm before the amendment.

03.06.2025 14:15/05:32:50

MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS

Note this is an unofficial vote and moved to approve the recommendation. Jason moved for a vote on the recommendations and the motion passed unanimously.

03.06.2025 14:18

Lindsay Young Leaves Meeting

03.06.2025 14:18/[05:35:40](#)

ITEM 7. Status of the Kaheawa Wind Power I (KWP I) Habitat Conservation Plan, Maui

Molly Stephenson presented, on behalf of Kaheawa Wind Power LLC, an update on the status of their incidental take license and their compensatory mitigation actions.

03.06.2025 14:36/[05:53:46](#)

Continuation of ITEM 7. Status of the Kaheawa Wind Power I (KWP I) Habitat Conservation Plan, Maui

Kinsley McEachern presented, on behalf of DOFAW, an overview on the status of the licensee's incidental take license, their compensatory conservation actions, and DOFAW's concerns & recommendations.

03.06.2025 14:43/[06:00:41](#)

Questions and Comments from the ESRC Members

There were no comments from the ESRC

03.06.2025 14:44/[06:01:08](#)

Questions and Comments from the Public

There were no questions or comments from the public.

03.06.2025 14:46/[06:03:15](#)

Recommendations from the ESRC to Kaheawa Wind Power LLC (KWP I)

There was dialogue between the ESRC, HCP staff, and the licensee regarding recommendations. Kawika asked about minimization for nēnē. Kinsley explained some complications at the site that Molly expanded on. Kawika asked if pheromones could be used. The following recommendations were provided to the licensee: **1)** use of pheromones to deter nēnē at the wind farm site. It was also noted that KWP I does not have any deterrents and can therefore not share deterrent data in their annual reports.

03.06.2025 14:53/[06:10:04](#)

MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS

Note this is an unofficial vote and moved to approve the recommendation. Jason moved for a vote on the recommendations and the motion passed unanimously.

03.06.2025 14:55/06:12:15

ITEM 8. Status of the Kaheawa Wind Farm II (KWP II) Habitat Conservation Plan, Maui

Kinsley McEachern presented, on behalf of DOFAW, an overview on the status of the licensee's incidental take license, their compensatory conservation actions, and DOFAW's concerns & recommendations.

03.06.2025 15:00/06:17:30

Continuation of ITEM 8. Status of the Kaheawa Wind Farm II (KWP II) Habitat Conservation Plan, Maui

Molly Stephenson presented, on behalf of Kaheawa Wind Power LLC, an update on the status of their incidental take license and their compensatory mitigation actions.

03.06.2025 15:09/06:26:19

Questions and Comments from the ESRC Members

Melissa about why MBTA fatalities differ between sites. Molly commented that there are differences in site use and other environmental variables. Jenny made a similar comment.

03.06.2025 15:12/06:29:11

Questions and Comments from the Public

There were no questions or comments from the public.

03.06.2025 15:12/06:29:54

Recommendations from the ESRC to Kaheawa Wind Power LLC (KWP II)

There was dialogue between the ESRC, HCP staff, and the licensee regarding recommendations. It was noted that KWP II does not have any deterrents and can therefore not share deterrent data in their annual reports.

03.06.2025 15:13/06:30:31

MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS

Note this is an unofficial vote and moved to approve the recommendation. Jason moved for a vote on the recommendations and the motion passed unanimously.

03.06.2025 15:14/06:31:48

Kinsley updated cumulative take tables for all projects to reflect the 16 pueo fatalities at KWP I. She then stated that DOFAW will require the licensee to include mitigation for this species in future plans. Melissa asked if the carcasses had been sent to Bishop Museum. Kinsley said she would check on this. Molly confirmed that the last pueo fatality occurred in 2020.

03.06.2025 15:16/06:33:46

ITEM 9. Status of the Auwahi Wind Farm Habitat Conservation Plan, Maui

Kinsley McEachern presented, on behalf of DOFAW, an overview on the status of the licensee's incidental take license, their compensatory conservation actions, and DOFAW's concerns & recommendations.

03.06.2025 15:25/06:42:58

Continuation of ITEM 9. Status of the Auwahi Wind Farm Habitat Conservation Plan, Maui

Julia Hoeh presented, on behalf of Auwahi Wind Energy LLC, an update on the status of their incidental take license and their compensatory mitigation actions.

03.06.2025 15:45/07:02:26

Questions and Comments from the ESRC Members

Melissa asked if this site has deterrents. Julia stated that they do and that they were installed in 2020. It should be noted that only one company makes these deterrents. The only difference between sites with deterrents is how they are mounted. Melissa wanted to confirm that the outplanted trees are native for Tier 1 and 4 mitigation activities. Julia confirmed this. They will be working with DOFAW Maui for species selection for Tier 5. They will most likely use koa.

Kawika asked for clarification on invasive species control, if this meant vegetation or other species. He also wanted to know what vegetation species were removed. George stated that Bocconia, Tropical Ash, Black Wattle, and Monterey Pine were identified as target weed species for removal. Kawika stated these species are for the benefit of other conservation actions, their removal does not directly benefit the bats.

Karen asked about how the deterrents are going to be adjusted since it appears that they are not reducing take. Julia said Auwahi is going to work with staff at the Agencies to develop ideas for this. Kinsley mentioned that the licensee is working on developing a deterrent study. Melissa asked if there will be an update on this moving forward. Melissa asked this be added to the recommendations.

Melissa commented that species like āke'āke should potentially be included in future HCPs and ITLs. **ESRC would like to see a draft permit amendment before a year has passed, specifically before the next annual review.**

03.06.2025 16:01/07:18:02

Questions and Comments from the Public

There were no questions or comments from the public.

03.06.2025 16:02/07:19:00

Recommendations from the ESRC to Auwahi Wind Energy LLC

There was dialogue between the ESRC, HCP staff, and the licensee regarding recommendations. The following recommendations were provided to the licensee: **1)** share specifications for deterrents in annual report; and **2)** request to meet with the permittee in six months to report on conversations with the Agencies on how they are addressing the current amendment and the use of deterrents.

03.06.2025 16:10/07:27:35

MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR AUWAHI AND GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

Note this is an unofficial vote and moved to approve the recommendation. Jason moved for a vote on the recommendations and the motion passed unanimously.

03.06.2025 16:13/07:30:29

ITEM 10. Adjournment

Jason made a motion to adjourn.

- Lisa: Second
- The motion passes unanimously.