

STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
Division of Forestry and Wildlife
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

April 26, 2024

Chairperson and Members
Board of Land and Natural Resources
State of Hawai'i
Honolulu, Hawai'i

Land Board Members:

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF AN ALLOCATION PROCESS
FOR KOA CANOE LOG HARVEST PERMITS FROM THE
KAPĀPALA KOA CANOE MANAGEMENT AREA, TAX MAP KEY
(3) 9-8-001:014, KAPĀPALA, KA'Ū, HAWAI'I.

SUMMARY:

This submittal requests Board approval for the Division of Forestry and Wildlife (DOFAW) Allocation Protocol for issuing special use harvest permits for koa canoe logs from the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area (KKCMA).

BACKGROUND:

The Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area is a roughly 1,257-acre section of the Ka'ū Forest Reserve, located in Kapāpala, Ka'ū, on the island of Hawai'i. This area was set aside for koa timber production in 1989 and further refined to focus on koa for the traditional and cultural use of creating koa canoes in 2004. It was officially incorporated into the Ka'ū Forest Reserve in 2013 to afford it the protection of the statutes and administrative rules of the Forest Reserve System.

Acknowledging the need for community and expert advice and input on the management of KKCMA, DOFAW started a working group in 2015 comprised of key stakeholders including kūpuna and residents of Ka'ū, canoe clubs and associations, cultural practitioners, canoe builders, conservationists, adjacent landowners. Voyaging organizations were also approached to participate in the working group, but none decided to become members. Stakeholders were invited to be a part of the working group by the DOFAW administrator, and membership has changed over time. However, the intention and makeup of what became known as the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Working Group has remained intact. The group has been meeting 1-3 a year times since 2015, to give their advice and input on the plans for the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area. Their input has been essential, providing various perspectives on canoe building, traditional practices, local knowledge, and forestry experience.

In an accompanying board submittal, DOFAW presents a forest management plan for KKCMA with the management objective of providing a long-term, sustainable supply of koa for the traditional and cultural practice of creating canoes while minimizing impacts on the natural and cultural resources in the area. This management plan broadly outlines how organizations can apply for and be selected for harvesting koa canoe resources from the area. However, to further define the allocation process for public koa resources, DOFAW staff, with input from the KKCMA working group, has developed the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Allocation Protocol (Exhibit A). Applications for koa resources received through this process will be reviewed and scored by DOFAW staff and Kapāpala Koa Canoe Working Group members.

DISCUSSION:

The attached Kapāpala Koa Canoe Allocation Protocol (Exhibit A) will guide how organizations apply for koa canoe resources from KKCMA, how those applications are reviewed, and how koa canoe resources are awarded and tracked. This document is meant to be a guiding, living document. Some components, including the permit application, application scoring system, application periods, makeup and membership of the review committee, and interaction with applying organizations, may need to be revised to allow for adaptive management as these protocols are implemented and need to be adjusted to increase efficiency and to achieve more positive outcomes.

Below is an overview of the allocation process. For details please see the attached Exhibit A:

- 1) DOFAW staff will determine what koa canoe resources are available and open an application period.
- 2) Interested organizations submit applications for Koa canoe resources.
- 3) Applications are reviewed by an evaluation committee, consisting of members of the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Working Group. The Working Group delivers results to DOFAW.
- 4) DOFAW makes final decisions on the allocations and the award of permits for canoe logs to selected applicants.
- 5) DOFAW awards a preliminary Special Use Permit for the harvest of koa canoe resources from KKCMA.
- 6) DOFAW works with awarded applicants on the canoe log harvest process, ensuring organizations follow their harvest plan and all applicable rules and regulations.
- 7) Koa canoe resources are put into a tracking system that ensures koa resources will be used for the purpose described on the permit and to prevent logs from being lost, stolen, or sold.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

That the Board of Land and Natural Resources:

1. Approve the allocation process for issuing koa canoe log harvest permits from the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area.

Respectfully submitted,



DAVID G. SMITH, Administrator
Division of Forestry and Wildlife

APPROVED FOR SUBMITTAL:



DAWN N.S. CHANG, Chairperson
Board of Land and Natural Resources

ATTACHMENTS:

EXHIBIT A: Kapāpala Koa Canoe Allocation Protocol

Exhibit A:

Kapapala Koa Canoe Management Area Log Allocation Protocol

This protocol outlines establishing eligibility and awarding permits to applicants seeking to harvest koa logs from the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area (KKCMA) for wa‘a (canoe) building or obtaining koa wood for canoe repair. KKCMA is a 1,257-acre unit of native forest designated by the Board of Land and Natural Resources for sustainable koa harvesting to promote the native Hawaiian tradition of canoe building. This allocation protocol ensures that a transparent, predictable, and consistent process is applied to all applicants.

Organizations interested in harvesting koa resources from KKCMA must apply to the Division of Forestry and Wildlife (Division). The Division developed the application form in partnership with the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Working Group (KKCWG), which includes a diverse representation of stakeholders, including kūpuna and residents of Ka‘ū, canoe clubs and associations, cultural practitioners, canoe builders, conservationists, and adjacent landowners. The application form and all applicable information will be posted on the Division website.

By this KKCMA Log Allocation Protocol, all applications received will be reviewed and subjected to a standardized scoring system. Applicants will be prioritized or ranked based on application scores during each application period. The scoring system utilizes several criteria, including the applicant’s need, purpose, use, expertise, capacity, and follow-on cultural and stewardship practices in KKCMA and/or other forested areas in Hawai‘i. This Log Allocation protocol is for the legitimate use of koa canoe logs for building canoes that may be used for racing, voyaging, fishing, display, education, or other traditional and customary practices.

This protocol and application process applies to koa trees living, dead, or downed within KKCMA and may be used for other koa logs on a case-by-case basis with the Division in collaboration with the KKCWG. In addition to this protocol, the Division provides permits for collecting salvage dead or downed koa logs on other lands managed by the Division. That practice will continue and be handled separately. The KKCMA allocation protocol and permits are intended to supplement this existing process.

This document is meant to be a guiding document that may be amended occasionally by the Division in collaboration with the KKCWG. Some components, including the permit application, application scoring system, application periods, makeup and membership of the review committee, and interaction with applicants, may be revised to allow for adaptive management as these protocols are implemented and need to be adjusted to increase efficiency and achieve program outcomes.

Allocation Process

1. The Division will survey the KKCMA, identify suitable koa canoe log(s) and their location, and determine the amount available for allocation for a given application period. The harvest limits outlined in the 2023 Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area Plan will determine the amounts made available.
2. An application period is determined, and interested organizations can submit applications to the Division (see application below).
3. The Division will conduct a preliminary review of applications for completeness and compliance with application guidelines. Division staff will work with applicants to submit missing information or revise required elements needing clarification. Staff may collaborate with the Kapāpala Working Group to determine whether clarification is needed.
4. Application Review Process.
 - a) An evaluation committee recommended by and comprising Kapāpala Koa Canoe Working Group members and/or other appropriate evaluators will score all completed applications. The committee will review applications using the scoring sheet found below.
 - b) The committee will create a ranked list of all applications submitted during that application period based on scores.
 - c) The evaluation committee submits scores and recommendations to the Division.
 - d) The Division will review the submitted scores and recommendations and, upon approval, determine log allocation based on the scores and recommendations.
5. Organizations that have their applications approved will work with the Division through the canoe log selection process. Logs will be selected from those the Division determines are available for harvest at the beginning of the application period.
6. The Division reviews the permittee's harvest plan and implementation timeline and will issue a Special Use Collection Permit for koa canoe log harvest once approved. Permit holders will be responsible for adhering to all requirements of the Hawaii Revised Statutes and Hawaii Administrative Rules.
7. After the Division Administrator approves the permit, copies of the permit will be provided to the Division of Conservation and Resource Enforcement (DOCARE).
8. The Division follows up with permittees to ensure all aspects of the harvest and log utilization are carried out according to the permittees' harvest plans. The Kapāpala Koa Canoe Working Group and the Hawaii Canoe Racing Association (HCRA) or other agreed-upon steward(s) implement the monitoring plan for 1)

log removal, 2) log shaping, and 3) completion and documentation of the final product(s).

9. Tracking. The koa canoe is put into a tracking program with the HCRA or other agreed-upon steward(s) to ensure the koa resource will be used for the purpose described on the permit application and to prevent logs from being lost, stolen, or sold:
 - a) A database will contain a picture of each log > canoe with a corresponding name that identifies a log or lumber from the time of harvest.
 - b) Photos will be taken during each processing step (log extraction, building, and the finished canoe).
 - c) During the curing process, the log shall be marked with painted ID numbers visible in the photographs. The ID numbers must remain visible on the log during the curing process.
 - d) The log/koa canoe's name must be documented in the tracking system and updated as needed.
 - e) The organizations must provide an annual report of the location and status of the log/canoe.

PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area Collecting Permit Application

Please fill out the following application to submit your request for a koa canoe log for traditional and customary uses from Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area. This application will be reviewed by the Division of Forestry and Wildlife (Division) and ranked by an evaluation committee as recommended by the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Forest Working Group. All items must be completed for the application to be reviewed and ranked. If there are any questions regarding the following items, a Division of Forestry and Wildlife forester or natural resource specialist will be available to assist. All applications submitted within the same application period will be evaluated against each other. Applications with the highest scores will have the highest priority.

General Information

1. Date of application:

2. Organization Name:

3. Organization Description (i.e., Canoe Club, Educational Organization, Voyaging Society, etc.):
 - a. How many koa canoes do you currently have? Please provide any appropriate details about existing canoes, including condition:

4. Point of Contact:

5. Number of organization members:

6. Location of organization (City, Zip Code):

7. Type of Canoe the log will be used for (e.g., voyaging, racing, fishing, or other intended use):

a. What will the canoe be used for, specifically?

8. Desired log dimensions (width, length):

Canoe Carving/Building/Shaping Plan

9. Who will carve/build the proposed canoe? Primary builder and apprentice or student(s)

10. How will the canoe be built and shaped? Please explain in detail, e.g., only using traditional tools and cultural customs, only using modern tools with minimal cultural customs or a combination of contemporary and traditional cultural techniques

11. What will happen to the log/tree parts not used for the canoe?

12. Where and how will the log be stored before building?

13.Where will the carving/building be done?

14.Beyond the builders, who will be involved in the building process? Include any educational components envisioned.

Preliminary Harvesting Plan

Note: This is a preliminary plan and can be subject to change. The Division of Forestry and Wildlife will oversee but is not responsible for harvesting and delivering the logs to the applicant. When possible, we encourage organizations to combine resources to harvest material from the forest, as this will usually be more cost-effective for all parties and decrease impacts on the forest. If you are open to collaborating on harvest operations, please indicate in your plan below. A final, detailed plan is required once a log is allocated.

15.How will the log be harvested and transported from the forest?

16.Who will be doing the harvesting? Note: Harvesters/loggers must be available for a pre-consultation with the Division of Forestry and Wildlife before harvesting.

17.Identify insurance coverage:

18. Once a log is made available, what is the proposed time frame for harvesting and extracting the log?

19. Describe any traditional ceremony, blessing, or practice that will occur before, during, or after harvest, if any.

Financial Plan.

20. Include details, amounts budgeted, and a timeline on how you will finance the following activities:

Note: The labor costs associated with harvesting trees can include hiring an experienced cutter, ground person, and machine operator, which are the applicant's responsibility. The complexity of the tree harvesting operation will likely vary significantly between different trees for various reasons. The machines required will likely consist of an excavator, a forwarder, and/or a bulldozer. These machines need to be transported to and from the forest, which adds additional costs to the operation. Finally, the log is transported on the highway, possibly in an oversized load vehicle, and may be shipped off the island to another location. The budget is estimated between \$6,000 and \$20,000, though it is highly variable and subject to change according to harvest operations and the destination of the log. If and when possible, it will be cost-efficient and reduce impacts on infrastructure and the forest if operations between organizations or with the Division can be combined or done in quick succession with each other.

a. Harvesting

b. Transportation

c. Canoe Construction

Stewardship Plan

- 21.** Will the organization and its members reciprocate to either Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area or other forests on their island? Please provide details describing where, when, and what you will do as a service project(s):

NOTE: There are a variety of ways and places organizations can give back, which can include at the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area, other lands, or with other forest stewardship volunteer activities provided by forestry and conservation groups across the state. Some examples could include outplanting native or culturally significant species, weed control, outreach events, trail maintenance, etc. All applicants are encouraged to discuss stewardship plans with the Division for projects at the Kapāpala Koa Canoe Forest, or other Division-managed lands.

Before any work is done on state lands, the Division must approve all activities and materials, such as out-planting species, invasive species to be removed, etc. Out-planted plants must be from a reputable source, site-appropriate, and used appropriately.

- 22.** What stewardship activities/actions has your organization done in the past? Please provide details on experience with land stewardship actions (e.g., forest management, out-planting, trail maintenance, weed control, etc.) and any expertise stewardship participants have with forest stewardship.

Note: Prior stewardship experience is not a requirement or part of the scoring criteria but helps the Division determine the level of oversight and forestry education needed for implementing stewardship projects.

23. Estimated stewardship hours and/or person/days provided:

Cultural/Educational Outreach

24. How will this canoe help educate people about the native Hawaiian tradition of koa canoes?

25. How will your organization perpetuate the canoe carving/building tradition?

26. How will your organization educate within and outside of your organization about the value, use, and tradition of koa canoes?

Succession and Tracking

27. Who will be the long-term steward of the koa canoe, including the parties responsible for the management, storage, and maintenance?

28. What is the succession plan for the koa canoe?

29. Who will track and submit annual reports and photographs to the tracking organization?

Kapāpala Koa Canoe Management Area Application Scoring System

Date of Review: _____

Reviewer Name: _____

Date of Application:

Name of Applicant:

Canoe Type:

Scoring criteria: Koa log will be used for traditional, customary, and/or educational uses perpetuating Hawaiian culture. Points = 0 to 30 pts.

Location of Applicant:

Ka'ū / Hawaii Island / Other Islands

Scoring criteria: Koa log will be located in Ka'ū District (10 pts), on Hawaii Island (5pts), or transported to another island (2pts). Points = 0 to 10 pts.

Current number of Canoes:

0 1 2 3 4 5+

Scoring criteria: The organization does not have an existing koa canoe (20pts); has one koa canoe but it is damaged (15pts); has one functional koa canoe (10pts); has between two to four koa canoes (2-5pts); has more than five functional koa canoes (0pts). Points = 0 to 20 pts.

Canoe Building Plan:

1. Traditional Tools Modern Tools Combo (explain)

Scoring criteria: Building method is well described and connects to traditional, customary, and educational use for koa canoes. Points = 0 to 10 pts.

2. Involvement of organization, community, and/or public in the building process.

Scoring criteria: The plan includes the involvement of the users, community, and a diverse group of people (20 pts); includes apprentices and users (15pts); includes apprentices (10pts); will be showcased/highlighted within the community or public (5pts); does not include any involvement or education opportunities (0pts). Points = 0 to 20 pts.

3. Utilization of tree

Scoring criteria: The plans include the utilization of the log with minimal wasted materials (10pts); most of the log will be utilized, and scraps will be purposed for other canoe-related needs (scale from 1-9); the plan is unclear on the use of extra material (0pts). Points = scale from 1-10, 0 to 10 pts.

4. Storage during curing

Scoring criteria: The koa log will be stored in a secure location and monitored by the organization to prevent theft (20pts); the organization has identified a storage site but does not have a plan for avoiding theft (10pts); the organization has not identified a location for storage (0pts). Points = 0 to 10 pts.

Preliminary Harvest Plan:

1. Log harvesting and extraction

Scoring criteria: The organization has a well-thought-out preliminary harvesting plan that includes an identified harvester, logistics, and financing and provides consideration for minimizing impact to the surrounding forest (20pts); financing is less secure, but harvesting details are sound (10pts); preliminary harvesting plan does not include considerations for minimizing impacts (5pts); harvesting plan is not complete or sound (0pts). Points = 0 to 20 pts.

2. Timeline

Scoring criteria: The organization has a well-thought-through timeline for extracting the log or lumber once it is made available (10pts); timeline was provided (5pts); timeline needs additional considerations (2pts). Points = 0 to 10 pts.

3. Use of traditional ceremony before harvesting

Scoring criteria: The organization will include appropriate cultural protocols before harvesting (10pts); a ceremony will be completed (5pts); no ceremony will be completed (0pts). Points = 0 to 10 pts.

Stewardship Plan:

1. Stewardship plan and activities

Scoring criteria: The organization has a well-thought-out stewardship plan with identified participants, inclusion of members, stakeholders, outreach to the community, etc., with contributions of time and resources (20pts); less developed (10pts); still needs additional thought (5pts); stewardship activities do not relate to koa forestry (2pts). Points = 0 to 10 pts.

2. Location

Scoring criteria: The organization plans to contribute time and resources to Kapāpala Koa Canoe Forest (20pts); in a koa forest on Hawai'i Island (15pts); in a koa forest on another island (10pts); in a forest in Hawaii (5pts); another area (2pts). Points = 0 to 20 pts.

3. Person-hours of service per member/in total

Scoring criteria: 0-50 (1pt) / 50-100 (2pts) / 100-150 (3pts) / 150-200 (5pts) / 200-250 (7pts) / 250-300 (9pts) / 350-400 (11pts) / 400+ (15pts). Points = 0 to 15 pts.

Financial Plan:

Scoring criteria: The organization has sufficient financing to harvest, transport, and carve the log (20pts); financing is identified but not secured (10pts); financing is identified for most of the process (5pts); financing is not secured (1pts). Points – 0 to 20 pts.

Cultural/Educational Outreach:

Scoring criteria: The applicant includes consideration for education of people about the native Hawaiian tradition of carving and provides for outreach to its members and a diverse group of people outside of the organization (20pts); less than the best but still very good (15pts); less but good (10pts); less (5pts); minimal to none (0-2pts). Points – 0 to 20 pts.

Succession Plan:

Scoring criteria: A succession plan is provided, and the organization has thought through ownership, maintenance, and tracking. the plan includes verification criteria (20pts): less than the best but still very good > less but good > minimal > none (sliding scale) Points – 0 to 20 pts.

Additional comments or considerations:

Scoring criteria: The evaluation committee can award up to 5 points for exceptional plans or purposes pertaining to the abovementioned criteria. Justification must be provided. Points = 0 to 5 pts.