From: <u>Jacques U Baenziger</u>
To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Moorings at Maka'iwa Beach

Date: Thursday, July 25, 2024 5:02:59 PM

A request for additional moorings at Maka'iwa Beach is being made by the Auberge Hotel without having informed other interested parties. We are owners that front on this beach and strongly feel we should have input. This has been done in secret by the hotel to prevent public comment. We urge you to delay any decision until other owners at Mauna Lani resort can provide input. Jacques U Baenziger 68-1399 Mauna Lani Dive, D202, Kamuela, Hi 96743

Sent from Outlook

From: <u>Kimberley Bennett</u>
To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] NO to Makaiwa/Mauna Lani mooring

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 9:24:47 AM

I oppose the addition of another mooring in Makaiwa bay. It creates more boat traffic in an area where my family and I enjoy swimming and surfing and it poses potential risk of injury to the public using the area for these recreational activities.

Signed Kimberley Bennett

From: <u>Jane Bentley</u>

To: DLNR.BLNR.Testimony
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Boat Moorings
Date: Friday, July 26, 2024 4:47:21 AM

I only rec'd information about the moorings this morning so this is just a quick email of protest that We are NOT in favour of boat moorings in Maikawa Bay.

Jane and Bruce Crawford The Islands C1

Jane

jbentley081@gmail.com C: 403-479-6683 From: Bernstein

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Please NO to Moorings at Maka'iwa Bay at Mauna Lani

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 4:37:34 PM

#### Aloha Members of the Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I am writing to express my strong opposition to the request submitted by DHL Mahi OPCO, LLC, to install two new offshore moorings outside of a designated offshore mooring area in Maka'iwa Bay, Kohala, Island of Hawaii. This request includes a further appeal to exempt the installation and use of the moorings from the requirement for an environmental assessment, a move that I believe could have significant and detrimental impacts on our coastal and marine environments.

Firstly, the installation of these offshore moorings outside of the designated mooring area sets a dangerous precedent. By allowing moorings to be installed wherever convenient, rather than within established areas, we risk disrupting marine ecosystems that have been designated as off-limits for good reason. These ecosystems often harbor delicate marine life and are integral to maintaining the biodiversity and health of our coastal waters.

The proposed mooring site, while described as not providing habitat for known endangered species, does not guarantee the absence of other critical marine life. The cumulative impact of additional moorings and increased vessel traffic can lead to unintended consequences, such as anchor damage to the seabed, which can disrupt benthic habitats and lead to long-term ecological imbalance.

Moreover, exempting this project from the requirement to prepare an environmental assessment is a cause for serious concern. Environmental assessments are vital in ensuring that any potential negative impacts are thoroughly evaluated and mitigated. The absence of such an assessment means there is no comprehensive analysis of the potential risks, including the possibility of introducing pollutants, increased noise, and physical disturbances to the marine environment.

It is also troubling that the mooring installation is being justified under the Department of Land and Natural Resources' Exemption List. While minor structures accessory to existing facilities might warrant exemptions, new offshore moorings that accommodate commercial vessels should not fall into this category. These structures are not minor in nature and have the potential for significant impact, both environmentally and on the use and enjoyment of our public coastal resources.

Lastly, the approval of these moorings without a thorough review undermines the integrity of our environmental regulations and the public's trust in the processes designed to protect our natural resources. It is essential that all projects, especially those involving our precious coastal and marine environments, undergo stringent scrutiny to ensure they are in the best interest of the public and the environment.

I urge the Board to deny the request from DHL Mahi OPCO, LLC, and to uphold the requirement for a comprehensive environmental assessment. The preservation of our natural habitats and adherence to rigorous environmental standards should be our foremost priority.

Mahalo nui loa for considering our concerns. I trust that the Board will make a decision that reflects a commitment to environmental stewardship and sustainable development.

reflects a communent to environmental stewardship and sustainable develop	ρı
With much aloha,	
Karen & Todd Bernstein	
Karen & Todd Bernstein	

Villages at Mauna Lani 68-1025 N Kaniku Drive, Apt #510 Kamuela, HI 96743 From: <u>steveboreri</u>

**To:** <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject:[EXTERNAL] Morning"s at Mauna LaniDate:Thursday, July 25, 2024 2:45:43 PM

WHY.. these morning have no Beneficial use for the community these will be private mornings for private boats. If you let them put in more mornings it will set President for the whole coast

Sent from my Galaxy

From: Robert Borosky
To: DLNR.BLNR.Testimony

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Proposal for new moorings in Makaiwa Bay

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 4:01:27 PM

Hi. The proposed moorings are in direct line of the path taken by swimmers and snorkelers, especially the one close to shore. I snorkel almost every day in that line because that is where the turtles, fish, rays, etc. congregate. The mooring close to shore as shown in the photo is right next to the remaining healthy coral.

The outer mooring is next to an extremely healthy group of coral. It extends perpendicular to shore and is only 10 feet below the water near where the mooring is proposed. Today, in that very area a young turtle was resting in the coral. It has been there for most days. Also, hundreds of fish of various varieties were there today as usual. To the left of the outer proposed mooring was a shoal of thousands of fish trying to survive the hunting of twenty or so Trevally. In other words the proposed moorings are next to the prime healthy coral supporting the largest concentration of marine life in Makaiwa Bay.

My other concern is the tenders that will bring passengers from shore to these boats. It's path will cross the paths of swimmers, boarders, and snorkelers. This is very dangerous and unnecessary.

Please consider what the consequences of allowing more moorings will have on the ocean you are tasked to protect. And the people.

Thanks, Bob Borosky Sent from my iPhone From: <u>Danielle Bradshaw</u>
To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] strong opposition to the proposed Installation of two (2) New Offshore Moorings outside of an

Established Offshore Mooring Area, Makaiwa Bay, Kamuela, Island of Hawaii, Hawaii, For DHL MAHI OPC), LLC.

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 8:41:37 AM

#### Dear Members of the BLNR:

I am writing to voice my strong opposition to the proposed Installation of two (2) New Offshore Moorings outside of an Established Offshore Mooring Area, Makaiwa Bay, Kamuela, Island of Hawaii, Hawaii, For DHL MAHI OPC), LLC.

The following are the reasons I am strongly opposed:

- 1) Many residents and visitors use this area for snorkeling, scuba diving, paddle boarding, surfing, and canoeing. These moorings and the increased boat traffic will cause safety issues for these people.
- 2) These moorings and increased boat traffic will create negative environmental impacts. The area of the proposed moorings contains some of the last healthy coral reef in the area. In additions there are many species of fish, eels, turtles, rays and seals.
- 3) This is an area of Hawaiian cultural significance. It is home to fish ponds and a settlement used by early Hawaiians. It is critical to preserve this. Adding the moorings and having boats anchored there will litter coastline changing the historic look of the location and potentially changing the way the water flows in such a way that it may damage the fish ponds.

I urge you to please deny this request for these moorings or at minimum demand that there be more studies done looking into the environmenal and cultural impacts prior to approving this proposal.

I would like to speak at the meeting if possible. I plan to attend via Zoom.

Thank you,

Dr. Danielle Bradshaw

Palm Villas Mauna Lani

From:

doug browne
DLNR.BLNR.Testimony
[EXTERNAL] New Moorings
Friday, July 26, 2024 8:18:59 AM To: Subject: Date:

I am opposed to these new Moorings! We do not need them! Sent from my iPhone

From: <u>heidi cook</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Cc: Jon Wilson

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Proposed Commercial Moorings in Makaiwa Bay just in front of the Mauna Lani Beach Club.

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 5:37:02 PM

#### Aloha,

I believe Mauna Lani Resort should NOT permit Auberge's plan to go forward with the installation of two moorings for commercial boats just outside the beloved Beach Club and the historic ponds.

In my opinion, Makaiwa Bay's underwater beauty is second to the waters at Kelakekua Bay South of Kona. Coral is starting to come back in Makaiwa Bay waters. The clear water of this bay is home to many kinds of tropical fish as well as eels, humpback whales, manta and spotted eagle rays, an occasional endangered monk seal or seals as well as turtles.

Several hundreds of homeowners, renters and Auberge guests come to the Beach Club to snorkel, stand up paddle board, swim in open water as well as to surf. Having two more commercial boats anchored in this small body of water is definitely not a good idea as the diesel fuel and the noise of high powered outboard motors would scare away our beautiful tropical fish and marine animals. Having these commercial boats on site is dangerous for the various activities mentioned above.

Commercial boats can be moored in Kawaiikae Harbor just 18 North of the Mauna Lani Resort. From the protected small boat Harbor, the Auberge commercial boats can take snorkelers or scuba divers to the waters off of the town of Puako or North of Kawaihae to Mahukona, both beautiful spots for snorkeling without the crowds,

Heidi Cook-Rich Dworkis Villages # 606 Mauna Lani Resort. Homeowners for 18 years. Sent from my iPad From: <u>Tinsley Davis</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Comment on request for 2 new moorings at Makaiwa Bay

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 2:59:27 PM

#### Aloha,

I have read the recent submittal by DHL Mahi OPCO, LLC, requesting 2 new offshore moorings in Makaiwa Bay. I have been swimming, snorkeling, and canoeing in this beautiful bay for more than a decade. It brings joy to see so many residents and visitors enjoying the small bay, with its lively reef.

Makaiwa is home to many species of juvenile fish, and the coral is already under stress from changes in our world. Adding two new moorings would not only impact the recreational use of the area for surfers, swimmers, paddlers, and snorkelers bringing safety concerns and other issues, it would negatively impact the reef. Additional moorings mean the additional inevitable leaks of fuel, and even minute amounts can make a difference to water quality, reef health, and the health of those who use the water.

Noise from some types of motorboat engines has been shown to inhibit juvenile damselfish response to threats (McCormick et al., 2018). Research also suggests that boat noise interrupts the ability of reef fish larvae who use reef sounds to find suitable habitat to settle on the reef (Holles et al., 2013). Given the shallow depths near the proposed moorings, noise and pollution effects would be magnified. Shadows created by heavily used moorings can also affect fish behavior.

Mauna Lani has been intentional in protecting the fish ponds located just inland of the proposed mooring sites, stewarding them for the enjoyment and education of future generations. The same intentionality should be applied to the bay, which lives and breathes as one with the ponds. I urge the Board to keep Makaiwa Bay in the public trust and preserve its character and its reef for future generations. Please deny the application for any additional moorings.

Mahalo, Tinsley Davis Cohen From: <u>Jeff Faiola</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>; <u>DLNR.CO.PublicDLNR</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Opposition to Two New Moorings at Maka"Iwa Bay

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 4:28:28 PM

Letter of opposition to (2) new moorings at Makaiwa Bay

Chairperson & Members
Board of Land and Natural Resources Honolulu, Hawaii 96819 & Dawn N. S. Chang
DLNR Main Office
Kalanimoku Building
1151 Punchbowl St.
Honolulu, HI 96813

To whom it may concern (Board of Land and Natural Resources):

I am writing in regards to the following proposition for Makaiwa Bay:

## RE: DIVISION OF BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION APPROVE INSTALLATION OF 2 (TWO) NEW OFFSHORE MOORINGS OUTSIDE OF AN ESTABLISHED OFFSHORE MOORING AREA, MAKAIWA BAY, KAMUELA, ISLAND OF HAWAII, HAWAII, FOR DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC

My name is Jeff Faiola and as a resident at Mauna Lani Point and frequent user of Maka'iwa Bay I strongly oppose the application for two new moorings in Maka'iwa Bay for exclusive use of DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC. The community was neither consulted nor even advised that two new moorings were being considered for Maka'iwa Bay. The applicant has admitted that during the two year application process there has been zero notice provided to the community of this project. Given the negative impact these moorings will have on both the environment and public use of this treasured area it is unacceptable that the public has to learn of this application at the 11th hour and through the coconut wireless no less. Such moorings in their proposed locations pose a significant safety risk to ocean goers in that area. Makaiwa Bay is used by residents and visitors for swimming, snorkeling, diving, paddling, surfing, kayaking, paddleboarding. The addition of watercraft permanently moored in the bay and the traffic of these vessels in and out of the bay is dangerous for all. These proposed moorings and the activity that would follow, would also be detrimental to the reef, marine life, and wildlife of this special area. The proposed inside mooring and its proximity to the makaha would have a negative impact on the sacred fishponds of Kalahuipua'a. The coastlines suffer from overdevelopment and these new moorings would carry that congestion into the ocean.

I urge you to reject these new moorings at Maka'iwa Bay. These moorings serve to benefit only the hotel (in a very limited way at that) and a very small group of tourists while irreparably harming the environment and the community that has enjoyed Maka'iwa Bay for generations. I respectfully ask that this matter receives fair review including island wide public disclosure rather than what appears to be an intentional hiding of this application. Allowing such applications to be brought forth without community knowledge, input, or adequate time to challenge sets a very dangerous precedent that jeopardizes the few environmental treasures we have left on the big island.

Mahalo nui for your consideration in this matter.

Sincerely, Jeff Faiola

Resident/Owner 68-1050 Mauna Lani Point J-105 Kamuela, HI 96743 From: Rory Frost

To: DLNR.CO.PublicDLNR; DLNR.BLNR.Testimony
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Moorings at Makaiwa Bay
Date: Friday, July 26, 2024 7:54:21 AM

Chairperson & Members

Board of Land and Natural Resources Honolulu, Hawaii 96819 & Dawn N. S. Chang DLNR Main Office
Kalanimoku Building
1151 Punchbowl St.
Honolulu, HI 96813

To whom it may concern (Board of Land and Natural Resources):

I am writing in regards to the following proposition for Makaiwa Bay:

RE: DIVISION OF BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
APPROVE INSTALLATION OF 2 (TWO) NEW OFFSHORE MOORINGS OUTSIDE OF AN
ESTABLISHED OFFSHORE MOORING AREA, MAKAIWA BAY, KAMUELA, ISLAND OF
HAWAII, HAWAII, FOR DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC

My name is Rory Frost, I am a resident at Mauna Lani Point and a regular user of Maka'iwa, Bay, and have been my entire life, I learned to swim and snorkel in this special place. I strongly oppose the application for two new moorings in Maka'iwa Bay for exclusive use of DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC. The community was neither consulted nor even advised that two new moorings were being considered for Maka'iwa Bay and we are not aware of any notice provided to the community. This flies in the face of Due Process, which is a core component to our democracy.

The underhanded and stealthy manner in which this application is being put forth is despicable. Such a serious permanent installation, as these moorings would be, deserves serious community wide consideration, the environmental impact and effect on community ocean goer safety needs to be addressed before this application should even be reviewed.

The applicant has even admitted that during the two year application process there has been zero notice provided to the community of this project. Given the negative impact these moorings will have on both the environment and public use of this treasured area it is unacceptable that the public has to learn of this application at the 11th hour and only from other concerned residents. Such moorings in their proposed locations pose a significant safety

risk to ocean goers in that area. Makaiwa Bay is used by residents and visitors for swimming, snorkeling, diving, paddling, surfing, kayaking, paddleboarding and fishing.

The addition of watercraft permanently moored in the bay and the traffic of these vessels in and out of the bay is dangerous for all. These proposed moorings and the activity that would follow, would also be detrimental to the reef, marine life, and wildlife of this special area. The proposed inside mooring and its proximity to the makaha would have a negative impact on the sacred fishponds of Kalahuipua'a. The coastlines suffer from overdevelopment and these new moorings would carry that congestion into the ocean.

I urge you to reject these new moorings at Maka'iwa Bay. These moorings serve to benefit only the hotel (in a very limited way at that) and a very small group of tourists while irreparably harming the environment and the community that has enjoyed Maka'iwa Bay for generations. I respectfully ask that this matter receives fair review including island wide public disclosure rather than what appears to be an intentional hiding of this application. Allowing such applications to be brought forth without community knowledge, input, or adequate time to challenge sets a very dangerous precedent that jeopardizes the few environmental treasures we have left on the big island.

Mahalo nui for your consideration in this matter.

Sincerely,
Rory Frost
F101 Mauna Lani Point
68-1050 Mauna Lani Point Drive
Kamuela, HI 96743

From: Rachel Gillis

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] RE: DIVISION OF BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION APPROVE INSTALLATION OF 2 (TWO) NEW

OFFSHORE MOORINGS OUTSIDE OF AN ESTABLISHED OFFSHORE MOORING AREA, MAKAIWA BAY, KAMUELA,

ISLAND OF HAWAII, HAWAII, FOR DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 7:43:55 AM

To whom it may concern (Board of Land and Natural Resources):

I am writing in follow up to the issue regarding two additional moorings requested at Makaiwa Bay. I'm recent light of Pete Alles the GM of Auberge, openly acknowledging his lack of communication with the public during an admitted 2 year period of working with DNLR to obtain these proposed mooring bouys. Thereby admitting intention to withhold this information from the community at large, who, if it had such information would strongly oppose the moorings.

I would request to all that serve on the Board of Land and Natural Resources to delay approval on the moorings in order for Fair due process to take place for this matter & allow opportunity for impact study & public comment. Makaiwa Bay & the connected fishponds of Kalahuipua'a have such strong cultural & historical significance to this area & deserve thorough review to assess the impact that additional moorings (& the resultant boat traffic, activity, pollution, etc) would have on this sacred place.

Mahalo for your consideration.

Rachel Gillis 8088961130

From: <u>Lauren Greider</u>
To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] New moorings at Maka"iwa Beach

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 8:50:31 AM

To Whom It May Concern,

I wish to speak at the meeting to express concern in regards to the location of the requested moorings.

The existing mooring that was used for the Wynonna is in open sand and a distance from the reef.

The proposed 2 moorings appear on the map to be right at the edge of the reefs and in an area used by swimmers and snorkelers. This isn't good for marine life or safety of people using the beautiful bay.

Thank you,

Lauren Greider Mauna Lani Terrace F302 scubama@hotmail.com Cell 858-922-8784 From: Gary E Grosshesch
To: DLNR.BLNR.Testimony

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Installation of 2 new moorings at Maka Iwa bay

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 2:57:32 PM

Aloha,

I am opposed to this plan.

First, It seems unfair to even suggest that a large corporation could put new moorings in a none designated mooring area. There are designated Mooring areas near by. Kawaihae South and North Small Boat Harbors are near by. Of course there is a long waitlist for moorings there. Partly because Kawaihae South was never properly built out. But that's a topic for another day. I suggest the requesting party get in line and apply for a mooring there and pay the waitlist fee for a few years. Like everybody else.

I understand that there is an existing mooring there, that belonged to Kamuela Leisure Corp., for their Catamaran Winnona. They provided a ocean activities to the resort. Not sure why they aren't providing that service now? That mooring was "Grandfathered in" a long time ago. I believe the mooring was there long before the resort was built. No new offshore moorings along the coast have been approved for a very long time. Not in Pauko or anywhere else. Often if one gave up a grandfathered mooring it just went away and was not allowed anymore. Why the change?

There has been no public information on this. It would seem to me that if the DLNR-BOR is willing to open areas up to new onshore moorings that it would be fair to allow for public comment first not all, and then allow a fair process of application. Possibly offering those moorings for someone on the current wait list of a nearby designated mooring area, Paulo, Kawaihae South or North.

Winona's mooring is in the sweet spot of the small bay. The bay is really a fair weather spot. Very strong winds and sometimes large winter surf. Winnona often had to run to Kawaihae when the weather got nasty. The proposed moorings seem a little close in to where the surf picks up. This increases the risk a vessel breaking or dragging its mooring and floundering on the reef. That would be devastating to the marine life in the area.

If you allow this request then what will you say to the next request at Paniau, Pauko, Wailea? Just for starters. There are plenty of more spots and plenty of local boat owners and small tour operations who would not mind a mooring. Even if only a fair weather one. Tell them get in line!

Gary E. Grosshuesch

From: <u>Izzy Faiola</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>; <u>DLNR.CO.PublicDLNR</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Opposition to Two New Moorings at Maka"Iwa Bay

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 8:21:21 PM

Letter of opposition to (2) new moorings at Makaiwa Bay

Chairperson & Members
Board of Land and Natural Resources Honolulu, Hawaii 96819 & Dawn N. S. Chang
DLNR Main Office
Kalanimoku Building
1151 Punchbowl St.
Honolulu, HI 96813

To whom it may concern (Board of Land and Natural Resources):

I am writing in regards to the following proposition for Makaiwa Bay:

## RE: DIVISION OF BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION APPROVE INSTALLATION OF 2 (TWO) NEW OFFSHORE MOORINGS OUTSIDE OF AN ESTABLISHED OFFSHORE MOORING AREA, MAKAIWA BAY, KAMUELA, ISLAND OF HAWAII, HAWAII, FOR DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC

My name is Isabelle Faiola and as a resident at Mauna Lani Point and frequent user of Maka'iwa Bay I strongly oppose the application for two new moorings in Maka'iwa Bay for exclusive use of DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC. The community was neither consulted nor even advised that two new moorings were being considered for Maka'iwa Bay. The applicant has admitted that during the two year application process there has been zero notice provided to the community of this project. Given the negative impact these moorings will have on both the environment and public use of this treasured area it is unacceptable that the public has to learn of this application at the 11th hour and through the coconut wireless no less. Such moorings in their proposed locations pose a significant safety risk to ocean goers in that area. Makaiwa Bay is used by residents and visitors for swimming, snorkeling, diving, paddling, surfing, kayaking, paddleboarding. The addition of watercraft permanently moored in the bay and the traffic of these vessels in and out of the bay is dangerous for all. These proposed moorings and the activity that would follow, would also be detrimental to the reef, marine life, and wildlife of this special area. The proposed inside mooring and its proximity to the makaha would have a negative impact on the sacred fishponds of Kalahuipua'a. The coastlines suffer from overdevelopment and these new moorings would carry that congestion into the ocean.

I urge you to reject these new moorings at Maka'iwa Bay. These moorings serve to benefit only the hotel (in a very limited way at that) and a very small group of tourists while irreparably harming the environment and the community that has enjoyed Maka'iwa Bay for generations. I respectfully ask that this matter receives fair review including island wide public disclosure rather than what appears to be an intentional hiding of this application. Allowing such applications to be brought forth without community knowledge, input, or adequate time to challenge sets a very dangerous precedent that jeopardizes the few environmental treasures we have left on the big island.

Mahalo nui for your consideration in this matter.

Sincerely, Isabelle Faiola

Resident/Owner 68-1050 Mauna Lani Point J-105 Kamuela, HI 96743 From: <u>Kaiolohia Espere</u>
To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Mooring at Mauna Lani
Date: Friday, July 26, 2024 10:04:25 AM

#### Aloha!

I am writing in opposed of the additional 2nd & 3rd mooring in Makaiwa bay outside of Mauna Lani. If you look at the location it will be right off the surf spot. From the info I have gathered I oppose it.

I believe it's a possible threat to the reef, the fish pond and our surf spot! There are already 2 there and I think the bay isn't big enough for a 3rd.

Additionally, There was no communication during an admitted 2 year period when they were working with DNLR to obtain these additional mooring bouys.

I am sending in testimony, noting this admission to the Board of Land and Natural Resources to please delay your consideration of this matter for public comment.

Mahalo for your time,

Kaiolohia Fo

From: sarah jasper

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Testimony to refuse Makaiwa mooring installation

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 7:56:23 AM

#### Aloha DIVISION OF BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION:

I am writing to address this topic today:

1. Approve Installation of two (2) New Offshore Moorings outside of an Established Offshore Mooring Area, Makaiwa Bay, Kamuela, Island of Hawaii, Hawaii, For DHL MAHI OPC), LLC.

[Testimony - 7/23, 7/25]

good morning to the Board of Directors and voting council,

I have spent my lifetime being competition diver and spending a lifetime being an ocean guide on this coastline, I cannot support any additional mooring to this particular location. The reef is already greatly depleted at Makaiwa Bay from high human traffic levels.

We do not need two additional mornings at this bay. It would be detrimental to the reef and the health of the ocean.

There needs to be an environmental study of the decline of reef life before proceeding with more boats and additional tourism traffic.

In addition, the use of bleach and other chemicals on existing boats already moored in this area needs to be addressed. The process of cleaning boat decks and equipment is being done with harmful chemicals that are hurting the reef.

We do not need any more boats moored at Makaiwa Reef.

Mahalo for your consideration, Sarah Kamanu Diver, former lifeguard and Ocean Guide

Sent from my iPhone

From: jacob keanaaina
To: DLNR.BLNR.Testimony

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Support for J-1 - DLNR Board Meeting 7/26/24

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 4:27:50 PM

#### Aloha,

To whom it may concern. I would like to share my support for installing two Moorings offshore at Makaiwa Bay. The main purpose for this mooring is to provide shelter and anchorage for boats operating in and around this area. As many locals know the ocean and weather conditions can change in a matter of minutes causing safety concerns for boats having to trek the 25 miles to Honokohau Harbor which would be the case without these new moorings. We also need to consider the hundreds if not thousands of gallons of gas saved by boats not having to commute from Honokohau Harbor to Mauna Lani if we have these additional Moorings.

The ocean is central to Hawaiian culture, providing resources and physical and spiritual sustenance for Native Hawaiians. The Kainalu Team, along with Bullet and Ikaika stewardship offer visitors to Hawaii a glimpse of this rich history through their many offerings on canoe, in the ocean and on boat. This truly is Kainalus mission in providing authentic experiences that resonate with our valued visitors.

Sincerely Jacob Keana'aina

From: <u>King, Spencer</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Maka"iwa Beach moorings Date: Friday, July 26, 2024 2:50:43 AM

As a home owner facing this beach I request that any action on the requests for approval be postponed untill I have been given a chance to review it.

Spencer King A102 Mauna Lani Terrace Sent from my iPhone From: Sheila Kinzer

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Oppose 2 additional moorings at Makaiwa bay

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 8:01:33 AM

#### Aloha,

I oppose Auburge's request for two additional moorings at Makaiwa Bay. This area has been overpopulated due to the traffic from the hotel and its surrounding condominiums. This bay sits in front of large hotels, Napua restaurants, and many condominiums. We swim, dive and surf there. The additional moorings will create more traffic and eventually kill the reef. We do not need two additional moorings that only satisfy the need for Auburge and its activities of which they charge an arm and a leg. None of that money goes back to the repair of the reef or anything related to marine conservation. Killing the reef will cause marine life to be displaced, and the moorings will create more traffic in turn more tourist in the water which means more sunblock and other pollutants. Please Please no more traffic in this area. As a local, we have already been inconvenienced to get to the spot. We have to fight for parking and then walk 15 minutes to get there. There are also talk story nights where people gather for music and talk stories on the lawn in front of Ewa Parker Wood's cottage. Instead of enjoying the bay, they will be looking at an eyesore of three boats including the Winona that is permenantly parked there. Imagine sitting there and looking at three boats instead of enjoying the scenery.

I heavily OPPOSE this request for two additional moorings by the mainland company Auburge!

Mahalo,

#### Sheila Kinzer

- \* Personal Trainer at the Mauna Lani
- \* Group Fitness Instructor at Mauna Lani
- \* Former manager at the Mauna Lani Fitness Club

From:

jim kinzer
DLNR.BLNR.Testimony
[EXTERNAL] Makaiwa bay
Friday, July 26, 2024 10:16:38 AM To: Subject:

Date:

Please no more moorings, should never obstruct a view of the sunset for profit. Sent from my iPhone

From: Michael J. Kolasa

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>; <u>DLNR.CO.PublicDLNR</u>

Cc: Kim Smith

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Letter of opposition to (2) new moorings at Makaiwa Bay, hearing today 7-26-24

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 3:07:11 AM

#### Letter of opposition to (2) new moorings at Makaiwa Bay

Chairperson & Members

Board of Land and Natural Resources Honolulu, Hawaii 96819 & Dawn N. S. Chang

**DLNR Main Office** 

Kalanimoku Building

1151 Punchbowl St.

Honolulu, HI 96813

To whom it may concern (Board of Land and Natural Resources):

We are writing in regards to the following proposition for Makaiwa Bay:

# RE: DIVISION OF BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION APPROVE INSTALLATION OF 2 (TWO) NEW OFFSHORE MOORINGS OUTSIDE OF AN ESTABLISHED OFFSHORE MOORING AREA, MAKAIWA BAY, KAMUELA, ISLAND OF HAWAII, HAWAII, FOR DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC

Ours names are Michael and Kim Kolasa and as residents at Mauna Lani Point and frequent users of Maka'iwa Bay we strongly oppose the application for two new moorings in Maka'iwa Bay for exclusive use of DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC. The community was neither consulted nor even advised that two new moorings were being considered for Maka'iwa Bay and we are not aware of any notice provided to the community. This flies in the face of Due Process, which is a core component to our democracy.

The applicant has even admitted that during the two year application process there has been zero notice provided to the community of this project. Given the negative impact these moorings will have on both the environment and public use of this treasured area it is unacceptable that the public has to learn of this application at the 11th hour and through the coconut wireless no less. Such moorings in their proposed locations pose a significant safety risk to ocean goers in that area. Makaiwa Bay is used by residents and visitors for swimming, snorkeling, diving, paddling, surfing, kayaking, paddleboarding. The addition of watercraft permanently moored in the bay and the traffic of these vessels in and out of the bay is dangerous for all. These proposed moorings and the activity that would follow, would also be detrimental to the reef, marine life, and wildlife of this special area. The proposed inside

mooring and its proximity to the makaha would have a negative impact on the sacred fishponds of Kalahuipua'a. The coastlines suffer from overdevelopment and these new moorings would carry that congestion into the ocean.

We urge you to reject these new moorings at Maka'iwa Bay. These moorings serve to benefit only the hotel (in a very limited way at that) and a very small group of tourists while irreparably harming the environment and the community that has enjoyed Maka'iwa Bay for generations. I respectfully ask that this matter receives fair review including island wide public disclosure rather than what appears to be an intentional hiding of this application. Allowing such applications to be brought forth without community knowledge, input, or adequate time to challenge sets a very dangerous precedent that jeopardizes the few environmental treasures we have left on the big island.

Mahalo nui for your consideration in this matter.

Sincerely,
Michael and Kim Kolasa
J205 Mauna Lani Point
68-1050 Mauna Lani Point Drive
Kamuela, HI 96743

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTE: This message, including any attachments, may be legally privileged and/or confidential and is intended only for the use of the addressee(s). If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately by return e-mail, delete this e-mail and destroy any copies. Any dissemination or use of this information by a person other than the intended recipient is unauthorized and may be illegal.

From: Levine, Bob (Avison Young - CA)

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>
Cc: <u>Golf Villas at Mauna Lani</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Request from Auberge Hotels for Additional Moorings in Makaiwa Bay, Mauna Lani

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 3:00:48 PM

If one was looking for the worst place to establish two new moorings for commercial craft on the west coast of the Kohala Coast, you couldn't go much wrong by proposing them for Makaiwa Bay, a much stressed, over used marine sanctuary adjacent to ancient fish ponds that rely on the Bay for constant rejuvenation.

My family and I have been visiting Mauna Lani annually since the mid-1980's and have owned a residence there for the last 20 years. During that time we have seen the gradual degradation of the reef and its fishes in Makaiwa Bay. Due to the growth of the permanent and transient population at Mauna Lani, Makaiwa Bay is increasingly overcrowded and over stressed by the number of visitors. Whether a large number of water users have affected the fertility of the adjacent fish ponds, we do not know, but it's a fair assumption that the addition of two motorized commercial craft in the Bay is not going to enhance the health of the fish ponds.

If Auberge Hotels is desirous of operating commercial craft for its hotel guests, we're sure there are ample mooring opportunities at Kawaihae Harbour or at Honokohau Marina that would be far more suitable for the environment..

Please stop the permitting of the two additional moorings in Makaiwa Bay as they will only exacerbate the demise of it's ecosystems.

Bob Levine Owner Golf Villas, Mauna Lani From: Bianca Lindsey
To: DLNR.BLNR.Testimony
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Maka'iwa mooring
Date: Thursday, July 25, 2024 8:07:48 PM

#### Aloha!

I strongly oppose the moorings approval in Maka'iwa bay. This is a very small area and having 3 commercial boats operating here doesn't make sense. Especially with the Paulo harbor only a few miles away and the new & improved Kawaihae harbor juts a 10 minute drive away.

This area has significant reef damage from all of the people who already gather on the very small piece of coastline. There is no space and the impact it will have on the fragile eco system is not worth it. Please do not let this happen!

Mahalo Imiola Lindsey From: Wela Ana

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Maka'iwa Bay Mooring Date: Friday, July 26, 2024 9:18:23 AM

#### Aloha,

I Kiersten Lum a community member born and raised resident here on the Big Island of Hawai'i in Waimea. I OBJECT to the addition of a third mooring at Maka'iwa Bay by Mauna Lani Auberge. They pushed out a local small family owned and operating business who operated off of the Winona mooring, with the intention to steal the Winona mooring to start operating themselves. After that got rejected by DLNR they are seeking to quietly go around the community to get this third mooring.

Mahalo,

Kiersten Lum

From: Sid Marcovitch
To: DLNR.BLNR.Testimony

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] July 26, 2024 Meeting: Proposed Moorings at Maka'iwa Bay

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 1:25:55 PM

#### Dear Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I am writing to express my strong objection to the proposed installation of two new offshore moorings at Maka'iwa Bay. This proposal threatens to undermine the rich cultural heritage and natural environment of the area, which are of immense significance to the Hawaiian community.

The Mauna Lani Resort area, including the Kalahuipua'a fishponds, is rich in historical and cultural significance. These fishponds, dating back centuries, were integral to the traditional Hawaiian way of life and were used for sustainable food production. The fishponds were crucial components of a sophisticated aquaculture system that supported Hawaiian communities<sup>1,2</sup>. The claim that the proposed moorings are not in the vicinity of significant artifacts is misleading, as the entire area is a cultural treasure.

Furthermore, the assertion that the impact of the moorings will be de minimis is fundamentally flawed. The legal concept of de minimis implies an impact so minor that it is negligible. However, this project may involve up to three commercial watercraft. Each watercraft will bring its own schedule, increased human activity, and associated hotel operations, significantly disrupting the bay's ecosystem and cultural sites. The cumulative effects—pollution, noise, habitat disruption, and increased commercial clientele—amplify the impact far beyond a negligible level<sup>3</sup>.

The name Maka'iwa Bay itself reflects its character; "Maka'iwa" can be interpreted to emphasize the small and delicate nature of the bay, which stands in stark contrast to the planned commercial activities<sup>4</sup>. The presence of three commercial moorings will not only obstruct the line of sight but also heighten activity, visually creating obstacles and making the bay busier, detracting from its serene nature.

The Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) has a critical role in protecting Hawaii's natural and cultural resources. Its mission is to "enhance, protect, conserve and manage Hawaii's unique and limited natural, cultural and historic resources held in public trust for current and future generations"<sup>5</sup>. This proposal seems to be moving quickly without enhanced scrutiny, which undermines the DLNR's responsibility to the public and to the preservation of Hawaii's heritage.

In my opinion, approving this project without a more comprehensive and deliberate review would be an abrogation of duty by the DLNR. This action would not only set a disappointing precedent but also raise serious questions about the Board's commitment to its mission and the people it serves.

Hawaiian culture and identity are under constant threat from commercialization and exploitation. The approval of this project, without a more thorough public scrutiny and environmental assessment, disregards the cultural and environmental values fundamental to the community. The Office of Hawaiian Affairs and other Native Hawaiian leaders are

actively working to protect Hawaiian cultural heritage and prevent its erasure. It is imperative that we honor these efforts by rejecting proposals that prioritize commercial interests over cultural preservation<sup>6</sup>.

I urge the Board to reconsider this proposal, conduct a comprehensive environmental assessment, and engage in a more transparent and inclusive review process that fully respects the historical, cultural, and environmental significance of Maka'iwa Bay. Future generations will look back on the decisions made today, and it is crucial that they see a legacy of protection and respect for Hawaii's invaluable resources, rather than one of neglect and shortsightedness.

Sincerely,

Sid Marcovitch 68-1025 N.Kaniku Dr. Apt 401 Kamuela, HI 96743

(808) 825-2580

# **Footnotes**

- 1. NOAA Fisheries. "Hawaiian Fishponds: Providing Physical and Cultural Sustenance." 2021.
- 2. Wildlife Management Institute. "Culturally Important Fishponds in Hawaii." 2020.
- 3. Hawaii State Planning, Environmental Review Program.
- 4. Hawaiian Planner. "Makaiwa Bay, Big Island." 2024.
- 5. DLNR Official Website.
- 6. Office of Hawaiian Affairs Legislative Package 2024.

From: <u>Tony Mayer</u>

**To:** <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Mooring request for Maka"iwa beach

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 2:30:25 PM

The proposed moorings for Auberge at Mauna Lani have been a total secret. THe MLRA just learned about them yesterday. This doesn't allow time for comment from the community. I suggest that you postpone review of this application until you can hear from the community.

Tony Mayer Mauna Lani Point C-202 
 From:
 Tomomi Menjo

 To:
 DLNR.BLNR.Testimony

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Reg. the submission by DHL Mahi OPCO, LLC

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 6:34:52 AM

#### Aloha,

Though we are not full time residents, one of the main reasons why I chose to purchase a home in the VIllages is the beauty of the Beach Club. During my first house visit, we were able to spot dolphins from the parking lot of the beach club. It's a very special beach with special meaning to many different homeowners.

It is already "crowded" enough with tourists and hotel visitors, and I can't imagine adding more reasons to make the beautiful beach more crowded. Additionally, home owners pay dues to be able to have access to the beach and maintain the beauty. We should have the power to keep the bay the way it is.

Please protect the beautiful bay and listen to the home owners instead of allowing commercial/business owners to make decisions solely based on profit.

Mahalo,

Tomomi Menjo (Villages 221) 650-575-5608

From: Michael J. Kolasa

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>; <u>DLNR.CO.PublicDLNR</u>

Cc: renard.kolasa@couzens.com

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] FW: Opposition to Two New Moorings at Maka"Iwa Bay

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 8:23:54 AM

From: Renard J. Kolasa < Renard. Kolasa @ Couzens.com >

**Sent:** Friday, July 26, 2024 2:08 PM

**Subject:** Opposition to Two New Moorings at Maka'lwa Bay Letter of opposition to (2) new moorings at Makaiwa Bay

July 26, 2024

Chairperson & Members
Board of Land and Natural Resources Honolulu, Hawaii 96819 & Dawn N. S. Chang
DLNR Main Office
Kalanimoku Building
1151 Punchbowl St.
Honolulu, HI 96813

To whom it may concern (Board of Land and Natural Resources):

I am writing in regards to the following proposition for Makaiwa Bay:

# RE: DIVISION OF BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION INSTALLATION OF 2 (TWO) NEW OFFSHORE MOORINGS OUTSIDE OF AN ESTABLISHED OFFSHORE MOORING AREA, MAKAIWA BAY, KAMUELA, ISLAND OF HAWAII, HAWAII, FOR DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC

I have been a visitor to your beautiful island and an admirer and user of Maka'iwa Bay. I oppose the above application for two new moorings in Maka'iwa Bay for exclusive use of DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC. You should reject that application.

I do not believe that you have done adequate due diligence to determine the full impact of such moorings on the sensitive nature and beauty of this Bay and its ecosystem. I understand that the local community has not consulted or advised that two new moorings were being considered for Maka'iwa Bay. These moorings would have a negative impact on the environment and public use of this treasured area. The moorings could pose a safety risk to ocean users in that area. Additional moored watercraft and boat traffic would negatively impact this sensitive area, which might include the reef, marine life, and wildlife. Have you obtained representative input from residents regarding the impact concerning local sacred? You should have a full environmental impact statement prepared for this request, including obtaining full public comments and hearings.

Thank you for your attention to this request.

Renard J. Kolasa, JD, MA

Couzens Lansky 39395 W. Twelve Mile Rd. Suite 200 Farmington Hills, MI 48356 248-489-8600

This email and any attachments contain information from the law firm of Couzens, Lansky, Fealk, Ellis, Roeder & Lazar, P.C., which is privileged, confidential or otherwise protected from disclosure. The information is for the viewing and/or use of the intended recipient only. If you are not the intended recipient, any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of this message, or its contents or any of its attachments, is prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify us and delete this email and any copies.

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTE: This message, including any attachments, may be legally privileged and/or confidential and is intended only for the use of the addressee(s). If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately by return e-mail, delete this e-mail and destroy any copies. Any dissemination or use of this information by a person other than the intended recipient is unauthorized and may be illegal.

From: Melissa Miller

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Mooring Balls for Makaiwa Bay

Date: Thursday, July 25, 2024 5:01:03 PM

## Aloha Members of the BLNR:

I have read the recent submission by DHL Mahi OPCO, LLC, requesting 2 new offshore moorings at Makaiwa Bay at Mauna Lani.

As a new resident of the Villages, I am very opposed to this request. I moved here for the beautiful beaches and ocean, I love to swim & snorkel. I am surprised that for such a small beach area this is even a consideration. Please keep our ocean and beaches free of pollution.

Mahalo, Melissa Miller From: <u>Noelani</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Land board submittala Date: Friday, July 26, 2024 9:53:57 AM

### Aloha,

I was only just made aware of the proposed moorings at Maka'iwa bay and believe that my testimony may be too late because of it. I grew up in Kawaihae harbor and while i believe sailing and wa'a culture is important to our community, adding commercial moorings is NOT. These moorings would be placed in areas that are already limited to the public, including surf spots that are important to our people. As a local citizen i would like to send testimony against this proposal. Mahalo

With aloha, Noelani From: Ramona Rodrigues
To: DLNR.BLNR.Testimony
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Mauna Lani
Date: Friday, July 26, 2024 7:55:05 AM

Aloha

Why?

Sent from my iPhone

From: Gary Rogers

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Maka'iwa Bay on the agenda July 26 J1

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 3:14:09 PM

Aloha Chairperson and Members,

As a long-time visitor of the Mauna Lani Resort, I am concerned about the proposed two buoys for Maka'iwa Bay on the agenda July 26 J1.

There are many reasons to not approve this as proposed, and it should at the very least be delayed to allow the many users of Maka'iwa Bay to be adequately notified and allowed to comment prior to a decision.

Maka'iwa Bay is a historic, important and heavily used community resource. It and its adjacent beach are the sole ocean access locally for this area. The bay, and the area proposed for the moorings, is heavily used for swimming, snorkeling and even surfing in the winter months. Semi-permanently mooring a 42' motor yacht there will seriously impair this use.

Historically, the Winona mooring has served as the mooring of a sailboat. Mooring a very large motor yacht there will certainly introduce motor-generated fumes and pollution to a small bay with many swimmers and snorkelers, and impact the important reef area there. Having three commercial moorings in a small area like that is not in the interest of Hawaii but only for financial gains of the applicant.

The impacts on this historic community resource are significant and should be subject to careful community review before granting such a major change in usage,

This warrants a visit to the site by the entire board before allowing the commercialization of our beautiful Hawaiian shoreline.

Mauni Lani Hotel should use the boat ramp at Puako., there is truly no reason to grant his request!

Respectfully

Gary Rogers

### Board of Land and Natural Resources

## Item J-1

Friday July 29, 2024 9:00AM DLNR Boardroom #132 Kalanimoku Building 1151 Punchbowl St.

# In support of item J-1

I, Shane Satomba, am in support of two new moorings in Makaiwa Bay. I have been a Captain and crew member on the waters of West Hawaii and more specifically the Kohala Coast for over 25 years. I am a crew member on Kalama Kai. These waters and our marine life are important to me as part of my lifestyle and also my livelihood. I believe that by sharing the beauty of our marine culture and animals with others, it helps them to understand the importance of respecting the animals, water and keeping the ocean clean.

I support the installation of these two moorings because not only will it positively impact the lengthy work day, it will cut down on the emissions in the environment and lessen our carbon footprint. We will use less gas and most importantly provide a safer working environment for our Captain and crew. Some days the waters surrounding Makaiwa Bay are calm but the waters to and from Kona, an hour away where the boat is currently moored, are extremely rough putting the crew in a more precarious situation than is necessary. These moorings will directly impact and help to provide a safer working environment and protect the ecology of our ocean.

Shane Satomba Crew Member, Kalama Kai From: <u>Leilani Silver</u>

**To:** <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] No to more moorings at Makaiwa bay

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 8:20:53 AM

Aloha! We do not need two more

Moorings at Makaiwa bay. The reef will die! My family does not want any more destruction of our beautiful natural habitats!! Please think about the future generations being able to enjoy healthy oceans and reefs! Vote with your heart! Our oceans and reefs need your help and protection now!!

Mahalo!! Leilani Silver

Sent from my iPhone

From: <u>Ethan Souza</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Support for J-1 DLNR Board Meeting 7/26/24

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 4:12:56 PM

## Aloha,

I am writing in support of the proposal to install new offshore moorings at Makaiwa Bay, Kamuela, on the Island of Hawai'i. Based on the consultation of several government entities including the Division of Aquatic Resources, the planned moorings do not appear to pose a threat or impact to any natural, historical, or cultural resources within Makaiwa Bay. The proposed moorings would be placed in the vicinity of a pre-existing offshore mooring that has been in place for years. This indicates that limited offshore mooring in this area of Makaiwa Bay has not negatively impacted either the ecology or community of the area in the past. Currently, when the Mauna Lani boat needs to be brought to Makaiwa Bay, it sails from Honokohau Harbor in Kailua Kona. It would reduce the carbon footprint of the business as a whole for the vessel to have mooring nearer to the place where it will actually be used. I am confident that Mauna Lani can utilize an offshore mooring in a way that is respectful of the local ecosystem, and that the resort can work with the community of Makaiwa Bay to ensure responsible stewardship of the area.

Mālama pono, E. Souza

--

**ETHAN SOUZA** | ALOHA AINA - NATURAL RESOURCES MANAGER MAUNA LANI, AUBERGE RESORTS COLLECTION

68-1400 Mauna Lani Drive, Kohala Coast, Hawaii 96743 P+1.808.855.6622 ethan.souza@aubergeresorts.com AUBERGERESORTS.COM From: <u>JACK STARKS</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] New moorings at Mauna Lani
Date: Thursday, July 25, 2024 10:49:56 PM

## Sent from my iPhone

This is wrong for too many reasons. The disruption of the visual beauty from the beach. The probable environmental impact on the reef and the interrelationship between the ocean and ancestral ponds.

The intrusion on the beach surf activities, i.e,

Snorkeling surfing boarding swimming etc.

This disruption and disturbance of all the beach goers to please a few wealthy boaters. It is not fair or beneficial to the majority of people using this leisure site.

This needs to be rejected.

Jack R Starks

Mauna Lani Homeowner

From: <a href="mailto:stephen@sastimac.com">stephen@sastimac.com</a>
To: <a href="mailto:DLNR.BLNR.Testimony">DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</a>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Installation of 2 new moorings in Makaiwa Bay

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 3:10:37 PM

### Aloha all,

My wife and I are owners of a condo within the Mauna Lani Resort. We are also daily users of Makaiwa Bay, enjoying surfing, open-water swimming, diving, and many other water activities the bay offers ourselves and thousands of users every year.

I am writing to state that two additional <u>commercial</u> mooring buoys in Makaiwa Bay are <u>inappropriate</u> relative to the overuse of a minimal natural resource in this area. The bay's name means Bird's Eye or Eye of the Iwa Bird, meaning "small" bay in Hawaiian, as many islanders have told me in years past. This tiny bay is geographically unique where current, constant activities already exist which have stretched the bay's limits relative to coral and wildlife health. I disagree with the DNLR letter where it stated that there is no proven impediment to fish spawning etc. caused by mooring buoys. This may be true for the buoy but not necessarily the negative effects of 3 boats attached that may or may not be moved regularly.

One proposed new, commercial, buoy is inappropriately located within the surf break area many use during the winter. Additionally, this commercial buoy is situated toward the shore directly in front of a Makaha related to the ancient fishpond that serves as the channel for outflowing brackish water. This area provides the "channel" needed to escape the breaking waves by surfers and will impede surf activity dangerously if installed with a moored, commercial vessel. It's also toward the shoreline and inside the current buoy that Mauna Lani Sea Adventures used for their Winona catamaran. Paragraph 5 in your letter is interesting as it seems to imply the applicant intends to take over that existing buoy also.

These are commercial-use buoys (3) with attached boats that would be hazardous in rough surf if someone did not relocate the boats. If nothing else, they would be an eyesore in our beautiful environment and impede typical daily water activities for one resort hotel owner's exclusive commercial use. The nearby Kawaiihae small boat harbor, not Makaiwa Bay, should be used as a commercial port.

Our resort will continue to expand its existing 2000 hotel rooms and residential properties with an upcoming proposed hotel on site M, located on Hoohana Street, by the same ownership group as the additional buoy applicant and many other planned residential developments shortly. The Mauna Lani owner's beach club and Makaiwa Bay are now crowded with activities from the owners and guests. I can't imagine three large commercial craft and their activity in this compact area. Our resort could have nearly 3000 hotel rooms or residential units at full development, with Makaiwa Bay as the primary water activity area.

Please protect our beautiful Makaiwa Bay for all users instead of allowing commercial, single owner use mooring buoys (3)!! The Bay does not need 3 buoys especially one located in the surf break.

Aloha,

Stephen Stimac

stephen@sastimac.com

C: 206-465-9124

From: <u>Sarah Taylor-Balanga</u>

To: DLNR.BLNR.Testimony; Bianca Lindsey
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Proposed Mauna Lani mooring
Date: Friday, July 26, 2024 10:31:03 AM

### Aloha,

As a resident avid surfer, paddler ,waterwoman, local business owner & Mom. I am fully against this! If you are not aware this coastline is already incredibly hard for locals to access. The hotels have pushed out the locals by: restricting parking & making the walk ridiculously long. Only those staying at the hotels have proper access. I want to point out that Mauna Lani Auberge without permits from DLNR has hosted numerous surf events at Makaiwas forcing the locals out of the water. Tourist are prioritized continuously. I understand we rely on tourism as myself own a local business. However, what we are leaving for the residents is shameful! I have first hand experiences in this location as my company ran the beach shack at Mauna Lani. The tourist continuously walk on the reefs without care. The reefs need some care and restrictions not adding more tourists to trample all over them. Additionally this coastline is difficult to navigate! The wind continuously shifts & many rescues by helicopter or boat are necessary. Please look into the Mauna Lani Auberge incident reports with their watermen surfing tourist into the reefs with Canoes! I understand the need to make money but we shouldn't be endangering lives for a few dollars. Thank you,

Sarah Taylor-Balanga

From: Gerhard & Kristen Vierthaler

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>; <u>DLNR.CO.PublicDLNR</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Letter of opposition to (2) new moorings at Maka'iwa Bay

**Date:** Friday, July 26, 2024 7:12:18 AM

# Chairperson & Members

Board of Land and Natural Resources Honolulu, Hawaii 96819 & Dawn

N. S. Chang

**DLNR Main Office** 

Kalanimoku Building

1151 Punchbowl St.

Honolulu, HI 96813

To whom it may concern (Board of Land and Natural Resources):

We are writing with regards to the following proposition for Maka'iwa Bay:

RE: DIVISION OF BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
APPROVE INSTALLATION OF 2 (TWO) NEW OFFSHORE
MOORINGS OUTSIDE OF AN ESTABLISHED OFFSHORE
MOORING AREA, MAKAIWA BAY, KAMUELA, ISLAND OF HAWAII,
HAWAII, FOR DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC

Ours names are Gerhard and Kristen Vierthaler and as residents of the Big Island and frequent users of Maka'iwa Bay we strongly oppose the application for two new moorings in Maka'iwa Bay for exclusive use of DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC. The community was neither consulted nor even advised that two new moorings were being considered for Maka'iwa Bay and we are not aware of any notice provided to the community.

The applicant has even admitted that during the two-year application process there has been zero notice provided to the community of this project. Given the negative impact these moorings will have on both the environment and public use of this treasured area it is unacceptable that the public has learned of this application at the 11th hour and through word of mouth in the community. Such moorings in their proposed locations pose a significant safety risk to ocean goers in that area. Maka'iwa Bay is used by residents and visitors for swimming, snorkeling, diving, paddling, surfing, kayaking, paddleboarding. The addition of watercraft permanently moored in the bay and the traffic of these vessels in and out of the bay is dangerous for all. These proposed moorings and the activity that would follow, would also be detrimental to the reef, marine life, and wildlife of this special area. The proposed inside mooring and its proximity to the makaha would have a negative impact on the sacred fishponds of Kalahuipua'a. The coastlines suffer from overdevelopment and these new moorings would carry that congestion into the ocean.

We urge you to reject these new moorings at Maka'iwa Bay. These moorings serve to benefit only the hotel and a very small group of tourists while irreparably harming the environment and the community that has enjoyed Maka'iwa Bay for generations. I respectfully ask that this matter receives fair review including island wide public disclosure rather than what appears to be an intentional hiding of this application. Allowing such applications to be brought forth without community knowledge, input, or adequate time to challenge sets a very dangerous precedent that jeopardizes the few environmental treasures we have left on the big island.

Mahalo Nui for your consideration in this matter.

Sincerely, Gerhard and Kristen Vierthaler 27-104 Lali Place Hilo, HI 96720 Board of Land and Natural Resources

Written Testimony of Walter Naauao Vivas

Item J-1 Friday, July 26, 2024 at 9:00am DLNR Board Room Rm. 132 Kalanimoku Building 1151 Punchbowl Street Honolulu, HI. 96813

## In Support of Item J1:

I, Walter Naauao Vivas, am in full support of the installation of the two new moorings proposed to be installed at Makaiwa Bay. I am a Hawaiian cultural practitioner, fluent in our language and would otherwise be against this proposal, however, it does appear that the team proposing this installation has done their due dilligence to assure a safe and environmentally friendly installation. I believe this will add to the expereince of Makaiwa Bay and provide a greater ability to share knowledge of this area.

As I am more familiar with Ikaika Vivas from the team, I would like to speak on behalf of his abilities and knowledge. Ikaika has been born and raised in the Hawaiian culture and practice along with speaking our language as well. I trust, with his upbringing, and with his awareness of environment that he has and will assure the 'āina, kai, and moana (land, shorelines, and ocean) will be cared for with the utmost respect and aloha along this journey. This is embedded in him from childhood. The journey it took for him to become a captain was a lot of work and a lot of time in the ocean either navigating with modern equipment and utilizing traditional navigational experience to guide canoes/boats to various areas around the Pacific with Makali'i, Hōkūle'a, and partnering with other seafarers in Aotearoa (New Zealand) and Tahiti. With this knowledge, it is evident that Ikaika has to where with all to embark on this journey in the utmost pono (right) and aloha (caring).

From my knowledge and my polling of visitors, they are looking for an authentic Hawaiian experience with true stories of space and place, along with a person who has the ability to share that experience. I work in both education and the visitors industry informally. The team who is proposing this has the ability to continue to provide this authentic experience in a safer and more efficient way should the proposed mooring additions be approved.

With the knowledge this team has and the due dilligence to respectfully take the steps needed to complete the application process. I support the team in approving their proposal to install

the two moorings requested. I believe that if this team did feel there would be any impact on the oceans health or environment, they would not be in place to request for such approvals.

Walter Naauao Vivas Hawaiian Cultural Practicioner 808-960-0044



### MISSION STATEMENT OF THE WEST HAWAII FISHERY COUNCIL

To effectively manage fishery activities to ensure sustainability; enhance nearshore resources; develop and implement management plans for minimizing resource depletion and conflicts of use; per legislative mandate to the Department of Land and Natural Resources to provide for substantive involvement of the community in resource management decisions; and encourage scientific research and monitoring of the nearshore resources and environment from Upolu Point to Ka Lae.

Chairperson and Members Board of Land and Natural Resources 1151 Punchbowl St. Room 132 Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

26 July, 2024

Subject: Opposition to new moorings at Makaiwa Bay, item J-1 on 7/26/24 agenda

## Aloha kāua:

The West Hawai'i Fishery Council (WHFC) opposes agenda item J-1 requesting the establishment of new moorings at Makaiwa Bay. We serve as an advisory body to the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) to help fulfill the mandates of Act 306 through ensuring substantive community involvement in natural resource management decisions in the West Hawai'i Regional Fishery Management Area (WHRFMA), formally established in statute as HRS §188F.

# HRS §188F-4 states:

"The department shall develop a West Hawaii regional fishery management area plan that identifies and designates appropriate areas of the management area as follows:

- (1) Designates a minimum of thirty per cent of coastal waters in the West Hawaii regional fishery management area as fish replenishment areas in which aquarium fish collection is prohibited;
- (2) Establishes a day-use mooring buoy system along the coastline of the West Hawaii regional fishery management area and designates some high-use areas where no anchoring is allowed;
- (3) Establishes a portion of the fish replenishment areas as fish reserves where no fishing of reef-dwelling fish is allowed; and

(4) Designates areas where the use of gill nets as set nets shall be prohibited. [L 1998, c 306, pt of §2]"

Moorings that are properly vetted *in collaboration with community* to consider environmental and community impacts play an important role in protecting the marine environment and ensuring the safety of vessels in West Hawai'i. In this case, community consultation has been lacking and we hope the BLNR will therefore consider the following concerns. We have three objections to approving the proposed new moorings at this time: 1) community impact has not been assessed; 2) the location has not been properly characterized; 3) the rationale for environmental exemption is inadequate.

# **Community Impact**

Since 2000, the WHFC has successfully supported DLNR by ensuring community engagement. Our members include cultural practitioners, marine scientists, recreational fishers, commercial fishers, subsistence fishers, divers, swimmers, and boaters with deep knowledge of our region.

The WHFC has been a forum for new mooring proposals and vetting for 24 years. Since that time thousands of community members have participated in meetings and shared knowledge that should inform anyone proposing new moorings.

Our engagement with knowledgeable stakeholders and rights holders in West Hawai'i has identified the following impacts not addressed by the applicant: moorings cause changes in the movements and behaviors of culturally and economically valuable mesopelagic and planktivorous fishes, most notably 'ōpelu (*Decapterus macarellus*); moorings increase damage to coral reefs from SCUBA divers; moored vessels increase pollution through spills, fouling, and bilge discharge; moorings impact shoreline fishers and divers by creating entanglement hazards and changing fish behavior; moored vessels impact view planes; lights on moored vessels contribute to wildlife harm; mooring chains and the increased presence of motorized vessels in the vicinity of moorings contribute to underwater noise pollution that impacts wildlife communication; boat traffic around moorings is a hazard to swimmers and shore divers; iron leeching from moorings increases algal growth; moorings create entanglement hazards for hāhālua (*Manta spp.*).

In the absence of consultation, community impact has not been acknowledged or addressed by the applicant.

## Location

Makaiwa Bay is located in the ahupua'a of Waikoloa in the district of South Kohala. Boating, snorkeling, SCUBA diving, swimming, and several types of fishing are common activities. Protected honu, green sea turtles (*Chelonia mydas*) are abundant in this frequently visited area. Residents and visitors swim in these waters every day, many without dive flags or an awareness of the danger posed by motorized vessels.

The living coral reef surrounding Makaiwa is extensive with high habitat complexity and <a href="vulnerability">vulnerability</a> to climate change impacts. There is a narrow sand channel between coral reef habitats that features an existing mooring. Live reef is present on the North, South, and East sides of the Bay. Locations proposed for new moorings are "Outside of an Existing Offshore Mooring Area." The existing mooring is tucked in between reef shelves to the north and south in water that is too deep for waves to break. The mooring proposed mauka (inland) of this area is in a zone that will be exposed to breaking waves during a large WNW swell. The mooring proposed makai (seaward) will be fully exposed to the sea on three sides and subjected to strong tradewinds and choppy conditions. While they appear well engineered, ocean conditions in the region have broken mooring lines, snapped chains, and dragged mooring blocks across sandy areas to impact reefs elsewhere in south Kohala (e.g. Waiaka'ilio, 'Ānaeho'omalu Bay). It is probable that breaking waves or unmitigated gales acting on vessels will create significant risk to the corals on 3 sides of the Bay and the vessels themselves.

These areas lack infrastructure for pumping holding tanks or containing fuel spills with the nearest marine fuel facility located over 30 miles away at Honokōhau Harbor. Fuel will need to be transported securely from shore and fueling conducted at sea or the vessel will need to transit to the harbor to prevent releasing contaminants into the sensitive environment of Makaiwa Bay.

In the absence of safety plans, benthic habitat maps, wind/surf assessments, and maintenance/refueling requirements that eliminate predictable habitat damage, the locations proposed are problematic from a safety and habitat perspective.

# **Exemption**

We do not agree that installation of mooring buoys is exempted from the environmental requirements of HRS Chapter 343 and HAR Chapter 11-200.1. While General Exemption Type 3, Part 1:20 appears to exempt "placement or construction of accessory structures such as... mooring buoys, blocks, and piles..." from environmental assessment, the proposal does not consider the context in which these moorings would be placed. Context must be considered per HAR § Section 11-200.1: "...All exemptions under subchapter 8 are inapplicable when the cumulative impact of planned successive actions in the same place, over time, is significant, or when an action that is normally insignificant in its impact on the environment may be significant in a particularly sensitive environment."

It is not enough to consider new moorings in isolation. Because the West Hawai'i coast has been the site of decades of mooring installation, the two moorings proposed constitute a successive action in the same place, over time. There is another mooring in the immediate vicinity and dozens of additional moorings along the contiguous reef within which Makaiwa Bay is located. The cumulative impact of all of these moorings is significant to the determination to approve any new moorings. The vulnerability of the live coral reef in the region may well constitute a particularly sensitive environment. The absence of a biological determination on cumulative impact and environmental sensitivity is currently lacking.

We do not feel that these three areas of objection have been adequately addressed.

Further, we are concerned about the precedent that may be set should these moorings be approved without any consultation or effort to address these concerns. The limited availability of slips and moorings for commercial and large private vessels in West Hawai'i creates high demand for places to moor large private and commercial vessels. We anticipate that many more applications will be submitted that will contribute to a proliferation of moorings along our coast if this precedent is set.

Although we oppose the application, we welcome engagement with the applicants and with DOBOR. Our Council serves as a resource to ensure impacted and concerned stakeholders and rights holders are informed and able to provide input into all new moorings in the WHRFMA. We invite members of the DLNR, DOBOR especially, and Applicants to share their proposal with our community and to consider input to inform their actions. We also have a standing invitation for a DOBOR representative to sit ex officio on our council, alongside DAR and DOCARE who regularly participate in our meetings. We welcome the opportunity to support better communication with impacted stakeholders and rights holders in West Hawai'i.

Thank you for your consideration,

Chris Funada & Nathan Tsao

Chairpersons

on behalf of the West Hawai'i Fishery Council

Christopher Funada Nathan Tsao

From: <u>bea witt</u>

To: <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Auberge moorings off our Maka"iwa beach - NO

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 5:28:46 PM

PLEASE do not approve this proposal by the Mauna Lani Auberge for two new moorings of Maka'iwa beach on Friday, July 26, 2024. The Auberge group has been horrible to the locals and owners in and around Mauna Lani and Maka'iwa beach, systematically removing local usage of water activities and placing no trespassing signs around areas that they have annexed. They also have NOT even told the homeowners, as is normally required when there is such a major change, that they are trying to ruin our beautiful beach with two moorings.

We are urging you to stop this action of approval as there has not been sufficient notice to ANY of the owners and stakeholders.

Thank you,

BC Wittenberg Owner in Mauna Lani From: <u>John Wowk</u>

**To:** <u>DLNR.BLNR.Testimony</u>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Proposed Makaiwa Bay Moorings

**Date:** Thursday, July 25, 2024 2:16:00 PM

The proposed moorings in Makaiwa bay cannot be approved. It is a small bay that is home to the Mana Lani beach. The historic fish ponds border the area between the beach and the Auberge hotel. The inner mooring proposed is extremely close to shore.

The beach is highly utilized by people swimming and snorkeling in that area. It is also an area that is in a surf break. This past winter had several days of very high surf crashing through the bay and I predict that the vessels moored there will wind up crashing into the fish ponds. There has been no information or discussion by the Auberge that involved the Mana Lani resort owners association of their plan. I would ask that no decision be made at this time a to allow for a transparent process that would allow time for further investigation of this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

John Wowk Joy Hom Wowk July 26, 2024

To: Chairperson and Members
Board of Land and Natural Resources State of Hawaii
DLNR Office
Kalanimoku Building
1151 Punchbowl St
Honolulu, Hawaii. 96814

Email: <u>blnr.estimony@hawaii.gov</u>

Fr: Layne Yoshida 40 Terrace Circle Hilo, HI 96720

Email: yoshida.lky@gmail.com

RE: Approval of Installation of 2 New Moorings Outside of an Established Mooring Area at Makaila Bay

I have not seen any notices by the DLNR or the company submitting the proposal for the 2 proposed moorings. I thought that there was a requirement that a notice to the general public of any such action was required, ie publication in the newspaper and other means.

Further, I have not seen any environmental assessment of the projects impact on the area and also on the general public. At the very least any action on this requested project should be postponed until a complete environmental study has been completed and presented to the public for review and comment. I personally feel that the project should be rejected outright but again at the very least I believe that the project should at a minimum be properly and fully vetted before any action is taken.

The very fact that the proponent of the mooring project, DHL MAHI OPCO, LLC, has admitted that the immediate community that is impacted by this request was never informed or consulted about the project should raise red flags about the permitting process.

The increase in noise both above and under the water will effect both people living in the area and more importantly to me, the marine life in the area. Will the increase in vessel activity lead to concerns about water pollution? As a boat owner I am aware that most marine engines emit oil and other pollutants when they are used. How will this effect the water quality and marine life in the area.

Then there is the issue of safety of swimmers, kayakers. Paddle Boarders and snorkelers using the area. Will the increase in vessel activity lead to safety issues concerning the recreational users of the area?

The State of Hawaii DLNR has the responsibility to fully vet any project that comes before it for action and it is very clear that this project has not been fully vetted and that the public, both those living in the general area and the general public have not been given adequate notice and

information on the proposed moorings. This kind of shoddy approval process should not be allowed and the DLNR should follow common sense rules and procedures.

Respectfully Submitted; Layne Yoshida