STATE OF HAWAI'L DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES Division of Boating and Ocean Recreation Honolulu, Hawai'i 96819

July 22, 2022

Chairperson and Members Board of Land and Natural Resources State of Hawai'i Honolulu, Hawai'i

SUBJECT: Approval of petition for a contested case hearing (CCH) by Eric R. Alpert regarding June 24, 2022 enforcement action for alleged illegal principal habitation of a vessel, in violation of Hawaii Administrative Rule (HAR) § 13-231-26, or alternatively for alleged violation of HAR § 13-231-28, regarding staying aboard a vessel moored in Ala Wai small boat harbor.

SUMMARY:

Eric R. Alpert requests a CCH concerning the June 24, 2022 Board of Land and Natural Resources (Board) enforcement action brought by the Division of Boating and Ocean Recreation (DOBOR). Mr. Alpert is entitled to a CCH, and DOBOR staff recommends the Board approve Mr. Alpert's CCH petition.

BACKGROUND:

As Item J-3 of the Board's regularly scheduled meeting on June 24, 2022, DOBOR brought an enforcement action against Mr. Alpert for alleged illegal principal habitation of a vessel, in violation of HAR § 13-231-26, or alternatively for alleged violation of HAR § 13-231-28, regarding staying aboard vessels in Ala Wai small boat harbor. Mr. Alpert verbally requested a CCH petition at the June 24, 2022 Board meeting, then submitted a written CCH petition to the Board on July 5, 2022 (attached as **EXHIBIT A**).

DISCUSSION:

HAR § 13-1-29(a) provides in relevant part:

An oral or written request for a contested case hearing must be made to the board no later than the close of the board meeting at which the subject matter of the request is scheduled for board disposition. An agency or person so requesting a contested case must also file (or mail a postmarked) written petition with the board for a contested case no later than ten calendar days after the close of the board meeting at which the matter was scheduled for disposition.

As stated above, Mr. Alpert verbally requested a CCH at the June 24, 2022 Board meeting and submitted his written CCH petition on July 5, 2022. Mr. Alpert therefore meets the deadline requirements of HAR § 13-1-29(a).

Additionally, because the June 24, 2022 enforcement action involves penalties for alleged violations, Mr. Alpert is entitled to a contested case hearing.

RECOMMENDATION:

DOBOR recommends that the Board:

- 1) Approve Eric R. Alpert's petition for a contested case hearing; and
- 2) Authorize the Chairperson to take any and all actions necessary to effectuate its decision including, but not limited to, appointing a Hearing Officer for Mr. Alpert's contested case hearing.

Respectfully Submitted,

(LACHON)

EDWARD R. UNDERWOOD, Administrator Division of Boating & Ocean Recreation

APPROVED FOR SUBMITTAL:

Sgame Q. Case

SUZANNE D. CASE, Chairperson
Board of Land and Natural Resources

Attachments:

A. Contested case hearing petition by Eric R. Alpert (submitted July 5, 2022)



STATE OF HAWAII BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

PETITION FOR A CONTESTED CASE HEARING

OFFICIAL USE ONLY		
Case No.	Date Received	
Board Action Date / Item No.	Division/Office	

INSTRUCTIONS:

1. File (deliver, mail or fax) this form within ten (10) days of the Board Action Date to:

Department of Land and Natural Resources Administrative Proceedings Office 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Phone: (808) 587-1496, Fax: (808) 587-0390

- 2. DLNR's contested case hearing rules are listed under Chapter 13-1, HAR, and can be obtained from the DLNR Administrative Proceedings Office or at its website (http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/forms/contested-case-form/). Please review these rules before filing a petition.
- 3. If you use the electronic version of this form, note that the boxes are expandable to fit in your statements. If you use the hardcopy form and need more space, you may attach additional sheets.
- 4. Pursuant to §13-1-30, HAR, a petition that involves a Conservation District Use Permit must be accompanied with a \$100.00 non-refundable filing fee (payable to "DLNR") or a request for waiver of this fee. A waiver may be granted by the Chairperson based on a petitioner's financial hardship.
- 5. All materials, including this form, shall be submitted in **three (3)** photocopies.

	A. PETITIONER				
(If there are multiple petitioners, use one form for each.)					
1. Name	2. Contact Person				
ERIC R. ALPERT		JASON Z. SAY, ESQ.			
3. Address	4. City HONOLULU	5. State and ZIP HAWAII 96814			
6. Email	7. Phone	8. Fax			

B. ATTORNEY (if represented)				
9. Attorney Name	10. Firm Name			
JASON Z. SAY, ESQ	LAW OFFICE OF JASON Z. SAY LLLC			
11. Address	12. City	13. State and ZIP		
1001 BISHOP STREET, SUITE 1503	HONOLULU	HAWAII 96813		
14. Email	15. Phone	16. Fax		
JZS@JASONSAYLAW.COM	(808) 679-7360	(808) 772-4538		

FORM APO-11

 Board Action Being Contested Revocation of Petitioner's existing use permits. Not reissuing to Petitioner any new use permits for a period of two years. \$30,000 total fine (\$5,000 per incident for 6 alleged violations). Board Action Date June 24, 2022	ection
2. Not reissuing to Petitioner any new use permits for a period of two years. 3. \$30,000 total fine (\$5,000 per incident for 6 alleged violations). 18. Board Action Date June 24, 2022 19. Item No. J 3 20. Any Specific Statute or Rule That Entitles Petitioner to a Contested Case HAR Sec. 13-1-29 21. Any Specific Property Interest of Petitioner That Is Entitled to Due Process Protect Legally attained use permits 22. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 23. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with respace Agenda item J 3. 24. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the public also has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptored in the proper oversight of DLNR to ensure the public also has a	ection
3. \$30,000 total fine (\$5,000 per incident for 6 alleged violations). 18. Board Action Date June 24, 2022 19. Item No. J 3 20. Any Specific Statute or Rule That Entitles Petitioner to a Contested Case HAR Sec. 13-1-29 21. Any Specific Property Interest of Petitioner That Is Entitled to Due Process Protect Legally attained use permits 22. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 23. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp Agenda item J 3. 24. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conc proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an	ection
18. Board Action Date June 24, 2022 20. Any Specific Statute or Rule That Entitles Petitioner to a Contested Case HAR Sec. 13-1-29 21. Any Specific Property Interest of Petitioner That Is Entitled to Due Process Protect Legally attained use permits 22. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 23. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp Agenda item J 3. 24. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are cond proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an	ection
June 24, 2022 20. Any Specific Statute or Rule That Entitles Petitioner to a Contested Case HAR Sec. 13-1-29 21. Any Specific Property Interest of Petitioner That Is Entitled to Due Process Protect Legally attained use permits 22. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 23. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp. Agenda item J 3. 24. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest. The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptoder investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR.	ection
20. Any Specific Statute or Rule That Entitles Petitioner to a Contested Case HAR Sec. 13-1-29 21. Any Specific Property Interest of Petitioner That Is Entitled to Due Process Protect Legally attained use permits 22. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 23. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with respace Agenda item J 3. 24. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are comproper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper oversight of the public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper oversight of the HAR.	ection
21. Any Specific Property Interest of Petitioner That Is Entitled to Due Process Protect Legally attained use permits 22. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 33. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with respace Agenda item J 3. 44. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptioner investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR.	ection
 21. Any Specific Property Interest of Petitioner That Is Entitled to Due Process Protect Legally attained use permits 22. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 23. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp Agenda item J 3. 24. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are cond proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an interest in proper investigations. 	ection
 Legally attained use permits 2. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 3. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp Agenda item J 3. 4. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptorer investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an anticological proper investigation in the proceeding Would Serve the Public also has an anticological proper investigations. 	ection
 Legally attained use permits 2. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 3. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp Agenda item J 3. 4. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptorer investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an anticological proper investigation in the proceeding Would Serve the Public also has an anticological proper investigations. 	ection
 Legally attained use permits 2. Any Disagreement Petitioner May Have with an Application before the Board Reserved. 3. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp Agenda item J 3. 4. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceptorer investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an anticological proper investigation in the proceeding Would Serve the Public also has an anticological proper investigations. 	ection
Reserved. 23. Any Relief Petitioner Seeks or Deems Itself Entitled to Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp Agenda item J 3. 24. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conc proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an	
Petitioner request the Board rescind its decision issued on June 24, 2022 with resp Agenda item J 3. 4. How Petitioner's Participation in the Proceeding Would Serve the Public Interest The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are cond proper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an	
The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceproper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an	pect to
The public has an interest in proper oversight of DLNR to ensure that they are conceproper investigations and enforcement pursuant to the HAR. The public also has an	
	nducting
5. Any Other Information That May Assist the Board in Determining Whether Petition the Criteria to Be a Party under Section 13-1-31, HAR Reserved.	ioner Meets
Check this box if Petitioner is submitting supporting documents with this form.	
Check this box if Petitioner will submit additional supporting documents after filing this f	form.
ASON Z. SAY, ESQ JULY 4, 2	2022
Petitioner or Representative (Print Name) Signature Date	