

From: [Austin Lefevre](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:23:09 AM

Hello,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources through science provided by DAR.

Thanks for your time,

--

-Austin Lefevre
734-476-2926

From: [info acuariomalaga](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 8:50:01 PM

Dear Sirs, Agenda Item F1 Support - I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR! Yours sincerely,
Yours sincerely Charalambos Papis
Acuariomalaga

From: [Meg Adams](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:34:00 AM

Hello,

I am writing to OPPOSE the decision to re-open commercial aquarium collection in West Hawaii. As a long time community member of Puako, I have personally seen the fish population recover and believe it is extremely harmful to allow the reef's vital fish population to be taken. The habitat there should be protected and environmental safety prioritized above commercial gain. DO NOT AGREE TO AC IN WEST HAWAII.

-Meg

Meg Adams
Group Resource Manager
7301 John Galt Way | Arbuckle, CA 95912
(530) 668-2038 | meg@adamsgrp.com



From: [Alfred Martabano](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:36:40 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

Have been keeping marine fish since 1973, and have always had Yellow & Kole Tangs and Flame wrasses in my tanks.

Thanks for listening

Alfie

From: [Karen Anderson](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:30:56 AM

As a person living next to the beautiful Puako Reef, and supporting efforts to remove all of the wastewater off of the reef to allow it to recover, the last thing we want is to have the reef's vital fish populations taken. DO NOT AGREE TO AQUARIUM COLLECTION IN WEST HAWAII.

- BLNR should be the ultimate decision-makers on whether or not to issue AQ permits, not just the Chair of DAR staff
- NO AQ permits should be issued

Sincerely,
Karen Anderson

From: [Norman Arakaki](#)
To: [Joe Carvalho](#)
Cc: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#); [Bobby Glory](#); [Adrian Carvalho](#); [Guy Sasaki](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Aquarium Fish Taking
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:16:32 PM

Good job bruddah, proud of you. We don't need the aquariums, we need the fishes to eat.

On Wed, Aug 21, 2024 at 1:04 PM Joe Carvalho <kohala1@yahoo.com> wrote:

I am testifying to stop all fish taking for aquariums. eg; where are the pakakui? Used to be in abundance along the shore.

Respectfully,
Joe Carvalho
Halaula, North Kohala

Sent from my iPhone

From: [BARTHELEMY Dominique](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:30:29 AM
Attachments: [Outlook-bjwmdw1c](#)
[Outlook-Une image](#)
[Outlook-Une image .png](#)
[Outlook-Une image .png](#)

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Best regards,



Dominique Barthelemy

Conservateur / General Curator
Président de l'Union des Conservateurs d'Aquariums
(UCA)

Port de Plaisance du Moulin Blanc – BP 91039 – 29210
Brest cedex 1
Tél : 02 98 34 49 51 - fax : 02 98 34 40 69
Site web : <http://www.oceanopolis.com/>



dominique.barthelemy@oceanopolis.com





DU 6 JUILLET AU 1^{er} SEPTEMBRE

BRETAGNE®

PALÉOCÉAN 3D

À la découverte de la biodiversité d'hier et d'aujourd'hui

été à Brest

Océanopolis

BREST

brest'aim Brest



From: [Jeffrey Bednarek](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:07:52 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. This fishery was a shining example of proper management up until closing a few years ago. Let it be a positive example again of proper regulations and conservation by reopening it and managing it correctly.

--

Jeffrey R Bednarek

From: [Brian Belet](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:06:03 PM

Dear Hawai'i Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I write to express my strong opposition to the Division of Aquatic Resources' request to your Board to reopen West Hawai'i (or any water surrounding any of the islands) to commercial aquarium collection. My name is Brian Belet, and I live in Mililani on O'ahu.

There are many reasons for BLNR to deny this request from DAR. From a strictly legal perspective, the Environment Impact Statement that DAR is using in support is currently pending before our state Supreme Court, so any action at this time is premature. In addition, BLNR approved (unanimously, December 2023) a petition to prohibit aquarium collection statewide.

DAR is also attempting to empower the Chair of BLNR, and not the full board, to decide aquarium collection permits. This is absurd, as it would render the BLNR inert as an oversight entity, and would effectively remove the opportunity for any public input (such as this letter I write today).

Additional concerns weigh in against this DAR request. Environmentally, we need to protect our native wild fish population and our coral reef community. This is a call upon our basic stewardship of our islands and waters, and also a very practical move to assist our wild species to adapt to climate change.

In closing, I ask the full BLNR to deny the aquarium collection request from DAR. Also, I urge the full BLNR Board to remain vigilant against any person or entity's attempt to weaken or erase the full Board's rights and responsibilities in all matters that fall under your jurisdiction. Thank you for your time and consideration of my views.

- Brian Belet

95-1150 Ahoka Street
Mililani, HI 96789

--

Brian Belet
beletbrian@gmail.com
www.BeletMusic.com

From: [Romain Benderdouch](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:37:41 AM

Dear Sir/Madam

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Best regards

Romain Benderdouch

From: [Marco Bertolino](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:47:49 AM

From: [Wm.Anthony Beverly](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:35:27 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

Please re-open....



FRIENDS of HANAUMA BAY

CONSERVE • PROTECT • RESTORE

*Dedicated to the conservation of coastal and marine environments,
emphasizing stewardship of the natural resources of Hanauma Bay*

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

DATE: August 23, 2024

TIME: 9:00 a.m.

PLACE: DLNR Boardroom, Kalanimoku Bldg.
1151 Punchbowl Street, 1st Floor / & Online via Zoom

August 21, 2024

Testimony regarding Agenda Item F1

Aloha Chair Chang and Members of the Board of Land and Natural Resources, we strongly object to all of DAR's proposals submitted under Agenda Item F1.

In December 2023, the Board unanimously approved a petition from Kalanihale, KUPA Friends of Ho'okena Beach Park, Moana 'Ohana, Ko'olaupoko Hawaiian Civic Club and For the Fishes to begin "Rulemaking to Prohibit the Take of Marine Life for Commercial Aquarium Purposes (With Exemptions)."

DAR has completely ignored your directive. Instead, with Chair Chang's approval, DAR is moving forward with their plan to re-open West Hawai'i to commercial aquarium collection (AQ) on behalf of the mainland businesses that sell wildlife for aquariums. DAR is proposing this even though the validity of the EIS, upon which their plan is based, is still pending before the Hawai'i Supreme Court.

Clearly understanding the Board's growing opposition to commercial AQ, DAR is also proposing to remove BLNR's oversight of the trade and the ability for the public to have a voice, by giving sole AQ permitting authority to the Chair, who could sign off without the public even being notified, let alone given an opportunity to provide any input.

Silencing community voices that have long opposed this activity and shielding potential AQ collectors from public scrutiny is yet another in a long list of unacceptable and troublesome decisions DAR has made on behalf of the obscenely inhumane AQ pet trade that measurably, cruelly, and needlessly diminishes the biodiversity of our coral reefs and benefits only off shore markets.

Enough already.

You spoke clearly and unanimously in December, and we urge you to speak with that same voice now. Please oppose all of DAR's Agenda Item F1 recommendations to ignore your December 8, 2023 directive, open West Hawaii to the AQ trade, remove BLNR's oversight over all aspects of this issue, and allow anyone to shield potential AQ collectors from public scrutiny.

With aloha and mahalo for volunteering to be a member of the Board of Land and Natural Resources,

Lisa Bishop, MS
President

From: [Gary Borman](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 9:43:16 AM

Hello

My name is Gary Borman and we have lived in Kamuela/Puako since 2007. As a person living next to the beautiful Puako Reef, and supporting efforts to remove all of the wastewater off of the reef to allow it to recover, the last thing we need is for the reef's vital fish populations reduced further than it already has become.

WE DO NOT AGREE TO AC IN WEST HAWAII and we must increase fish abundance if our reefs are to have a fighting chance against climate change impacts. Sacrificing tens to hundreds of thousands of important herbivores to an unnecessary and destructive activity contradicts best available science and common sense

- BLNR should be the ultimate decision-makers on whether or not to issue AQ permits, not just the Chair of DAR staff
- NO AQ permits should be issued

I vehemently OPPOSE the reopening of our reefs to the destructive AQ trade. The benefits of leaving our fish on the reefs FAR OUTWEIGH the monetary gains of a handful of people who rake them off the reef for sale to the AQ pet trade outside Hawaii.

Our voices regarding the permitting process must not being silenced. It would be a betrayal of the public trust!
NO AQ permits should be issued.

The aquarium trade fundamentally conflicts with local, cultural, and broad social values of our Hawaii home.

Mahalo for your attention on this huge issue.
Sincerely,
Gary Borman

From: [Antonin Bouchez](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Testimony on DLNR 8/23/24 Agenda item F-1
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 7:01:32 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of DLNR,

As a resident of Hawaii and Lālāmilo ahupua'a, I strongly oppose reopening the waters of West Hawaii to aquarium collection (AQ). Our reefs are hurting! This is plainly clear when you spend time in the waters off our coast. Ocean warming, fertilizer and pesticide runoff, and unintentional spills and pollution are all taking their toll. I have been swimming and paddling in these waters for 25 years, and have seen the change over this time. The last thing we need is commercial fish collection to deplete the life that remains. There is so much more to be gained for all of us by allowing the reef to recover as best it can.

I urge you to reject DAR's AQ request and deny all AQ permits. I also urge you to reject the request to delegate authority on these matters to the DLNR chair. This request appears to be an attempt to shield the AQ trade from public scrutiny. This is the last thing any of us wants to see.

Mahalo for all you do to preserve our 'aina,

Dr. Antonin Bouchez
Lālāmilo ahupua'a, Moku o Keawe

From: [Richard Buchner](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:11:20 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

Rick's iPhone - please excuse any auto corrections and typos.
678-787-4524

From: [Kathy Buckovetz](#)
To: [DNR, BLM, Testimony; Kathy Buckovetz](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Fwd: Aquarium Collection Permitting/Testimony Information
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 8:15:55 AM

Subject: F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Katherine Buckovetz, a retired Kailua Kona kupuna. I have fished and swam the coastal areas since I was a keiki. My tutus loved the area and shared the magic of the ancestors stories and love of marine life when we fished for food or swam with the sealife. We loved seeing the beautiful fish, monk seals and birds, which have sadly declined. It is our job to preserve the Aina. You are in the position to make a difference impacting traditional Hawaiian life and culture for our future generations by conservation actions. Act now!

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, please reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together while considering facts related to each issue.

Mahalo nui loa,

Katherine Buckovetz
78-6980 Kaluna Street
Kailua Kona, HI 96740

From: [michael bushnell](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:02:43 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Having fish and coral greatly helps the future survival of them all. With all the reefs being bleached out by global warming. It's best to ensure they species are spread as far and wide as possible. It provides the possibility of them not becoming extinct should the ocean trends continue. It would further allow for diverse species from the hobby to also be propagated to restore them in their natural environment should the worst happen.

[Yahoo Mail: Search, Organize, Conquer](#)

From: [Dawn Butler](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 Support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 9:52:39 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.png](#)
[image003.png](#)
[image004.png](#)
[image005.png](#)
[image007.png](#)
[image008.png](#)
[image009.png](#)
[image010.png](#)
[image011.png](#)
Importance: High

Good Morning,

I am emailing to express my support for opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Regards

Dawn Butler | Senior Customer Service/Office Manager

📞 +44 161 9461538

🌐 tropicalmarinecentre.com

📍 Unit 3, Beta Court, Sharston Industrial Estate, Harper Rd, Wythenshawe,, Manchester, M22 4QE



INVESTORS
IN PEOPLE



This message contains confidential information and is intended only for the intended recipients. It may contain privileged and/or confidential information. If you are not an intended recipient you should not distribute or copy this e-mail. Please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail. Any personal views and opinions expressed in this email message are the sender's own and do not necessarily represent the views and opinions of Tropical Marine Centre Ltd (TMC). TMC will not accept any liability in respect of such communication.

WARNING: Computer viruses can be transmitted via e-mail. The recipient should check this email and any attachments for the presence of viruses.

The company accepts no liability for any damage caused by any virus transmitted by this e-mail.

From: [Emily Cadiz](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 I OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & I OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 9:15:35 AM

Subject: F-1 I OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & I OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Emily Cadiz and I represent the nonprofit organization, Hui Maka'āinana o Makana. Our organization is based in Hā'ena, Kaua'i and we have close relationships to West Hawai'i community through the shared work of grassroots organizations taking care of their places. We have been working closely with West Hawai'i communities for decades with the goal of better place-based fisheries management. Community led, government supported.

On behalf of Hui Maka'āinana o Makana, we **OPPOSE** issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits. We find this is contradictory to the herbivore package that was proposed earlier this year. We also worry about the precedence this will set for not just West Hawai'i but for all of Hawai'i.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for this opportunity,
Emily Cadiz

--

Emily A. Cadiz
Program Director, Hui Maka'āinana o Makana
P.O. Box 1225 Hanalei, HI 96714
<https://www.huimakaaainanaomakana.org/>

From: [Joe Carvalho](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Cc: [Bobby Glory](#); [Norman Arakaki](#); [Adrian Carvalho](#); [Guy Sasaki](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Aquarium Fish Taking
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:04:18 PM

I am testifying to stop all fish taking for aquariums. eg; where are the pakakui? Used to be in abundance along the shore.

Respectfully,
Joe Carvalho
Halaula, North Kohala

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Ethan Chang](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 8:09:06 AM

Aloha mai,

I am Ethan Chang, a resident of Mānoa on O'ahu, deeply concerned by the Department of Aquatic Resources efforts to issue permits for commercial aquarium collection (AQ) in West Hawai'i.

Given the unanimous decision by the Board of Land and Natural Resources (BLNR) in December of 2023 to prohibit commercial AQ statewide, this move comes with surprise to what I understand to be democratic processes and commitments to serving Hawai'i.

I want to make two points clear:

1. NO AQ permits should be issued
2. BLNR should be the ultimate decision-makers on whether or not to issue AQ permits, not just the Chair of DAR staff

Mahalo for receiving this testimony.

Aloha,
Ethan

From: [Edgar Chavez](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 8:38:36 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you

Edgar Chavez

CHAIR CHANG AND BOARD MEMBERS,

I SUPPORT OPENING THE AQUARIUM FISHERY IN HAWAII. THE SCIENCE SUPPORTS THAT THIS IS A SUSTAINABLE, WELL MANAGED FISHERY AND PERMITS SHOULD BE ISSUED.

THANK YOU,
SARA CHEN

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery. This fishery has been through HEPA and has decades of studies and scientific data that support the sustainability of the fishery. It's well managed by DAR based on science.

Mahalo.

Joan Sydney

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery in west Hawaii.

Jana Serrano

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery because it has been through the environmental review and proven to be sustainable. Sustainable fisheries should be supported and used as examples of how to better those fisheries that are less studied and with less intensive management. DAR has done a great job with the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,
Phoebe Noi

Dear Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources:

I'm supporting the aquarium fishery and think that permits should be issued.

Thank you,
Gen Bets

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Genevive Vitalis

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. It has completed the HEPA review.

Thank you,
B. Cunningham

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Sean Bradshaw

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the west hawaii aquarium fishery and issuing permits to do so.

Thank you very much,
Kathleen Labio

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery in west Hawaii. It's the only fishery to successfully complete the environmental review and it's the only fishery to be so heavily managed which will help keep plentiful fish stocks.

Thank you,
Kathy Marnell

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
A. Pua

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Seth Cowan

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery because it went through the HEPA process and is a sustainable fishery. I support reissuing permits and opening West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Norm Laude

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening the aquarium fishery.

Peter DeMaio

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. The scientific data proves this is a sustainable fishery with good management ensuring proper protection and growth of fish stocks.

Mahalo,

M. Levy

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits to reopen the aquarium fishery. Thank you.

Mark Y.

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery and reissuing permits to allow fishing in West Hawaii again. Good management backed by science is key to ensuring it remains sustainable.

Mahalo,
Will Alvarado

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mickey Flanks

Chair Chang and Board Members:

I support issuing permits for west Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Thank you,
Derick Russell

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. With so few permits allowed and catch limits in place for the only eight species that can be caught will really help ensure that fish populations will not be depleted.

Thank you,
Katalina Velasco

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm testifying in support of issuing permits to reopen the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Manu Townes

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and reopening West Hawaii for fishing.

Thank you,
Elana Yasi

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and managing this fishery in accordance with the science behind it.

Thank you,

M. Lee

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
B. McLeod

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support permitting and reopening West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Randy Sullivan

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening the aquarium fishery. Management has been in place and has proven to be highly effective.

Chris Sacorro

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island. It's a proven sustainable fishery.

Mahalo,
Nora Estabillo

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
Camille Sevilla

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. I support issuing permits. The HEPA review has been completed and accepted.

Mahalo,

Dave Melvin

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support permitting and opening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Shelby Lin

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I strongly support issuing permits for the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,
Cole Patterson
Kona

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and believe permits should be issued so the fishery can be reopened in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Amy Saari

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm supporting reissuing permits to open the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Theo Sal

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. The fishery is backed by scientific studies showing it's sustainable. And it completed HEPA.

F. Long

Chair Chang and Board Members:

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits on the Big Island. The fishery has completed the required HEPA review. As shown in studies done by DAR/DLNR, fish populations are increasing and this fishery is sustainable.

Mahalo,

B. Chun

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
Tom Soloway

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I fully support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery. It completed the HEPA review. It's sustainable and good management based in science, as set forth by DAR, will see to it that it stays that way.

Thank you very much.

W. Johnson

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members-

I support issuing permits and allowing the aquarium fishery to reopen.

Thank you,

Nelson L.

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources.

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. I believe there is ample scientific data that confirms proper management of this fishery has worked to ensure it is sustainable.

Mahalo.

Yuen Fung

I support issuing permits for the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,

Nalani I.

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing. This fishery has completed the HEPA review and should be allowed to re-open.

Lani Whitflye

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

Thanks,

Hailie Go

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in Hawaii as well as managing resources according to the science that backs it up.

Mahalo,
Brad Ray

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening aquarium fishing in West Hawaii. This has been a well managed fishery and it will be only a handful of permits with limits so no danger of over fishing.

Mahalo,

G.H. Tiongco

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I fully support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Amie Torrez

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm in favor of issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Lynda Young

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the west Hawaii aquarium fishery and I support science based management provided by DAR.

Gale Bensi

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii.

Hazel Ignacio

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm in support of reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii fishing. This fishery has been proven sustainable and with good management and far fewer permits being issued then it certainly will remain sustainable.

Mahalo,

Rob Alvare

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and opening the aquarium fishery.

Thank you.

W. Ramos

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening the aquarium fishery as it has years of scientific data that demonstrate the health and vitality of the fishery, which goes to show how effectively the state has managed it.

Thank you,
Flora Reyme

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and issuing permits.

Mahalo,

Bella Marsh

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you very much,
Chloe Herredia

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits to allow aquarium fishing in West Hawaii, and
I support managing resources by science as provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Maria Tiongco

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and allowing aquarium fishing to resume in West Hawaii.

Thank You,
JJ Diep

I support issuing permits for reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Jonjon de Vera

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

The aquarium fishery on the Big Island has been proven sustainable and I support reopening it. Please issue permits.

Mahalo,
K. Ray

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'd like to submit my support for issuing aquarium fishing permits. I support reopening the fishery.

Mahalo,

Jeane Louis

I support reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Jacquelyn Dominguez

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources:

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

**Thank you,
Cary Garrett.**

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery. Resources should be managed by science and this fishery has been a model of good management based on many years of studies and scientific data.

Thank you,
Mitzi Bue

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Lito Cayetano

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery and believe it should be reopened again. I support the issuance of permits for West Hawaii fishing.

Mahalo,
Kaipo Rodeck

Hello,

I support opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Austin Walton

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support managing resources by science and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. Support issuing permits.

Mahalo,
Fey Clark

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the aquarium fishery with sound management backed by science. I support issuing permits for West Hawaii.

Dale Lin

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources Members,

I'm testifying in support of reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii.

Thank you,

Irene Smith

I support re-opening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Dianna Aguada

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits and believe this fishery has been proven sustainable. It should be allowed to operate like any other fishery in Hawaii.

Leanna Gonzalves

From: [Cheryl Manago](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:13:22 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. Please vote for this agenda item and support our local businesses

Cheryl Manago

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Chris H](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:38:10 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Melissa Clark](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Removal of reef fish in West Hawaii
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:50:14 PM

Sent from my iPad

The removal of any reef fish in order to sell them commercially is unconscionable. Please consider how approving this activity is against the sacred and fundamental cultural values of the Hawaiian people.

From: [Chris Clevers](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 8:30:36 AM
Importance: High

I whole heartily support opening the aquarium fishery and I support managing resources by the extensive science-based data provided by DAR. The data has proven time and time again that this fishery can be properly managed to protect it.
Chris Clevers



OCEAN RIDER, INC

ocean rider

August 15th, 2024

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I STRONGLY OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

I , Carol Cozzi- Schmarr, along with my husband Craig Schmarr own and operate The Ocean Rider Seahorse Farm, located within the Natural Energy Lab in Kona, since 1998. We produce over 10,000 farm raised seahorses (aquarium fish) per year for the pet trade in a profitable and sustainable manner.

Because of the fact that wild aquarium fish die within a month after capture due to stress and starvation, 1 million seahorse were taken out annually for home aquarium hobbyists before 1998. When our farm raised seahorses came on the market in 1998, the total number of seahorses consumed by the pet trade went down to 10,000 per year because farm raised seahorses live 10 years or more in a home aquarium. Not only do they live longer but they also are more colorful, friendly and healthier simply making a better pet.

Today in 2024 no one in the aquarium industry can even remember a wild caught seahorse being taken off the reef and put into an aquarium. It just doesn't make ecological or economic sense.

This same model must be applied to all aquarium fish. They must be farmed not fished off the reef just to die in some one's tank on the mainland. This is simply a Jurassic idea, The value of the fish is so much greater alive on our reefs here in Hawaii. These aquarium fish are coral reef fish . They are critical to keeping our reefs alive and critical to the tourism industry which is worth much so more than the few dollars the collectors get for the fish. It is a tragic idea to even consider opening up our precious reefs to the raping of our fish followed by the death of our reefs. Anyone who favors the collection is clearly in the pockets of the wholesalers who just want cheap fish.

Don't let anyone tell you there are enough fish out there for the collectors. That is a lie and simply a false reality with false numbers. I have been in the ocean here every day with a mask on my face since 1984 and I can tell you the numbers of yellow tangs, butterfly fish, angel fish, pipe fish and any beautiful fish are down by 90%. We cannot afford to share what is left for mainland greed.

Please don't let greed and false information sway you to make a horrific decision that affects everyone in Hawaii and destroys the last of our world's coral reefs. No single person or small group of people have that right.

Sincerely,

Carol Cozzi- Schmarr, President/Owner , www.seahorse.com, 8089374368

From: [Catherine Crewe](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] commercial aquarium permits
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 9:37:15 AM

Aloha,

My name is Catherine Crewe. I live in Fernie, BC Canada. I have been coming to the big island since 2017. I joined Kawaihae Canoe Club in 2018 and since then have become heavily involved with the club, the community meal in Waimea on Thursdays and many other events and activities on the big island. I consider Kawaihae my family.

I have been an avid swimmer, and scuba diver, and snorkel almost my whole life. I no longer scuba dive but I do snorkel and swim. Every day while there, I go to many place's from Honaunau to Mahukona. I average 2 hours in the water and up to 4 hours every day depending on where I am.

I cannot express my concern over the proposal of the aquarium trade. Since 2017 I can see the loss of small reef fish. Every year when I return it is much more apparent. The yellow tangs used to be in fairly large schools now they are small schools, very few in numbers, the fish themselves also small, the mature ones almost gone. That is one example, I could go on and on about each species, it is the same.

The aquarium trade is a horrible practice, the death rate of the fish before they even get to the buyer is astronomical. This is not a huge industry within Hawai'i. The tourist industry is so much larger, and these reef fish are what the tourists come to see.

This practice is not sustainable.

I'm extremely concerned about the proposal to take away any voice from the local Hawaiian's for the future.

Please reconsider what could happen here by making the wrong decision to benefit so few people.

Mahalo for taking the time to read this. I look forward to your response.

Sincerely

Catherine Crewe

Box 2366

Fernie, BC

V0B1M0

250-881-0767

Sent from my iPad

From: [Robert Culbertson](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item F-1 OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 7:12:01 PM

Aloha Big Island BLNR representative Riley Smith, and fellow members of the Board,

As a mainland transplant of some 30 years, enamored with the spirit of aloha, I learned to love this island and especially its magical underwater seascapes. Since then, I have watched with dismay as a reign of state sanctioned depredation took effect in these special places. I particularly loved watching our 'Yellow Tang', the veritable symbol of Hawaii's natural abundance! But now I know them differently - that they are the number ONE target fish of the 'Pet Industry' collectors on Hawaii Island. They have been extracted by the hundreds of thousands on an annual basis in the past and would be again if your Board condones and enables it.

DLNR's stated mission is to "Enhance, protect, conserve and manage Hawaii's unique and limited natural, cultural and historic resources held in public trust for current and future generations of the people of Hawaii nei, and its visitors, in partnership with others from the public and private sectors." **No where does an obligation exist within this definition to promote takings for private profits.**

Furthermore, State agencies have an obligation to uphold Native Hawaiian rights as written in our Hawai'i Constitution. Commercial AQ collecting is an act in direct contrast to Hawaiian values and entitlements in law - plain and simple.

I will say also that it is not written on some sacred bureaucratic tablet that even *one* permit to continue the trade *must* be granted. **Yet some state officials have tried to hoodwink the public on such a mythic obligation.** On the contrary, residents, Kanaka and otherwise, faithful to the spirit of Aloha, know the time is right to put this painful issue to rest; to finally end this abusive trade.

We are NOT GOING BACK!

So today, please use your present authority to deny the issuance of ANY commercial collection permits for our West Hawaii reef fish! Every one of them is needed in sustaining the existence of our 'at risk' coral reefs, not to mention the subsistence needs of our own residents. Do not *invert* the **'hierarchy of uses' principle** DLNR has invoked for over 25 years.

Second, please DO NOT abrogate your collective responsibilities and powers in the scheme sponsored by DAR to "delegate" authority for issuance of permits to the Chair only! This would be a derogation of the Board's *intended purpose and its fiduciary duty to the public*. Retain the discretionary authority of the Board

who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialized knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together in a *fully transparent manner*.

Sincerely,
R A Culbertson
member, Big Island Reef Keepers hui
Honokaa

From: [Tim Daigneault](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:37:39 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

Sent from my iPhone

From: ddt808raider@yahoo.com
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Local fish stores
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 9:19:57 PM

To whom it may concern,

I support local marine life stores and local collectors to maintain their business in the state of Hawaii. I do not support the ban on local marine life as long as they do it sustainably and responsibly.

Dan

From: [James Dandar](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:25:28 PM

Hello,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and I support managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank You,

James Dandar

From: [Marcos Delgado](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:24:18 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

-Marcos Delgado

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Ez Doe](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:37:21 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

From: [Dunker, Kristine J \(DFG\)](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Cc: [Bruce Prunk](#); [julie.ziemelis.com](#); [Michael OConnor](#); [Cindi Punihaole](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms and Conditions to Issue AQ Permits and OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:19:40 PM

Greetings to the Chair and Board of the Hawaii Department of Land and Natural Resources.

My name is Krissy Dunker. I am not yet a Hawaii resident, but I am a frequent visitor to Hawai'i Island and regularly volunteer with two island-based organizations (365 Hawaii Island Community Fund and the ReefTeach Program). I wish to submit testimony in **opposition** of the request to re-establish aquarium collection permits in West Hawaii and to **oppose** delegating authority for aquarium permit decisions to the Chair.

As a visitor, I am particularly drawn to west Hawai'i's marine habitats. While on island, most of my family's time is spent snorkeling, diving, and observing the incredible marine life that Hawai'i is so fortunate to harbor. Over the last ~10 years, however, I have watched the condition of west Hawai'i's coral reefs decline, especially following the recent bleaching events. With the decline I have observed in coral health over time, I have also perceived a notable decrease in nearshore fish abundance, particularly of surgeonfish that are so vital to balancing algal growth on the reef. With the abundance of dead and dying coral structure now present, algae, including invasive forms, can more easily establish themselves. Without sufficient stocks of surgeonfish, algal colonization can happen before new coral recruitment can take hold. Also, as bleaching events become more common with climate change, corals that might otherwise survive a bleaching event can be covered with algae in the absence of sufficient grazing by surgeonfish, thereby guaranteeing their mortality.

I have read the request in item F-1-1. I strongly believe in DLNR's mission to 'enhance, protect, conserve, and manage Hawaii's unique and limited natural, cultural, and historic resources held in public trust for current and future generations of the people of Hawaii nei, and its visitors, in partnership with others from the public and private sectors', though I question how well re-authorizing aquarium permits in west Hawai'i fits this mission. I recognize, respect, and appreciate that DAR biologists have conducted the population assessments to determine that the proposed TACs should not lead to biologically meaningful reductions in the overall population sizes of each species. However, while these TAC limits may be biologically sustainable, they will still result in *perceived* reductions by ocean recreationists and contribute to indirect ecological effects, such as the algae example I provided. The proposed TAC of 200,000 yellow tang is notable. As a tourist, it is no longer common that I observe large schools of these fish as I once regularly did. As a ReefTeach volunteer, I am often asked, "where are all the fish?". This question typically comes from people who are visiting for the first time in decades, and the differences to them are stark.

Tourism contributes greatly to Hawaii's economy. West Hawai'i is a world-renown destination for observing endemic fish found nowhere else. The Potter's angelfish is a great example of an endemic species I rarely observe while snorkeling or diving, but it is absolutely enthralling when I do. Under the proposed permit structure, over 4,000 of these angelfish could be collected. That will reduce the quantity of an already rarely observed taxon for snorkelers and divers. I firmly believe that people care more about marine

conservation when they have direct experience observing healthy marine ecosystems. I don't question the work that DAR has done in determining the sustainability of the TACs; I question the unintended consequences that come with this. Residents and visitors will notice. They will see coral reefs in poor condition with fewer fish. As a result, many will lose motivation and interest in protecting Hawai'i fragile nearshore environments and supporting the organizations that are dedicated to conserving them. In the end, this decision to re-issue aquarium collection permits would benefit only a few permit holders who stand to gain financially by taking public trust resources from the ocean with the intent of distributing them out of state. I understand that providing economic opportunity is an important consideration for the state, but I believe this proposal comes at great economic risk to tourism and the already established businesses that rely on visitors coming to observe these species in their natural habitats.

I can also directly attest to the fact that most of the fish collected will not survive. I am a salt-water aquarist and have been for almost 20 years. In the beginning of my hobby, I purchased marine fish regularly, not understanding the ecological impact of doing so. I look back shamefully now because, at one time, I did try to establish yellow tang in my reef tank. I would buy a tang; it would live a few weeks or months, then die, and I'd go buy another. It would live a few weeks and die, and I'd buy another. And so on, and so on. I was trying to recreate a little Hawaii in my home in Alaska, completely ignorant to what I was contributing to. These fish most likely were taken from Hawaiian waters. I feel abhorrent now knowing I once contributed to this industry. As I have learned about the low survival of wild-caught marine fishes, experienced it myself, and extrapolated this across all salt-water aquarists, I have come to realize there is an *astronomical* amount of waste in the salt-water pet trade. *Is it worth risking further damage to west Hawai'i's reefs when fewer than 10% of the fish collected are likely to survive past one year?* I do still maintain a coral garden tank, but it is with the intent of offsetting this waste now. I grow coral frags as a means of providing them locally to reduce the demand here for corals that would otherwise come directly from the ocean. I no longer keep fish, and the few that my reef ecologically needs to remain healthy are only from aquacultured sources. Should Hawaii have greater economic interest in participating in the salt-water pet trade, I would recommend collecting brood and supporting a local industry that tank-raises these fish for export to distributors, rather than collecting them in the wild. Aquacultured fish are hardier, pathogens and parasites are controllable, and there is a substantial market for them. Aquarists, like me, tend to be ocean enthusiasts, but once they learn about the negative side of the industry, they overwhelmingly prefer tank-raised species when they are available. All of this is to say that there are better and more ecologically responsible ways of providing economic opportunity in this sector than permitting wild fish collections in west Hawaii once again.

Mahalo for your time in reading my comments and testimony. I truly admire and respect DLNR's work, and I trust the right decision will be made on this matter.

Aloha,
Krissy Dunker
7800 Casey Circle
Anchorage, AK 99507

From: [Nam D](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:49:21 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Respectfully

--

Randy Duong
Santa Clara, CA

From: [Sandy Ednie](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] RE: Agenda Item F.1 Allowing Commercial Aquarium Fishing off the coast of Hawaii, Big Island.
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:18:06 PM

How can you even seriously consider allowing the Commercial collection of Hawaii's Reef Fish!

As a tax paying citizen of Hawaii for the 82 years of my life I cry at even Needing to instruct my State leaders on this issue!

NO Commerial Collection of fish should be allowed!

I have spent almost EVERY DAY OF MY INDEPENDANT LIFE ATER 14 YEARS OLD swimming in our ocean waters. I have lived oceanfront in Puako, HI for the last 50 years.

I have seen the depletion of our reefs and fish, especially since 2015 and global changes are so apparent.)

PLease do not give any more of them away, intentionally for profit or simply from lack of awareness of the loss of this vital earthly resource.

Sincerely Sandra Folk Ednie

ednie59@gmail.com

808-937-7181

From: [Edson Gonzalez](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:45:22 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Randy Fernley](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Land Board Mtg (8/23) -Agenda Item F1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 7:36:56 AM

Aloha Chair Chang and Land Board Members,

Thank you for allowing me to speak and I'll make this brief.

My name is Randy Fernley.

At 73 years old, I've been a commercial fisherman for over 50 years. I'm now retired from running a pet store in Aiea called Coral Fish Hawaii....and I support the aquarium fishery in Hawaii.

The Big Island has met and exceeded all the parameters needed to obtain their permits for the 7 applicants. The science that has been conducted by the Chairs own department over many years has proven that this fishery is sustainable and should be a poster child for all other fisheries in the state of Hawaii.

Please allow these 7 permits to be issued.

Mahalo for your time and consideration,

Randy Fernley

From: [R. Fong](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:35:11 PM
Attachments: [4fd50b68-2d4b-42c3-9bbe-bbe141e24b9e.png](#)

Dear Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

I am a small business owner in Canada and I have testified Live over Zoom to the Board in the past (October 9th, 2021). As the owner of Coral Reef Shop; I've been privileged to work with several Public Aquariums & Academic Institutions such as: Vancouver Aquarium, Ripley's Aquarium of Canada, and University of Guelph - Marine Biology programs. All have stellar track records of research and education.

With the OPENING on the aquarium fishery - we can once again continue research and captive breeding programs while educating others about Oceans & Biology.

I fully support the science backed data outlined by DAR and encourage the opening of the aquarium fishery.

If you have any questions/concerns; please do not hesitate to contact me at your earliest convenience. I can offer a Canadian perspective at the academic/research level, wholesale level and retail level.

I thank the Board's time and consideration in this matter and look forward to a positive outcome for the Fishermen of Hawaii whom I consider friends & ohana. I would very much like to continue to contribute to their livelihood.

--

Regards,



Red Fong

方智行
Chief Executive Officer

Coral Reef Shop Inc.
1371 Plains Road East
Burlington, Ontario
L7R 3P9, CANADA

☎ 289.337.3398
✉ red@coralreefshop.com
🐦 [#coralreefshop](#)
🌐 www.coralreefshop.com
📘 [@coralreefshop](#)
📷 [coralreefshop](#)

Red Fong - Chief Executive Officer

Coral Reef Shop

1371 Plains Road East,

Burlington, Ontario,

L7R 3P9, **CANADA**

(289) 337-3398

August 20, 2024

Cindy Freitas
makainanqi@gmail.com

BLNR

Meeting: Aug. 23, 2024

Time: 9:00 a.m.

Place: DLNR Boardroom, Kalanimoku Bldg.

RE: Item F-1 DIVISION OF AQUATIC RESOURCES

He Mele komo a he mele aloha no na kupuna o ke au i hala Aloha mai kakou.

Aloha,

My name is Cindy Freitas and I'm a Native Hawaiian descended of the native inhabitants of Hawai'i prior to 1778 and born and raised in Hawai'i.

I am also a practitioner who still practice the cultural traditional customary practices that was instill in me by my grandparents at a young age from mauka (MOUNTAIN TO SEA) to makai in many areas.

I STRONGLY OPPOSE AQUARIUM PERMIT IN HAWAII'S OCEAN for the following reasons:

It fails to protect the CUSTOMARY TRADITIONAL PRACTICES.

In view of the Hawaii State Supreme Court's "PASH" and "Ka Pa'akai O Ka 'Aina" decisions, the issue relative to native Hawaiian gathering and fishing rights must be addressed. These rights must be addressed in terms of the cultural, historical, and natural resources and the associated traditional and customary practices of the site.

The Constitution of the State of Hawai'i clearly states the duty of the State and its agencies is to preserve, protect, and prevent interference with the traditional and customary rights of native Hawaiians. Article XII, Section 7 requires the State to "protect all rights, customarily and traditionally exercised for subsistence, cultural and religious purposes and possessed by *ahupua'a* tenants who are descendants of native Hawaiians who inhabited the Hawaiian Islands prior to 1778" (2000). In spite of the establishment of the foreign concept of private ownership and western-style government, Kamehameha III (Kauikeaouli) preserved the peoples traditional right to subsistence. As a result in 1850, the Hawaiian Government confirmed the traditional access rights to native Hawaiian *ahupua'a* tenants to gather specific natural resources for customary uses from undeveloped private property and waterways under the Hawaiian Revised Statutes (HRS) 7-1. In 1992, the State of Hawai'i Supreme Court,

reaffirmed HRS 7-1 and expanded it to include, "native Hawaiian rights...may extend beyond the *ahupua'a* in which a native Hawaiian resides where such rights have been customarily and traditionally exercised in this manner" (Pele Defense Fund v. Paty, 73 Haw.578, 1992).

Act 50, enacted by the Legislature of the State of Hawaii (2000) with House Bill 2895, relating to Environmental Impact Statements, proposes that:

...there is a need to clarify that the preparation of environmental assessments or environmental impact statement should identify and address effects on Hawaii's culture, and traditional and customary rights...[H.B. NO. 2895]

BLNR also violates the State Environmental Protection Laws by lack of decisive action tells aquarium trade players that there's no need to comply with Hawaii's environmental protection laws. Therefore other private interests will take advantage of this note.

Therefore BLNR should not issue **AQUARIUM PERMITS IN HAWAII'S OCEANS.**

Mahalo,

_____/s/_____
Cindy Freitas

From: [Susan Frett](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:50:35 PM
Attachments: [mkt_donation_email_sig_r3_500px_59742678-0de9-40fc-ac98-07ce516adf52.png](#)

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

On behalf of Pacific Whale Foundation (PWF) and its 10,000 supporters and members we are submitting this letter opposing the issuance of commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and PWF opposes delegating authority to the Department Chair. PWF strongly supports the rights of subsistence fishers as well as the benefits to the community and visitors for viewing and experiencing Hawai'i wildlife wild in their natural habitat. Any aquarium collection taking place on any Hawaiian reefs should be maintained for the sustainable, educational use only by local established caretakers including Maui Ocean Center and the Waikiki Aquarium with appropriate adherence to permits issued by DLNR-Divison of Aquatic Resources.

A *Honolulu Civil Beat* article (June 1, 2020) notes that, "Between 1976 and 2018, more than 8.6 million fish were taken from West Hawai'i waters for use in aquariums around the world." Sending any quantity of Hawaiian reef fish away from Hawaiian waters deprives the local environment of the ecosystem services provided by these species. It also risks the loss of the ability for subsistence fishers to feed their families and continue their cultural practices. Finally, the local economy is highly dependent on protecting our local environment and wildlife for tourists and residents to enjoy via snorkeling, scuba diving and recreational fishing. The reefs of the world are at risk from many threats including climate change, marine plastic pollution, ocean acidification and more, an additional threat should not be added only to benefit a few who largely do not live in Hawai'i and add little to nothing to the local economy.

Additionally, do not delegate authority for this issue to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Sincerely,

Susan Frett

Programs Director

Pacific Whale Foundation

[300 Ma'alaea Road Ste 211, Wailuku, HI 96793](#)

Cell (808) 269-2728

[PacificWhale.org](#)

**Donate to Support
Marine Wildlife Programs**



From: [Sara Fuller](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Cc: [Sara Fuller](#); karen.anderson@puako4reefs.org
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23 Agenda Item F.1
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 9:00:08 PM

My name - Sara Fuller

Address - 69-1647 Puako Beach Drive
Kamuela, Hawaii 96743

- I oppose commercial aquarium fish collecting in West Hawaii and all of Hawaii
- I strongly believe commercial aquarium fish collecting permits should be banned forever.

How do I justify this?

- Hawaii's citizens are working hard to strengthen and to rebuild her strong Hawaiian culture for current and future generations. The Hawaiian culture promotes a sense of belonging, purpose and direction for its people. **You are the very people who can help promote this. Hawaii needs the government's agencies supporting these goals.** The taking of her reef fish creates imbalance. Hawaii's people need the ocean in balance so her reefs can thrive once again to feed all her people and to create sustainability and a sense of worth.

- Hawaii's economy is not dependent on commercial aquarium fish collecting: the taking and killing of her reef fish for export.

- Traditional tourism is Hawaii's number one economic industry, but, it does not need to be. Other industries that can build Hawaii's economy while strengthening cultural practices, creating sustainability and keeping her environment clean are: aquaculture and aquaponics; thriving fish ponds; cultural ecotourism and Hawaiian farming.

There are many reasons to forever ban commercial aquarium fish collecting. Ask Hawaii's Kapuna to answer this.

There is not one justifiable reason to allow it.

Shame on anyone that can morally, culturally and environmentally come up with a reason to support Hawaii commercial aquarium fish collecting.

For Support of Hawaii's People, I oppose commercial aquarium fish collecting.

Sara Fuller

From: [santij](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:45:26 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

Thanks
Al Giansanti

From: [Josh Gilbert](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Urgent: "Agenda Item F1 Support" Reopening the Hawaii Aquarium Fishery
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 5:31:56 PM

Dear Hawaii Aquarium Fishery

I hope this message finds you well.

I am writing to express my **support for the reopening** of the aquarium fishery in Hawaii, provided that it is managed according to the scientific guidelines and recommendations provided by the Division of Aquatic Resources (DAR).

We must rely on science-based management to ensure the sustainability of our marine resources. The expertise and data from DAR can guide responsible practices and help maintain the balance necessary for both ecological health and economic viability.

Thank you for considering my perspective on this matter. I believe that with the right scientific oversight, we can achieve a solution that supports both conservation and the aquarium industry.

Best regards,

--

Joshua Gilbert
Bluegum Electrical
Director of Operations - Qualified Electrician

Solar Accreditation Australia: Solar & Battery Designer and Installer
SAA: S2411040 - A Grade: A42953 - REC:20047

Office: 1300 306 342
Mobile: 0467 178 413

bluegumelectricalsolutions.com.au



P.S. We've got a FREE Information Session called '[The Real Secret to a \\$0 Electricity Bill](#)'. To get instant access and discover the five common solar mistakes and how to avoid them, [click here for your FREE pass](#).

From: robgonzalez88@aol.com
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F2 and F3
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:31:08 AM

I oppose banning the aquarium fishery,
and I support managing resources by science as provided by DAR.

Signed: Robert Gonzalez

[Sent from AOL on Android](#)

From: [gg-alain](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 5:38:07 AM

Hello,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thanks

Géraldine Gonzalez .

From: [Barbara Gordon](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] West Hawaii aquarium requests
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:34:55 PM

Aloha

My name is Barbara Gordon, and I am a full time resident at Mauna Lani. We enjoy our beach club and water activities that include swimming, snorkeling and diving in the area at issue.

I OPPOSE the issuance of any commercial aquarium permits in West Hawaii and I also OPPOSE delegating authority in this issue to the dept chair.

We feel taking any marine life from this area is detrimental to the overall health of the ecosystem, not to mention the loss of fish for residents and visitors alike. Hawaii depends on ocean activities that won't negatively impact the environment, and this proposal is the polar opposite of that sentiment.

We also feel that the entire board should be making decisions on this important issue as opposed to just the one person (dept chair) having the sole authority. Our community is diverse and needs to have that representation on the board as a whole while discussing how certain activities and decisions impact our community.

Thank you for an accepting comments from the community. It's important to have your finger on the pulse of the community that will be impacted the most by this decision.

Mahalo

Barbara Gordon
Mana Lani resident

From: [Antoni Grifó](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL]
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 9:16:43 PM

Subject : Agenda Item F1 Support

Text: I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

I'm biologist nature lover, so please protect your beautiful nature but supporting the sustainable ornamental fishery and local economy of fishermen.

Thank you!.

From: [Furry face](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:14:36 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and I support managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Lorin Grow



From: [Gregg G](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Fw: : Item F-1 - OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 4:15:12 PM

I am a resident of Kamuela and have been diving and snorkeling the West Hawaii Coast of the Big Island since the 1980s.

It is very sad and shocking to see with my own eyes to see the huge decline in our reef fish populations. The aquarium trade likes to blame pollution and climate change for the vast decline in our reef fish populations. It defies logic that with, say, 80% of the fish gone, we ought to issue permits for the other 20% to be taken! This is not food fishing! It is a practice that does immense harm to the environment, makes a small group of people quite wealthy and employs few!

Please see the attached photos. Even though this happened a while back; when a collectors' holding tank malfunctioned, killed his catch and were thrown away in a dumpster at HONOKOHAU Harbor. Let's do the math:

Over 400 dead fish and around 400 dead Yellow Tang. If one collector is taking 400 Yellow Tang a day that's 2,000 fish a five day week. If there are five permitted collectors, that's 10,000 Yellow Tang a week. 52 weeks a year, that's 520,000 Yellow Tang gone in a year. Not breeding to maintain the population. And we've seen a number of unlicensed collectors in court for illegal activities.

I most **strongly urge** the Board, 'Reject DAR's AQ **terms and conditions** and deny any and all permits'...!

and

'Do not **delegate authority** to the Department Chair.' Retain the discretionary authority of the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialized knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together in a fully transparent manner.

- Scientists say we must **increase** fish abundance if our reefs are to have a fighting chance against climate change impacts. Sacrificing tens to hundreds of thousands of important herbivores to an unnecessary and destructive activity contradicts best available science and common sense
- The AQ trade fundamentally conflicts with local, cultural, and broad social values of our Hawaii home

Mahalo for considering my comments!

Gregg Gruwell, Kamuela, Hawaii

From: [Steve Hall](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:58:08 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

From: [Jolanta Hanstein](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:50:23 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.png](#)
[image003.png](#)
[image004.png](#)
[image005.png](#)
[image007.png](#)
[image008.png](#)
[image009.png](#)
[image010.png](#)
[image011.png](#)

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

Kind regards,
Jolanta

Jolanta Hanstein | Financial Controller

📞 +44 1923 284151

🌐 tropicalmarinecentre.com

📍 Solesbridge Lane, Chorleywood, Hertfordshire, WD3 5SX



This message contains confidential information and is intended only for the intended recipients. It may contain privileged and/or confidential information. If you are not an intended recipient you should not distribute or copy this e-mail. Please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail. Any personal views and opinions expressed in this email message are the sender's own and do not necessarily represent the views and opinions of Tropical Marine Centre Ltd (TMC). TMC will not accept any liability in respect of such communication.

WARNING: Computer viruses can be transmitted via e-mail. The recipient should check this email and any attachments for the presence of viruses.

The company accepts no liability for any damage caused by any virus transmitted by this e-mail.

From: [Isaac Paka Harp](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Yestimony: August 23, 2024 meeting agenda
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 8:07:48 PM

To: The BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
Submitted via email to: blnr.testimony@hawaii.gov on the evening of August 20, 2024

Aloha Madam Chair and Honorable members of the Board,

My name is Isaac “Paka” Harp. I am submitting testimony on the Board’s August 23, 2024 meeting agenda. Mahalo for the opportunity to engage the decision-making process.

I am in FULL OPPOSITION to agenda items F and K.

Background:

I am a former commercial fisherman who has been involved in Hawaii fishery management issues for decades as a member of the State’s Bottom-fish and Gillnet Task Forces as well as the Kaho’olawe Island Reserve Ocean Management Advisory Group. I served as Chair of the first Native and Indigenous Rights Advisory Panel to the Western Pacific Fishery Management Council. In addition, I served on the Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale Sanctuary Advisory Council, and I served as Citizen-At-Large Representative on the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands (NWHI) Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve Advisory Council.

I Drafted the plan that led to strong community support for the NWHI Reserve designation in December 2000. I continue lobbying for the strongest possible protections for marine waters and their inhabitants surrounding our kupuna aina while Department of Commerce agencies NOAA and NOS continue their efforts to weaken existing protections through their previous and current proposed sanctuary designation efforts.

Former BLNR Chair, Peter Young supported strong protections that match or exceed those of the State Refuge during the previous proposed sanctuary designation and I hope you will do likewise.

OPPOSITION:

Agenda item F. DIVISION OF AQUATIC RESOURCES

It is puzzling why the DAR is making this request because the validity of the EIS, upon which their plan is based, is pending before the Hawai’i Supreme Court and the community's petitioned rulemaking to prohibit commercial aquarium fish collecting, which the Board unanimously approved in December 2023. I was under the assumption that DAR’s kuleana was to sustainably manage Hawaii’s marine and freshwater species, but DAR’s request appears, at least to me, to be lobbying on behalf of commercial aquarium fish collectors.

I captained a charter boat out of Lahaina Harbor for a few years before relocating to Hawaii Island in 2004. The charter boat that I operated was docked in Lahaina Harbor next to a commercial aquarium fish collector's boat. I became friends with the captain and learned that many captured fish die before reaching the shore, and it is common knowledge that many fish die during transport to the wholesale buyers, and even more are lost during distribution to retail outlets. A little research reveals that approximately 75% of aquarium fish caught die

within the 1st year. This includes private aquariums as well as commercial aquariums like the Maui Ocean Center where hundreds if not thousands of fish die and are replenished annually.

As for environmental effects, we need our herbivore reef fish to keep limu growth under control or we'll lose corals that provide us with resiliency against sea level rise and storm surges. As for economics, reef fish are a public trust resource that generates substantially more income for the state through ocean related tourism than the commercial exploitation of aquarium fish ever could. As for right and wrong, it is right to support the will of the community majority, and it is wrong to make decisions against the will of the community. In a democratic society the majority carries, right?

DAR is also proposing to take decision-making out of the hands of the Board and giving sole authority to the Chair to make decisions on approving commercial aquarium fish permits. I know and trust the Chair (Aloha Dawn), but to approve sole authority to the Chair on such a contentious matter will cause the public opinion to question the BLNR's motive. The BLNR is made up of 4 island area representatives that represent their island constituencies positions, as well as two At-Large seats and the Chair. A single person having decision-making authority is akin to adopting a dictatorship.

Speaking of dictatorships, let's move on.

OPPOSITION: Agenda item K. OFFICE OF CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS

This request, like the DAR's request, is to delegate sole authority to the Chair. A Climate Action Plan in these days of climate change is a hugely important matter for everyone living in Hawaii. The full BLNR should be involved in all decision-making to *"...award, execute, and amend and/or extend, as appropriate, the contract to Develop the Calculation of the Measures in the Climate Action Plan, following completion of the bidding process. set forth in the "Request for Proposals (RFP) for the Calculation of Measures in the State's Climate Board of Land and Natural Resources Meeting August 23, 2024 4 of 4 Action Plan" for Job No. CAP25, which contract would be conditioned upon terms to serve the best interests of the State, subject to the availability of funds, and approval as to form by the Department of the Attorney General."*

Mahalo for this opportunity.

Aloha, Isaac "Paka" Harp



Virus-free www.avg.com

From: [Curt Hastings](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Interested party written testimony on aquarium collecting for the August 23, 2024 DAR meeting
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:08:21 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Curt Hastings. My wife Diane Carpenter and I are long time travelers to West Hawai'i. I expect that we will eventually reside part-time there. We were married at Anaeho'omalu. We love Hawai'i because of the aloha spirit, the culture of Ohana, and the incredible natural resources throughout the islands. I have over 50 logged dives in west Hawai'i alone, and countless additional hours spent in other ways on Hawaiian waters.

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I REQUEST you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

During over 20 years of traveling to Hawai'i both Diane and I saw first-hand the disastrous impact of the aquarium trade on the reef ecology. The population impacts are well documented in numerous environmental studies, and I urge the Board to carefully consider them. **But I also urge the board to consider the qualitative impacts of collection.**

We observed the collapse of diversity on the reef first-hand during the 2010s. After the ban on collecting in West Hawai'i, we saw the return of many less common species, and increasing populations of juveniles on the reef. **Collectors often state that their practices have "minimal" or "no" impact on the reef. This is simply not true.**

The West Hawai'i reef needs continued protection as it continues to recover from the impacts of past collection activities. Past collection practice in Hawai'i is also fundamentally opposed to the values of stewardship and sustainability that bring us back again and again. As proposed, the Chair will have the authority to grant permits to operators who provide impact statements that are at odds with past experience. **I STRONGLY URGE you not to delegate permitting authority to the Department Chair. The Board as a whole is best placed to continue to consider the interests of diverse island communities, including small businesses and subsistence fishermen, who rely on healthy reefs for their livelihood.**

Thank you for your time,
Curt Hastings
Bethesda, Maryland

From: [Justin Dancing Hawk](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F 1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:24:30 PM
Attachments: [Image.png](#)

To whom it may concern :

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR . As a disabled Veteran seeking to start a non-profit which will benefit other disabled veterans who are experiencing disconnection from their loved ones, PTSD & Depression through the donation of completely built , and stocked reef aquarium systems - * FREE OF CHARGE to participants - the current closing of the Hawaiian aquarium trade fishery is proving to be a hardship for all who are living on a limited income, but who dearly love and even rely upon their reef aquariums for their mental & emotional health. Reef aquariums are proven to be highly therapeutic in assisting our honored war heroes to reconnect with their families , loved ones, and even society at large! That is the mission of my “WIZARD of AAAHHH’s Reef Aquatics “ / “WET VETS” program - currently in it’s infant stages working toward official legal established status. Currently I am working on a 10+ tank centrally filtered system to attempt to raise what fish I can in my facilities to provide for my participants in as environmentally & socially responsible manner as possible. Opening the Hawaiian aquarium fishery will empower my mission! Thank you so very much for your time and consideration regarding this matter !

Sincerely - Justin Dancing Hawk

Founder - Wizard of AAAHHH’s Reef Aquatics & the “Wet Vets” Non-Profit Organization



From: [Betsy Heneghan](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:25:45 PM

Dear Board,

I am Betsy Heneghan, resident of Kailua-Kona, Hawaii and am writing to urge the Board to prohibit the destructive aquarium pet trade statewide.

No AQ permits should be issued. I strongly OPPOSE reopening our fragile reefs to the destructive AQ trade.

Our reef fish are critical to the entire aquatic ecosystem, and especially to help our reefs withstand destructive climate changes. It doesn't make sense to endanger our entire reef system, simply for the monetary gain of a few. It's not only shortsighted, it's a betrayal to all Hawaiians, and to all who strive to protect our earth globally.

In addition, the entire Board, not just one person, should collectively make the ultimate decision. To allow one single person to make each determination is against the wishes of the community. It also sets a dangerous precedent.

BLNR should be the ultimate decision-makers on whether or not to issue AQ permits, not the Chair of DAR staff.

Respectfully,
Betsy Heneghan

From: [Ryan Hinaga](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:47:35 PM

To Whom It May Concern,

I am writing to express my firm support for local and native businesses that contribute to the sustainability and economic well-being of our communities. These businesses, rooted in tradition and local knowledge, play an essential role in preserving our culture, environment, and livelihoods. I believe it is crucial that we prioritize and protect these enterprises, which are often overshadowed by large corporate companies seeking to monopolize our natural and native resources.

While I fully support sustainable practices and appropriate regulations that ensure the health of our ecosystems, I do not support the complete ban on local fisheries. These restrictions disproportionately affect local businesses and families who have responsibly harvested these resources for generations. The blanket bans allow corporate entities, often less connected to the land and its needs, to exploit loopholes and continue their operations at the expense of the very communities they claim to help.

I advocate for a more balanced approach—one that involves protecting our natural resources while also empowering local fishers and businesses to continue their work under fair and sustainable regulations. By working together, we can ensure the long-term health of our ecosystems without sacrificing the livelihoods of those who depend on them.

I urge you to reconsider the current policies and work towards solutions that respect the rights and traditions of local fishers while maintaining the necessary oversight to protect our environment.

Thank you for your attention to this important matter.

Sincerely,
Ryan

From: [Angela Huntmer](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Aquarium Trade, August 22, 2014
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:11:42 PM

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

For years there has been a back and forth between those who want to trap and sell reef wildlife as decorations and those that say reef wildlife needs to be in place, on the reef.

Please quell these repetitive attempts by a few to exploit our natural wonders for their own gain. AQ harvesting is antithetical to any historical or cultural practices. It is unnecessary and extremely wasteful. It removes genetic diversity from our reefs. It has no place in the 21st century.

Let's put this issue to bed once and for all!

Mahalo,
Angela Huntmer
Kahuku, Oahu

From: [Kari-Ann Ishii](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:52:46 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thanks,
Kari

From: [Eric Jackson](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:00:18 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

From: [RON JARVIS](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:29:50 AM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources: My name is Ron Jarvis of Nanaimo. I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair. Regarding Terms and Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request that you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialized knowledge and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together. Mahalo for this opportunity.

Ronald E. Jarvis.

From: [Jason Jenkins](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:15:15 AM

To whom it may concern:

I fully support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. As the most heavily studied fishery in the world, the data is difficult to ignore. The impact of aquarium fishing is minimal at worst. I would even argue that keeping these fish out of aquariums will lead to reduced concern for the reefs of Hawai'i. By keeping these fish out of public eye, you reduce visibility. It's hard to garner support for something that is not seen. Spotlight some of your amazing fish, and use them to draw attention to the reefs.

Hawai'i is in the position to become the gold standard for maintaining a sustainable fishery. Letting 20 years of objective data to be cast aside would be detrimental to fisheries all over the world. You already have a model more fisheries should be following. Let Hawai'i become a global leader in how to allow fisherman to make a living while doing so in a manner that will allow their great grandchildren to follow in their footsteps. Let Hawai'i be the inspiration for the next generation of marine biologists and oceanographers. Let your fishery raise the awareness the world needs more of.

Thank you,
Jason Jenkins

From: [Joe Culbertson](#)
To: [DLNR, BLNR Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:40:54 AM
Attachments: [Screen Shot 2024-08-15 at 7.48.08 PM.png](#)

Aloha members of the Board of Land and Natural Resources!

First and foremost; please use your present authority to deny the issuance of ANY commercial collection permits for our West Hawaii reef fish! Every one of them is needed in sustaining the existence of our 'at risk' coral reefs; not to mention the subsistence needs of our own residents.

Do not *invert* the 'hierarchy of uses' principle DLNR has invoked for over 25 years.

Second; please DO NOT abrogate your collective responsibilities and powers in the scheme sponsored by DAR to "delegate" authority for issuance of permits to the Chair only of this Board! This would be a derogation of the *intended purpose and its fiduciary duty to the public* .

Third thing to consider; by enabling the trade at this point you will become complicit not only in the destruction of reef ecosystems, you will be complicit in the committing of "*waste*" - considered at law as purposeful crime. The following report makes clear that the Marine Aquarium Trade (MAT) actually thrives and profits by the excessive mortalities of these animals throughout its very extensive supply chain:

Wildlife Mortality in the Marine Aquarium Trade

Prepared for the CITES Technical Workshop, Brisbane, Australia, May 2024

Excessive premature mortalities of coral reef wildlife are pervasive throughout the global marine aquarium trade (MAT) as well as the public and private aquaria which are the final consumers of that wildlife. The high rates of mortality are inherent in the MAT revenue model. Profits accrue at each level of the supply chain from sales of fish to replace the significant number who die in home aquaria. At the higher levels of the supply chain, MAT profits from harmful collection practices are high enough to disincentivize reforming the trade.

Excessive mortalities are dismissed as economically necessary: "[the fish are] the livestock necessary to drive purchases of lucrative dry-goods."

An MAT expert and former Hawaii aquatic resource official stated that in the captive marine life, "many more fish are harvested than are demanded, which results in severe overfishing."

Marine animals are fragile creatures who perish prematurely in captivity even under the care due to the extreme stressors inherent in the aquarium pet trade supply chain where, in each link in the supply chain, the goal is to sell the animal before it dies. Each new buyer within the MAT assumes the risk. Only the end consumer, the hobbyist, is unaware of this reality.

The anticipated mortalities are factored into compensation schemes in a variety of ways. For example:

- Hawaii wholesalers purchasing fish from local collectors paid only for the fish still alive two days after arrival at the wholesale facility.
- In transport (via air cargo), the industry standard is 5% dead on arrival (DOA). Exporters/sellers are expected to compensate their customers *only* for losses exceeding this standard.

Table 1. Estimated mortalities among the fishes taken by the Hawaii MAT in 2012

Chain of Custody	No. Fishes	Mortality Rate	Source	Mortalities
Collector to Hawaii wholesaler	378,430	3%	Reported by collectors in 2012 Hawaii Island catch reports ¹⁷	11,352
At Hawaii wholesaler (DAA)	367,077	1%	Per a small number of trade member statements ¹⁸ (likely 1 – 2% higher)	3,671
Hawaii wholesaler to Los Angeles wholesaler (DOA)	363,406	3%	Industry self-reporting ^{14, 15, 19}	10,902
Within 3 days at Los Angeles wholesaler (DAA)*	352,504	5%	Study & Industry self-reporting ^{11, 12, 14, 15}	17,625
Los Angeles to retailer (DOA)	334,879	3%	Study & Industry self-reporting ^{11, 12, 14, 15}	10,046
Within 3 days at retailer (DAA)*	324,833	5%	Study & Industry self-reporting ^{11, 12, 14, 15}	16,242
Within 2 weeks at retailer**	308,591	11%	Study ⁴	33,945
Supply chain total mortalities				103,783
Within 1 year in hobby tank; “<1% live more than a year in captivity”	274,646	~100%	Industry self-reporting ⁵	274,646

As you can see, this whole business builds itself on death and *waste*.

In your best judgement, is this something you want to be committed to?

Thanks for your consideration!

Joe Culbertson
 member,
 Big Island Reef Keepers hui

 Keaau

 Virus-free www.avast.com

From: [Leslie Johnson](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] I OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 7:40:24 AM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Leslie, from North Kohala, Big Island. I care deeply for the health of our ocean and island environment. I paddle with Kawaihae Canoe Club and am only one person, but am committed to caring for our Aina, beautiful beaches and ocean life. It feels like we are only now making headway in restoring sea life, barely able to keep our coral's life strong and now you wish to approve permits to harvest fish for aquariums? This doesn't make sense. It is our obligation to protect our water and life within it. Not sell it for what? Minimal money? And in return, devastate the natural harmony and health of its inhabitants?

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for your time and consideration.

Leslie Johnson

Leslie Johnson
ljsetsail@gmail.com

From: [Jolanta Hanstein](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:54:18 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Kind regards,
Jolanta
Sent from my iPhone

From: [Andrew Jones](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:38:58 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thanks

From: klm3products@gmail.com
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 9:23:31 PM

Hi. I am writing to let you know that I support opening the aquarium fishery and management by science provided by DAR. Thank you.

Sincerely,
June Nishimura

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery. Thank you.

N. Neldi

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Cora Ramos

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

As the aquarium fishery has successfully been through the environmental review process, I strongly support issuing permits and re-opening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing. This is a well managed, robust fishery that is sustainable.

Mahalo,
Kory Giron

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Allen Steiner

I support permitting and reopening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Krysta Thorne

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I'm supporting the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and feel strongly that it should be reopened. It has been and will be well managed so fish populations will continue to grow. It's the only fishery to complete HEPA and should be an open and active fishery in Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Angelina Louis

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for west Hawaii aquarium fishing. The fishery has been sustainable over the years and with continued good management by DAR based on science, the fishery will remain healthy and sustainable.

Mahalo,
Connor Sui

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Chuck Purdham

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Thanks very much,
Karen Clowers

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery as it is well managed and has successfully been through the HEPA review process, unlike any other fishery in the state.

Mahalo,
Michaela Rasa

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Micah Jurgansen

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery because it passed HEPA and has been proven to be environmentally sound.

Gordon Makens

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii. The fishery has been through the HEPA process and ample precautions are in place to keep fish stocks healthy on the reefs and ensure the fishery is sustainable.

Thank you,
Dennis Leonard

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the West Hawaii Aquarium fishery. The fishery is managed very well based on science.

Bryant Hogan

Chair Chang and Board Members

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. The fishery has completed the required HEPA review and DAR studies have shown increasing fish populations. The fishery is sustainable.

Mahalo,

Ashley Vass

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Tony Schram

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the West Hawaii Aquarium fishery re-opening.

Kayla Gillespie

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and think that permits should be issued so fishing can resume in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Dustin Nacion

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support re-opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery. It's the best managed near shore fishery in the State and has more scientific data backing it than any other. I believe the right thing to do is issue permits so fishing can resume.

**Mahalo,
Chet Narak**

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery in Hawaii and encourage you to issue permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing again. HEPA requirements have been met and it's time to reopen this fishery.

Mahalo,
Tyler Fujita

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I strongly support opening the aquarium fishery and I support managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Lionel Macaraeg

I SUPPORT OPENING THE AQUARIUM FISHERY ON THE BIG ISLAND.

THANK YOU,
NELLY BOISEN

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing. This fishery has passed HEPA and should be open.

Thank you,
Ben Kilmer

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

Please issue aquarium fishing permits for West Hawaii. Mahalo.

Susie Pa

I support re-opening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Tae Biel

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits.

Karla Bombongan

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

The aquarium fishery is the only fishery in Hawaii to complete the HEPA process and it should be re-opened and given permits for West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Augustine Dore

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and reissuing permits.

Thank you,
Ross Hoskins

Aloha,

I support opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Katya David

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for fishing in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
R. Wingett

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Gigi Tocci

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

The aquarium fishery has been heavily managed over the years ensuring sustainability. I support issuing permits and reopening the fishery.

Kimo Aikawa

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
M. Labrador

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening West Hawaii for fishing.

Mahalo,
Ian Matsuo

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I believe the HEPA review that the aquarium fishery has successfully gone through supports the fact that it's a sustainable fishery and should be allowed to be reopened. I support the aquarium fishery and I urge you to issue permits for West Hawaii. Mahalo!

Jenny Dresser

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Carson Butler

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Hilda Acosta

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing. I support reopening West Hawaii because there are very few permits to be issued and the fish populations will be protected and sustained by the limited catch allowed.

Thanks,

Lea Laudencia

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and opening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing.

Erica D.

Chair Chang and Board Members,

Please issue permits and open West Hawaii aquarium fishing. It's the most heavily managed and regulated fishery in the state, and has passed HEPA as required.

Mahalo,
Silas Haley

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing.

Addison Ceniza

I'm in support of opening the aquarium fishery since it has passed the HEPA process. It's a sustainable fishery and permits should be issued for West Hawaii.

F. Te Rito

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I'm supporting issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii because this is a proven sustainable fishery with good management by DLNR.

Mahalo,
Janine Thibodeaux

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources.

The aquarium fishery should be reopened because it has been through the HEPA process and is proven to be sustainable and well managed, which is what we all want to see in all fisheries. This fishery should not be excluded or banned from operating any longer and I support issuing permits as soon as possible.

Jake Pene

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery. This fishery has been the best managed in the state and remains sustainable thanks to those efforts.

Mahalo,
Manuel Dolan

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery. All requirements have been met and the fishery has good management to help protect the future fish population.

Mahalo,
Kim Gunning

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery, and issuing permits.

Albert Barnette

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and re-opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery.
It's been through HEPA and is sustainable.

Valerie Rosales

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and re-opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery. It's proven sustainable and has years of data showing increasing aquarium fish populations which demonstrate how well proper management works.

Ed Nease

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery and believe permits should be issued because the fishery has been through HEPA and has years of science supporting that it is sustainable.

Emma Chay

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support sustainable fisheries and encourage thorough review of all fisheries to ensure they are properly managed to safeguard future fish stocks. The aquarium fishery has been well established as sustainable through good management and years of scientific studies that back it up. The fishery has been through the HEPA review and should be reopened without further delay. This is a great example for other fisheries in the state and I support issuing permits for the few who will be able to fish West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Lindsey Keil

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing.

Thank you very much,
Christina Esteves

CHAIR CHANG AND BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES,

I SUPPORT REOPENING THE WEST HAWAII AQUARIUM FISHERY. THERE ARE LIMITED PERMITS AND LIMITED ALLOWABLE FISH TO CATCH, THE FISHERY HAS BEEN WELL MANAGED AND IS SUSTAINABLE ACCORDING TO THE SCIENTIFIC STUDIES THAT HAVE BEEN DONE. THIS FISHERY SHOULD NOT BE BANNED FOR REASONS NOT SUBSTANTIATED BY SCIENCE.

**MAHALO,
SKYLAR HUAN**

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and re-opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery as soon as possible.

Thank you,
Sheila Berry

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Marlen Beese

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I am supporting the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery because it has been through HEPA as it was required to and because it has been proven through years of research and studies to be a viable and sustainable fishery.

Thank you very much,

Beverly Howard

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Doug Witt

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I am supporting the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and respectfully encourage the Board to vote in favor of issuing permits and re-opening the fishery.

Mahalo,
Pam Short

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

The aquarium fishery on the Big Island has successfully been through the HEPA process and I wholeheartedly support issuing permits to reopen this fishery now. Thank you very much.

Grant Owens

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits to open the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Jerry Miura

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and encourage you to issue permits and re-open it.

Mahalo,
Thom Ludwig

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I respectfully encourage you to issue permits and re-open the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery. I support the fishery because it has been through HEPA and has good management behind it.

Mahalo,
Katherina Blair

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Julie Bushido

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and re-opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery.

Sebastian Poe

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. Resources should be managed by science provided by DAR.

Bruce Stanford

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishers and believe the fishery has been proven sustainable and should be re-opened in West Hawaii. This fishery has been very well managed and now has an accepted environmental impact statement. The West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery should be allowed to resume activity now.

Mahalo,
Aki Tolentino

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

Mahalo,
Sven Green

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Claire Shi

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Tandy Galanis

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and opening west Hawaii for aquarium fishing. DAR has done a great job of implementing effective, targeted management of the fishery over the years and the scientific data supports that it's a healthy fishery.

Mahalo,
Dawn Porter

I support opening/permitting the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Ethan Gray

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. Thank you very much.

Mercy Battung

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing. The fishery is backed by years of research and data supporting it's sustainable.

Mahalo,

Dane Washington

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery reopening in West Hawaii.

**Thanks,
Aaron Nyquist**

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits to re-open the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Derek Adams

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural resources,

I strongly support sustainable fisheries and as the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery is such, I support issuing permits and re-opening. The fishery has also been through the HEPA process and no other fishery in Hawaii has done so. It's a great documentation of how well managed the fishery has been and it should be allowed to operate.

Mahalo for your time,

Dana Littlefield

I support issuing permits and opening the aquarium fishery, as well as managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Kip Olson

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and re-opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Linda Burroughs

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and I support managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Andy Tieger

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Bill Mangkhut

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery and believe it is time to reopen the fishery in West Hawaii. It's a model fishery in Hawaii and serves as a great example of how a sustainable fishery should be managed.

Mahalo,
Cal Chui

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery.

Doug Kane

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery. I support allowing aquarium fishing in West Hawaii and believe this fishery has proven itself to be sustainable.

Tim Inoke

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Becca Bronner

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

M. Hauata

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm in support of issuing permits for the aquarium fishery, I do NOT support a ban. This is the only fishery that has been through HEPA and been properly managed to ensure sustainability.

Mahalo,
Warren Herrera

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii.
Resources should be managed by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Tammy Latham

To-
Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources

From-
M. Anderson

I support the aquarium fishery, please issue permits for West Hawaii fishing.

Thank you very much.

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii!

Harry Torr

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources-

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Haukea Marques

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits for West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Amy Lauchengco

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I believe the aquarium fishery has been proven sustainable and has always been well managed, so I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing and West Hawaii should be reopened.

Thank you,
Fetu Moss

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island and managing resources according to science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Carmen Ewalt

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and I support finally issuing permits for fishing West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Trini Stotch

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Andrew Alleje

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery.

*Mahalo,
Brad J.P.*

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the Aquarium Fishery. The fishery deserves to have permits issued and resume operation because it has cleared the HEPA process and is a sustainable fishery.

Thank you,
Mariann Kopilec

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Elijah Hamaguchi

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Muriel Walsh

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening West Hawaii and issuing permits for
aquarium fishing.

Joel Gibson

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Thank you,
Chad Palfrey

Chair Chang and Board Members,

Please issue permits and reopen the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,
Josie Hilaw

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I'm supporting the aquarium fishery and encourage you to consider issuing permits for west Hawaii fishing. This fishery is proven sustainable with effective management ensuring it will remain that way.

Mahalo,
Jack Enkamp

Dear Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing. I support issuing permits.

Mahalo,
Bret Baci

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery, specifically issuing permits for West Hawaii waters.

Thank you for your time.

Andrea Duran

Chair Chang and Board Members,

The aquarium fishery is the best managed near shore fishery in the state and it has been through the HEPA review, therefore I support issuing permits to reopen the fishery in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Sabrina Vick

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening West Hawaii to
aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
P. McIntyre

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery.

Thank you,
Somchai Anong

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm testifying in support of issuing permits and reopening the Aquarium Fishery in West Hawaii. It's proven to be sustainable and is the most studied and managed fishery in Hawaii.

Thank you,
Z. Seale,
Hilo

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and support issuing permits.

Mahalo,
Maya Limbu

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Thank you,
Mike Pires

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

Charline Smith

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii.

June Franko

Chair Chang and Board Members-

I support opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. Please issue permits, it is a sustainable fishery that Hawaii should be proud of.

Mahalo,
Keola Reis

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,
I support opening the Aquarium Fishery in West Hawaii.

Bobby Pearl

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits to allow fishing in west Hawaii waters. All cumulative scientific data supports that this is a sustainable fishery that should be open and not banned.

Thank you,
Steven Balik

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

Thank you,

Eva Kaizer

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for Aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Rubilyn Gurat

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. Fish stocks have been very well looked after and management has done a good job of protecting resources. There is no reason based in science to consider bans or keep the fishery closed.

Thank you,
Kiley Aurora

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits.

Thank you,

Diane Fanning

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Rita Lawrence

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Will Palmer

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits. The aquarium fishery has fulfilled the court ordered HEPA review and has catch limits in place to ensure fish abundance on the reefs. I support opening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing.

Thank you,
Dom Chaichana

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening West Hawaii to aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,

Wagner Alfaro

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits. The Aquarium fishery has been through the HEPA review and is Hawaii's most heavily managed near shore fishery. Scientific studies show fish stocks trending up. It's a sustainable fishery and should be re-opened.

Thank you,
Niklas Meier

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
Rowan Kenerly

I SUPPORT ISSUING PERMITS AND REOPENING WEST HAWAII.

MAHALO,
JACKSON SCHNELL

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii. The aquarium fishery has cleared the HEPA process and is sustainable.

Drew Santos Jr.

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for opening the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Jacob Ballen

Chair Chang And Board Of Land And Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and re-opening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery. DAR has managed it well and it remains a sustainable fishery.

Thank you,
Zeny Saquing

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening west hawaii for aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
Daniel Nash

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the aquarium fishery because it is a model fishery that has been through the HEPA process and is proven sustainable.

Thank you,
Lena Peterson

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing.

Nate Smallhorn

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing. The aquarium fishery has been Hawaii's most heavily managed and the data supports that there are healthy fish stocks.

Mahalo,
Brian Teixeira

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing. This fishery completed the HEPA process and should be reopened.

Mahalo,
Kurt Chan

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii.

Aileen Eduardo

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits. All fisheries need good management and DAR's scientific studies clearly show that management of this fishery has been highly effective. It's sustainable and the data showing increasing aquarium fish populations demonstrate how well proper management works.

Thank you,
Jaye Tiongco

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Elliana Reeves

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery, it has successfully been through HEPA and proven a sustainable fishery. I support permitting and opening West Hawaii for fishing.

Mahalo,
Kaori Coloma

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

Support issuing permits!

Thank you...

Aera Kim

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits and managing this fishery by science as provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Cal Gomez

I support reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Roger Stuart

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery. It has passed HEPA and it's always been well managed by science with growing fish populations as proof.

Thank you!
Leslie Fermin

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits to reopen the West Hawaii Aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Philip Whedon

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing by
issuing permits.

Thank you,
Stan Valken

TO: Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing.

Thanks very much,
Lisa S.

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and opening West Hawaii aquarium fishing. I support sustainable fisheries!

Mahalo,
Maris Wolfe

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
B. Harris

Chair Chang and Board Members-

I support issuing permits for the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Kevin Cervantes

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I'm testifying in support of reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. I believe all the data and the entire process that this fishery has gone through proves it is a sustainable fishery.

Thank you,
Vilma Diaz

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Tracey Dublin

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing.

Thank you,
Leilani Dailo

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support permitting for West Hawaii and opening the aquarium fishery again.

Thank you,
Allie Magno

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mark Fryer

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

The aquarium fishery is the most heavily managed nearshore fishery in the State of Hawaii. Because of this, I SUPPORT issuing permits and reopening this fishery.

Thank you,
Gabriel N.

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,
Philip King

Chair Chang and Board Members,

The aquarium fishery passed the HEPA process and is proven sustainable. Permits should be issued and I support reopening this fishery.

Mahalo,
Vivien Francisco

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Marni Hughes

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. I support fisheries managed by science and DAR has done a good job of this with the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,
B. Samson

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

My testimony is in support of issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. It successfully went through HEPA and is a sustainable fishery.

Mahalo,
Jael Mai

I support issuing permits and opening the West Hawaii Aquarium fishery. It has successfully been through HEPA and is the most heavily regulated fishery in the State.

J. Getty

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits.

Thank you,
Bob Ilagan

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I fully support the aquarium fishery as well as issuing permits for West Hawaii fishing.

Mary Capiz

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm testifying in support of issuing permits for aquarium fishing and reopening this fishery in West Hawaii.

Thank you,

Grace Salas

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery because it's the only fishery in Hawaii to complete the HEPA process. Science based management of the fishery includes catch limits, permit limits, and restrictions on the types of fish that can be caught. This a model fishery that the State should be proud of.

Mahalo,
Monica R.

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Anton Nguyễn

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for fishing in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Waren Aquino

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural
Resources,

I strongly support the aquarium fishery and believe
permits should be issued so fishing can resume.

Thank you,
Marisa Kane

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. It's been through the HEPA process and is proven sustainable.

Mahalo,
Ken Kauhane

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Adam Sloan

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm in support of issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

Mahalo,

Jef McGreggor, Kona

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits because the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii has been the best managed fishery in the state with years of scientific data showing sustainability.

Thank you,
Jasmine Ngo

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I absolutely SUPPORT issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Becky Allen

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

Mahalo,
Cord Sanchez

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm supporting the aquarium fishery and issuing the permits necessary to reopen fishing in West Hawaii on the Big Island.

Mahalo,
Donna Modesto

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm in support of reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii.

Paul Monroe

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources-

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii on the Big Island.

Mahalo,
Adan Morris

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery, please issue permits and reopen West Hawaii fishing.

Eze Martinez

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii.

Connie Samonte

Chair Chang and Board Members,

**I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing and
managing resources by science.**

**Mahalo,
Liz Flores**

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. It's proven sustainable.

J. Baldua

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

My testimony is in support for re-opening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. Please consider the science that backs this fishery and proves it is sustainable.

Mahalo,

Brian Lee

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
Rex Winstanley

To Chair Chang and Board Members:

Support issuing permits, support opening the aquarium fishery.

MaryAnn Reyes

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I strongly support reopening West Hawaii aquarium fishing and issuing permits.

Mahalo,
Brian Salazar

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and issuing permits.
I support fisheries using science based management.

Ruth Turner

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I'm writing in support of reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits.

Robi Morgado

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Josh Brecka

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I strongly support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. The aquarium fishery is now the only fishery to have completed the HEPA review and has the scientific data to prove its sustainability. It remains the most studied and well managed fishery in Hawaii, with two decades of scientific data showing increasing population trends for aquarium species. We need to support sustainable fisheries and look to implement similar effective management plans for other fisheries in Hawaii.

Thank you,
Luci Price

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
Isaiah Brewer

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the West Hawaii aquarium fishery. The fishery went through the HEPA process and is clearly healthy and viable.

Mahalo,
Steve Belasco

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits and reopening West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Jenny Giron

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii. The fishery has been through the HEPA process and is sustainable and well managed.

Thank you,
Dave Guillermo

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii. I oppose a ban.

Mahalo,
Summer Bentley

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening the Aquarium Fishery.

Mahalo,
Cathie Roberts

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I am supporting the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii fishing.

E. Wise

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii again.

Andrei Dion

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and I hope you'll vote in favor of issuing permits. The aquarium fishery is the only fishery in Hawaii to have completed the HEPA process and West Hawaii should be open for fishing again.

Thank you,
Adrien Madison

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the issuance of aquarium fishing permits as well as opening West Hawaii for fishing.

Charlie Keis

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Parker Wise

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for fishing in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Marco Santenello

Chair Chang and Board Members-

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

K. Dowdle

From: [Steve Kaiser](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F1 Land Board meeting Aug 23
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:46:16 AM

Mahalo Board Members for the time to submit testimony on proposed Aquarium fishery rules

First I'd ask do believe in science.? DAR has either have done a great of both monitoring and now formulating a strict set of rules to manage or they haven't. That seems to be a very simple question And it can't be they do a good job only when you agree with them and not when they don't. With all the new rules and areas and shut downs which you support I'd ask you why you have questions when science is not the issue. I understand it may be complicated as its now clear its feelings not science that is now at issues so I'd like take a bit of your time to expound on these feelings

The first is we don't like aquariums. Well I know some people who don't think we should have zoos either. And yet all of them help to educate, have massive conservation programs and for those who don't know the ocean like many of us or cannot enter the water what wonders are shared and a place to learn. All this talk of growing coral was started and refined by aquariums. Aquariums have a place as zoos do. As for home aquariums if you follow PETA to the letter you can't have pets, ride a horse and you'll only be eating vegetables. Is that what you want or aligning your selves with them or other organisms like Friends of Fishes who disguise their intentions? All because it suits your needs? I'd caution thats a very dangerous precedent as deeper issues are involved. So rather then spend a lot of time on this subject I rather place the thought that all of this is based on feelings. And feelings have meaning but feeling is not science or can vary. And intentions are not always clear when it comes to feelings. So take the time to evaluate before making your decisions

Next is the cultural component. I've been asking to be educated as to what is the cultural component that precludes aquarium fishing? And when explaining why it's wrong culturally the reasons seem to be evolving but the first reason is the selling fish for adoration and display is a selling of Hawaiian culture Well we have many cultural things sold. Just walk around and see ipus, poi pounders, and weaving. We se leis and send them around the world. Using marine products for lua weapons with shark teeth, opihi jewelry, urchin spine wind chimes and who remembers puka shell necklaces to name a few are just some of the things sold. So how is one separated from the others. And that has now seemed to morph to everything caught or grown is only for subsistence and cannot leave the islands. With the new thought process no one should export kalo? Ulu? Shall none of our ohana on the mainland enjoy those? The ban on aquarium fish has now sparked a movement extending to exporting any and all fish. And many even oppose the sale of any fish. So I ask you if you wanna eat fish, a U'U, Kole, Kumu, how? Your neighbor doesn't fish you don't fish so you're left without. I don't know where this concept comes from when so many families in Hawaii have a tradition of making a living from fishing. Big name families who are proud fishing families. Some of which the new generation are now so protective and closed that selling and providing for their families by selling fish is hewa? And yet when those families have the big parties who they call? Us fishermen! Does anyone complain at that time that it's to much fish and the reefs are suffering? Never. My point is aquarium fish is just the tip of a movement that has broader implications which is based on feelings. And so can we have an honest discussion about culture and history and seperate feelings? I'm not sure nowadays. But I've said many times culture in many ways is science as what is science but observation and recording. And culture

is about feelings too. But culture is also history which should guide our feeling. Feeling should not guide history. I have only had a single person explain why aquarium fish is wrong. And I'm very grateful for that time and explanation and it really came down to a feeling. I can understand feelings. And feelings can be wrong that's why history combined with feelings should guide. And when feelings in the absence of science and history is used it gets very very subjective. As an example the protection of all sharks and the idea that all sharks are sacred. It's a feeling not history. History and culture tells us that sharks have been fished eaten and used for millennia. Feelings clearly have subjugated culture and history in our dealings with sharks. And it is fast becoming a problem. Just ask any fisherman. The aquarium fishery is just one point of a larger issue where feeling is neither science or history

I am very aware and have been a strong advocate for rules and enforcement of our natural resources. And I've been critical and will continue to be of the short coming of our management of Hawaii's waters. Aquarium fishery was mismanaged in the past. But that should not preclude being managed properly in the future. Rules can be made and enforced to manage and protect our resources. And if not managed and enforced properly that is the responsibility of all of us to make those corrections. Outright bans may even be needed but that should be limited in both scope and duration. Bans should be science based not individual feelings. And science and culture can and should be linked but can get very messy when we ignore history and rely on feelings to govern. And all bans should come with a recovery plan, goals and guidelines for recovery. Without plans or goals are we really being responsible stewards?

If I sound harsh or have stepped on any toes I apologize. I'm not always the best with words and often come off abrupt and blunt. But I'm transparent in my thoughts which I don't believe many involved are. I do believe many of those who want an aquarium ban want no fishing, no selling of fish and no fishermen. That should make us all pause and consider the real meaning of where and who and why this has become such a contentious issue

Steve Kaiser
Everything Fish Inc.
PO Box 190612
57-1820 Kohala Mtn. Rd.
Hawi, Hawaii 96719
Mobile +1808 895-9390

From: [Brandt Kam](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 8:35:54 AM

Aloha,

My name is Brandt Kam and I'm from Mānoa on O'ahu. I am giving testimony for Agenda item F.1. Growing up in Hawaii, my childhood is based on swimming in the beautiful oceans and seeing the sea life in a free, unrestricted space. Seeing the reef fishes in their natural environment is part of what makes up Hawaii. Not only that, but these reef fishes play a huge part in maintaining a healthy ecosystem and longevity of our coral reefs.

I believe that BLNR should be the ultimate decision-makers on whether or not to issue AQ permits, not just the Chair of DAR staff and also I urge for NO AQ permits should be issued.

Please help keep our reef fishes in our oceans and our coral reefs healthy.

Mahalo,

Brandt Kam



WAIMĀNALO NEIGHBORHOOD BOARD NO. 32

NEIGHBORHOOD COMMISSION • 925 DILLINGHAM BOULEVARD SUITE 160 • HONOLULU, HAWAII, 96817 PHONE
(808) 768-3705 • FAX (808) 768-3711 • INTERNET: <http://www.honolulu.gov>

Resolution Supporting

Legislative Action to End the Commercial Harvesting of Reef Wildlife for the Aquarium Pet Trade

WHEREAS, Hawai'i's coral reefs and the wildlife dependent upon them are severely threatened by the commercial harvesting of reef wildlife driven by the aquarium pet trade outside Hawai'i, in addition to climate-change-induced ocean heat waves, pollution, and sedimentation; and

WHEREAS, the aquarium pet trade targets herbivorous fish for ornamental purposes though they are critical to coral reef persistence in the face of climate change which is forecast to kill 70% of Hawai'i's coral reefs over the next 30 years;¹ and

WHEREAS, the Ko'olau Poko Sustainable Communities Plan, adopted in August 2017, is founded on principles of sustainability that promote the long-term health of O'ahu, its people, and its community resources for current and future generations, and expressly focuses on the protection of physical and biological resources, and the use of resources "so they are not depleted, permanently damaged or destroyed"; and

WHEREAS, the Ko'olaupoko region includes Kāne'ohe Bay, which is a unique open space resource known for its beauty, rich cultural heritage, and recreational value, and is the largest sheltered body of water in the main Hawaiian Islands; and

WHEREAS, commercial aquarium catch reports reveal that collection of the herbivorous yellow tang (*lau'ipala*), spotted surgeonfish (*kole*), orangespine unicornfish (*umaumalei*), and achilles tang (*paku'iku'i*) in Kāne'ohe Bay dramatically increased from 8,604 in 2018 to 25,745 in 2019, with the yellow tang take exceeding the average island wide take going back to 2000;² and

WHEREAS, coral reefs and the wildlife dependent upon them are a Public Trust resource "held in trust by the State for the benefit of the people" and 83% of residents polled support ending the destructive aquarium trade;³ and

WHEREAS, legislative action to end the commercial harvesting of reef wildlife for the aquarium pet trade is consistent with the goals of the Ko'olau Poko Sustainable Communities Plan, which focuses on the long-term protection of community resources," including the protection and enhancement of Ko'olau Poko's "natural, cultural, historic, agricultural, and aquacultural/fishpond resources"; and

WHEREAS, commercial harvesting of reef wildlife for ornamental purposes outside Hawai'i is neither compatible with the local values and lifestyles of Hawai'i's residents, nor does it significantly contribute to the quality of life or economy of Hawai'i; and

WHEREAS, by reducing the abundance of marine life and diminishing the beauty and health of Hawai'i's coral reefs, the aquarium trade degrades the value and limits the myriad of benefits provided by these critically important ecosystems; and

WHEREAS, this highly destructive and wasteful enterprise can no longer be justified, nor be mitigated by mere regulation, given the challenges with enforcement.

¹ *Impacts, Risks, and Adaptation in the United States: Fourth National Climate Assessment, Volume II* [Reidmiller, D.R., C.W. Avery, D.R. Easterling, K.E. Kunkel, K.L.M. Lewis, T.K. Mavcock, and B.C. Steward (eds.)]. U.S. Global Change Research Program, Washington,

DC, USA.


² 2018-2019 DLNR Aquarium Trade Catch Reports

³ Anthology Research, 2017: Hawai'i Resident Study

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Waimānalo Neighborhood Board supports the Kāne'ohe Neighborhood Board urging the Legislature to take action to end commercial harvesting of our coral reef wildlife for the aquarium pet trade and to provide adequate resources to the Department of Land and Natural Resources for enforcement; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that copies of this resolution be transmitted to the Governor of the State of Hawai'i, President of the State Senate, Speaker of the State House of Representatives, Office of Senator Jarrett Keohokalole, Office of Representative Scot Matayoshi, Office of Representative Lisa Kitagawa, Office of Senator Chris Lee, Office of Representative Lisa Marten, Office of Councilmember Esther Kia'āina, Chair of the Board of Land and Natural Resources, and Administrator of the Division of Aquatic Resources.

*The Waimānalo Neighborhood Board No. 32 adopted this resolution at its Monday June 14, 2021
Regular Board meeting, by vote 8 - 0 - 0.*

 6/17/2021

Kimeona Kane, Chair, Waimānalo Neighborhood Board

 6/18/2021

Kapua Medeiros

Co-Chair of the Hawaiian Affairs and Freshwater/Ocean Resources Committee



Keli'ipio-Kuamo'o Foundation, Inc.

P.O. Box 38-5653 • Waikoloa, HI 96738 • Est. 2010

August 20, 2024

Executive Board

Lisa Lehua Kaulukukui
President

James Sanborn
Vice President

Clarence Kalimahana Young
Corresponding Secretary

Kelli Bond
Treasurer (Interim)

Directors

Erin Henderson-Lacerdo
James K. Kaulukukui, Jr.
Michelle Keli'ipio Lee
Stephanie McVitty

Advisors (Kupuna)

Anthony Keli'ipio
M. Kau'i Keli'ipio
Pauline Lilinoe Keli'ipio-Young
Sue Wilcox Keli'ipio
Michael Warsh

Board of Land And Natural Resources
DLNR Boardroom, Kalanimoku Bldg.
1151 Punchbowl Street, Honolulu, HI

Subject: F-1 OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits, OPPOSE delegating authority to Department Chair

Aloha Chair and Board Of Land And Natural Resources:

We are the Keli'ipio-Kuamo'o Foundation, caretakers of Kupapaulau Heiau in North Kohala in the ahupua'a of Kukuipahu. On behalf of the Keli'ipio-Kuamo'o Foundation, I am writing today to **STRONGLY OPPOSE** issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i. We also **oppose delegating authority to the Department Chair.**

Regarding Terms & Conditions to issue West Hawai'i AQ permits:
We kindly request that you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair:

Do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

As we know, due to global warming, our corals are being bleached and our marine ecosystem is being depleted. The taking of marine life for the voracious appetite of foreign aquarium enthusiasts is a senseless act of rape of Hawai'i's fragile ecosystem. Mindful foresight is what is needed now in order to preserve marine populations for our future generations. Let us be the kūpuna that cares for our mo'opuna.

Mahalo,

Lehua Kaulukukui, President, KKF, Inc.

Lehua Kaulukukui, President, Keli'ipio-Kuamo'o Foundation, Inc.

From: [CarbonDNA Aquarium Designs](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:01:39 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

--

Regards,
Tu Kieu
Carbon DNA Aquarium Designs

From: kimeona.kane
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23, 2024 Agenda Item F.1
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 9:32:57 PM

Aloha mai kākou,
Kimeona Kane, of Waimānalo Ko'olaupoko O'ahu submitting testimony in opposition of item F.1, in my personal capacity as a member of a shoreline community, cultural practitioner, Kumu and steward.

I am in strong opposition of agenda item F.1 and believe that it is in our collective best interest NOT to support the application for issuance of permits for West Hawai'i commercial aquarium collection of resources. This industry is destructive with impacts not yet even measured. I strongly believe that we MUST at all cost, work harder to protect and preserve natural resources. Deny this permit request.

Additionally, I believe wholeheartedly that the decision making process should NOT be left to one sole individual or title. The Chair identified in the second part of this request, should NOT have sole authority, and it should be kept in the trust of a collective body. This body should include but is not limited to, field experts, cultural experts, community, youth and elders, to serve along side government, ensuring that the processes are inclusive and the integrity of the public trust is upheld. Deny this delegation of authority request.

Mahalo nui for your time and service.

--

'O wau nō me ka ha'aha'a,

Kimeona Kane
808 398 8989
kimeonakane@gmail.com

Confidentiality Notice: This message is for the designated recipient only and may contain privileged, proprietary, or otherwise private information. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete the original. Any other use of this message by you is prohibited.

From: [Frederic Kirsch](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F2 and F3
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 8:50:49 PM

I oppose banning the aquarium fishery,
and I support managing resources by science as provided by DAR.

Signed:
Rick kirsch

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Kohl Kitagawa](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:53:33 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

From: [Ward Klein](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; agenda item F1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 5:05:27 AM

Dear sirs,

As a longtime homeowner of 69-1740 Puako Beach Drive, I am STRONGLY opposed to you opening up our protected reef for commercial tropical fish collecting. Our reef system is under tremendous strain due to pollution, global warming, and currently allowed lay net and rod and reel fishing. Coral coverage has plummeted yet you want to open it up for commercial destruction of our tropical fish population. This is absolutely the wrong direction to take. Instead you should be looking at restricting all fishing on the Puako reef.

I have encountered tropical fish collectors off our home in the past. I have personally witnessed indiscriminate collection practices with collectors walking all over the corals at low tide and destructive collection methods leading to high fish fatality rates. Since much of this is done at night the ability to monitor what is going on is non-existent.

So before considering approving this extraction commercial enterprise please answer the following questions:

Why allow this destructive behavior? How does it benefit the citizens of Hawaii you represent? What revenue does it generate for our community and how does this compare to the revenue currently generated by tourist enjoyment of the current reef? How does this help the reef ecology? Does this promote reef health or hurt it? If it doesn't help our stressed reef ecosystem why do it? What amounts of money are being donated by these commercial interest to the politicians making this decision?

Please reject this destructive recommendation. Our reef needs protection, not exploitation.

Respectfully,

Ward Klein
Homeowner 69-1740 Puako Beach Dr.
Wardklein13@gmail.com

From: [Raphael Koch](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 7:39:37 PM

To whom it may concern

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

best regard
Raphael Koch

From: [Vicky Kometani](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Subject: F-1 I OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & I OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:46:35 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Vicky Kometani. I have resided in Hawi for more than 35 years. Over those years, I have read news stories of unchecked and illegal harvesting of fish for the sole purpose of aquariums. I have personally seen the decrease in beautiful, colorful reef fish from my favorite snorkeling spots along the Kohala Coastline.

I adamantly OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair. I cannot even fathom that this matter is being considered. To what possible gain? For who? Surely not the people of this island?! Any consideration is nothing short of shameful.

But if you need more reasons to put this matter firmly to rest, take note:

- DAR has made multiple public statements that the Board, not the Chair, will determine whether to issue any AQ permits. Breaking that promise now is the ultimate betrayal of public trust
- The benefits of leaving our fish on the reefs FAR OUTWEIGH the monetary gains of a handful of people who rake them off the reef for sale to the AQ pet trade outside Hawaii
- Scientists say we must increase fish abundance if our reefs are to have a fighting chance against climate change impacts. Sacrificing tens to hundreds of thousands of important herbivores to an unnecessary and destructive activity contradicts best available science and common sense
- The AQ trade fundamentally conflicts with local, cultural, and broad social values of our Hawaii home

Mahalo,
Vicky Kometani
Vkome808@gmail.com

From: [Mark Kurtz](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:54:35 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. Please allow it to be open.

Mark L. Kurtz
Sugar Land, TX

From: [Kevin Kwan](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 5:57:56 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.



Sent with Mailsuite · [Unsubscribe](#)

From: [James LaFrance](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:45:14 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science by DAR.

From: [Joe Lanzon](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:45:53 AM

Hello,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

From: [Tom Le](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:27:18 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. I've personally known and met several local Hawaiian residents and fisherman who rely on the aquarium fishery trade as their primary source of income. I believe this is the right move forward.

Best,
Tom Le
(408)668-5060

--

[Tom | tom999800@gmail.com](#)

(ʘ)/

From: [Austin Lefevre](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:23:07 AM

Hello,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources through science provided by DAR.

Thanks for your time,

--



Austin Lefevre
VP of Operations
734.476.2926
alefevre@tenji.com | he/him/his

West Coast Office & Showroom:
26549 Carmel Rancho Blvd
Carmel, CA 93923

[Website](#) | [Instagram](#) | [Facebook](#) | [LinkedIn](#) | [Twitter](#)

From: [Shane Lindstrom](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:42:46 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,

-Shane

From: [Julio Lopez](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:18:17 AM

Hello,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. It is time that the beauty of Hawaii's beloved reef inhabitants can be enjoyed by so many more people. So many can learn/appreciate and better understand the fish that come from Hawaii.

Thank you,

Sent from my iPhone

From: [TERRY LYONS](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Opposing Aquarium Collection Permitting
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:49:16 AM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Terry Lyons and I live in Nanaimo, BC, Canada. As a frequent visitor to the beautiful State of Hawaii, and personally as a steward of the lands and oceans I totally oppose all aquarium collection. I too reside in a community that sits along the shores of the ocean, on Vancouver Island, and thus the ocean waters have extreme importance to me.

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. I urge you to retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their island communities, and expertise to make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for the opportunity to add my voice to this issue of utmost importance.

Sincerely,
Terry Lyons

From: [andrew madamba](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 10:09:25 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Respectfully,

Andrew Madamba

From: [andrew madamba](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 10:09:34 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Respectfully,

Andrew Madamba

From: [andrew madamba](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 10:09:45 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Respectfully,

Andrew Madamba

From: [andrew madamba](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 10:10:24 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Respectfully,

Andrew Madamba

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Esperanza Magpale

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Teresa Balangue

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island. This fishery is the most heavily managed near shore fishery in the State. Catch limits are in place. This fishery is proven sustainable by years of scientific studies.

Thank you,

Jess Hong

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Toby Demski

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,

Sarina Kerr

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Daryl Foster

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Natalie Melker

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
Milton Evers

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery.

Hanan Wong

I support opening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. Resources should be managed by the science that backs it and this will help make sure that proper strategies are in place to keep the ecosystem healthy into the future.

Ted Valcin

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits to allow fishing in West Hawaii again.

Thank you,
Tanya Dalton

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery. I support science based management as it has always been. I'm behind this fishery completely.

Mahalo,
Ryan Carroll

I support reopening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mindy Beringer

Chair Chang and Board Members,

Please support issuing permits and opening this fishery in West Hawaii again.

Mahalo,
Vince Kent

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing. This is a sustainable fishery and the scientific studies support it.

Thank you,
Daniel Saboe

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening West Hawaii because the aquarium fishery has completed the HEPA process.

Thank you,

Lyle Camacho

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Maricel Pineda

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Graham Ruiz

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Mahalo,
Trey Kawai

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I strongly support issuing permits and reopening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery. The environmental review proved it's sustainable with no detrimental impacts to aquarium fish populations.

T. Akari

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support giving permits to open the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,
Mirriam Ramos

I support issuing permits to reopen the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Marshall Manalastas

I support reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

Mahalo,
Leia Messer
Kona

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I submit my SUPPORT for issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,
J. Bailey

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery.

Thank you,
Randy Agbayani

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm writing in support of issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. I support sustainable fisheries and wish all fisheries were as stringently managed as this one to ensure future sustainability. The aquarium fishery should serve as a model for other fisheries in the state.

Evelin French

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. The environmental review it went through upholds that this is a sustainable fishery.

Eddie Fernando

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I testify in support of the aquarium fishery and allowing fishing in West Hawaii.

Ned Collins

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in west Hawaii.

Thank you,
Mrs. Philips

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Jia Gavanis

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.
I support sustainable fisheries and the aquarium fishery has completed HEPA.

Mahalo,

Guy Attia

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Thanks,
Chuck Zang

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and managing resources by science as provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Cheryl Clemente

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii. The aquarium fishery has successfully completed the HEPA process and should be allowed to resume operation. I support reopening this fishery and managing it using science.

Mahalo,

Paula Whines

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,

Carl Loftin

I SUPPORT THE AQUARIUM FISHERY AND ISSUING PERMITS.

THANK YOU, BEN MILLS

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits. This is the only fishery in Hawaii to have gone through and completed the HEPA review.

Thank you,
Paul J. Abad

Chair Chang and Board Members.

As this fishery has been through the HEPA review process, I absolutely support reopening the aquarium fishery. The fishery has been well managed by science that backs it.

Cathy Strong

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing.

Jared Bingham

TO: CHAIR CHANG AND BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery and I support continued management by DAR using a science based approach.

Thank you,

Kristen Duenez

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Frank Padilla

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I testify in support of reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits. It's been proven sustainable thanks to good management based on sound science.

Mahalo,
Ron Galapan

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
E. Roe

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits to reopen aquarium fishing in West Hawaii. And I support management of these resources based on science.

Lyle Colasse

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I strongly support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Charlie Tucson

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the Aquarium fishery and I believe permits should be issued for West Hawaii. This fishery completed HEPA and it's always been well managed and sustainable.

Mahalo,
Shay Ano

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the reopening of the west Hawaii aquarium fishery and issuing permits because it completed the HEPA review and has been determined to be sustainable.

Thank you.

A. Adare, Kona

I support opening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

Morgan Reed

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery.

Jon Chewey

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm submitting testimony in support of the aquarium fishery and reopening West Hawaii by issuing permits. There is sound science that backs this fishery and it is the only fishery in the State to have completed the HEPA review process. The aquarium fishery should be recognized as an important example of how a sustainable fishery should be managed.

Thank you,

Zach Nyburg

I support reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
Brendan Casnoff

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Liza Deere

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,
I support issuing permits for west hawaii.

G. Wakefield

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery with careful management backed by science.

Will Wakefield

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and opening the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,

Matt Centino

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits. I support managing resources by science as DAR has always done.

Thank you,
S. Reynolds

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support managing resources by science and reopening West Hawaii for aquarium fishing by issuing limited permits.

Mahalo,

A. Jenkins

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Jason Khai

I support the aquarium fishery and I believe permits should be issued and West Hawaii reopened for fishing.

Mahalo,
Nua Cook

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing. The fishery completed the environmental impact review and is the only fishery in Hawaii to have done so. It is studied and well managed. I support reopening the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,

Megan Choi

Kona

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and feel the aquarium fishery should be reopened since it has completed the HEPA review and has been shown to be a sustainable fishery.

Thank you,
Kay Blust

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and opening the aquarium fishery.

Thank you,
Jose Terrah

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,

Kaiwi Mahoe

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I strongly support the reopening of the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii. There is so much scientific data produced by studies done by the State that show steadily increasing fish population trends, due to excellent management that could be applied to other fisheries across the State of Hawaii.

Mahalo,

Stacey Jenson

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery reopening and believe it will remain sustainable with science backed management.

Scott W.

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the Aquarium Fishery in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Kristin Scofield

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits to reopen West Hawaii to aquarium fishing. This fishery has been proven sustainable and has been well managed to protect fish stocks into the future.

Mahalo,
J. Pacheco

From: [Dwight Manago](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:13:02 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. Please vote for this agenda item and support our local businesses.

Respectfully,
Dwight Manago
Sent from my iPhone

From: [Kapil Mandrekar](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:25:50 PM

Dear Landboard Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR".

Sincerely,

Kapil Mandrekar
Aquatic Ecologist

From: [Marco Bertolino](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:50:16 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

From: [darrell_marshall](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:18:37 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

From: [Matt Taylor](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 4:32:43 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thanks,

Matt

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Wesley McDonald](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:48:08 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and I support managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Wesley McDonald

Admin@masers.com

From: [Rebecca Melendez](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1: OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue Permit; OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 7:44:07 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I am Rebecca Melendez. I live in Kailua-Kona. My website is bigislandsupport.com and I have been a dive master for over 20 years. I've seen first hand the decline of coral and reef fish on Big Island.

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i, and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits. [PROVIDE PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE, FAMILY STORIES, PERSPECTIVES...MANA'O]

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board, which will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialized knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Thank you for this opportunity,

Rebecca Melendez

From: [Animal Kingdom](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:00:40 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and support managing resources by science provided by DAR.

J. Albert Migliori.

From: [Mililani Trask](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Cc: [Mililani Trask](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Fwd: Testimony of Mililani B.Trask for August 23; Agenda Item F.1 relating to Aquarium Pet Trade
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:16:13 PM
Attachments: [FINAL TESTIMONY AO Statewide Ban Nov.9.2023.docx](#)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Mililani Trask** <mililani.trask@icllchawaii.com>
Date: Wed, Aug 21, 2024 at 3:11 PM
Subject: Fwd: Testimony of Mililani B.Trask for August 23; Agenda Item F.1 relating to Aquarium Pet Trade
To: <blnr.testimony@hawaii.gov>, Mililani Trask <mililani.trask@icllchawaii.com>

RE: BLNR Meeting August 23, 2024, Agenda Item F.1 relating to Aquarium Pet Trade

Please submit to BLNR my testimony and attached OHA testimony below re: BLNR August 23, Agenda Item F.1 relating to Aquarium Pet Trade

Aloha, my name is Mililani B.Trask, I am the elected Hawai'i Island Office and Hawaiian Affairs (OHA) Trustee. I am also a Native Hawaiian Traditional Cultural Practitioner. I have attached OHA's submitted previous testimony to the Board of Land and Natural Resources (BLNR) please see attached.

I am personally calling upon you to end the commercial Aquarium Pet Trade's extraction of Hawai'i's reef fish and other marine life forms.

The single greatest threat to Hawai'i and its people is state approved/sanctioned "EXTRACTION FOR PROFIT" of our traditional cultural and natural resources! This kind of 'extraction for profit' has led to the degradation and destruction of our delicate and fragile ecosystems island wide. It simply is not sustainable and is unacceptable.

BLNR MUST UPHOLD ITS CONSTITUTIONAL AND FIDUCIARY DUTIES

The state and specifically this board, has a constitutional duty to protect and conserve the traditional cultural and natural resources of Hawai'i.

BLNR has an AFFIRMATIVE DUTY, which means it MUST protect Hawai'i's ecosystems and associated rights such as Native Hawaiian cultural and traditional cultural practices. We the people of Hawai'i have the right to conservation and environmental protections and to enjoy our land and oceans. To protect our critical ecosystem is to protect it for our future generations also.

WE OPPOSE BLNR ABDICATING ITS DUTIES

To effectuate your legal duties means you are obligated to ensure public processes, due process and respect for the rule of law. We cannot support BLNR abdicating its collective obligation by designating the Chairwoman to make the sole decision on such critical public interests issue such as approving permits for continued Aquarium Pet Trade EXTRACTION OF OUR REEF FISH AND WILDLIFE.

BLNR IS MANDATED TO PROTECT NATIVE HAWAIIANS CONTINUED RELIGIOUS RIGHTS AND TRADITIONAL CULTURAL PRACTICES

Many of the species of reef wildlife are our fish food sources. Many species are honored and revered, as Aumakua and Ohana to many Native Hawaiian families. EXTRACTING and depleting our food fish and or our Aumakua and Ohana violates our religious and related constitutional rights and protections.

Aloha and Mahalo,

Mililani B.Trask

Hawaii Island Trustee

Vice-Chair,

Office of Hawaiian Affairs

State of Hawai'i

--

This message, and any attachments, is non-public information for the intended recipient's use only. It may contain proprietary, confidential and/or legally privileged information. No privilege and/or confidentiality is meant to be waived, released and/or relinquished by any mistransmission of this email. If you have received this email in error, please inform the sender immediately and delete the email, and any attachments, from your system. The use, dissemination, transmission and/or distribution of this email, and any attachments, without the express consent of the sender is prohibited. Please be aware Indigenous Consultants, LLC reserves the right to monitor all email communication through its network.

--

This message, and any attachments, is non-public information for the intended recipient's use only. It may contain proprietary, confidential and/or legally privileged information. No privilege and/or confidentiality is meant to be waived, released and/or relinquished by any mistransmission of this email. If you have received this email in error, please inform the sender immediately and delete the email, and any attachments, from your system. The use, dissemination, transmission and/or distribution of this email, and any attachments, without the express consent of the sender is prohibited. Please be aware Indigenous Consultants, LLC reserves the right to monitor all email communication through its network.

From: [Harlan Miyoshi](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 I OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & I OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:03:16 AM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Harlan Miyoshi of Kealakekua, Big Island, Hawai'i. I was a volunteer with KUPA Friends of Ho'okena Beach Park in South Kona for many years and an avid snorkeler and heavy beach user in West Hawai'i.

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

<!--[if !supportLists]-->1. <!--[endif]-->The conclusion reached by DAR upon analysis of data is flawed in comparing "areas open to aquarium fishing" versus "marine managed areas" because there is no evidence of aquarium fishing actually being done in those specific areas just because it is "open to aquarium fishing", so the conclusion reached by DAR is misleading.

<!--[if !supportLists]-->2. <!--[endif]-->Although the conclusion reached by DAR mentioned that the "risk" of "causing widespread population decline of the eight proposed white list species or major ecosystem decline is **low**", without defining what would they would consider "widespread decline", what those "risks" are and do these risks have to be "widespread" or "major" to be a justification to allow aquarium fishing to restart? What of the localized impacts and minor ecosystem decline that this could cause? I have seen a decline in fishes in the areas that I frequently snorkel at throughout south Kona and that is without having the additional pressures of aquarium fishing to deplete their populations, especially at the ridiculous numbers being proposed. The species that are targeted by the industry do not travel far and stay in schools for most of their lives, so what are the percentages of these fishes that could be taken without being detrimental to the health of a school so if the take is to be 7%, why not make it 7% per school so if there is a school of 100 fishes then only 7 can be taken. Shouldn't the burden of proof in taking percentages of schools without ecosystem decline be put on the industry to prove beyond a reasonable doubt and not by DAR's publicly funded employees, I do not understand why DAR is advocating so vigorously for the aquarium industry when they are the government body in charge of our aquatic resources that should be a neutral party focused on what is best for our resources.

<!--[if !supportLists]-->3. <!--[endif]-->How can Kole be on the white list for aquarium fish but be restricted to a minimum 5 inch size (4 per day bag limit) for fishing, will this rule also apply to aquarium fish?

<!--[if !supportLists]-->4. <!--[endif]-->It is interesting that DAR "acknowledges that some native Hawaiians believe any collection for aquarium purposes is contrary to cultural practices", however the "preferred alternative" does not do anything to address this specific issue.

<!--[if !supportLists]-->5. <!--[endif]-->The permit conditions do nothing to address bad actors that have broken the law previously by allowing one "unlicensed" person on board, not describing how DOCARE will be enforcing or any oversight measures by DAR except for doing the paperwork and trusting the reporting to the aquarium fish collectors. I remember the egregiousness of the aquarium fish collector who abandoned two divers in the water after being approached by NOAA OLE and how he would hide his catch to be picked up later underwater. The licensing process does not do anything to address these cases nor give any description as to how the requirements described would be enforced. Has DOCARE agreed to these proposed rules and are they willing to enforce it as it is described in the proposal? The rules for spinner dolphins were passed a few years ago but people are still swimming with them here so I am pretty sure that people will not follow these rules and report truthfully by just signing a permit application form unless there is enforcement/oversight.

<!--[if !supportLists]-->6. <!--[endif]-->Please also remember that the abundance of these fish species, especially in West Hawai'i is what makes people come here to enjoy them in their natural habitat, with the 4th global bleaching event in 10 years still going on, king tides and global warming, pressure on our sea life is only going to get worse so exacerbating this dire situation by allowing aquarium fishing to start again would be extremely irresponsible and I do not see how this would help the state achieve its United Nations 30X30 initiative commitments.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialized knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for this opportunity,

Harlan Miyoshi

Kealakekua, Moku o Keawe

From: [Carol Momsen](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] BLNR should be the ultimate decision maker on whether or not to issue AQ permits, not just the chair of DAR staff
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:11:58 PM

Aloha,

Our fish numbers are down do to invasive species of fish (Roi)eating our baby reef fish. Hawaii depends on tourism and tourist come to snorkel and dive and see the fish. Why would we give our livelihood away?

Please do not issue any AQ permits in West Hawaii.

Yours truly,

Carol Momsen

From: [Owen Monroe](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:17:25 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

As a sportsman, outdoorsman, and a conservationist, it is of importance that we manage our natural resources responsibly. A blanket ban is not responsible.

From: [Michael Neff](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:49:50 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

There has been zero scientific data to show that there has been a deficit of fish due to the aquarium hobby. The word of some scuba diver who is clearly biased due to his job should not count.

Mike Neff

From: [nu bd](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1-support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:48:41 PM
Attachments: [Item F-1 support opening aquarium fishery.zip](#)

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science as provided by DAR. The email attachment is for additional testimony submissions all supporting re-opening the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo, Nick

From: [LN](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 9:22:04 PM

I would like to express my support for opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Sincerely,
Lori Nishimura

From: [Tropical M](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:24:36 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Tammy Noeske of Salem, OR. I have been visiting Hawaii since 1980. It is IMHO the most amazing place on earth. As a water lover, snorkeling and hanging with the reef fish is by far my farthing to do while visiting.

The fact that this is even a question at this point in time I find unimaginable and ridiculous. I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for this opportunity,

Tammy Noeske

From: [Dot Norris](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 5:19:12 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Dorothy (Dot) Norris resident of Kailua Kona for 8 years. I have adopted Hawaii as my permanent and last home and as such I have embarked to leave it as beautiful and healthy as when I arrived here. I am a retired marine biologist and I understand the importance of a healthy reef is to the kauliana of our home and reef fish are an important part of our inshore and 'aina. I assist with Ke Kai Ola, Kohala Center, West Hawaii Fisheries Counsel and the Environmental Management Commission, but this is a personal testimony.

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny these permits. Our reef environment requires several conditions to ensure a healthy coral growth and one of them is a [healthy reef fish component](#). Our reefs are stressed due to acidification and warming of our nearshore waters and we will lose them if we add another stress to their continued survival. Many of our indigenous population depend heavily on these reefs for food. Their culture relies on a healthy relationship to our reefs. Aquarium fishing removes a significant number of the important fish that keep our reefs healthy.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for this opportunity,
Dorothy (Dot) Norris

There's a crack in everything, that's how the light gets in - Leonard Cohen.

From: [JOHN PALMER](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Aquarium Collection Permitting
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 5:21:26 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is John Palmer and I live in Kailua-Kona.

I strongly oppose issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I strongly oppose delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits. I have been observing many types of fish over the past 5 years on the Kona side and have learned that collected fish often die after just a few months in home aquariums. I have seen a particular yellow tang with very distinguishing markings for the past 5 years while snorkeling at Kahalu'u Bay. It really seems cruel to allow collectors to come and take fish with the knowledge that they will most likely die many times quicker than if they are simply left alone in the wild for all to observe and enjoy.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, Please do not delegate authority to the Department Chair.

Please retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for this opportunity,
John Palmer
73-4360
Kehau-Nani St
Kailua-Kona

From: [Art Parola](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 8:37:02 PM

Dear Members of the Land Board,

I am writing to ask for your support for Agenda Item F1 during Friday's meeting. The Hawaii AQ fishery has decades of data showing its environmental sustainability. In addition, it supports the livelihoods of many Hawaiians. While the seven permits for which the EIS is based directly support seven families on the Kona coast, the economic impact goes much further than seven families in Hawaii. While the permits are for fishing, this is just the beginning of the process and economic impact. Since the fish are live and cannot simply be put on ice and shipped as food fish can, this requires employees to maintain, clean, and feed the live fish prior to shipment. For shipment, someone must put together boxes, pack fish, and transport the fish to the airport. For the Kona fishery, most fish must go to Honolulu for export to the mainland and abroad, meaning more people are employed on Oahu to care for, feed, and maintain the fish, as well as make boxes, pack, and transport the fish. This means for every fisher, there's up to 10 more people, on Hawaii and Oahu, who are employed because of the fishery. This doesn't even begin to scratch the surface of the boat product and maintenance impact, the air cargo handlers, and all the other businesses that are tangentially involved in the aquarium fish trade which are also significantly impacted financially. Please allow Hawaiians to sustainably and ethically make use of the resources nature provides us to support their families and the economy of Hawaii. For Hawaii to continue to build toward a more sustainable economy, there must be diversity of industries and not overreliance on tourism. Industry that harvests renewable resources at sustainable levels, such as the AQ fishery's harvest of highly fecund reef fish, will be integral as Hawaii continues to work to meet the needs of the present population of people, without jeopardizing future Hawaiian's ability to meet their own needs. It is for this reason I ask that you vote yes on agenda item F1.

Sincerely,

Art Parola

From: [GEORGE PATTERSON](#)
To: [LANIHAU-rsmith](#); [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] BLNR Written Testimony Agenda Item F1. I OPPOSE issuing AQ Permits & I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:11:56 PM

AGENDA ITEM : F1. August 23, 2024

I OPPOSE THE BOARD ISSUING AQ PERMITS.

I OPPOSE DELEGATING AUTHORITY TO THE DEPARTMENT CHAIR.

I am a long term resident and home owner in North Kohala. I am an active ocean user. My credentials include being an active member of the Professional Association of Diving Instructors holding the Professional Divemaster Rating with over 500 dives along the Kohala Coast from 2003 to date, more than 20 years of observing the ocean resources. In addition, I am a swimmer and snorkeler that does long distance swimming from Kapaa County park to Lapakahi State park at least 3 to 4 days per week, a distance of several miles. I have practiced this for many years, thousands of times in the ocean and near shore reef zone.

The West Hawaii Regional Fishery Management Area revised final EIS. Is clearly deficient in its scope and accuracy. There is essentially no data from Kawaihae to Upon Point. My observations are far more significant and over a broader time frame.

The target fishes of the Aquarium Collectors are actually in decline, not resurgence. Particularly, the Lau'ipala, Yellow Tang, are only just maintaining a stable or slightly declining population with juveniles under represented. The general observation is that the corals are doing poorly from excess algae growth. Herbivores normally keep the algae growth in check. Warming ocean waters promote algae growth while herbivores keep it in check. To allow aquarium collectors to harvest herbivores is just insane. I oppose the board issuing AQ permits. The board has a responsibility to protect the reefs and it's resource fish populations. The board has the responsibility to put in place policies that protect and improve the resource, not destroy the resource by privatizing the sale of fish that need to stay protecting the reefs. I oppose delegating authority to the department chair.

There have been many public statements that the BLNR Board, not the DAR Chair, will determine the issuing of any AQ permits. In the public interest, the BLNR Board must retain the authority. In that case, the BLNR Board will exercise transparency while informing the public of it's decisions. No AQ permits should be issued.

Mahalo from Kapa'au, HI

From: [Marion Paul](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Protect our local fish please -August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:43:19 AM

Aloha,

Hawaii's marine life belongs in Hawaii, in their ocean home. Removing them for aquariums across the nation is short-sighted to our long-term reef health.

With the pressures of climate change, we need to keep our fish population intact and robust to insure that they will be here for generations to come.

Therefore, **no permits should be issued.**

The aquarium industry does not need our fish - they only want more profit by stealing ours. Instead, let them raise their own fish to sell, and charge more for the fish if need be.

Please take the long view. Please protect Hawaii's ecosystems. Please honor our future generations.

Mahalo,

Marion

Marion Paul
P.O. Box 492
4620A Kuawa Road
Kilauea, HI 96754-3022
808-634-3196

From: [Yann PAYET](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:14:56 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Best Regards

Yann PAYET

From: [Adrienne Peck](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23, Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 9:54:04 AM

I, Adrienne Peck live (on Puako Beach Drive) across the street from the amazing Puako Reef. I support efforts to remove all of the wastewater off of the reef to allow it to recover, the last thing we want is to have the reef's vital fish populations taken. DO NOT AGREE TO Aquarium Collection IN WEST HAWAII.

- BLNR should be the ultimate decision-makers on whether or not to issue AQ permits, not just the Chair of DAR staff
- NO AQ permits should be issue

I Scuba Dive at least 3-4 times a week in our neighborhood and a few times a week in Kona. I have personally seen the dwindling population of rare fish that are "sought after, sold at high prices, and highly collectible to the Aquarium Fish Sales Trade" I have personally seen these beautiful fish dwindling in numbers over the years. When I post photos of these magnificent fish on Social Media... I never state where I found them because I do not want them disappearing. They are beautiful to watch in their natural habitat & do not need to be in an Aquarium that will shorten their natural life span. There are plenty of aquarium fish that can be bred in captivity (aquariums) and there is no need to take fish from our ocean for that purpose.

Aloha,

Adrienne Peck
AdrienneWT@gmail.com

From: [Ming Peng](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] RE: August 23 meeting: Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:11:07 AM

Board Members,

I was just informed of this critical issue yesterday so my written testimony will be brief.

I am vehemently opposed to having fish removed from Hawaiian waters. The trafficking of our fish for profit is absolutely the antithesis of what is sacrosanct in Hawaii. It has no place in our state. These fish are an essential resource for our environment, maintaining ecological balance within our oceans while maintaining significant cultural relevance.

Furthermore, BLNR, not the DAQ or its chair, should have authority to issue AQ permits. The current status of the BLNR in charge allows for transparency and public discussion as to who, if any, should be permitted to remove fish from our waters. These fish are a shared resource and no one person should be the sole decision maker.

Mahalo nui loa for your time and kokua!

Ming Peng, MD FACR
Hilo, Hawaii

PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL: This document and the information contained herein are confidential and protected from disclosure pursuant to Federal law. This message is intended only for the use of the Addressee(s) and may contain information that is **PRIVILEGED** and **CONFIDENTIAL**. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that the use, dissemination, or copying of this information is strictly prohibited. If you received this communication in error, please erase all copies of the message and its attachments and notify the sender immediately.

From: [Marcie Phares](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:33:36 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is **Marcie Phares of Kailua-Kona, Hawaii**. I am an educator. I work with the ReefTeach program at Kahalu'u. It's always been a dream of mine to teach on the beach and inform people on how to care for our bay, including the coral and all of its nani critters.

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

One of the many stories I share with guests and visitors is about the Yellow Tang. How the coast of the Big Island used to be called the Gold Coast because so many Yellow Tang were in the water that the coast appeared yellow from above. As overfishing and collecting for aquarium use happened, this beautiful sight began to dwindle. As laws were put into place, the numbers came back! I am so concerned that we may lose this beautiful sight again if we do not protect it.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialized knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for this opportunity,
Marcie Phares

**Never lose your wonder,
Marcie Phares**

"The expert in anything was once a beginner."

From: [Fanney Plummer](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Items F-1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:13:51 PM

To whom it may concern:

I would like to strongly oppose the permit to allow fish to be caught for selling to individuals and companies around the world. Our fish and our oceans need to stay where they're at and at risk of Extinction please do not allow this permit to go through.

Mahalo

From: [Cayde Poley](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Opposition
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:26:41 AM

I do not support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

From: [MITCHELL K POWERS](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:54:22 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

L@@K This is my new email address: powers3113@gmail.com

From: [Bruce Prunk](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Cc: [julie.ziemelis.com](#); [Michael OConnor](#); [Cindi](#); [Kristine Dunker](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:51:26 PM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,
My name is Bruce W. Prunk, 73-4364 Kapuahi Street, Kailua Kona, Hawaii, Board President of the 365 Hawaii Island Community Fund and volunteer for the Reef Teach program at Kahalu'u' Bay. Our 365 Community Fund Board supports the reef, natural resources, and marine life of West Hawaii and are in opposition of any proposed trade permits for the collection of aquarium fish. I observed that DLNR's stated mission is to "Enhance, protect, conserve and manage Hawai'i's unique and limited natural, cultural and historic resources held in public trust for current and future generations of the people of Hawai'i Nei, and its visitors, in partnership with others from the public and private sectors." Inherent in DLNR's mission is its duty to mālama. This duty must also bind all to whom access and/or use of the Public Land Trust through the DLNR's leases and permits.

Hawaii's lands and oceans should be shared, accessed and enjoyed fairly by all. Aquarium trade permits would allow a few individuals to profit by granting them exclusive access to harvest aquarium fish. This policy on its face appears to conflict with DNLN's stated mission. Therefore, on behalf of the 365 Hawaii Island Community Fund, I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and also OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Additionally, Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits. Further, Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, I'd request that you DO NOT delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialized knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together. Mahalo for this opportunity to voice my concerns,

Bruce W. Prunk

Board President

365 Hawaii Island Community Fund

503-816-3432

Bprunk@comcast.net

365HawaiiIslandCommunityFund.org

From: [Damien Richard](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:39:44 AM

Good evening (may be morning for you),

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR (Division of Aquatic Resources).

Best regards,

Damien RICHARD
2 RUE NEUVE DES SABLONS
27120 MENILLES
FRANCE
+33(0)6.82.49.43.55

From: [Rick Johnson](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#); [Leslie Johnson](#); [Susy Ruddle](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Raping the Reefs
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:20:08 AM

Aloha DLNR,

Please forgive the strong subject line, it however screams of the violation that allows commercial reef fish collecting for aquariums.

Please strongly consider the impact that this will have for generations of the natural order of the food chain in our reefs. We already have a crisis with coral bleaching which many of these species of small fish feed from and how that serious bleaching situation negatively impacts the fish population. To open up commercial collecting of the already weakened populations would be devastating for the small fish, the coral reefs and the natural order of the food chain therein.

I cannot stress strongly or loudly enough that the DLNR is the governing body that we place our trust in to protect our natural coast.

Your decision should, in my humble opinion, be in the benefit of the Island, its people and maintaining the already fragile ecosystem.

Mahalo for your work in the protection of our reef fish.

Sincerely,

Richard Kirwin Johnson

From: [Risucci3](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 5:13:22 AM

Good afternoon

I strongly support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

I believe sustainable collection when managed properly is possible.

The lift of the current ban would have numerous positive impacts on Hawaii govt and local fisherman

Sincerely
Greg Risucci

From: [Susy Ruddle](#)
To: [DNR_BNR_Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Aquarium Collectors Testimony
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 8:01:49 AM

Aloha, My name is Susy Chillingworth Ruddle and I am writing to you today to **OPPOSE** issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawaii. I also **OPPOSE** delegating authority to the Department Chairperson.

I reject DAR's AQ terms and conditions and ask that we **DENY** all permits going forward. Here is one experience I had.

In the early 2000's I was at Aloha Cargo at the Keahole Airport to pick up a large order of lei for a celebration of life. As I pulled into the parking lot I was blocked by a large flatbed truck that had a stack of plastic storage containers, probably over 100 in total. At first I was patient, assuming they would move soon, but after a while I realized they had no intention of opening the parking to others. When I got out of my car to investigate I asked a young man if he could move his truck. He looked at me with a blank stare and that is when I realized he did not speak English. I went in to talk with the Air Cargo staff and asked what this guy was doing and how I could get into the parking area. That was the moment that I was overwhelmed by what was happening. This man had a flatbed of plastic containers filled with Yellow Tang Fish. He was shipping them to I believe Los Angeles or Long Beach to then be transported to unknown destinations. Talking with the Air Cargo employees I learned that this was a regular delivery several times a week. The employees "hated" that this was being allowed, but their jobs were on the line and they said to me...we can't voice our opinions. They went on to educate me on what actually was happening to these fish. They were in small containers within the large "Tupperware" style bins. Their fins had been cut so that more could fit into the smaller containers. I learned then that these fishes had their bladders "punctured" so that they could "harvest" them faster than what would be their normal surface rise. They went on to tell me that about half of them never survived the trip. I left flabbergasted that this was "OK"! My first thought was, What the heck is happening to the Big Island...This was just ONE collector. I feel that ANY collector is too many. We need to recognize the beauty that our Moku o Keawe offers to our locals and our visitors. We need to stop selling our assets to those with money, this will not benefit us in the future. **Not to mention the cruel and inhumane treatment of these precious creatures.**

I am not an activist, I am a keiki o ka aina that wants to secure the future of our islands. We are moving way too fast to please the instant gratification of those that flash their money at us. Please consider the long term impact and do NOT allow the Board to bring back this horrific practice. We cannot go backwards...IMUA! with respect and Aloha, Susy Chillingworth Ruddle



From: [Liquid Cosmos Divers](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 I OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & I OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:41:48 AM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Mike Rudenko, I live in Hawi on Hawai'i island and together with my spouse Jessica Glazner we own and operate a small SCUBA outfit, Liquid Cosmos Divers out of Kawaihae harbor.

I OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and I OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits,
I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

We have been working as scuba professionals here in Hawaii for 15 years and we witnessed first hand the rapid decline of the reef fishes and the reef degradation as a whole during the time when Aquarium Collection was still permitted.

Ever since the ban was placed our reefs started to recover, we are now seeing increasing numbers of all of the important reef fish species, however, the damage that has been done by years of Aquarium Collection will take many more years to go back to a well-balanced ecosystem.

Many local people enjoy the beauty of the reef on daily basis, thousands of tourists from all around the world visit Hawaii to witness these spectacular waters and observe our marine life. Reopening Aquarium Collection will be a devastating blow to our reefs that are having a hard time fighting global climate change and local pollutants as is. Also, it'll be a massively wrong move that will go against the will of so many residents and tourists alike. Please don't make it happen.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair,
DO NOT delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Thank you for your time,
Mike Rudenko
Liquid Cosmos Divers
Kohala coast, Hawai'i island.

From: [Dawn Sagar](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 7:37:35 PM

Aloha Chair and BLNR,

I am writing today to express my opposition to issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and, furthermore, in delegating authority to the Department Chair.

My name is Dawn Sagar, I'm a straight up Haole who is blessed to be able to live here and work here, for two locally owned businesses, full time for eight years. I am also so blessed to be able to witness the recovery of some of the coral reefs since I first came here 13 years ago. The reefs then (and that was before the big bleaching event) was struggling hard. It's still a struggling ecosystem, but there is hope. A bit of hope, odds are against our coral reefs due to ocean warming, pollution, etc.

Opening this delicate system up to commercial aquarium permits is going to set things back so far, so very far. I know you know how special this tiny strip of coastline is, more than I do, please do what you can to help it continue to heal and, hopefully, thrive.

Regarding delegating authority to issue AQ permits to the Department Chair, please do not delegate authority to the Department Chair, please retain the discretionary authority with the Board, with their diverse ties to the Island Communities. You know, better than I do, how important it is to keep these decisions local, with people who know and care about these waters, and are working towards long term solutions.

Mahalo nui loa for your time,
Sincerely,
Dawn Sagar
Kailua-Kona, HI
808-557-5887

From: [Dawn Sagar](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 7:37:35 PM

Aloha Chair and BLNR,

I am writing today to express my opposition to issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and, furthermore, in delegating authority to the Department Chair.

My name is Dawn Sagar, I'm a straight up Haole who is blessed to be able to live here and work here, for two locally owned businesses, full time for eight years. I am also so blessed to be able to witness the recovery of some of the coral reefs since I first came here 13 years ago. The reefs then (and that was before the big bleaching event) was struggling hard. It's still a struggling ecosystem, but there is hope. A bit of hope, odds are against our coral reefs due to ocean warming, pollution, etc.

Opening this delicate system up to commercial aquarium permits is going to set things back so far, so very far. I know you know how special this tiny strip of coastline is, more than I do, please do what you can to help it continue to heal and, hopefully, thrive.

Regarding delegating authority to issue AQ permits to the Department Chair, please do not delegate authority to the Department Chair, please retain the discretionary authority with the Board, with their diverse ties to the Island Communities. You know, better than I do, how important it is to keep these decisions local, with people who know and care about these waters, and are working towards long term solutions.

Mahalo nui loa for your time,
Sincerely,
Dawn Sagar
Kailua-Kona, HI
808-557-5887

Dear Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits for West Hawaii. It has completed the HEPA review and has been well managed based on science.

Sam P.

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing.

Thank you,
Karla Gurat

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you
Owen Hammond

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing the permits needed to open West Hawaii for fishing.

Mahalo,
Cheyanne Zamora

Support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits
for West Hawaii.

M. Brass

I support opening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Denise Waller

Chair Chang and Board Members-

In support of reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Joan Monroe

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and I support issuing permits.

Patsy T.

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,
Mel Diep

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Stephen Poulos

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm testifying in support of issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Eugene E.

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,

T. Sung

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support allowing the aquarium fishery to reopen under the continued management and guidance of DAR. I support issuing permits.

Mari Solner

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Amber Hopkins

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Thank you,
Laverne Rivera

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reissuing permits and opening West Hawaii to aquarium fishing again.

Thank you,
Phil Walker

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits for West Hawaii.

Thank you,

Terri Walker

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. This is the only fishery in the state to go through the HEPA process.

Thank you,
Kenzi White

Chair Chang and Board Members -

SUPPORT for issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

Greg Deves

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery.

P. Westin

I support issuing permits to allow aquarium fishing in West Hawaii and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Penny Pudiquet

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm in support of issuing permits and reopening the Aquarium Fishery in West Hawaii. It's proven to be sustainable and is the most studied and best managed fishery in Hawaii.

Thank you,
Kris Burgard

I support issuing permits.

I. Jacobs

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Kelly Mooney

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Nikki Vermillion

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing aquarium fishing permits and reopening West Hawaii.

Mahalo,
Andrea Makori

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and believe it should be reopened. I support issuing permits and allowing this HEPA approved fishery to operate again.

Mahalo,
Kelly Ramos

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Thank you,
George Tapu

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Ruth Jahan

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii fishing. I believe that resources should be managed by science and DAR has done a good job of this for this fishery. It is still the most heavily regulated fishery in Hawaii.

Thank you,
Jamie Murack

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits to reopen West Hawaii aquarium fishing.

Thank you,
Jennifer Sullivan

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I'm testifying in support of issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island. Scientific data gathered from DAR studies done over the years do support that this is a sustainable fishery.

Mahalo,

Maile Steele

I support the aquarium fishery and I support issuing permits.

Mahalo,

Ava Brennan

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. I support issuing permits. Numerous studies and numerous experts have demonstrated with clear scientific data that this is a sustainable fishery.

Thank you,

Lee Ashford

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Alika H.

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for West Hawaii fishing.

Mahalo,

Sandy Kovace

Kona

I'm supporting the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for west Hawaii.

Mahalo,

L. Levi

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I'm in support of reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii. It's well managed, well studied, has completed the HEPA review process.

Mahalo,

Claye Boute

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support managing fisheries based on science, not rhetoric. The aquarium fishery should have permits reissued and West Hawaii reopened as long as the scientific data continues to support that this is a sound and sustainable fishery.

Mahalo,
Dana Myers

Aloha,

I support issuing permits for the aquarium fishery and re-opening West Hawaii.
And I support science based management of all fisheries.

Mahalo,
Margaret Stone

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits to allow fishing in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,

V. Shaylor

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support permit issuance and opening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

Mahalo,
Nathan Jarvis

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support giving permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii and believe this fishery has been well managed using scientific data.

Mahalo,

Giesel Ramel

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery. It's proven sustainable and well managed.

Mahalo,

S.C. Poole

Strongly SUPPORT issuing permits for the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

B. Flatmann

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support the aquarium fishery and believe permits should be issued. It's been a well managed fishery and it should be reopened.

Mahalo,
Kalei Hall

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits to allow aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Mahalo,

Gannon Landry

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits...the aquarium fishery has completed the HEPA process and I support reopening the fishery. Studies have shown increasing fish populations, it has been well managed by the state and is proven sustainable.

Thank you,
Mitchell Freye
Kona, Hawaii

Dear Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Thank you,
Deloris Kaur

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support opening the aquarium fishery. Please vote in favor of issuing permits. The scientific data proves this is a sustainable fishery with effective management ensuring proper protection and growth of fish stocks.

Thank you,

C. Han

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,
I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing in West Hawaii.

Greg Haim

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits. The aquarium fishery in West Hawaii is the best managed and most studied fishery in the State. Populations of aquarium fish species have risen over the years, showing how powerful good management can be. In addition, this fishery has completed the HEPA review process and is proven sustainable.

Mahalo,

Raine Moralez

Kona

Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Angel Lucas

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits and reopening the aquarium fishery. After completing the HEPA review, and being the only fishery to have done so, it's been proven to be sustainable and deserves to be in operation again.

Mahalo,

Sammy Byron

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the West Hawaii aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Alison Black

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support issuing permits for aquarium fishing as well as fishery management based on sound science. I support re-opening the aquarium fishery.

Mahalo,

Fredo Salas

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits for fishing in West Hawaii.

Thank you.
Erin Westin

Aloha Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Mahalo,
Russel Tan

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery and issuing permits. This is the only fishery in Hawaii to have gone through and completed the HEPA review and is proven sustainable. Thank you for your time.

Kealoha R.

Chair Chang and Board Members,

I support reopening the aquarium fishery on the Big Island.

Myra Jacildo

I support re-opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Regina Lim

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I strongly support issuing permits for West Hawaii aquarium fishing. The fishery has gone through the court ordered HEPA review process in order to determine if it was sustainable and environmentally safe to continue. The HEPA process was completed and accepted and the fishery still has the best management plan of all fisheries in the state.

Mahalo.

Edna Anderson

Aloha Chair Chang and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

I support the issuance of permits and reopening the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.

Tevita B.

I support issuing permits to reopen the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii.
This fishery completed the HEPA review.

This fishery is sustainable, as identified in the HEPA review. This fishery is well managed with multitudes of studies by DAR showing an increase in aquarium fish populations. Management does work and this fishery should be open.

Mahalo,
O. Charles Byron

I support issuing permits and managing resources by science as provided by DAR.

**Thank you,
Garett Beseir**

From: jettsantos.att@gmail.com
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 6:02:50 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

From: [sav sav](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 5:54:25 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

[Yahoo Mail: Search, Organize, Conquer](#)

From: [S.Schu](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:19:32 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

From: [Shorty Daboss](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23,2024 testimony
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 9:41:30 PM

To whom it may concern,

As a native being apart both aquarium fish keeping and being a fisherman I see both sides of the spectrum. I see divers wastes 100's of fishes weekly if not daily all due to illegal diving, fisherman take out fish to eat but aquarium marine fish collectors cannot collect and sell fishes to preserve a life. It's okay to kill fishes through lay nets, throw nets, fishing leads, or even tourist envading their home with tanning oils and perfumes. The collector get blamed for killing fishes when they are the experienced ones collecting them humanely with scoop nets and special equipment to bring deep water fish to the surface slowly without killing them. To protect all herbivore species will be the most wrongful move the board and state can decide. Herbivores eat algae and other plant matter in the ocean and by protecting them they eat the main source of oxygen for the world. All fish eat phytoplankton another source of oxygen producing organism for the ocean. Lifting the ban will bring population control to the ocean while the main predator for herbivores (ulua) is the most hunted fish by fisherman. While there is no regulation on the main population control of these herbivores we have a ban on all collection for all marine fish commercially. While herbivores eat the oxygen producing organisms and plants for our air there will be no population control on them while they produce 1 million babies per year per pair of herbivore species. We want to preserve our native species of fish through sharing it with the world but not while corporate companies monopolize off our native resources. Hawaii local and native communities have been pushed out of homes and businesses since this ban was placed. Many local marine shops and collectors have been put out of business while the corporate company biota its thriving off Hawaii fishes. What once was \$10-40 for a yellow tang has 100x increased in price. Yes I do support LOCAL and NATIVE people of Hawaii to thrive and I do not support a BAN that restricts our people from making a living from our own home. These herbivores are not in anyway threaten of being extinct or even on the radar of being on the CITES list.

I ask the board to lift the ban and support local and native businesses to flourish and to stop corporate companies taking advantage of our resources and stopping our people from having a honest living!

Mahalo nui loa

Shane "shorty"

Keeping the hobby alive one fish at a time.

From: [Lisa Kaneshiro](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:33:49 AM

To whom it may concern,

I am writing to you today to express my support for opening the aquarium fishery in Hawaii. In addition I'd like to express my support of the practical management of the fishery as well. Thank you.

Sincerely,
Lisa Shimizu

From: [Jeffrey Shumaker](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:59:23 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

From: [Antonio Silva](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:14:58 AM

I support sustainable fisheries and the science behind DAR. Open up again the sustainable aquarium fish trade.

Tony Silva

Sent from my iPhone

LEGAL DISCLAIMER The information in this message is confidential and may be privileged. It is intended solely for the addressee. Access to this message by anyone else is unauthorized. If the reader of this is not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this communication, or any action or omission taken by the reader in reliance on it is prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you

From: [Tyler Sonnemaker](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 3:59:06 PM

Aloha pumehana,

My name is Tyler Sonnemaker, I live in the ili of Keahupuaanui in the ahupua'a of Kailua on the island of O'ahu.

After listening to the mana'o shared by lawai'a and loko i'a practitioners in my community, **I OPPOSE DAR's proposal to allow AQ in West Hawai'i** despite BLNR's unanimous decision to prohibit AQ statewide.

I also **OPPOSE DAR's request to BLNR to grant the DAR chair sole authority over issuing AQ permits.**

We import 90% of our food in Hawai'i... does DAR seriously believe that what we need to allow more of is commercial AQUARIUM FISHING for a small handful of wealthy collectors not from Hawai'i?

There is no world in which that benefits those of us who rely on this moana and 'āina to nourish us, and this is opposed to the ideas of mālama 'āina and mālama kaiāulu.

How can cutting out community input and consolidating power within a sole (already powerful) public official be justified?

We have to stop this kind of short-term thinking... if we don't, we're telling our keiki and future generations that our desire to pocket a bit of extra cash or let people watch fish in an aquarium was more important than their ability to feed themselves.

E mālama pono,
Tyler

--

Tyler Sonnemaker

From: [BRIAN STAFFORD](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:09:57 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

[Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android](#)

From: [Tom Stick](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23 Agenda F1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 8:53:20 AM

I live at the beach in Puako on the big island and I have been involved for several years in efforts to clean up the waters off our shores and deal with wastewater problems. Population of aquarium size fish has not increased but has decreased since I've lived here for 14 years and I can see no reason to harvest them for commercial purposes. I am definitely opposed to allowing that.

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Ron Takata](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item F-1 OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 7:34:25 PM

I am a Hiilo native and have lived in Hawaii for 80 years. Earlier in my life, I have enjoyed snorkeling off the Kona coast and seeing its rich marine life. It is a beauty that we must perpetuate.

I am totally opposed to the commercial collecting and sale of marine aquatic fish throughout the State of Hawaii. Please increase the penalties to include equipment and boat seizure, and prison times. Take steps to increase Leave the marine species alone, excepting for food purposes.

Reject DAR's AQ **terms and conditions** and deny any and all permits' Do not **delegate authority** to the Department Chair.' Retain the discretionary authority of the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialized knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together in a fully transparent manner.

Ron Takata
Puna, HI

From: [宮崎琢斗](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 6:36:53 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.



SIERRA CLUB OF HAWAI'I

Testimony to
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

August 23, 2024

In OPPOSITION to the Staff Recommendations in F-1:

REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF THE APPLICATION FORM AND TERMS AND CONDITIONS FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I AQUARIUM FISH PERMIT PURSUANT TO HAWAII REVISED STATUTES SECTION 188-31; REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF TERMS AND CONDITIONS FOR THE WEST HAWAI'I AQUARIUM PERMIT PURSUANT TO HAWAII ADMINISTRATIVE RULES SECTION 13-60.4-7; REQUEST TO DELEGATE AUTHORITY TO THE CHAIR TO APPROVE, SIGN, AND ISSUE WEST HAWAI'I AQUARIUM PERMITS AND STATE OF HAWAI'I AQUARIUM FISH PERMITS AUTHORIZING LIMITED COMMERCIAL AQUARIUM COLLECTION IN THE WEST HAWAI'I REGIONAL FISHERY MANAGEMENT AREA (WHRFMA) TO UP TO SEVEN APPLICANTS THAT MEET CERTAIN CRITERIA AND REQUIREMENTS.)

Aloha Chair Chang and members of the Board of Land and Natural Resources,

The Sierra Club offers testimony in **OPPOSITION** to the proposed recommendations to facilitate the reopening of commercial aquarium collection in West Hawai'i, through the adoption of aquarium collection permit terms and conditions and the delegation of authority to the Chair to issue such permits. **Rather than take the action proposed today, the Sierra Club urges the Board of Land and Natural Resources (BLNR) to instead request that staff follow through on a standing petition for rulemaking to ban commercial aquarium collection as an industry incompatible with local and cultural values, and the Department of Land and Natural Resources' (DLNR's) own recognition of the importance of herbivore species to our reef ecosystem – as well as the recreational and subsistence fishers, ocean enthusiasts, small businesses, and Hawai'i residents that rely upon it.**

In 2021, the Sierra Club of Hawai'i adopted an Aquarium Trade Policy (Policy) in support of a ban on commercial aquarium collection. As the preamble to this Policy states,

Hawai'i's coral reefs and the wildlife dependent upon them are severely threatened and being degraded by human induced global warming, increasing marine pollution, and commercial harvesting of wildlife via the "aquarium fish trade". Thus far administrative attempts to regulate, enforce, and resolve community user conflicts around this industrial style

activity have failed and have not diminished the increasing societal objections to this activity. Among these objections are the inhumane treatment by which collectors regularly inflict unnecessary and unusual harm and injury to these unique and varied forms of aquatic life (including incidental damage to the living corals from which they are hunted), in the pursuit of shipping them out of state to private aquarium collectors. This trade, rather than resembling the traditional forms of recreational and subsistence fishing, is in no way compatible with the local values and lifestyles of most of Hawai'i's residents and sport fishermen. And most importantly, with on-going research and appreciation of the ecological value and symbiotic relationships between all forms of life on the reef still in its infancy, the loss or degradation to any of these elements is having consequences few can anticipate, and certainly no longer be justified by their purely economic benefits for a few.

Accordingly, the Policy calls for a ban on commercial reef wildlife collection, with exceptions for Native Hawaiian traditional and customary rights, the taking of aquatic life for bait or consumption, noncommercial aquarium collection, and collection under a special activity permit issued by the Division of Aquatic Resources. **As this agenda item would authorize steps to reopen commercial aquarium collection in West Hawai'i, the Sierra Club of Hawai'i strongly opposes its recommended actions.**

The Sierra Club notes that the BLNR and the DLNR have recognized the need for much stronger protections for certain herbivore species, due to the critical role that herbivores play in maintaining healthy coral reefs. The Sierra Club further notes that herbivorous fish such as lau'ipala, kole, and many others on the proposed "white list" for collection are regularly targeted by commercial aquarium collectors, with their schooling behavior allowing many specimens to be captured at once and at the same site. **However, no meaningful discussion is provided in the submittal regarding the potential localized and regional impacts of allowing the targeting and removal of herbivores¹ on coral and ecosystem health in light of the growing impacts of ocean acidification, climate change, and intensifying land uses in the West Hawai'i region - particularly where species are subject to an annual and unenforceable "total allowable catch," which would incentivize rapid take under a "tragedy of the commons" scenario.**

Notably, no science is offered in the submittal to indicate whether or not acknowledged declines in herbivore fish density² or repeated interruptions of schooling and feeding behavior by commercial aquarium collectors has a local or generalized impact on coral

¹ A single paragraph in a statement submitted in the Umberger v. DLNR litigation, by a commercial fisheries biologist, concedes that the harvest of herbivores has "some impact" on "herbivory," and that impacts to reef resilience "is less certain."

² Patricia Tummons, *Study Links Aquarium Collection to Decline of Reef Fish on O'ahu*, ENVIRONMENT HAWAII, October 2020, available at <https://www.environment-hawaii.org/?p=12980>.

reef health. No discussion is raised regarding the potential economic and ecological benefits of preventing potentially thousands of aquarium specimens, including primarily herbivores, per day from being taken from West Hawai'i's waters. There is no contemplation of the potential for the the number of aquarium collectors to expand over time, exacerbating the industry's impacts and the costs of permit administration and enforcement, and future reactive regulations. The submittal's arbitrary analysis accordingly only indicates a substantial deference to the aquarium industry, through its Revised Final Environmental Impact Statement ("RFEIS") that was rejected by half of the voting BLNR members when it was presented for final approval.

The Sierra Club is also troubled by problematic statements in the submittal, based on the aforementioned RFEIS, that largely dismisses deeply held Native Hawaiian beliefs regarding the relationship between Kānaka Maoli, i'a, and 'āina, based on summary statements such as "there is no universal Native Hawaiian traditional and customary worldview based on aquarium collection," and that "as long as the species are available, the cultural practice is not negated." The summary dismissal of Kānaka Maoli worldview regarding the integrity of and relationship to the many collective and individual components of 'āina, and the importance of this integrity to the perpetuation of site-specific cultural practices including the traditional and customary practice of mālama 'āina, thus leads the submittal to inappropriately conclude that all traditional and customary rights "can still be asserted, even if the proposed [total allowable catch] of the white list species is eventually released." The Sierra Club strongly urges the BLNR to ensure a much higher standard for understanding and analyzing cultural impacts, in this and future matters.

As a final note, the Sierra Club commends the BLNR for its prior decision to reject a staff recommendation to deny a community petition for rulemaking that would have prohibited commercial aquarium collection, subject to certain exceptions. The Sierra Club urges the BLNR to ask staff to move forward with this community petition, which received significant support from a broad cross-section of stakeholders, rather than move forward with the recommendations to reopen the commercial aquarium fishery in West Hawai'i.

Accordingly, because this submittal seeks to reopen a public trust fishery for the benefit of private entities seeking commercial gain, without due regard to cultural beliefs and practices or the unknown effects of the fishery on an increasingly vulnerable ocean environment – one upon which our ecological, cultural, subsistence, recreational, and economic interests rely – the Sierra Club respectfully but strongly urges the BLNR to **deny** its recommendations.

Mahalo nui loa for the opportunity to testify on this matter.

From: [Andrea Testi](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 11:47:59 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Inviato da [Outlook per iOS](#)

From: [David Thomas](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:41:50 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR



**Testimony of Toni Marie Davis
Executive Director/Activities & Attractions Association of Hawaii**

Before the Board of Land and Natural Resources

Friday, August 23, 2024

STRONGLY OPPOSE AGENDA ITEM F #1

Aloha Chair Chang and Members of the Land Board,

Mahalo, for this opportunity to testify, my name is Toni Marie Davis. For the last 27 years, it has been my honor to serve the state's in-destination tourism experiences through my position as the Executive Director of the Activities & Attractions Association of Hawaii, Inc.

Personally, I am a 36-year resident of Maui, a certified diver, avid snorkeler and I've also owned/part-owned in Hawaii both commercial and recreational fishing, sailing, snorkeling & scuba vessels. The purpose of my testimony is to express my strong opposition on Item F #1.

This request is to issue 7 permits on Hawaii Island and reassign the oversight to DAR staff. Please, no. And no.

We should not support or permit the exporting of Hawaii's Reef Fish for mainland Aquariums. It is the antithesis of regenerative Tourism.

Scientists say we must increase fish abundance if our reefs are to have a fighting chance against climate change impacts. Sacrificing tens to hundreds of thousands of fish to an unnecessary and destructive activity doesn't pass the common sense test.

The export aquarium trade fundamentally conflicts with local, cultural, and broad social values of our Hawaii home. The cruel procedures taken to improve successful transport, none the less result with a percentage of mortalities.

To issue these permits with the oversight solely under DAR staff is irresponsible. If the BLNR is insistent on issuing these permits, they should be tough to get and keep and the board should oversee.

First and foremost the focus of DAR should be on stopping illegal operations which take fish from the reefs currently. When this is stopped, maybe then issuing permits and managing could be considered - A3H will always oppose taking of Aquarium fish to export. We do support the UH Waikiki and Maui Ocean Center Aquariums, where animals remain on island, are never sold to market and are shared for our community and our visitors to gain an enhanced appreciation of the reefs and the amazing creature that call Hawaii's ocean home.

Mahalo for this opportunity to testify.



Board of Land and Natural Resources
Regarding Agenda Item F. 3

Kalanihale's, KUPA Friends of Ho'okena Beach Park's, Moana 'Ohana, Ko'olaupoko Hawaiian Civic Club's, and For the Fishes' Petition for Rulemaking to Prohibit the Take of Marine Life for Commercial Aquarium Purposes (With Exemptions).

November 9, 2023

9:15 a.m.

Online via ZOOM

The Office of Hawaiian Affairs (OHA) files this testimony in **SUPPORT** of the Native Hawaiian and marine protection groups formal petition to the BLNR to enact rules to prohibit collection of reef wildlife for the aquarium pet trade. OHA **strongly recommends** the Department of Land and Natural Resources – Division of Aquatic Resources to begin rulemaking and hold public hearings on the petitioner's proposal to end the aquarium pet trade in the State of Hawai'i.

Article XII, §7 of the State of Hawai'i's Constitution affirms and protects the Native Hawaiian rights, customarily and traditionally exercised for subsistence, cultural and religious purposes, therefore Native Hawaiian rights must take precedent over and above the aquarium pet trade extractive activities for profit. OHA also notes that the aquarium trade has historically taken more herbivores than subsistence, recreational, and food fishers combined. This is excessive and not sustainable especially given the increasing climate challenges to our near shore reefs and ecosystems. The BLNR has an affirmative duty to uphold the State's Constitution.

Many Native Hawaiians regard ocean habitants as kinolau – physical embodiments as described in the Kumulipo and other cosmogonic chants. Therefore, for Native Hawaiians ocean wildlife is not only sacred and endeared but are considered our 'ohana.

OHA values meaningful engagement and consultation and supports the continued protection of our vital resources through rulemaking and public hearings. Mahalo, for the opportunity to comment on this important matter.

From: [Cody Tridento](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:02:43 PM

I **support** opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

From: [Aidan Tung](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:41:28 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

From: [John Van Uden](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:03:24 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

As someone who lives on the mainland, is active in the saltwater aquarium hobby, and has family on the Big Island whom we frequently visit, I understand there is more than one valid perspective on this. I think this careful science and data driven compromise approach to reopening the fishery is the correct path.

Sincerely,
John Van Uden

From: [Ute Bouchez](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] I STRONGLY OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & I STRONGLY OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:24:05 PM

Aloha,

The suggested proposals are wrong on so many levels. On the simple governing level, it is a betrayal to the people and our democracy. It opens up for wrongdoing and extended greed in addition to what already appears to be in place by these proposals.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits,

I adamantly request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

Our ocean population is keeping itself at a natural balance, working hard in regards to keeping ocean, coral, reefs, and the ocean's general population in an equilibrium. Human interference causes this equilibrium to break.

There are solid reasons as to why the permits were no longer passed out. It was less than a year ago that the Board of Land and Natural Resources "unanimously" approved the prohibition of Commercial Aquarium Collecting.

Have we not learned of the absurdity of caging-in (in this case Aquariumizing) animals? Do we need to continue in a practice that goes against sound and logical thinking?

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair,

This is an example of betrayal to the people's trust and an example of ill governing. Do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialise knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together. Allow the people of this State to continue to believe in the rightfulness of this government.

Mahalo for this opportunity,

Ute Z Bouchez
Kohala

From: [Oahu Chair](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23, 2024, Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 4:21:13 PM

Dear BLNR,

I am writing to express my deep concern over the Department of Aquatic Resources request to remove BLNR's authority over commercial aquarium collection by relinquishing control to the Chair of DAR. DAR wants to issue permits to allow for commercial aquarium collection on the West side of Oahu.

This would be catastrophic to the reefs and to the fish population. As an ocean swimmer on the West side, I have already seen a reduction of the reef fish over the past ten years. Hawaii's reefs must be protected and the fish are a critical component to the health of the reefs.

I implore you to not give control to DAR and do not allow commercial aquarium collection off the shores of Hawaii. Fortunately, our coral reefs have not experienced the massive bleaching that is occurring worldwide, but we must do everything we can to protect the fragile ecosystem of our beautiful coral reefs.

Sincerely,

Arleen Velasco
Honolulu, Oahu

From: [Shawn Verne](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] West Hawai'i reopen commercial aquarium collection?
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 2:48:23 PM

Aloha to all concerned,

It has come to my attention that The Division of Aquatic Resources is going to ask Board of Land and Natural Resources to approve the reopening of commercial aquarium collection on West Hawaii.

This is a terrible idea that will cause all of Hawaii to lose its last shining star in the tropical fish world.

I grew up on the Big Island in the 1980's and graduated from Konawaena High School in 1986.

Back then I used to dive the reefs frequently...After moving back to the Big Island in 2012 from the mainland with my family, I started to dive the very same reefs as I did decades earlier. Wow, what a shock I had...

The reefs were empty with tropical reef fish compared with what was once abundant before.

I started to ask around if anyone could shed some light on this only to find out it was the aquarium collection trade that devastated the reefs on the Big Island.

I can tell you that after diving the other islands, West Hawaii is the last, best example of tropical fish in all of Hawaii.

If West Hawaii is reopened to this latest attack on the tropical fish, everyone loses, forever, especially the State of Hawaii.

Shawn Verne

President

CityHost411.com

Office (800) 793-7107

From: [Bradley Vialu](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Testimony
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:20:48 AM

Sent from my iPhone

To Whom It May Concern,

I am writing to express my firm support for local and native businesses that contribute to the sustainability and economic well-being of our communities. These businesses, rooted in tradition and local knowledge, play an essential role in preserving our culture, environment, and livelihoods. I believe it is crucial that we prioritize and protect these enterprises, which are often overshadowed by large corporate companies seeking to monopolize our natural and native resources.

While I fully support sustainable practices and appropriate regulations that ensure the health of our ecosystems, I do not support the complete ban on local fisheries. These restrictions disproportionately affect local businesses and families who have responsibly harvested these resources for generations. The blanket bans allow corporate entities, often less connected to the land and its needs, to exploit loopholes and continue their operations at the expense of the very communities they claim to help.

I advocate for a more balanced approach—one that involves protecting our natural resources while also empowering local fishers and businesses to continue their work under fair and sustainable regulations. By working together, we can ensure the long-term health of our ecosystems without sacrificing the livelihoods of those who depend on them.

I urge you to reconsider the current policies and work towards solutions that respect the rights and traditions of local fishers while maintaining the necessary oversight to protect our environment.

Thank you for your attention to this important matter.

Sincerely,
Bradley Vialu

From: [Jim Ward](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item F-1 OPPOSE Issuing AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 6:15:27 PM

Aloha, Below is my testimony regarding AQ permits

- **Terms & Conditions** to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits
- I'm asking that AQ permits be denied. As a diver who has been diving south kona reefs for 15 years, I've seen what the AQ trade has done to decimate some species, and I've seen the beginnings of a comeback of some (but not all) since the legal AQ collecting was banned (the illegal collecting continues)
- **Delegating Authority** to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair
- Oppose putting this decision making with any one person. The decisions should be with the board consisting of representation of the different parties involved

Below I've copied other "points which I agree with. The AQ trade is going to keep throwing money at this to get their business back. The ecosystem is too fragile to support harvesting of reef fish though I'm sure they can "buy" a survey that proves otherwise.

- DAR has made multiple public statements that the Board, not the Chair, will determine whether to issue any AQ permits. Breaking that promise now is a betrayal of public trust
- The benefits of leaving our fish on the reefs FAR OUTWEIGH the monetary gains of a handful of people who take them off the reef for sale to the AQ pet trade outside Hawaii
- Scientists say we must **increase** fish abundance if our reefs are to have a fighting chance against climate change impacts. Sacrificing tens to hundreds of thousands of important herbivores to an unnecessary and destructive activity contradicts best available science and common sense
- The AQ trade fundamentally conflicts with local, cultural, and broad social values of our Hawaii home

I hope the ban on AQ trade is maintained for the good of all, not the profit of a few.

Mahalo,
James Ward 88-1653 Moana Dr

Captain Cook, HI 96704
808-895-9656

From: [Sheryl Weinstein](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] West Hawaii Reef Rape
Date: Tuesday, August 20, 2024 4:55:59 PM

Dear BLNR & Gov. Josh Green:

I am a longtime resident of Hawaii and a scuba diver. I continue to witness the destruction of Hawaii's underwater world caused by cruise ship sewage dumping, pollution from water treatment plants, run-off from rivers and streams, especially construction areas. In the 2014-15 El Nino episode many marine creatures were killed, wiped out and never seen anywhere since(rendered extinct).

Obviously, Hawaii's ocean is in peril—one need only stick their face in the water to see for themselves. How and why then would Gov. Green & the powers that be EVER allow aquarium fish collection in Hawaii??? PLEASE PLEASE PLEASE STOP this law!!! Most of the reefs in West Hawaii are barren—like a desert, currently. The reef fronting the Hualalai Four Seasons Resort is an sad example of just how void the reefs are of fish—and very little recovery has happened in the few years of the no-fishing moratorium there. Another pitiful example is Keauhou Bay, where people continue to “fish”—and there's little, if any fish to be found or caught!

Thank you for your time in reading this—and PLEASE, for the love of the Ocean, do NOT allow aquarium fish collectors—AKA “Reef Rapers” in Hawaii.

Sheryl Weinstein
Kailua-Kona

From: [Jonathan Wilson](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 7:42:34 AM

To whom it may concern-

I am writing in support of opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR

I can tell you that having visited Hawaii on numerous occasions to snorkel and scuba and support the economy there I would not have likely done that if I did not own an aquarium and get introduced the beautiful ocean fishes.

This has stimulated my curiosity which has grown for many years now. These fish that are harvested do well state side. I have had many of these fish for over 10 years and teach kids about the ocean in my own home.

If done responsibly, these harvested fish help educate the world and in many cases aquaria in homes help fight depression and anxiety as well.

It has also been shown that people with aquariums have higher test scores too.

We should do whatever we can that is both responsible to the fish and helps support the aquarium industry.

Sincerely

Jonathan E. Wilson, DO, FACOS, FSVS, RPVI
Midwest Aortic and Vascular Institute,PC
816-842-5555
Jwilson@mavi.life

This message is confidential, intended only for the named recipient(s) and may contain information that is privileged or exempt from disclosure under applicable law. If you are not the intended recipient(s), you are notified that the dissemination, distribution or copying of this message is strictly prohibited. If you receive this message in error, or are not the named recipient(s), please notify the sender at either the email address or by phone at [816.842.5555](tel:816.842.5555) and delete this email from your computer. Thank you.

From: [Phil Wind](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 9:33:19 AM

Hello,

I support the reopening of fisheries in HI and responsible / science-based management of natural resources to ensure sustainability while making animals available to the aquarium trade.

Thank you

Phil Wind
President
Reef eScape LLC
Aquarium Design, Install & Maintain
Mobile (703)943-6631
Phil@reefescape.net

www.facebook.com/ReefeScape



From: [Noah Winn](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 Support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 1:25:52 PM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR. The Hawaiian fishery has been well managed and the proposed permits have low risk to have long standing negative effects.

From: [Rilee Geiermann](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] August 23; Agenda Item F.1
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 12:04:05 PM

Hello,

My name is Rilee Yates and my husband and I are long time residents of Kihei. We frequent the waters of this Island for many reasons, whether it be surfing, snorkeling or boating. One of these reasons is fishing, we fish these waters often to feed our family and because of that we understand the delicate ecosystem we are blessed to be a part of and respect it. It is for this reason that we believe the ultimate decision makers on whether or not to issue AQ permits should be BLNR, not just the Chair of DAR staff. Furthermore, we believe that NO AQ permits should be issued. The devastating fire in Lahaina has hurt us all and the Island may be on a path to recovery, but if these AQ permits are issued I fear that the devastation will only continue and will change the face of this beautiful Aina for generations to come. I urge you to consider what this means for my family, this island and the delicate ecosystem which surrounds us all.

If you have any questions please feel free to contact me.

Thank you,

Rilee Yates
(907) 306-0092

From: [Chee Peng Yeap](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 10:21:55 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

Johnny Yeap

Sent from my iPhone



Department of Land and Natural Resources
Hawaii State Aha Moku
State of Hawaii
Post Office Box 621
Honolulu, Hawaii 96809

August 23, 2024

Board of Land and Natural Resources
State of Hawaii
Honolulu, Hawaii

Re: Testimony on item F1
Request for Approval of the Application Form and Terms and Conditions for the State of Hawaii
Aquarium Fish Permit.

My name is Charles Young. I reside in Kealia South Kona in the Kapalilua region of Hawaii Island. This testimony is submitted on behalf of the Hawaii Island Aha Moku in opposition to the issuance of permits for the purposes of Aquarium Fish Collection within the West Hawaii Regional Fish Management Area (WHRFMA) in perpetuity. Our opposition arises out of our concerns over the Cultural Impacts, concern as a beneficiary and as Indegenous Native Hawaiians over our resources held in Public Trust and concern over the policies and decision making processes that have led to a diminishment in trust among the people of Hawaii and their governing institutions.

Cultural Impacts:

Hawaii State Constitution specifically protects Native Hawaiian gathering rights. The Hawaii State Supreme Court affirmed that in its' Ka Pa'akai O Ka 'Aina vs Land Use Commission decision in 2000. In summary the State and all its subsidiaries are required to conduct a Ka Pa'akai Analysis to determine whether Native Hawaiian rights to include religious beliefs would be impacted by its actions. **A Kapa'akai Analysis is different and more detailed than a cultural impact statement in that it relies heavily on community input from Native Hawaiians.** The Aha Moku is unaware that any specific communities were consulted. We believe it would be improper for the BLNR to decide on such an important issue without the benefit of a Kapa'akai Analysis.

In his book Na Hana a ka Po'e Kahiko (The Works of the People of Old) Kamakau states **"The Hawaiian people were a race of expert fishermen. The art had been handed down from their ancestors. Agriculture and fishing were the two main professions always passing it on by the grandparents for the boys – and at the same time they taught them that thievery and idleness are disgraceful"**.

The Hawaii Constitution and Laws of 1842 describes various laws on fishing. It states **"His Majesty the King hereby takes for fishing grounds from those who now possess them from Hawaii to Kauai, and gives one portion of them to the common people, another portion to the landlords**

*Moku O Keawe (Hawaii Island), Moku O Piilani (Maui), Moku O Kanaloa (Kahoolawe), Nana'i Kaula (Lanai)
Molokai Pule Oo (Molokai), Moku O Kakuhihewa (Oahu), Manokalanipo (Kauai), Ka Aina O Kawelonakala (Niihau)
Kalanimoku Bldg., DLNR, 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130, Honolulu, HI 96813*



Department of Land and Natural Resources
Hawaii State Aha Moku
State of Hawaii
Post Office Box 621
Honolulu, Hawaii 96809

and a portion he reserves to himself”. “But the fishing ground from the coral reefs to the sea beach are for the landlords and for the tenants of their several lands, but not for others”.“

The above two sources shed light on how Native Hawaiians view fish as a resource and subsumed those views into their cultural beliefs and practices. The latter, in my opinion was an attempt to codify those practices into a Constitution and Laws. From our cultural perspective the practices of Konohiki, Kuleana, Malama and Pū 'ai (share food) are described. Although Hawaii today is not a monarchy the above principles have been handed down and as Kamakau states is an important component of a living culture and not to be assigned only to the past . Clearly the reef fish were reserved for the people of place, the tenants. In this regard the people of place have not been allowed sufficient voice on resources that traditionally, customarily and at one time legally belonged to them. At minimum 4 of the 7 species proposed for harvest by the AQ collectors are widely known to Native Hawaiians as food fish, Kole, Umaumalei, Kole Nukueo and Mai'i'i. All 7 would serve as a food source during the lean times. This fact alone is cause enough for denying AQ collection. The practice of collecting and capturing fish off the reefs of the WHRFMA for profit, and the selling of those live specimens to offshore markets only to be displayed in private aquariums is on its face is haole (foreign) for Native Hawaiians. We would not teach this to our children because what we teach our children will determine what choices they make for the future. DAR asserts that Native Hawaiian individuals have participated in AQ collection which seem to contradict the prevailing Hawaiian sentiment. DAR should also consider that had it not been for the legalization and “permitting” AQ collection in the first place Native Hawaiians would not have to deal with this dichotomy of foreign practices. Communities have been generous in acknowledging the divisiveness within their own families due to this fact. **At question here is whether members of the BLNR can continue to validate these kinds of practices, particularly when those practices are completely out of step with the use of our Public Trust.**

Public Trust Lands:

The history of Hawaii's Public Trust Lands is rooted in what has been described as an “Illegal Overthrow” of the Hawaiian Kingdom and Resolution of Annexation in 1898 by the United States and subsequent Organic Act of 1900. It is widely accepted that the Native Hawaiians never relinquished their sovereignty over their lands. That is clearly stated in the United States apology bill of 1993. Language was inserted in the afore mentioned documents that stated among other things the Public Trust Land would be used to benefit native Hawaiians. The State of Hawaii amended that to include the general public, however the courts have maintained that native Hawaiians have a clear and distinct interest from those of the general public in these lands particularly as it relates to Native Hawaiians gathering rights. The State has included language alluding to its' Kuleana and intent to Malama. The DLNR's mission statement to **“Enhance, protect, conserve and manage Hawaii's unique and**

*Moku O Keawe (Hawaii Island), Moku O Piilani (Maui), Moku O Kanaloa (Kahoolawe), Nana'i Kaula (Lanai)
Molokai Pule Oo (Molokai), Moku O Kakuhihewa (Oahu), Manokalanipo (Kauai), Ka Aina O Kawelonakala (Niihau)
Kalanimoku Bldg., DLNR, 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130, Honolulu, HI 96813*



**Department of Land and Natural Resources
Hawaii State Aha Moku
State of Hawaii
Post Office Box 621
Honolulu, Hawaii 96809**

limited natural, cultural and historic resources held in public trust for current and future generations of the people of Hawaii nei, and its visitors, in partnership with others from the public and private sectors.” captures those sentiments. The AQ industry is profitable and understandably incentivizes individuals to participate. The AQ industry has been “permitted” to grow and entrench itself and has leveraged those profits into influence. The AQ industry is a private sector that provides little or no benefit to the current and future generations of Hawaii. It has a history of destructive collection practices, depletion of resources and community dissatisfaction. **In addition, the taxpayers incur the costs to monitor and collect data that helps support and validate the industry.** The industry contends that it is the most highly regulated in the State. This is a direct result of community intervention. Left on its own things would not have changed. This is not a criticism of those whose livelihood in Hawaii depends on it, only that in the pursuit of profit, Pono management practices have taken a back seat. We contend that industries like this should not benefit from Hawaii’s Public Trust Lands without meeting its duty to Malama and Share. Inherent in the public trust doctrine is that all should have access and benefit fairly from the resources held within the trust. We believe that the AQ industry as a business unfairly benefits from our public trust resources and to continue to allow and/or permit it is a contradiction to the values and goals of Hawaii and its people. It is too simple to just say that it is sustainable. It does not sustain our values, the values of our ancestors and certainly not the values that we are passing on to our descendants.

Policies and Decision Making:

AQ collection permits, like most of the permits for ocean use are business propositions. The State exercises its authority to grant permits to private individuals seeking opportunities to profit from the public trust. In its policies for leasing land the DLNR cautions lessees that the land needs to be returned to its original state upon the termination of the lease. We are not aware that these policies exist for ocean permits. As beneficiaries we would like to advocate for more transparency and profitability. As with all permits the State can impose conditions. From a business perspective and as a matter of public policy we would like to better understand:

1. The financial solvency of all applicants before issuing any permits.
2. The business justification and operational plans of the applicants and an end to end ocean to consumer value chain. Where the fish are going and the costs/profits associated. Fish mortality throughout the value chain.
3. Monthly financial reports that include where, when and the number of fish gathered by species.
4. Annual gross/net profit. Income tax statement.

*Moku O Keawe (Hawaii Island), Moku O Piilani (Maui), Moku O Kanaloa (Kahoolawe), Nana'i Kaula (Lanai)
Molokai Pule Oo (Molokai), Moku O Kakuhihewa (Oahu), Manokalanipo (Kauai), Ka Aina O Kawelonakala (Niihau)
Kalanimoku Bldg., DLNR, 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130, Honolulu, HI 96813*



**Department of Land and Natural Resources
Hawaii State Aha Moku
State of Hawaii
Post Office Box 621
Honolulu, Hawaii 96809**

The above information will help the State and inform the beneficiaries of the credibility, reliability and actual on ocean practices of the permittees. Perhaps the State can support electronic tracking devices on each vessel to help all parties monitor and report their activities.

Understanding the value chain will help the State assess financially fair permit conditions. Our fish are being collected, sent and sold offshore. Each time our fish change hands profits are made. Knowing the true worth of the value chain the State and its beneficiaries will be able to assess the true value of the permit and realize a fair return for the resources that are forever extracted.

The BLNR may likely view these suggestions as farfetched. We totally agree, when compared to the status quo. Our point is that if the BLNR is weighing its decision and hoping to find balance between profits that put resources at risk, between livelihoods and cultural norms, between communities and extractive consumption, between legal opinions and common sense and between a future for Hawaii its children and its resources and no future, we trust that you will decide based on the guidance within the DLNR's mission statement.

Below are the DLNR's rules regulating Forest Reserves, specifically rules regulating the collection of forest products. The Aha Moku is concerned about such inconsistencies among Departments, in particular why the rules for AQ collection are considerably more lax. Our resources should be given fair and equal protection. DAR's proposal includes language like "must" and "may" rather than "shall". The former two are not specific nor do they carry any legal or enforceable consequences.

**DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
SUBTITLE 5 FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
PART 1 FORESTRY
CHAPTER 104
RULES REGULATING ACTIVITIES WITHIN FOREST RESERVES**

§13-104-21 Collecting permits. (a) Persons wishing to collect forest products for personal use and at no charge shall obtain a collecting permit authorizing the collection in a specific area.

(b) Each application for a collecting permit
104 -17

3382 ~

§13-104-21
shall be considered on its own merits, including its potential effect on forest reserve resources and the public's use and enjoyment of the forest reserve.

(c) Collecting permits **shall** specify:

(1) The date or dates of collection;

*Moku O Keawe (Hawaii Island), Moku O Piilani (Maui), Moku O Kanaloa (Kahoolawe), Nana'i Kaula (Lanai)
Molokai Pule Oo (Molokai), Moku O Kakuhihewa (Oahu), Manokalanipo (Kauai), Ka Aina O Kawelonakala (Niihau)
Kalanimoku Bldg., DLNR, 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130, Honolulu, HI 96813*



**Department of Land and Natural Resources
Hawaii State Aha Moku
State of Hawaii
Post Office Box 621
Honolulu, Hawaii 96809**

- (2) The quantities and products to be collected;
 - (3) The areas of collection; and
 - (4) Any other terms and conditions deemed necessary by the board or its authorized representative.
- Cd) Permits **shall** not be issued for collecting products for sale.
- (e) No permits **shall** be issued for the collection of endangered or threatened wildlife or plants except as provided by chapter 13-124.
- (f) No more than one permit within a seven-day period may be issued to the same person or persons, group, organization, or association listed on the permit for collecting any of the same forest products.

Energy/Environmental Cost Analysis

The Hawaii AQ industry exists solely to supply out of State markets. There is little or no demand from our residents. Should the AQ industry disappear from Hawaii there would be no disappointed consumers.

The Hawaii AQ industry is not regulated by a standard of care for the fish and instead has been allowed to develop their own standards. Aquarium fish collected and sold as coming from Hawaii can be found online at costs as high as \$449 per fish. The highly profitable nature of the industry has attracted many participants throughout the value chain, all starting with the collector themselves who are "permitted" to collect fish in Hawaii waters. The AQ industry proposes to harvest a total of 224,136 fish from the West Hawaii Regional Fish Management Area (WHRFMA). Online sales demand suggests that the annual take can be conservatively estimated at \$45,000,000 at market value. No one knows for sure because the industry is not required to report that. Industry guidelines suggest that during their captive lifetime the 224,136 fish collected from West Hawaii will consume the equivalent energy to power 7,500 households per year. In 2022 there were an estimated 7,443 households in Kona. We could power most of West Hawaii's households from the energy it takes to support 7 permits, seems wasteful. This would convert to around 3,181,000 gallons of fossil fuel @ \$5/gal, \$15,905,000 (35% of market value in fuel costs). This estimate only includes the energy to transport them and keep them healthy in Aquariums. No one knows for sure because no one keeps track of that. The University of Missouri published guidelines for the transportation for live fish which recommended that each fish should be shipped in vessels containing 1.5 to two gallons of water, instead the Hawaii AQ industry choses to self-regulate. The Hawaii AQ industry choses to follow its own guidelines, however based on the UM guidelines we estimate that transporting the 224,136 fish out of West Hawaii would consume the

*Moku O Keawe (Hawaii Island), Moku O Piilani (Maui), Moku O Kanaloa (Kahoolawe), Nana'i Kaula (Lanai)
Molokai Pule Oo (Molokai), Moku O Kakuhihewa (Oahu), Manokalanipo (Kauai), Ka Aina O Kawelonakala (Niihau)
Kalanimoku Bldg., DLNR, 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130, Honolulu, HI 96813*



**Department of Land and Natural Resources
Hawaii State Aha Moku
State of Hawaii
Post Office Box 621
Honolulu, Hawaii 96809**

equivalent energy of 620 households per year. In a time when we and even the AQ industry point to climate change as a significant threat to Hawaii's marine resources, the Aha Moku strongly encourages the Department of Land and Natural Resources to consider the total environmental consequences in its actions.

In summary our strongest opinions are guided by our attachment to our culture. Through our actions and words, we teach our children to care for the ocean. They are teaching their children and so it will go on as Kamakau reported. AQ collection undermines those teachings. Of any other ethnicity living in Hawaii, Hawaiians are the most resilient. That resiliency is born out of our cultural connections to our place. Hawaiians are entitled to and indeed legally have a seat at the table. Before the DLNR proceeds there needs to be a comprehensive Ka Pa'akai Analysis that truly reaches out to the communities, and not merely a cultural impact assessment. The Aha Moku believes that the true merits of having a Ka Pa'a Kai analysis are still evolving and that the Aha Moku was established to assist the DLNR and its agencies as they evolve.

And finally, in exercising its authority to issue permits for use of our Public Trust resources I encourage that the State and all its agencies review whether it's a good business proposition that incorporates cultural values and a fair return to beneficiaries. When issuing permits for the use of the Public Trust for business purposes, the business is the States business.

I appreciate this opportunity to provide testimony opposing the issuance of Aquarium Fish Collecting permits for the WHRFMA in perpetuity.

Mahalo
Charles Young -Po'o Hawaii Island Aha Moku
PO Box 505
Honaunau, Hi 96726

Cc:

Leimana DaMate, Luna Alaka'i/Executive Director Hawaii State Aha Moku
808-640-1214

Leimana.k.damate@hawaii.gov<mailto:Leimana.k.damate@hawaii.gov

*Moku O Keawe (Hawaii Island), Moku O Piilani (Maui), Moku O Kanaloa (Kahoolawe), Nana'i Kaula (Lanai)
Molokai Pule Oo (Molokai), Moku O Kakuhihewa (Oahu), Manokalanipo (Kauai), Ka Aina O Kawelonakala (Niihau)
Kalanimoku Bldg., DLNR, 1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 130, Honolulu, HI 96813*

From: [Jason Zacher](#)
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item F1 support
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 5:01:58 AM

I support opening the aquarium fishery and managing resources by science provided by DAR.

We cannot learn about these animals if we cannot keep them. The only way to understand how these animals breed and behave is by having an industry that supports sustainable collection.

Most people do not have the ability to dive and see these animals in their natural habitats but many can have a small piece of the ocean in their homes. The Reef Aquarium hobby gives the average person the ability to understand, appreciate and want to protect what lives in our oceans.

My 6 year old daughter understands corals and reef fish as she sees them up close every day and has a relationship with those fish that would never be possible without sustainable collection. I know that as she grows into adulthood she will be inspired preserve the wilds from which they came.

Jason Zacher

From: julie.ziemelis.com
To: [DLNR.BLNR.Testimony](#)
Cc: [Cindi Punihaole](#); [Michael OConnor](#); [Bruce Prunk](#); [Dunker, Kristine J \(DFG\)](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] F-1 OPPOSE Terms & Conditions to Issue AQ Permits & OPPOSE Delegating Authority to Department Chair
Date: Wednesday, August 21, 2024 11:03:11 AM

Aloha Chair and Board of Land and Natural Resources,

My name is Julie Ziemelis, Founder and board member of the 365 Hawaii Island Community Fund and long time resident of Kailua Kona. Our Community Fund supports the reef, natural resources, and marine life of West Hawaii.

DLNR's stated mission is to "Enhance, protect, conserve and manage Hawai'i's unique and limited natural, cultural and historic resources held in public trust for current and future generations of the people of Hawai'i Nei, and its visitors, in partnership with others from the public and private sectors."

Inherent in DLNR's mission is its duty to mālama. This duty must also bind all to whom access and/or use of the Public Land Trust through the DLNR's leases and permits.

Hawai'i's lands and oceans are to be shared and accessed fairly by all its beneficiaries. Aquarium trade permits allow a few individuals to profit by granting them limited and exclusive access.

On behalf of the 365 Hawaii Island Community Fund, we OPPOSE issuing commercial aquarium permits in West Hawai'i and we OPPOSE delegating authority to the Department Chair.

Regarding Terms & Conditions to Issue West Hawai'i AQ permits, I request you reject DAR's AQ Terms and Conditions and deny any and all permits.

Regarding Delegating Authority to Issue AQ Permits to the Department Chair, do not delegate authority to the Department Chair. Retain the discretionary authority with the Board who will continue to utilize their diverse island communities, specialize knowledge, and expertise to weigh in and make informed decisions together.

Mahalo for this opportunity,

Julie Ziemelis

Founder

365 Hawaii Island Community Fund

808-785-2898

Julie@Ziemelis.com

