

DAVID Y. IGE  
GOVERNOR OF  
HAWAII



SUZANNE D. CASE  
CHAIRPERSON  
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

ROBERT K. MASUDA  
FIRST DEPUTY

M. KALEO MANUEL  
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES  
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION  
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT  
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS  
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT  
ENGINEERING  
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION  
LAND  
STATE PARKS

**STATE OF HAWAII  
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION  
KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING  
601 KAMOKILA BLVD, STE 555  
KAPOLEI, HAWAII 96707

**DRAFT MINUTES, pending OIBC APPROVAL  
OAHU ISLAND BURIAL COUNCIL MEETING**

**DATE: Wednesday, March 13th, 2019**  
**TIME: 11:09 AM**  
**PLACE: Department of Land and Natural Resources  
Kalanimoku Building  
Board Room, #132  
1151 Punchbowl Street  
Honolulu, HI 96813**

**OIBC Members:**

**Hinaleimoana Wong-Kalu**, Chair, Kona District representative  
**Aulii Mitchll**, Vice Chair, Wai'anae District representative  
**Beverly Amaral**, Ko'olaupoko District representative  
**Kamana'opono Mills**, Large Landowner representative  
**Mana Caceres**, Ewa District representative  
**Chuck Ehrhorn**, Large Landowner representative  
**Kali Fermantez**, Ko'olauloa District representative  
**Lurline Naone-Salvador**, Waialua District representative

**SHPD Staff:**

**Regina K. Hilo**, Burial Sites Specialist – O'ahu

**Attendants:**

**Kamana Caceres**, 'ohana  
**Keiko Denbeau**, Kawaiaha'o Church  
**Correna Knight**, UH Mānoa  
**Hallett Hammatt**, CSH  
**Alison Welser**, CSH  
**Mishalla Spearing**, CSH  
**David Shideler**, CSH  
**Haunani Hendrix**, Kawaiaha'o  
**Bill Haole**, Kawaiaha'o  
**Matt McDermott**, CSH  
**Andrew McAllister**, public  
**Clinton Salvador**, public  
**Kahu Kenneth Makuakane**, Kawaiaha'o  
**Lani Maa Lapilio**, Aukahi

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

*Meeting called to order by Vice Chair Mitchell at 11:09 AM*

**II. ROLE CALL/PULE**

*Members present at 11:09 AM introduced themselves in the following order:*

*Vice Chair Mitchell, Member Amaral, Member Mills, Member Ehrhorn, and Member Caceres*

*Member Caceres recused himself from items IV. B, C, and D*

**III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

*Deferred to a future meeting as all minutes listed below are incomplete*

~~A. Minutes from 10/10/2018~~

~~B. Minutes from 11/14/2018~~

~~C. Minutes from 12/12/2018~~

~~D. Minutes from 2/13/2019~~

**IV. Business**

**A. Discussion on O‘ahu Island Burial Council membership, roles, and responsibilities**

**Information/Discussion:** Discussion on the above items

*Not addressed*

*Member Fermantez arrived at 11:11 AM*

**B. Cultural Descendancy Recognition of Brandy Kalehua Kamohali‘i Caceres and ‘Ohana (names listed on attachment) as Cultural Descendants to Human Skeletal Remains located at the Bethel Street Project located at 49 South Hotel Street, Honolulu Ahupua‘a, Kona District, O‘ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-002:007**

**Discussion/Determination:** Discussion and determination on the Department’s recommendation to recognize the applicant as cultural descendant to the Native Hawaiian skeletal remains located at the above project.

The Council may elect to go into executive session pursuant to HAR §13-300-25(d). The Council may close a meeting whenever location or description of a Native Hawaiian Burial site is under consideration. The chairperson, by concurrence of a majority of members present at the meeting, shall be authorized to require the public to leave the meeting while the confidential matter is being discussed and reopen the meeting once the confidential matter is no longer being considered.

*Member Caceres recused himself*

*Vice Chair read the above agenda item onto record*

*Vice Chair asked Member Caceres for assistance in pronouncing the names of Caceres ‘ohana*

*Summary:*

Member Caceres shared a story about first coming to the OIBC meetings as a kako‘o to Paulette Kaanohi Kaleikini. Caceres learned more about genealogy, and was taught now to malama iwi. Through his and his ‘ohana’s involvement in the process, he and his ‘ohana have learned a lot more. Caceres and his ‘ohana have learned a lot from Kaanohi, from Hina, from Aulii, and from Kala‘i [Kamuella Kala‘i]. This kuleana is carried by his entire ‘ohana, and this has brought the family back to the foundation of what it means to be kanaka. Caceres and his ‘ohana are thankful to the OIBC. There are two important components to

malama iwi: pale and kalai mihi. Ho'oponopono is also important. Oki is important as a process of moving forward with life and living.

Vice Chair Mitchell thanked Caceres for his work and the work of his 'ohana.

Vice Chair asked if the OIBC had any comments

- Member Fermantez commented that the OIBC has a specific kuleana: to malama iwi kupuna. Fermantez' daughter and Caceres' daughter will be graduating from high school, which puts the kuleana into a broader context.
- Member Amaral shared that, as a newer member of the OIBC, she looks to Member Caceres for his experience and opinion

Vice Chair Mitchell opened the floor to the public

- Kala'i thanked Caceres and his 'ohana for the work they do
  - The kuleana to malama iwi kupuna is of the highest order
  - Important to get your house in order
    - Entering into unchartered territory
  - Member Caceres and his entire 'ohana, young daughters and wahine, are an example of really taking kuleana seriously
    - This reminds you of who you are and who you come from
    - This reminds you of who your 'ohana are
    - This reminds you that they're always right here
      - We don't always feel them because we're not always in a situation where you can feel them because there are too many distractions
  - It is because of Kaanohi Kaleikini that Kala'i has strength and confidence to say the things that need to be said, to be honest, to have integrity, and to care for and protect 'ohana
  - Kala'i looks forward to the day when Kaanohi joins the OIBC and OIBC meeting attendants with her voice and her mana
  - Kala'i thanked Caceres and his 'ohana
  - Kala'i told Caceres to hoomau

***Member Naone Salvador arrived at 11:20 AM***

**Motion:** To recognize Brandy Kalehua Kamohali'i Caceres and 'Ohana (names listed on attachment) as Cultural Descendants to Human Skeletal Remains located at the Bethel Street Project located at 49 South Hotel Street, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-002:007

**Moved by: Member Mills**

**Second: Vice Chair Mitchell**

**VOTE: 5 YES (Mitchell, Amaral, Fermantez, Mills, Ehrhorn); 1 RECUSAL (Caceres)**

***Chair Wong Kalu arrived at 11:20 AM***

**C. Līlia Waikīkī (formerly Kūhiō Collection) Project, Waikīkī Ahupua'a, Honolulu District, O'ahu, TMKs: [1] 2-6-021:100 and 114**

**Information/Discussion/Update:** Update on the above project.

**Discussion/Determination:** Discussion and determination whether to preserve in place or relocate the human skeletal remains at the above project and location.

*Update provided by Matt McDermott*

*Summary:*

AIS is still under SHPD review

No determination is requested at this time

**D. Kawaiaha'o Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017**

**Information/Discussion:** Update on the above project

*Update provided by Lani Maa Lapilio; David Shideler, Bill Haole*

*Kawaiaha'o Trustees present in the room: Haunani Hendrix, Keiko Denbeau*

*Summary of discussion:*

David Shideler

- three volumes of documentation given to SHPD in Oct. 2018

Bill Haole: March 19<sup>th</sup>, 2019 meeting for the recognized descendants

- presentation
- would like to hear the descendants wishes
- thanked the Chair for taking the Kahu to visit sites

Chair Wong-Kalu acknowledged what was said

- Because of the ongoing discussion and consultation with recognized descendants, there is recognition that the greatest desire is expedition of what will be the final disposition of the iwi kupuna who will be laid to rest.
- Chair engaged Kahu to visit places that have kuleana to malama iwi kupuna to give the Kahu greater clarity;
- Kahu can share with the Kawaiahao team;
  - hopes to expedite this;
  - Chair looks forward to whatever the Kawaiahao Church team presents at next week's meeting

Kala'i

- she had explained at the last consultation meeting that all the families want the kupuna back exactly from where they came from;
- will always say that until she dies or passes on, it is the only pono thing;
- the first kuleana of the Council is to decide whether to preserve in place or relocate;
- the kupuna have been in the basement for the past 8, 9, 10, 11 years;
- doesn't look forward to hearing what the Church has to say;
- Church and CSH have benefited and profited from the work done;
  - had a convo with Hal Hammatt when he was holding a shovel, he stated he had a contract;
  - Kala'i stated that she had asked him how he would feel if someone took a shovel to his grandmother's grave;
- how the Church continues to get away with it;
- anyone working with them is complicit in a crime, a thousand times over
- has no sympathy for anyone who deals with the Church
- Church found a way to cut the OIBC and the descendants out of the process
- The lawsuits stopped anything [any work] from happening
- Preserve in place is the only right thing to do in this situation
- If the Church has any other ideas, keep it, and shove it, doesn't want to hear it
- the kupuna have always deserved better
- the first 23 encountered were designated as inadvertent
- SHPD was not part of that process, and it was Department of Health
- Doesn't want to wait for the SHPD to take a year to review

- We are doing this backwards
- We know they're in the basement
- What is the best way to go home
- You don't shove them in a corner, you don't cremate them
- Put them back where you found them,
- This is different, unique, horrible, painful
- This should never have happened,
- Companies like CSH, David Shideler, need to be held accountable;
  - where's the ethics of this industry
  - Kala'i hopes someone comes to them at night and whispers in their ears what they did wrong
  - There's only one decision to make; preserve in place or relocate
- If this was asked before the work was done, what would you have decided, preserve in place or relocate
- This is not a proud tradition: digging up kupuna with the blessings of their kahu
  - This will never be right; we all have kupuna
  - Think about it
  - Not good, not right, never gonna be right
- hopes the meeting is more than wala'au
- Addressed the OIBC – ask yourselves preserve in place or relocate, and take it from there

Chair addressed the Council and everyone else

- Personally and professionally, as one Hawaiian looking at another Hawaiian in a position of leadership, it is not without reason that these scenarios have taken place elsewhere.
- Kahu can speak for himself and invites Kahu to join them at the meeting

Kahu Ken Makuakane

- The Council needed something from the project proponents to take an action on

Chair stated she would like to see this expedited as quickly as possible

- Hina taught children K thru 12, sometimes you just need the steam and pressure to come out
- Doesn't try to purposely censor anyone, asks that they, all present, armor up;
- the Council hasn't yet needed to take the wrath
- Asked if Kahu had anything to say about the excursion he had with Hina

Kahu

- apologized for being late, as he was stuck in a meeting
- Kahu went throughout the Kona district, as far as Waikiki, to view different kinds of burial preservation areas;
- was touched by the ways in which iwi kupuna were taken care of; see how the iwi kupuna are honored;
- our people haven't had a voice for very long;
- we should value all kanaka mana'o, which has not been brought to the forefront before;
- Kahu is from Keaukaha – he can see Mauna Kea from there, and there are different perspectives depending on where you are looking at Mauna Kea;
- kanaka, as a unified entity, can discuss how to take care of our iwi kupuna;
- trying to listen through the discussion;
- some people talk about iwi like a product or outcome;

- they are ‘ohana, it is no less than that, and we value everything our people in the past and present have lain down their lives for;
- it’s an honor for ‘ohana to place their ‘ohana remains at the Church;
- thanks the OIBC for sharing his sentiments

Member Naone Salvador asked when Kahu started as Kahu

Kahu stated he started on May 6, 2018

Member Naone Salvador

- shared that she knows Kahu and what he believes;
- Lurline believes Kahu was placed at Kawaiahao to address this matter;
- stated she will pule for him;
- he inherited something that had gone on for years

Kahu thanked Lurline

Lurline thanked Kahu for what he was doing

Kahu thanked Lurline for her sentiments, and also thanked the Chair for the huaka’i

Chair

- stated that she had done so as a fellow Hawaiian in a leadership role;
- also to hopefully expedite judiciously reburial of the remains;
- from one kanaka to another kanaka

Member Caceres

- shared his mana’o as a recognized cultural descendant;
- thanked Hina for taking Kahu on the huaka’i to honor and acknowledge the space;
- thanked Chair for her comments about expediting the decision as last month
- Recognized descendants held a meeting, and 7 or 8 ‘ohana were represented;
  - Caceres ‘ohana is one of the younger families, and they were asked a lot of questions;
  - will be another meeting;
    - an opportunity to be separate from the larger meetings where aggravations can cause newer ‘ohana to be intimidated;

Bill Haole

- thanked the Council and Chair for showing the Church the way,
- has surmised that based on Kahu’s direction and the direction of the Council that it is imperative that the Church listen;
- they will build upon what is heard;
- it is hard to hear the kaumaha of Kala’i
- apologized that it has taken so long

Member Fermantez apologized for missing the first two OIBC meetings of 2019

RKH stated that there was no meeting in January 2019

Member Fermantez wants to know more about the Board's position on the iwi kupuna at Kawaiahao [currently in the basement for which the BTP is being prepared with consultation from the recognized descendants]

Haunani:

- agrees with everything the Kahu said,
- the Kahu has the Board's blessings

Member Fermantez asked Lani what the sticking point is, as the Council tries to operation in consensus

Lani stated that consensus is the goal.

- It's a lot to say preservation in place, but what does that mean?
- Still listening to others ideas to what that means. Knows the kupuna will go back into the puka, but exactly where is uncertain.
- Listening to what the 'ohana want
- Board is very supportive;
- Kahu has a committee, they will come up with options;
- for the next meeting, the Church wants to listen, with preservation in place, what does that really look like

Haunani: January 2019 was the first time there was any discussion about the burial treatment plan

Member Fermantez reiterated the Council's intention is to make things pono

Member Ehrhorn stated that he supports what the Chair did; also thanked the Chair for taking the Kahu to see different burial preservation locations around Honolulu

Member Fermantez stated the Chair is pretty independent

Member Ehrhorn joked about not knowing Member Fermantez' name

Member Fermantez stated he is pretty independent himself

Member Ehrhorn asked what updates can be discussed since the last meetings

Bill Haole

- the first three volumes have been submitted;
  - were originally shooting for a mid-late March 2019 for the remaining volumes;
  - might bring in another consultant
  - understands that the plan is very important to the descendants
- in the Church's discussions, they are re-thinking how they approach meetings
  - the puka, under the Chair's directions and those of the Board, will be cleaned out, monitoring weed-abatement;
- monitoring the weather as well, discussing increasing security measures;

Member Ehrhorn asked about the meeting next Tuesday

- what exactly are the Church's goals for the meeting?

Lani: as Bill said, the Church wants to change the strategy and be more inclusive of the descendants. Listen and come up with mana'o that can be worked on. Doing the BTP, knowing that the kupuna are going back in the puka, details.

Member Ehrhorn: not coming to the meeting with any strategy the RCD can react to?

Haunani: it's still under discussion and trying to figure out a strategy.

Member Ehrhorn: Concerned because this has been going on for years. Work towards a conclusion.

Kahu: at last month's Board meeting, a treatment with 3 options was decided upon by the Board. Whether the descendants like it or not is unknown.

Member Ehrhorn: ok.

Kahu: will be built into the discussion.

Bill: It will be important to present to the RCD to get their mana'o and bring the discussion points from the meeting to the Council. Bill was not present at the January 2019 meeting, but reviewed the notes and saw that all the options presented were shot down by the RCD.

Member Ehrhorn: Only one product of an end result, but several ways to get there. We all have to work on that.

Lani: correct.

Vice Chair Mitchell: how do the three options the Church has stack up with what the RCDs want?

Bill: Conflicting points of views about what preservation in place is. For example, the RCDs don't want individuals to be stacked, yet that is how the burials were discovered in those locations. Can those iwi be contained in a way that is respectful of the RCDs desires?

Taking into account all the RCDs comments.

First meeting was very contentious, with the plans approved by the Board and with the Kahu, see how to mitigate the concerns and address the RCDs concerns; take into account and mitigate the RCDs concerns

Understands that time has never been in the favor of the Church; but need to take the necessary time to listen and get it right

Member Caceres: an important piece of info the 'ohana Caceres needs is how many hina'i are in the basement, how many are we looking at

Bill: how many baskets and how much space; if the timing is right, we'll share those go back again, mixing the RCDs thoughts and concerns

Chair Wong-Kalu: Former history; sometimes it was the developers' interest and the interest of the Council in treatment; yet the OIBC advocates and supports the RCDs recommendations; Chair fields calls from other IBCs; previously, there How will they be laid out? How will it look like at the top?



Chair looks forward to hearing that in the meetings

Member Caceres kakoo that mana'o

Vice Chair cannot attend; Chair will attend and Bev will attend with the Chair

Caceres is a RCD and his position must come from that of a RCD

Chair Wong-Kalu stated that the OIBC had taken action to ensure Caceres could attend as a RCD

Member Caceres stated he is not part of the "PIG" [Permitted Interaction Group]

Chair thanked the Church for their updates

Member Fermantez stated that logistics is the big issue; there is no precedent for this?? Need to have the details.

*RKH left the room at 12:15 PM*

*RKH returned to the room at 12:18 PM*

*Agenda section V was addressed next*

## V. INADVERTENTS/COMMUNICATIONS

### A. Inadvertent discovery of human skeletal remains on February 15, 2019 at Howard Hughes Corporation's Aalii Project, Kukuluaeo Ahupua'a, Kona District, O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-3-002:106

**Information/Discussion:** Information on the above inadvertent discovery.

Updates provided by RKH

RKH shared that a number of finds had occurred on this project around the same time as this and couldn't recall the specifics of this inadvertent find

### B. Inadvertent discovery of human skeletal remains on February 13<sup>th</sup>, 2019 at Waialeale Ahupuaa, Ko'olauloa District, O'ahu, TMK: [1] 5-8-001:015

**Information/Discussion:** Information on the above inadvertent discovery.

Updates provided by RKH

Summary:

Phone call was received after hours at the SHPD's Kapolei office from a tourist who had been walking the beach at Kaunala/Velzyland and came across what appeared to her to be human skeletal remains. HPD was contacted, HPD stated DLNR needed to be contacted, which is why the message was left with SHPD. RKH heard about the case on Feb. 15<sup>th</sup>, and coordinated a site visit with the individual who reported the finding for Feb. 22<sup>nd</sup>. Remains that were found were fragmentary, and had likely been in the water for a long time: one of the cranial fragments was very smooth as if it had been tumbling in the surf for a long period of time. There was also a tibia on a grassy knoll above the beach. The remains are in curation with the SHPD.

Member Fermantez apologized as he was in New Zealand for the previous meeting. RKH stated she planned on talking with Uncle Ralph Makaiiau of Turtle Bay on any options for reburial on Turtle Bay grounds or something nearer to the discovery. The beach grounds are City and County property. RKH can talk to City and County as well.

Member Fermantez asked how RKH was able to get onto City and County property RKH stated the area is right next to UH's Experimental Agricultural Station, on the ocean side; the remains were right on the shore. RKH had no idea where the remains originated from and walked the beach looking for any information on where they may have eroded out from. Didn't see anything indicative of a burial feature, and the cranial fragment appeared to have been in the water for a long time. The cranial fragment was smooth with no sutures visible.

Vice Chair Mitchell commented

RKH said that sometimes, if remains are located at a depth affected by tidal fluctuation while in a sandy deposit, the remains may become ossified or mineralized. Remains that are mineralized are hard and heavy. Makai portion has a fishpond right in front of the agricultural station.

RKH will send updates to Member Fermantez

**C. Inadvertent discovery of human skeletal remains on March 06<sup>th</sup>, 2019 adjacent to the Oahu Cemetery, Nuuanu Avenue Right-of-Way, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, O'ahu, TMK: [1] 1-8-001: Nuuanu Avenue Right-of-Way**

**Information/Discussion:** Information on the above inadvertent discovery.

Updates provided by RKH

RKH stated the remains were heavily impacted by previous road grading in the area and installation of a drain line many years before. Remains were very fragmented.

RKH will work with Oahu Cemetery on reburial.

Remains were removed from the trench excavation and are currently being curated by the SHPD.

**D. Update on the inadvertent discovery of human skeletal remains on January 15, 2018 at the Pililau Army Recreation Center, [1] 8-5-001:009**

**Update:** Update on the above inadvertent discovery.

Updates provided by RKH

The remains were returned to PARC via their cultural advisors and will be reburied on PARC property in their burial preservation area

**E. State Historic Preservation Division's History and Culture branch update on cases, inventory, and internship outreach**

**Information/Discussion:** Information and discussion on the above topics.

Updates provided by RKH

RKH currently has three interns assisting at the SHPD: one is a student in the Certificate in Applied Forensic Anthropology program at UH West Oahu and will be graduating this semester, two are students at UH Mānoa

RKH will be providing monthly updates at the OIBC meetings to the OIBC regarding the SHPD's cases in curation and seeking their assistance in reburial, community outreach, etc.

OIBC thanked RKH for her work

## **VI. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**A. Next meeting date is scheduled for 10:00 AM on Wednesday, April 10<sup>th</sup>, 2019, at the Kalanimoku Building, Board Room #132.**

**Motion: to adjourn the meeting**

**Moved by: Mitchell**

**2<sup>nd</sup>: Fermantez**

**VOTE: 7 AYES (Wong-Kalu, Mitchell, Amaral, Caceres, Mills, Naone Salvador, Ehrhorn), 0 NAY, 0 RECUSALS**

**Meeting adjourned at 1:27 PM**

**MEETING MINUTES in DRAFT FORM for OIBC consideration, review, and approval at their 2019-06-19 meeting.**

**Minutes respectfully prepared by Regina K. Hilo, Burial Sites Specialist, History and Culture branch, State Historic Preservation Division.**

**[2019-06-18]**

***‘Ohana Caceres***

**For recognition at the March 13<sup>th</sup>, 2019 Oahu Island Burial Council meeting,  
agenda item below:**

**IV. Business**

**B. Cultural Descendant Recognition of Brandy Kalehua Kamohalii Caceres and ‘Ohana,  
listed below, to Human Skeletal Remains located at the Bethel Street Project, 49 South  
Hotel Street, Honolulu Ahupua’a, Kona District, O’ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-002:007**

Brandy Kalehua Kamohalii Caceres

Norman “Mana” Christopher Moore Kaleilani Caceres

Kekamamakoakailihou Kaleilani Kamohalii Caceres

Keaheaalaiianiikekamaehuokahikiku Kiekiekananiokuuleilehua Kamohalii Caceres

Kekamakeuakauikuhaikalai Kalehuahie Kamohalii Caceres

Kahuakaokekamaakawai Kamanaokaopuulehua Kamohalii Caceres