STATE OF HAWAII DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

Division of Forestry and Wildlife Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

January 13, 2017

Chairperson and Members
Board of Land and Natural Resources
State of Hawaii
Honolulu, Hawaii

Land Board Members:

SUBJECT:

REQUEST TO CONSOLIDATE THE PETITIONS FROM ELIZABETH RAGO, KAHUKU COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION, MAKANI PONO 'O KAHUKU, AND KENT FONOIMOANA WITH THE CONTESTED CASE HEARING REGARDING BOARD ACTION OF NOVEMBER 10, 2016, AGENDA ITEM C-1, REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF INCIDENTAL TAKE LICENSE AND HABITAT CONSERVATION PLAN FOR NA PUA MAKANI WIND ENERGY PROJECT ON THE ISLAND OF OAHU, HAWAII

BACKGROUND FACTS

On October 28, 2016, a Request for Approval of Incidental Take License and Habitat Conservation Plan for Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project on the Island of Oahu, Hawaii, was on the Board of Land and Natural Resources' (Board) agenda. At the meeting, the agenda item was deferred by the Board.

On November 10, 2016, Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project (Na Pua Makani) request for approval of a habitat conservation plan and incidental take license in connection with its wind energy project was again placed on the Board's agenda. As part of the application process for the habitat conservation plan, a public hearing was held on June 4, 2015, on the island of Oahu, to solicit comments from the public.

RECEIVED PETITIONS

No oral or written request for a contested case hearing was made prior to the end of the October 28, 2016 Board meeting.

At the November 10, 2016 meeting, Gil Rivere, on behalf of the Keep the North Shore Country organization, orally requested a contested case hearing. A written petition was transmitted to DLNR from Keep the North Shore Country on November 19, 2016, was presented to the Board on December 9, 2016 and the Board granted a contested case hearing.

At the November 10, 2016 meeting Kent Fonoimoana also orally requested a contested case.

Petition for a Request for a Contested Case Hearing Regarding Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project ITL/HCP

Four written petitions were transmitted to the DLNR on or about November 18 and 19. They were logged received on Monday November 21, 2016 and are attached:

- Elizabeth Rago (Attachment A)
- Kahuku Community Association through Kent Fonoimoana (Attachment B)
- Makani Pono `O Kahuku through Kent Fonoimoana (Attachment C)
- Kent Fonoimoana (Attachment D)¹

AUTHORITY FOR DESIGNATING HEARING OFFICERS

HAR § 13-1-32 (d) provides that the BLNR may conduct the Contested Case Hearing, or at its discretion, may appoint a hearing officer to conduct the hearing. HAR § 13-1-29 (a) provides that, the time for making an oral or written request and submitting a written petition may be waived by the Board.

Additionally, HRS Chapter 92-16 and Chapter 171-6 also provide that the Board may delegate to the Chairperson the authority to select the hearing officer to conduct a Contested Case Hearing.

DISCUSSION

The Board has already approved holding a contested case in connection with the petition filed by Keep the North Shore Country. This submittal is requesting the appointment of a hearing officer to conduct proceedings for that contested case hearing.

The four petitions referenced above have requested a contested case hearing on the same subject matter as the contested case for Keep the North Shore Country, namely, the habitat conservation plan and incidental take license for Na Pua Makani. It would be most efficient to consolidate these four petitions with the pending contested case for Keep the North Shore Country. Because a hearing officer is also being recommended to be appointed, it would also be more efficient to have the hearing officer determine whether the four above petitioners have standing to participate in the pending contested case.

RECOMMENDATION: That the Board:

- 1) Authorize the consolidation of the attached four petitions with the contested case hearing for Keep the North Shore Country approved on December 9, 2016;
- 2) Authorize the appointment of a Hearing Officer to conduct all hearings relevant to the subject petition(s);

¹ Kent Fonoimoana filed three petitions in his own name. All three petitions are being considered as one consolidated petition for purposes of this item.

Petition for a Request for a Contested Case Hearing Regarding Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project ITL/HCP

- 3) Direct the Hearing Officer to determine whether the four petitioners, Elizabeth Rago, Kahuku Community Association, Makani Pono 'O Kahuku, and Kent Fonoimoana have standing to participate in the contested case hearing; and
- 4) Delegate to the Chairperson the authority to select a hearing officer to preside over the consolidated contested case.

Respectfully submitted

David G. Smith, Administrator Division of Forestry and Wildlife

APPROVED FOR SUBMITTAL:

Suzanne D. Case, Chairperson

Board of Land and Natural Resources

Attachment A: Petition for a Contested Case Hearing (Elizabeth Rago)

Attachment B: Petition for a Contested Case Hearing (Kahuku Community Association)

Attachment C: Petition for a Contested Case Hearing (Makani Pono `o Kahuku)

Attachment D: Petition for a Contested Case Hearing (Kent Fonoimoana)



PETITION FOR A CONTESTED CASE HEARING

| OREICTA | VUSEONEZ |
|------------------------------|-----------------|
| Case No. | Date Received |
| Board Action Date / Item No. | Division/Office |
| | |

INSTRUCTIONS:

1. File (deliver, mail or fax) this form within ten (10) days of the Board Action Date to:

Department of Land and Natural Resources Administrative Proceedings Office 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813 Phone: (808) 587-1496, Fax: (808) 587-0390

- 2. DLNR's contested case hearing rules are listed under Chapter 13-1, HAR, and can be obtained from the DLNR Administrative Proceedings Office or at its website (http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/forms/contested-case-form/). Please review these rules before filing a petition.
- 3. If you use the electronic version of this form, note that the boxes are expandable to fit in your statements. If you use the hardcopy form and need more space, you may attach additional sheets.
- 4. Pursuant to §13-1-30, HAR, a petition that involves a Conservation District Use Permit must be accompanied with a \$100.00 non-refundable filing fee (payable to "DLNR") or a request for waiver of this fee. A waiver may be granted by the Chairperson based on a petitioner's financial hardship.
- 5. All materials, including this form, shall be submitted in three (3) photocopies.

| The state of the s | V. PETHEONER | |
|--|--|------------------------|
| 1. Name Elizabeth J. Rago | 2. Contact Person Elizabeth J. Rago | eacn.) |
| 3. Address 56-331 Kekauoha St | 4. City Kahuku | 5. State and ZIP HI |
| 6. Email elizabethrago@gmail.com | 7. Phone 808-271-9011 | 8. Fax |

| 9. Attorney Name | 10. Firm Name | TORNEY (if represented) 10. Firm Name | | |
|------------------|---------------|---------------------------------------|--|--|
| 11. Address | 12. City | 13. State and ZIP | | |
| 4. Email | 15. Phone | 16. Fax | | |

FORM APO-11

Page 1 of 4

C STERRIEGH WATERR

17. Board Action Being Contested

Approval of incidental take license and conservation habitat plan for Napua Makani wind energy project on the island of O'ahu

18. Board Action Date October 28, 2016

19. Item No.

20. Nature and Extent of Petitioner's Interest That May Be Affected by the Board Action
I will be directly and immediately affected by the proposed action because my home is two blocks
from the proposed wind farm. The turbine flicker would adversely affect me as the flicker and the
"woosh" sound being reported by my neighbors as causing syptoms of imbalace, exhaustion, ringing
in ears, and sleeplessness. Furthermore, my property's value will decline 12 percent if the proposed
action moves forward. I will be directly and immediately affected by the proposed action because
The Hawaiian hoary bat is important to me as it provides natural pest control by eating mosquitoes
in our neighborhood and by spreading seeds. Most important regarding these bats are the
genealogical connection to the indigenous peoples of Hawai'i have with the Hoary bats. They are
the manifestation of Kanaloa, God of the ocean and an ancestor of native Hawaiians. They are our
legacy and as such, we have a responsibilty to mālama them.

21. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board

In proposing the number of take for the Hoary bats, Na Pua Makani used the take per turbine in the exisiting Sun Edison project to determine the propsed take for this project. However, they did so without taking into account that their proposed turbines currently stands significantly taller with blades that are significantly longer than the blades on the Sun Edison's project. The current proposal for the number of Hoary bats allowed to kill does not take into consideration that these proposed turbines have blades that are significantly longer than the turbrines currently in existence in Kahuku and that since they are larger, they will kill more bats.

The proposed HCP does not provide evidence that the proposed research or the short-term Poamoho Ridge management actions would increase the population of bats on O'ahu by one bat, let alone 51 bats. The proposed removal of pigs at Poamoho Ridge, for instance, is likely to reduce mosquito prey availability, so bat numbers at the mitigation site may decline rather than increase. The proposed "mitigation" may harm the species rather than benefit it. The proposed research will not, in itself, result in any increase in bat numbers on Oahu. There is no mention of any required increases in bat detection at Poamoho Ridge in the HCP measures of success. As it's currently written, the HCP does not require the applicant to undertake any action that would increase bat numbers to offset the requested level of bat take.

The page 65, section 6.3.1 Net Benefit section of of the proposed HCP (http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/wildlife/files/2013/09/Item-6-Na-Pua-Makani-Final-HCP.pdf) indicates: "Funding for Hawaiian hoary bat research provides a net benefit to the species by increasing the knowledge base about the species, thus allowing for more effective mitigation and conservation efforts...". Although the proposed research could inform what this applicant could do to mitigate for take of the bat, the research in and of itself would not have a tangible benefit to a bat. The research would not increase the Oahu bat population by even one bat. If research must be completed to figure out how to mitigate for take of the bat, then that research would need to be completed and a bat conservation project based on the results of the research, with some anticipated actual benefit to the bat, would need to be incorporated into the HCP as proposed conservation actions before the HCP will meet incidental take license issuance criteria pursuant to Hawaii Revised Statute §195D-4

FORM APO-11

(g). Implementation of the actions specified in the proposed wind farm HCP, as it's currently written, would not mitigate the impacts of the take of 51 bats, would not increase the likelihood the endangered bat species will survive and recover, and would not provide a net environmental benefit to the bat. I therefore advise the Board against issuing the incidental take license based on the current draft of the HCP.

(Hawaii State Law Background Information: Pursuant to Hawaii Revised Statute §195D-4 (g) (http://www.hawaii.edu/ohelo/statutes/HRS195D/HRS_195D-4.htm), the Board may only issue an incidental take license provided that:

- (1) The applicant, to the maximum extent practicable, shall minimize and mitigate the impacts of the take;
- (2) The applicant shall guarantee that adequate funding for the plan will be provided;
- (3) The applicant shall post a bond, or deposit a sum of money in the fund created by section 183D-10.5, adequate to ensure monitoring of the species by the State and to assure that the applicant takes all actions necessary to minimize and mitigate the impacts of the take;
- (4) The plan shall increase the likelihood that the species will survive and recover;
- (5) The plan takes into consideration the full range of the species on the island so that cumulative impacts associated with the take can be adequately assessed;
- (6) The measures, if any, required under section 195D-21(b) shall be met, and the department has received any other assurances that may be required so that the plan may be implemented;
- (7) The activity, which is permitted and facilitated by issuing the license to take a species, does not involve the use of submerged lands, mining, or blasting;
- (8) The cumulative impact of the activity, which is permitted and facilitated by the license, provides net environmental benefits; and
- (9) The take is not likely to cause the loss of genetic representation of an affected population of any endangered, threatened, proposed, or candidate plant species.
- 22. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to

The Board should send the application back to the Endangered Species Recovery Committee for revision to incorporate the Hawaiian hoary bat mitigation required by State Law (HRS 195D

23. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest
The contested case provides an avenue that, when compared to litigation, may enable the HCP to come into conformance with state law in a more timely manner.

FORM APO-11

Industrial Wind Turbines Killing Culturally Significant Winged Creatures in Hawai'i

Aloha nui mai kākou,

My name is Tēvita 'Ö. Ka'ili and I am a resident of Kahuku Ahupua'a. I am also a strong advocate for clean, green, and renewable energy for our 'āina. As a cultural anthropologist and a descendant of our ancestors Tangaloa (Kanaloa), Māui, and Hina, I have become quite concerned that industrial wind turbines in Hawai'i have killed close to 100 of our culturally significant birds, bats, and moths (see chart). Many of these beautiful winged creatures are identified in the Kumulipo (Hawaiian Creation Chant) and other Polynesian creation stories as indigenous, as ancestors, as protectors, as creators, and as our elders. Some are 'aumākua (ancestral gods), makua (parent birds), keiki (children of parent birds), kia'i (guardian/caretaker birds), and others are kinolau (body forms) of principal gods in Oceania. Below is a chart of nearly 100 culturally significant winged creatures killed by the largest industrial wind turbines in Hawai'i from 2007 to 2014. This data is based on the list obtained by KITV from the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Source: http://www.kitv.com/blob/view/-/25786724/data/1/-/n01e00z/-/Windmill-kills-animals-PDF.pdf). These are the reported numbers. It is likely that the numbers are much higher.

Based on the data, industrial wind turbines are killing 'Ōka'i (Blackburns Sphynx Moths), Kōlea (Pacific Golden Plovers), 'Iwa (Great Frigatebirds), Koa'e Kea (White-tailed Tropicbirds), Nēnē (Hawaiian Geese). Pueo (Hawaiian Owls), 'Ope'ape'a (Hawaiian Hoary Bats), 'Ua'u (Hawaiian Petrel), and 'Ua'u Kani (Wedge-tailed Shearwater). As you know, most of these winged creatures are 'Ōiwi (Indigenous/Native) to Hawai'i and are also recognized in the Kumulipo as kūpuna (ancestors). In the Kumulipo, the Nēnē and Pueo are kia'i, guardian/caretaker birds. The 'Iwa is a makua, parent bird, and the Kölea and Koa'e Kae as keiki, children of parent birds. In Hawaiian tradition, the Kolea, Pueo, and 'Ua'u are 'aumākua, deified ancestral guardians, who protect and give guidance to their descendants. The Kölea, known as Tuli in Sāmoan and Kiu in Tongan, is identified in Sāmoan and Tongan creation stories as an embodiment of the ancestral god Tagaloa/Tangaloa – a major pan-Polynesian god who is known as Kanaloa in Hawaiian and recognized in the Kumulipo as an ancestor (KL line 615). The 'Ōpe'ape'a (Hawaiian Hoary Bat) is a kinolau (body form) of Kanaloa in Hawaiian tradition. All of these winged creatures are our relatives and legacy of our common Polynesian cultures. It is our responsibility to mālama them. The United Nations recognizes the right of Indigenous Peoples to maintain and protect their cultural heritage (UNDRIP, Article 31). I urge the Board of Land and Natural Resources to send the Napua Makani application back to the Endangered Species Recovery Committee for revision to incorporate the Hawaiian hoary bat mitigation required by State Law (HRS 195D).

Mahalo nui,

Tevita O. Kaili

Tēvita 'Ō. Ka'ili, PhD. Associate Professor, Brigham Young University Hawai'i International Cultural Studies — Cultural Anthropology Jonathan Nāpela Center for Hawaiian & Pacific Islands Studies — Pacific Islands Studies

Culturally Significant Manu (Winged Creatures) Killed by Industrial Wind Turbines in Hawai'i August 2007 – March 2014 (Data Obtained by KITV from U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service)

| Hawaiian Name | English Name | Scientific Name | *Kumulipo: Hawaiian Creation Chant | Cultural Significance | Photo (www.fws.gov) | # Killed |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------------|--|---|------------------------|-------------|
| 'Ōka'i | Blackburns SphynxMoth | Manauca Iblackoura — | | 'Owi – indigeneus Io Hawais | | 1 |
| Kõlea | Pacific Golden Ployer | Pluvialis fulva | KL1ine 298 | 'Aumakua — ancestral god Kelki — child bird of the Ulli (Snipe) | | 4 |
| ʻlwa | Great Erigatebird | Fregataminor | KL line 347 | Makua parent bird of the kvare bird | | 12 |
| Koafe Kea | White-tailed Tropicbird | Phaethon lepturus dorotheae | KLine 318 | Keiki — child bird of the 'lwa | | 15 |
| Nēnē | Hawaiian Grose | Brania Sandvicensis | KLJine 349 | Kia'i ⊹guaidian bird of the Hehe 'Giwi⊨ indigeneus to Hawai'i | A. | 10 |
| Pueo | Hawaiian Owl | Asio flammeta sandwichensis | KL line 361 | 'Aumakua — ancestral god Kia'i —guardian bird of Noic 'Ōiwi — Indigenous to Hawaii | | 4 |
| 'Ōpe'ape'a | Hawailan Heary Bat | Lastrus cinerietis serrotas | KLInes/689 590-691, 592 | Kinolau — body form of Kanaloa Ölwi — Indigenous to Hawai i | | 27 |
| Ua'u | Hawaiian Petrel | Plerodroma sandwichensis | | *Aumakua — ancestral god *Oiwi — indigenous to Hawai'i | | Ā |
| Uaʻu kani / Iōʻio Fotal | | Puffinus pacificus pacificus | | Oiwi—indigenous to Hawaiii | | 93 |





STATE OF HAWAII BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES VOV 21 PM 1:51

PETITION FOR A CONTESTED CASE HEARING

| Board Action Date / Item No. | Division/Office |
|------------------------------|---|
| Case No. | Date Received |
| OFFI | CIAL USE ONLY |
| | 2 12 12 12 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 |

INSTRUCTIONS:

1. File (deliver, mail or fax) this form within ten (10) days of the Board Action Date to:

Department of Land and Natural Resources Administrative Proceedings Office 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Phone: (808) 587-1496, Fax: (808) 587-0390

- 2. DLNR's contested case hearing rules are listed under Chapter 13-1, HAR, and can be obtained from the DLNR Administrative Proceedings Office or at its website (http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/forms/contested-case-form/). Please review these rules before filing a petition.
- 3. If you use the electronic version of this form, note that the boxes are expandable to fit in your statements. If you use the hardcopy form and need more space, you may attach additional sheets.
- 4. Pursuant to §13-1-30, HAR, a petition that involves a Conservation District Use Permit must be accompanied with a \$100.00 non-refundable filing fee (payable to "DLNR") or a request for waiver of this fee. A waiver may be granted by the Chairperson based on a petitioner's financial hardship.
- 5. All materials, including this form, shall be submitted in three (3) photocopies.

| A. | PETITIONER | |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| (If there are multiple | petitioners, use one form for | each.) |
| Name Kahuku Community Association | 2. Contact Person Kent Fonoimoana | |
| 3. Address PO Box 007 | 4. City Kahuku | 5. State and ZIP Hi 96731 |
| 6. Email kent@trisland.com | 7. Phone 808-294-9991 | 8. Fax |

| В. А | TTORNEY (if represented) | | | |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|--|--|
| 9. Attorney Name | 10. Firm Name | | | |
| James H. Wright | Law Offices of James H. Wright | | | |
| 11. Address 745 Fort St. Ste. 1925 | 12. City Honolulu | 13. State and ZIP Hi 96813 | | |
| 14. Email wright@hawaii.rr.com | 15. Phone 808-523-1127 | 16. Fax 808-523-1127 | | |

| 1.0 | | CITE INCUE AS A PROPERTY. | |
|--------------|--|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 17 | | SUBJECT MATTER | |
| 17. | Board Action Being Contested | | |
| | Approval of Incidental Take License | | |
| | Wind Energy Project by Applicants | | |
| | Champlin Hawaii Wind Holdings, | LLC; Tax Map Key Nos | . (1) 5-6-06:018 and (1) 5-6- |
| | 08:006, Koolauloa District, Island of | | |
| 18. | Board Action Date | 19. Item No. | |
| | 11/19/2016 | C-1 | |
| | | | |
| 20. | Nature and Extent of Petitioner's In | iterest That May Be Aff | ected by the Board Action |
| | Health & safety of humans and flying | animals. Negative impac | ts on environment, culturally |
| | significant sites, private real property | values, community identi | ty and individual/collective |
| | wellbeing. | | |
| | • | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| 21. | Any Disagreement Petitioner May H | lave with an Application | before the Board |
| | The Kahuku Community Association | ı is in overwhelming opr | oosition to the Na Pua Makani |
| | proposal. | J | |
| | INADERWASE EIS | | |
| | MADEOUNIE CIS | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| 22. | Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deem | s Itself Entitled to | |
| | We seek a contested case hearing pu | | |
| | We poor a composite case near 119 be | | |
| | | | |
| | | | • |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| 3. | How Petitioner's Participation in the | e Proceeding Would Ser | ve the Public Interest |
| , | We are the public. As members of th | e nublic we are investor | d in the Kehular community and |
| | | c public, we are invested | a in the Nahuku Community and |
|) | interested in issues that impact us. | | |
| | • | • | • |
| | | | |
| | · | | |
| 4 | Any Other Information That May A | ssist the Roard in Deter | mining Whother Petitioner Mosts |
| 170 / | the Criteria to Be a Party under Sec | tion 12 1 21 HAD | mining as nether retitioner isteets |
| | | | |
| • | See criteria at §13-1-31 HAR (b 1-3) | • | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | ! |
| | | | |
| 76 | Check this box if Petitioner is submitting | ag aumonting decomments | |
| | Lucca this box if reducined is submitted | ig supporting documents | with this form. |
| 7 1 C | Check this box if Petitioner will submit | t additional supporting do | cuments after filing this form |
| 71 ~ | Shook and box if I defined will submit | daditional supporting do | coments after thing this form. |
| | 1 2 | 111 | |
| 1. | 1 6 | 1/1/1 . | |
| Of | A forounage | glisst. b- | 11-19-2016 |
| - | | 75: 1-7 | , , , |
| etit | tioner or Representative (Print Name) | / Signature / | Date |



STATE OF HAWAII BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

2016 NOV 21 PM 1:51

PETITION FOR A CONTESTED CASE HEARING PURE OF

| Board Action Date / Item No. | Division/Office |
|------------------------------|-----------------|
| Case No. | Date Received |
| OFF | ICIAL USE ONLY |
| | STATE OF HAMAII |

INSTRUCTIONS:

1. File (deliver, mail or fax) this form within ten (10) days of the Board Action Date to:

Department of Land and Natural Resources Administrative Proceedings Office 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Phone: (808) 587-1496, Fax: (808) 587-0390

- 2. DLNR's contested case hearing rules are listed under Chapter 13-1, HAR, and can be obtained from the DLNR Administrative Proceedings Office or at its website (http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/forms/contested-case-form/). Please review these rules before filing a petition.
- 3. If you use the electronic version of this form, note that the boxes are expandable to fit in your statements. If you use the hardcopy form and need more space, you may attach additional sheets.
- 4. Pursuant to §13-1-30, HAR, a petition that involves a Conservation District Use Permit must be accompanied with a \$100.00 non-refundable filing fee (payable to "DLNR") or a request for waiver of this fee. A waiver may be granted by the Chairperson based on a petitioner's financial hardship.
- 5. All materials, including this form, shall be submitted in three (3) photocopies.

| | A. PETITIONER | | |
|--|------------------------------------|------------------------------|--|
| (If there are mult | iple petitioners, use one form for | each.) | |
| 1. Name Makani Pono 'o Kahuku 2. Contact Person Kent Fonoimoana | | | |
| 3. Address PO Box 122 | 4. City Laie | 5. State and ZIP Hi 96762 | |
| 6. Email kent@trisland.com | 7. Phone 808-294-9991 | 8. Fax | |

| B. A | TTORNEY (if represented) | | | |
|------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------|--|--|
| 9. Attorney Name | 10. Firm Name | | | |
| James H. Wright | Law Offices of James H. Wright | | | |
| 11. Address | 12. City | 13. State and ZIP | | |
| 745 Fort St. Ste. 1925 | Honolulu | Hi 96813 | | |
| 14. Email | 15. Phone | 16. Fax | | |
| wright@hawaii.rr.com | 808-523-1127 | 808-523-1127 | | |

| | . SUBJECT | MATTER | | |
|--|-----------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------|--|
| 17. Board Action Being Contested | | TAKE PER | • | <u> 1840 - Nobel Maria, maria de la lagraga de la companya della companya de la companya della com</u> |
| 1. Request for Approval of Incident | ental Take I | icense and l | Final Hahitat | Conservation Dian for |
| Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project | | | | |
| | | | | |
| the former Champlin Hawaii Wir | | | | ns. (1) 2-0-00:018 and |
| (1) 5-6-08:006, Koolauloa District, | isiand of O | | | |
| 18. Board Action Date | | 19. Item N | 0. | |
| 11/10/2016 | | C -1 | | |
| 20. Nature and Extent of Petitioner's l | | | | |
| Health & safety of humans and flyin | | | | |
| significant sites, private real property | y values, con | munity ider | itity and indiv | vidual/collective |
| wellbeing. | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| 21. Any Disagreement Petitioner May | Hoyo with a | n Annling | on hofore 4L | a Roard |
| The Kahuku Community is in overv | | | | |
| | wieming of | hosraon m | uit iva Fua i | agrant highnees |
| INADEQUATE EIS | | | | |
| • | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| 22. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Dee | ms Itself En | titled to | | |
| We seek a contested case hearing p | | | L. | |
| TV C SCEN A CONTRODUCA CADO HEALTING P | our suarre co x | .11(03)111 | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| 23. How Petitioner's Participation in t | | | | |
| We are the public. As members of t | | | | nuku, we are invested in |
| the Kahuku community and interes | sted in issue | s that impa | ct us. | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| , | | | | |
| 24. Any Other Information That May | Assist the R | nard in Det | ormining W | hother Detitioner Mosts |
| the Criteria to Be a Party under Se | | | cimining A | nemer Pentioner Meets |
| See criteria at §13-1-31 HAR (b 1-3 | | 1, ILAN | | |
| see criteria at 313-1-31 max (b 1-3 |). | | | |
| | | | | |
| · | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | | |
| Check this box if Petitioner is submitted. | ting supporti | ng documen | ts with this fo | orm. |
| | ** * * * * * * | .• | 4 | |
| Check this box if Petitioner will subm | nit additional | supporting | documents at | ter filing this form. |
| | | | | |
| | 1/ | | | 11 |
| Kent Jongan | Kul | · | | 11-19-2016 |
| Datition on Bouneau taking (Drink Norma) | _ 4 / | | | D-4 |
| Petitioner or Representative (Print Name) |) Signatu | re / | | Date |



PETITION FOR A CONTESTED CASE HEARING

| OFFICIAL USE ONLY STATE CONTRACTOR | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Date Received | |
| Division/Office | |
| | |

INSTRUCTIONS:

1. File (deliver, mail or fax) this form within ten (10) days of the Board Action Date to:

Department of Land and Natural Resources Administrative Proceedings Office 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813 Phone: (808) 587-1496, Fax: (808) 587-0390

- 2. DLNR's contested case hearing rules are listed under Chapter 13-1, HAR, and can be obtained from the DLNR Administrative Proceedings Office or at its website (http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/forms/contested-case-form/). Please review these rules before filing a petition.
- 3. If you use the electronic version of this form, note that the boxes are expandable to fit in your statements. If you use the hardcopy form and need more space, you may attach additional sheets.
- 4. Pursuant to §13-1-30, HAR, a petition that involves a Conservation District Use Permit must be accompanied with a \$100.00 non-refundable filing fee (payable to "DLNR") or a request for waiver of this fee. A waiver may be granted by the Chairperson based on a petitioner's financial hardship.
- 5. All materials, including this form, shall be submitted in three (3) photocopies.

| | A. PETITIONER | |
|----------------------------|--|--|
| (If there are m | ultiple petitioners, use one form for each.) | |
| Name Kent Fonoimoana | 2. Contact Person Kent Fonoimoana | |
| 3. Address PO Box 122 | 4. City 5. State and ZIP Hi 96762 | |
| 6. Email kent@trisland.com | 7. Phone 8. Fax 808-294-9991 | |

| B. ATTORNEY (if represented) | | |
|---------------------------------------|---|--|
| 9. Attorney Name James H. Wright | 10. Firm Name Law Offices of James H. Wright | |
| 11. Address 745 Fort St. Ste. 1925 | 12. City 13. State and ZIP Honolulu Hi 96813 | |
| 14. Email wright@hawaii.rr.com | 15. Phone 16. Fax 808-523-1127 | |

| | C. SURI | JECTMATTER. | |
|-----|--|--|-------------|
| 17. | Board Action Being Contested | | |
| | • • | Final Habitat Conservation Plan for Na Pua Makani | |
| | | a Makani Power Partners, LLC and the former | |
| | | Tax Map Key Nos. (1) 5-6-06:018 and (1) 5-6- | |
| | 08:006, Koolauloa District, Island of O'ahu | | |
| 18. | Board Action Date | 19. Item No. | |
| | 11/10/2016 | C -1 | |
| 20. | | t That May Be Affected by the Board Action | |
| | Health & safety of humans and flying anima | als. Negative impacts on environment, culturally | |
| | significant sites, private real property values | s, community identity and individual/collective well | |
| | being. | | |
| | | | |
| 21. | Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have w | | |
| | | ing opposition to the Na Pua Makani proposal. | |
| | INADERUATE EIS. | | |
| ŀ | , , , , | | |
| l | | | |
| | | | |
| 22. | Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itse | elf Entitled to | |
| | We seek a contested case hearing pursuan | | |
| 1 | We believe the control of the state of the s | 11.00 111.00 71 11. | |
| | | | |
| l | | | |
| | | | |
| 23 | How Petitioner's Participation in the Proc | ceeding Would Sorve the Public Interest | |
| ٠. | | olic, we are invested in the Kahuku community and | 4 |
| 1 | interested in issues that impact us. | me, we are invested in the Randad Community and | 4 |
| | meresce m issues that impact us. | | |
| ŀ | | | |
| | | • | |
| 24 | A CALL TIPE AND THE AND ADDRESS OF THE AND ADDRESS OF THE ADDRESS | AL D I L. D | |
| Z4. | | the Board in Determining Whether Petitioner Me | ets |
| | the Criteria to Be a Party under Section 1 | 13-1-31, HAR | |
| | See criteria at §13-1-31 HAR (b 1-3). | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | • | | |
| | Check this box if Petitioner is submitting sup | pporting documents with this form. | ······ |
| _ | | • | |
| M | Check this box if Petitioner will submit addit | itional supporting documents after filing this form. | |
| | | | |
| 2 | 110 | 1/1 | |
| ď | ent Pordunana Z | 11-19-20, Date | 16 |
| £ | Litianas au Bannacantativa (Paint Nama) | 0 (10) | |



PETITION FOR A CONTESTED CASE HEARING

| CIAL USE ONLY |
|-----------------|
| Date Received |
| Division/Office |
| |

INSTRUCTIONS:

1. File (deliver, mail or fax) this form within ten (10) days of the Board Action Date to:

Department of Land and Natural Resources Administrative Proceedings Office 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Phone: (808) 587-1496, Fax: (808) 587-0390

- DLNR's contested case hearing rules are listed under Chapter 13-1, HAR, and can be obtained from
 the DLNR Administrative Proceedings Office or at its website
 (http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/forms/contested-case-form/). Please review these rules before filing a petition.
- 3. If you use the electronic version of this form, note that the boxes are expandable to fit in your statements. If you use the hardcopy form and need more space, you may attach additional sheets.
- 4. Pursuant to §13-1-30, HAR, a petition that involves a Conservation District Use Permit must be accompanied with a \$100.00 non-refundable filing fee (payable to "DLNR") or a request for waiver of this fee. A waiver may be granted by the Chairperson based on a petitioner's financial hardship.
- 5. All materials, including this form, shall be submitted in three (3) photocopies.

| | A. PETITIONER | |
|----------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|
| (If there are multi | ple petitioners, use one form for | each.) |
| Name Kent Fonoimoana | 2. Contact Person Kent Fonoimoana | |
| 3. Address PO Box 122 | 4. City Laie | 5. State and ZIP Hi 96762 |
| 6. Email kent@trisland.com | 7. Phone 808-294-9991 | 8. Fax |

| B. A' | TTORNEY (if represented) |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| 9. Attorney Name James H. Wright | 10. Firm Name Law Offices of James H. Wright |
| 11. Address 745 Fort St. Ste. 1925 | 12. City Honolulu 13. State and ZIP Hi 96813 |
| 14. Email wright@hawaii.rr.com | 15. Phone 16. Fax 808-523-1127 |

| | C. SUBJECT MATTER |
|------|--|
| 17. | Board Action Being Contested |
| | Approval of Incidental Take License and Final Habitat Conservation Plan for Na Pua Makani |
| | Wind Energy Project by Applicants Na Pua Makani Power Partners, LLC and the former |
| | Champlin Hawaii Wind Holdings, LLC; Tax Map Key Nos. (1) 5-6-06:018 and (1) 5-6- |
| | 08:006, Koolauloa District, Island of O'ahu, Hawai'i. |
| 18. | Board Action Date 19. Item No. |
| | 11/10/2016 C-1 |
| 20. | Nature and Extent of Petitioner's Interest That May Be Affected by the Board Action |
| | Health & safety of humans and flying animals. Negative impacts on environment, culturally |
| | significant sites, private real property values, community identity and individual/collective well |
| | being. |
| 1 | |
| 1 | |
| 21 | Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board |
| Γ. | The Kahuku Community is in overwhelming opposition to the Na Pua Makani proposal. |
| د. ا | |
| 7 | THE EIS IS DEFICIENT. |
| 1 | |
| | |
| _ | |
| 22. | Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to |
| | We seek a contested case hearing pursuant to HRS § 91-14. |
| | |
| l | |
| | |
| | |
| 23. | How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest |
| 1 | We are the public. As members of the public, we are invested in the Kahuku community and |
| | interested in issues that impact us. |
| | |
| | |
| ł | |
| 24. | Any Other Information That May Assist the Board in Determining Whether Petitioner Meets |
| | the Criteria to Be a Party under Section 13-1-31, HAR |
| | See criteria at §13-1-31 HAR (b 1-3). |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| L | |
| | Check this box if Petitioner is submitting supporting documents with this form. |
| ~ | |
| X | Check this box if Petitioner will submit additional supporting documents after filing this form. |
| | |
| , , | |
| K | met forourcano Lut Jo 11-19-2016 |
| Pet | titioner or Representative (Print Name) Signature 11-19-2010 |
| 1 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |



PETITION FOR A CONTESTED CASE HEARING

| OFF | ICIAL USE ONLY |
|------------------------------|-----------------|
| Case No. | Date Received |
| Board Action Date / Item No. | Division/Office |

INSTRUCTIONS:

1. File (deliver, mail or fax) this form within ten (10) days of the Board Action Date to:

Department of Land and Natural Resources Administrative Proceedings Office 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813 Phone: (808) 587-1496, Fax: (808) 587-0390

- DLNR's contested case hearing rules are listed under Chapter 13-1, HAR, and can be obtained from the DLNR Administrative Proceedings Office or at its website (http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/forms/contested-case-form/). Please review these rules before filing a petition.
- 3. If you use the electronic version of this form, note that the boxes are expandable to fit in your statements. If you use the hardcopy form and need more space, you may attach additional sheets.
- 4. Pursuant to §13-1-30, HAR, a petition that involves a Conservation District Use Permit must be accompanied with a \$100.00 non-refundable filing fee (payable to "DLNR") or a request for waiver of this fee. A waiver may be granted by the Chairperson based on a petitioner's financial hardship.
- 5. All materials, including this form, shall be submitted in three (3) photocopies.

| | A. PETITIONER | |
|-------------------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| (If there are mu | ltiple petitioners, use one form for | each.) |
| Name Kent Fonoimoana | 2. Contact Person Kent Fonoimoana | 1 |
| 3. Address PO Box 122 | 4. City Laie | 5. State and ZIP Hi 96762 |
| 6. Email kent@trisland.com | 7. Phone 808-294-9991 | 8. Fax |

| B. A | TTORNEY (if represented) |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| 9. Attorney Name James H. Wright | 10. Firm Name Law Offices of James H. Wright |
| 11. Address 745 Fort St. Ste. 1925 | 12. City Honolulu 13. State and ZIP Hi 96813 |
| 14. Email wright@hawaii.rr.com | 15. Phone 16. Fax 808-523-1127 |

| | C. SUBJECT MATTER |
|----------------|--|
| 17. | Board Action Being Contested |
| | Approval of Incidental Take License and Final Habitat Conservation Plan for Na Pua Makani |
| | Wind Energy Project by Applicants Na Pua Makani Power Partners, LLC and the former |
| | Champlin Hawaii Wind Holdings, LLC; Tax Map Key Nos. (1) 5-6-06:018 and (1) 5-6- |
| | 08:006, Koolauloa District, Island of Oʻahu, Hawaiʻi. |
| 18. | Board Action Date 19. Item No. |
| | 11/10/2016 C-1 |
| 20. | Nature and Extent of Petitioner's Interest That May Be Affected by the Board Action |
| | Health & safety of humans and flying animals. Negative impacts on environment, culturally |
| | significant sites, private real property values, community identity and individual/collective well |
| | being. |
| | |
| | |
| 21. | Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board |
| | The Kahuku Community is in overwhelming opposition to the Na Pua Makani proposal. |
| | INPOEQUATE ELS. |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| 22. | Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to |
| | We seek a contested case hearing pursuant to HRS § 91-14. |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | TI DAY - A DAY - A D. H. W. L. A. D. |
| 23. | How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest |
| | We are the public. As members of the public, we are invested in the Kahuku community and interested in issues that impact us. |
| | interested in issues that impact us. |
| | \cdot |
| | |
| 34 | Any Other Information That May Assist the Board in Determining Whether Petitioner Meets |
| £. | the Criteria to Be a Party under Section 13-1-31, HAR |
| | See criteria at §13-1-31 HAR (b 1-3). |
| | occommunity is a second of the |
| | |
| | |
| L | |
| | Check this box if Petitioner is submitting supporting documents with this form. |
| | \cdot |
| M | Check this box if Petitioner will submit additional supporting documents after filing this form. |
| | |
| ı | 1 + B |
| 上 | aut fondument finite (Print Name) Signature Date |
| Pet | itioner or Representative (Print Name) Signature Date |

FORM APO-11

Page 2 of 2