

DAVID Y. IGE
GOVERNOR OF
HAWAII



SUZANNE D. CASE
CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

ROBERT K. MASUDA
FIRST DEPUTY

JEFFREY T. PEARSON, P.E.
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

**STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION
KAKUHIHEWA BUILDING
601 KAMOKILA BLVD, STE 555
KAPOLEI, HAWAII 96707

**APPROVED MINUTES:
OAHU ISLAND BURIAL COUNCIL MEETING**

DATE: Wednesday, February 14, 2018
TIME: 11:30 AM
PLACE: Department of Land and Natural Resources
Kalanimoku Building
Board Room, #132
1151 Punchbowl Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

Attendance

Members:

Hina Wong-Kalu, Chair (Chair Wong-Kalu); Kona Representative
Aulii Mitchell, Vice Chair (Vice Chair Mitchell); Waianae Rep.
Beverly Amaral, Koolaupoko Rep.
Kali Fermantez, Koolauloa Rep.
Mana Caceres, Ewa Rep.

Absent:

Danna Holck, Large Landowner Rep.; excused

SHPD staff:

Regina K. Hilo, Burial Sites Specialist, History and Culture branch

Guests:

Matt McDermott, Cultural Surveys Hawaii
Jerry K. Spencer, Kinimaka 'Ohana
Johnston Kaipō Spencer, Kinimaka 'Ohana
Russell Yamamoto, WCC
Bill Haole, Kawaiaha'o Church
Jessica K. Eaton, WCC
Nancy McMahan, Exploration Associates
Lester H. Inouye, LIA
Sheila Valdez, Kunia
Leilehua Keohookalani, KLRF
Colby Makahilahila, Buckle 'Ohana
Ashley Makahilahila, Buckle 'Ohana
Lenette Makahilahila, Buckle 'Ohana
Alexander Akau, Buckle 'Ohana
Elaine Akau, Buckle 'Ohana
Brittany Beauchan, Cultural Surveys Hawaii
Amelia Kelley, Kunia
Sheila Okin, Kinimaka 'Ohana
Diane Fitzsimmons, Kinimaka 'Ohana
Kapu Kinimaka-Alquiza, Kinimaka 'Ohana
Nani Kinimaka-Davis, Kinimaka 'Ohana
Alika Johnson, OCR

Tuahine Kaleikini, Keaweamahi
Rick Howard, WCC
Jon Tulchin, KS
Trever Duarte, KS
Lani Maa Lapilio, Aukahi
Ellen Keala Kinimaka Senkus, Kinimaka 'Ohana
David Shideler, Cultural Surveys Hawaii
Debbie Lui-Anderson, KLRP
Mei Pang, BHGRE Advantage
Jennifer Okino, Long & Associates
Kalehua Caceres, Caceres 'Ohana
Nigel T. Kingsbury, SCS

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting started at 11:30 AM

II. ROLE CALL/PULE

*Members introduced themselves in the following order: Chair Hinalaimoana Wong-Kalu, Kona; Vice Chair Aulii Mitchell – Waianae; Member Beverly Amaral – Koolauloko; Member Kali Fermantez – Koolauloa; Member Mana Caceres – Ewa
Leo pule/oli offered by Member Fermantez*

Ue ka lani, ola ka honua.

Expansion on 'olelo no 'eau offered by Chair Wong-Kalu, pilina

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~~A. Minutes from 08/02/2017~~

~~B. Minutes from 10/25/2017~~

~~C. Minutes from 12/20/2017~~

Deferred

IV. Business

Items were addressed out of order to facilitate time and discussion

Member Danna Holck arrived at 11:36 AM

Item IV. E was addressed first

A. Discussion on O'ahu Island Burial Council membership, roles, and responsibilities

Information/Discussion: Discussion on the above items.

B. 'Alohilani Resort (formerly Pacific Beach Hotel) Renovation Project, Waikiki Ahupua'a, Honolulu (Kona) District, O'ahu, TMKs: [1] 2-6-026:020 and 026, Lili'uokalani Avenue and Kalakaua Avenue Rights-of-Way

Information/Discussion: Update on the above project.

C. Burial Treatment Plan for Human Skeletal Remains Designated SIHP #50-80-04-7836, Encountered in the Hale'iwa Town Improvement District Walkway/Utility/Landscaping Project, Kawailoa Ahupua'a, Waiialua District, O'ahu, TMK: [1] 6-6

Information/Discussion: Update on the above project.

David Shideler, Jim Niermann

Summary:

Update on project last presented 18 months ago; C&C representation, also involves KS lands

Pushed by 2 parties, Tom Shirai, hopes to be RCD for this case; Archaeology and H&C branch, do a quick presentation to the OIBC

PowerPoint: archaeo of the area – Anahulu area; Waialua side of the Anahulu bridge, just Mauka of Haleiwa Joes; (1) 6-2-12:030; AIS has been under review for 19 months, BTP cannot be reviewed by OIBC without an accepted AIS; SIHP 50-80-04-07838; photo of area; 2015 – excavation of 20 ft trench, MNI of 3, fragments in disturbed context, approx. 90 cmbs; Tom Shirai has been involved and is actively consulted on this issue, D. Shideler read his statement onto record:

“February 12, 2018. Aloha Dave, I sent SHPD my cultural descendant recognition application twice without reply. I’d like to formally be a cultural descendant for this specific iwi. A sidewalk will be built over them and currently it’s a walkway and bus stop. Relocate near. They deserve better. Await your response. Mahalo, Thomas T. Shirai, Jr.”

Kupuna was identified in 2015, Shirai has indicated it’s been too long; vehicles pull over in the area where the iwi are located; concerned about vehicular and pedestrian traffic

David: believes the iwi scatter continue towards Haleiwa town, widely scattered deposit of iwi; has reached out to other parties, conversation and discussion is ongoing; Keith Awai commented the iwi be recovered, wrapped in kapa and reburied somewhere safe, though no specific location was suggested; Shirai had suggested relocation to the Queen Liliuokalani church side, which is on the same side as the iwi are located, 200m toward Waialua side

Jim: Project started in 2014 with optimism that the project would go smoothly and quickly, has extended to 4 years; looking at landscape strip and walkway going through the area where the iwi were found; low curb or ballard to prevent vehicles from driving into that area and onto the shoulder; all possibilities are to be determined

Member Fermantez: Still got metal plates and/or construction materials?

Jim: Probably not our project; 7-11 had roadside improvements, other landowners have had work done

Vice Chair Mitchell: scattered remains? Archaeological context?

David: Fill deposit, previously disturbed fill deposit.

Chair Wong-Kalu: Kona Recognized Cultural Descendants have determined having vehicles pass over is ok, not an immediate concern. Not deliberately driving over iwi. Varying sentiments. Depends on what the consultation holds. Keith Awai is Chair’s close cousin, and a cultural voice for that side. Up to the consultants to determine how much weight to give Tom Shirai. As a former Council member, he was the member that hardly came.

Member Fermantez: Initial suggestion that Keith Awai be contacted for the project was provided 18 months ago.

David: Because 2 of 2 have responded asking for relocation, when the outreach has been; no RCDs to these iwi?

Hilo: Correct. No descendants have been recognized yet to the iwi at this project. Hilo reached out to Shirai because his email was unclear.

David: Since those who have weighed in on this have expressed preference for relocation, the BTP under preparation for OIBC approval will be for relocation.

Chair Wong-Kalu: wants to encourage the project proponents to reach out to the community and check to see if applications have been received by Regina for the project

DFitzsimmons: member of the Waialua Civic Club. After the Pali, Kamehameha stopped at Waimea bay to gather supplies; a bunch of warriors moved back to Waialua; may have genealogical ties, need to check Mahele.

HWK: asked Diane to contact project proponents.

KF: Determination to move before, rather than preserve in place.

D. Waikīkī Improvements Phase 2 – Kalākaua Avenue Project, Waikīkī Ahupua‘a, Honolulu (Kona) District, O‘ahu, Multiple TMKs

Information/Discussion: Update on the above project.

Item D: Waikiki Improvement project

Presented by Matt McDermott, Lani Maa Lapilio,

1st meeting; kinda a done deal, but want to make OIBC aware

City improvement project along Kalakaua, City moving forward proactively

ADA improvements. Shallow street improvements, MOU in place with SHPD unless there's ground disturbance; potential for encountering iwi, SHPD recommended AMP be prepared. City reached out to descendants to present archaeo monitoring plan. Tons of work in the area. Doing AIS for street improvement wouldn't provide more information. Macy's Outrigger (get rest from patt) Pacific Beach/Alohilani, Foster Tower, Aston Park Shore. NO federal involvement; MOU in place with SHPD 2015; AMP consultation meeting Dec. 5, 20217

Project sepcs: replace tiles, fix drainage issues, consolidate landscaping (vegetation buffers) ADA improvements.

Current: red brick sidewalk, change to consistent pavers. Unify look of Kalakaua area.

Project includes C&C and Private lands

Maps showing archaeo done in the area. Macy's and Outrigger area; street lighting improvements and utility trenching done. Burials w/in project area, p-i-p, Doing an AIS wouldn't necessarily provide more info.

City stated cultural monitoring would be supported; could start as early as June 2018; locate burials in the project area; and iwi kupuna finds would be inadvertent, and SHPD jurisdiction

KF: What's the state of those previously identified individuals:

Matt: Some still in place; majority were relocated to the Kapahulu vault, Ka Halia Aloha.

E. Burial Site Component of a Preservation Plan for One Known Burial Site (Site #50-80-08-7331) on Kunia Mauka Loa Ridge C&C Farmlands, Hono'uli'uli Ahupua'a, 'Ewa District, O'ahu Island, Hawai'i, TMK: [1] 9-2-053:057

Discussion/Determination: Discussion and determination whether to preserve in place or relocate human skeletal remains at the above location.

Recommendation to the State Historic Preservation Division whether to accept or not accept the Burial Site Component, above.

[BSCPP was erroneously listed on the OIBC agenda for determination; the BSCPP was not approved by the SHPD such that it could be addressed by the OIBC for determination]

Summary:

Project introduction by Nancy McMahon (NM);

- original proposal was 7 sites for preservation
- SHPD asked for additional testing
- survey work taken over by TCP Hawaii,
- additional testing found 1 confirmed burial, for which NM was contracted to prepare the BSCPP which addresses its treatment
- 7 more for preservation, and 18 features/sites for preservation
- BSC – landscaping, signage, buffer; farm manager (not present), has been some time since this BSC has been presented to the Council

Chair Wong-Kalu asked why only the one burial site was addressed in the BSC

RKH stated BSC documents address confirmed, tested burials; treatment of probable burial sites and/or features would be documented in a preservation plan

Chair Wong-Kalu [in Hawaiian] asked if Mana had attended the consultation meetings; Mana replied his wife had attended

Member Fermantez: 2 acres easement?

NM: Yes.

Member Fermantez: The other site buffers are smaller?

NM: Yes, they vary.

Vice Chair Mitchell: Read the BSCPP very carefully, had plenty concerns; what prompted them to test this burial and not the others?

NM: The first version of the report by TCP did not include sub-surface testing, same with the previous report submitted by CSH; SHPD wanted testing at particular sites, TCP (Chris) had some site testing parameters for dates, thought the enclosure might potentially be an animal pen; cross-section of wall, in-tact site; kiawe thicket protects the sitewent to base of wall to determine construction and seek additional information at the base of the wall. Found iwi while engaged in the excavation and stopped. Additional testing at the other sites was not done.

Vice Chair Mitchell: Use over time has changed significantly. Please review indices I thru F. As an anthropologist and researcher, there could be a lot more background research on the part of EAL. Lots of mistakes in here. So many questions.

NM: Mitchell is a newer member, as the earlier draft was more comprehensive.

Vice Chair Mitchell: Want to put that out on the table, from text to content. Tables, lots of space, emails on there, no information about who is talking to who. No reference as to who is talking, don't know who is talking.

NM: Early consultation, some people did not want to disclose their names.

Chair Wong-Kalu asked if there were any other comments.

NM: Looking for OIBC concurrence of a determination of preservation in place.

Chair Wong-Kalu: Asked for other people in the community

Leilehua Keohookalani (LK): Been on the aina for 48 years. Paniolo. Knows where sites are. The only reason the one burial was checked into was because we requested it. Army of one. The only one on the archaeological committee for Kunia Ridge.

Vice Chair Mitchell: Archaeo committee is only lot owners?

LK: "I am a lot owner."

NM: Leilehua has not submitted her genealogy, is a long term resident.

LK: Campbell Estate has a map that shows her last name.

Chair Wong-Kalu: for the purpose of formality; re-joined the Council in June, so meetings to discuss the project would have happened while Chair was serving on the Council; asked who in the audience was present for the project

Na wahine o Kunia, Kunia Farmland Board, na lala o ka aina

Chair Wong-Kalu [in Hawaiian, asked if there was a list of RCDs], read list of recognized descendants in the BSC on page 62 (below):

Paulette Kaanohiokalani Kaleikini

Shanlyn Maile Keaweamahi Kanohokula

Moani Umiaimoku Kaleikini

April Leimomi Keaweamahi

Tuahine Kanekapolei Kaleikini

Michael Lani Keaweamahi

Kala Waahila Kaleikini

Kalahikiola Mahikeahi Keliinoi

Kilinahe Ialumoku Keliinoi

Aliikaua Keawenuiaumi Kaleikini

Noeau Kamehanaokala Kaleikini
Haloa Kekoo Namakaokalani Kaleikini
Mahiaimoku Kekaulike Kaleikini
JR Keonekapu Williams
Moehonua Keaweamahi Kaleikini
Michael Kumukauoha Lee
Jim Medeiros Senior
Kimball Kekaimalino Kaopio
Brandy Kalehua Kamohalii Caceres
Norman “Mana” Christopher Moore Kaleilani Caceres
Kekamamakoaakailiou Kaleilani Kamohalii Caceres
Keahealaiianiikekamaehuokahikiu Kiekiekananiokuuleilua Kamohalii Caceres
Kekamakeuakauikuhaikalai Kalehuahiehie Kamohalii Caceres
Glenn Kila
Henry Kaleoaloha Rafael Jr.
Lindsey Kehaulani Rafael Richter
Scottina Malia Ruis

Sheila Valdez (SV) stated that she represents her children.

Chair Wong-Kalu asked if Leilehua went through the recognition process.

LV stated she did not

Chair asked how the consultation was done

Debbie Lui (DL): site visits; lots of sites, intention was always preservation in place; some sites in the CSH report were old Army roads, did preserve heiau in Lot 63, heiau is a letter lot of 18 acres, no one could go down there, use as a green space; intention has always been preservation in place; original visit with David Shideler and OHA, Debbie got lost, was separated from the group, came upon site, intention was never to disturb the site within those two acres

(discussion of the site dimensions differed between all discussants)

SV: stated there were mounds all around the enclosure

Chair Wong-Kalu asked what the method of consultation was

DL stated the engagement was direct

NM: Chris was doing the consultation initially, came and did presentations at the OIBC; NM took over at Chris' request; site visits following OIBC meeting with OHA; attempts to have field trips with people, some people showed up, some didn't; emailed concerns going on; some concerns about farm activities going on; NM did a presentation at the OIBC; Paulette asked that NM engage Joe Lapilio to direct the consultation, met with the recognized cultural descendants; got farm people together and had a meeting

SV: Was not allowed to speak at that meeting. Was moved to the back of the room; was excluded from speaking at that meeting. Never been on the email to be notified about meetings.

LK commented

DL: stated LK has her contact information and phone number and could call her at any time

SV stated there were group emails

DL stated she never initiated a group email; last time there was an issue, [someone] brought the news [station]; protocol wasn't followed

SV stated protocol was not needed, as she is 'ohana

LK stated she called [someone] because the lot [with the burial] was sold, and the new lot owner was in the burial with his machine. Tore down all the fencing that was protecting the burial.

SV stated he has piles of fencing all around the burials

Debbie: “You did speak to Elliott? Elliot was there?”

Leilehua: No, he was busy.

Chair Wong-Kalu: “Elliot is the farm manager? He’s the one that took us in the early –“

DL: No, that was Jeff Richardson. Jeff Richardson was the original –“

DL: intention is that if something happens, we are there to protect; coconut wireless, if something happens and someone calls, we do [address] it

HWK: Raucous opportunity, wild-wild uplands; most challenging thing to take Sheila’s concerns, compiled with the other issues as Shelia is representing her children, up there as part of Na Wahine; on the site visit, State kuleana with C&C is blurred; project received a small infusion of federal \$ through USDA; creating opportunity to bring people to the land to farm

DL: NRCS grant was a SIG grant to create conservation planning over a large landscape for individual small farms; NRCS created a handbook on this; landscape conservation plan, which received a grant; money did not come to the developers; created handbook for NRCS

KF: What is the business item we need to make a determination on?

RKH: Preservation in place., and recommend

KF: To expedite this item. SV has been coming to the Council for 5 years, as long as KF has been a member; can we do something to move forward? 2 acres easement. Other pilikia

HWK: Yes, we can address it. Yes other pilikia. OIBC wants to be responsible and address its kuleana appropriately. Reference to tangled hair. Challenge. Asked if anyone else attended Section 106 training.

RKH asked to check on Section 106 training (NPI) for all OIBC members.

HWK: Section 106 consultation.

NM: One of the members wrote a letter to the ACHP (Sheila), ACHP state there is no trigger for Section 106 consultation.

HWK: Mahalo, for me now, it’s worse. No need section 106, one less level of bureaucracy. Kali with what you’re saying, City and State was hands up about whose kuleana this is. worst part is for consultation, whatever is the in house engage, that’s what it is. Individuals feel they’re concerns are not being addressed.

Debbie: Educational.

Discussion

HWK: Up to the Board. Unless the board leadership. Told Leilehua to come forward for recognition. To the Board, and lot owners, and individuals, go back and engage each other.

Beverly: Asked if the Board member present is in charge of the Board.

Board member: We handle any problems we have on the farmland – erosion, BTP violations. Archaeo sites are left up to the landowner. Only get involved if the landowner comes to the board. Need to look at the deed and see what restrictions are on it. Flags, stones. Not allowed to disturb any of those sites. For lot owners, they come to the Board for clarification; they come to the consultant, Leilehua. Broad instructions to the individual lot owners. Map and deed indicate where the archaeo sites are through their real-estate agent who sold them the land.

Debbie: However, Elliot does (Farm manager).

Board member: lots of confusion.

Bev: I’m a real estate agent. These things must be disclosed. These are Native Hawaiian burial sites.

Debbie: They’re not all burials.

AM: Not all burials.

Leilehua: 350 sites.

NM: That (number) includes features.

Na Wahine: Unless the association makes rules, laws, no one is going to follow them. If Board is not going to do anything or make rules into consideration, a BTP will make no difference.

Debbie: The site (being discussed) is the only burial site. If Sheila wants to weigh in on the treatment....

Sheila: Thank you for that. I wrote a BSC. You took what I wrote and put it in your BTP as a comment.

HWK: Which one of you is going. Does not want to hear about this anymore. Request the project contact RKH when they've had another huddle. AM available to help with these people?

AM: Yes.

HWK: You can have up to 2 members. Mana and AM. Meet with them and support this.

AM provides #; MC provides #.

HWK ask that the project follow up with Regina.

RKH stated she does not want to be involved until there is resolution.

HWK asks of Council to support postponing and revisit until there is an opportunity for them to regroup and figure it out. Not acceptable.

Motion: To defer

Moved: Kali

2nd: Aulii

VOTE: ALL IN AGREEMENT

F. Waialae Country Club, Kāhala, Wai‘alae Iki Ahupua‘a, Honolulu (Kona) District, O‘ahu Island, Hawai‘i, TMK: [1] 3-5-023:003 (por.) and 038 (por)

Information/Discussion: Information, discussion, and update on the above project.

Item E: Waialae CC

Presented by Nigel and Liz

Previous engagement with OIBC and RCDs.

Project situated in Jaucus sand deposit and Beaches sand. Slide of the archaeological work in the vicinity.

Planned work in the vicinity, expansion into area currently with landscaping; office building; concrete footings to 12 inches below surface;

SIHP 50-80-14-7925, burial preserve

-50-80-14-7207 and 7206 found during monitoring for Clubhouse upgrade; 7206 moved to 7207, an in situ burial

SHPD approved AIS testing strategy;

Project map overlaid with LCAs, agriculture and habitation use,

1928 map – project owned by Territorial hotel;

HWK asks to be kept in the loop;

Nigel stated he would keep in touch, as the finds would be OIBC jurisdiction as to treatment

G. 4585 Kahala Avenue, Kāhala, Wai‘alae Iki Ahupua‘a, Honolulu (Kona) District, O‘ahu, Hawai‘i, TMK: [1] 3-5-004:001

Information/Discussion: Information and discussion on the above project.

Item G.: 4585 Kahala Avenue

Nigel, Liz

(Ask Nigel for the contact info of the other 2 women)

TMK: [1] 3-5-004:001

Demolition did not touch the slab

Beaches and Jaucus sand; Kawachi, SIHP - 1465 (1989)

Ground disturbance AIS trenches distributed throughout the area

LCA 228 Apana 2, no land use description given; konohiki award(?)

1927 sandborn Map; 1956 Sandborn Map;
Kawachi 1989: hsr found on project; SHPD collected and brought to ME; ME couldn't determine if were ancient or modern; found the excavation where the iwi came from; removed in situ phalanges
46-61 cmbs; 30 cm were recently imported for the construction, believed to be a flex burial, female 25-30 years old; only 2/3 of the individual was recovered; 15m from road 10m from SW boundary; will test area with a trench
Composite of the '28, '56, and modern aerial to show where the test trenches will be
AM: would rather let the remaining portion of the individual rest.
Nigel: Very good question. We don't have to go there, can avoid that. 2 thoughts: the entire area will be disturbed, find during AIS means OIBC will have jurisdiction; might be found during monitoring, if there will be monitoring
Will work with RKH to figure out
HKW: directs the two landowner reps to stay engaged
Mana: Ohana will be applying for recognition.

H. Kawaiaha'o Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017
Information/Discussion: Update on the above project.

Item H. Kawaiahao Church

Updates provided by: D. Shideler, Lani; Bill Haole

Request ES to discuss a sensitive issue pertaining to a decision made previously by the OIBC

Moving out of ES:

Open session at 1:39 PM

HKW: Update from Kawaiahao

IV. H

3 main things:

1) Update on AIS progress, moving forward with AISP: concluded AIS work on Mission Lane; all AIS work discussed in the AISP has been discussed and completed; iwi find in 2 locations, both in fill deposits;

2) MPC footprint and erosion mitigation: large L-shaped excavation; feel there's a consensus of RCDs in erosion mitigation, placement of plywood sheets supported by jersey barriers, with dirt between X and X; no bones will be moved in this process; iwi eroded out will be protected where they are with small wooden boxes

a. Kali remembered supporting that at the OIBC meetings previously

b. DS said yes

3) Deputy AG has provided mitigation agreement with moving forward with erosion mitigation;

4) Moving forward with working on language with Dana Hall;

a. HWK: is this the reason for delay?

b. DS: Yes.

Concurrence for the erosion mitigation work

Consultation for March 20, 2018, Tuesday (6 – 9 PM)

Lani: Initial meeting with the RCDs, continuing consultation

Bill: Kanaina has been reserved.

HWK: Chair and Vice Chair ok to attend?

AM: Will be in NZ.

HWK: Anyone else?

KF: Hard to commit, but will try to make time.

HWK: Ok.

Lani thanks the Council.

HKW: When the sun shines at its brightest and most intense, it makes the land dry and hot; because my name has to do with the moon, the brighter the sun shines, the brighter the moon shines too. The OIBC is not the reason for the duration of time that it has taken. Saying this in open session, b/c someone is telling Hina to hurry up.

Bill: Appreciates and understands the metaphor. Will carry the message and metaphor, and aloha.

HWK: Anytime anything was said to HWK 'hurry up', responded 'this is the process.' Take the mana'o back, perhaps the sun would benefit from a little bit of shade and cool comfortable environment.

Bill: Will work hard to be the shade.

HWK: Leaves one wondering. Example of wild west, Kawaiiaho is already contentious.

Bill: Mahalo.

HKW: Asked if the community had any concerns. This is pertaining to their update.

Kamu: Ok, so, the whole issue, erosion, yeah, in this puka. This open grave, it's not been only 1 year, it's been 7 years since that last kupuna was dug out of her or his grave.

On the church to figure it out. Wasn't until Kaanohi came forward to do something. I believe it was her that said. It hasn't been a year.

Finds it beyond belief that the Church acts like they're trying to be helpful.

Was the church trustees and the kahu who created this situation against, voices of ohana, community, church members, to please not do this. Set up meetings, kahea.

Kaanohi was one of the first to say to leave them alone.

Wants everyone to remember this; the only people responsible for 647 iwi kupuna unnecessarily dug from their graves, the church paid people to dig them out of their graves, despite ohana, community opposition; D. Hall, Kaleikini. Remember circumstances of how we're here today. Church skirted around the burial laws

Ripped from their graves. Here we are today trying to figure out what we going to that no more kupuna are unnecessarily exposed, desecrated. Grave been open the last 7 years. Why didn't someone figure out how to protect the kupuna in the walls?

Thanks god for Kaleikini and D. Hall for having the courage to step forward. Wants to see things done, and things done right. Please do something. Do it now. Protect the Kupuna that are innocent in all this; protect the ones still at risk.

Like pouring salt in the deepest wounds.

The only reason we're here today is b/c the church and its administrators and it's trustees walked away.

OIBC go visit the kupuna in the church.

We're forced to go through this process.

Taymer Kuuaiia, directly behind Lunalilo's tomb, her kupuna

Ask the church to speed it up and do the right thing.

Bill: Needs to address the council. Plethora of information and documents. Church's only intent was to follow the laws of this land. Dept of Health rules and SHPD rules. We've only been trying to do the right thing. To clarify: Bill and the Church brought attention to the erosion. When the fire lane was being compromised. Church will stand on the record; constant goal-line shift. You know this. We've come to the table, we've had people who came straight in to the Sunday service. Kaleikini was arrested because she tried to get Kamuela out. Have always been trying to follow the letter of the law.

HWK: Concurr. Has watched from day 1, ES called to huddle. Church members and families pleaded, all OIBC caught as deer in the headlights. Bill has sought advice and

opinion. Whether it was the best, it's still the kupuna who are waiting for something to happen.

Bill: Welcomes RCD. Must make it clear to the OIBC, has hosted 2 open sessions. Only talking to those who are RCD.

AM: Original member of na iwi. How much work was put into being proactive.

HWK: The most regrettable thing is that the laws that govern these things do not have any clarity to preside over our kanaka affairs. This is an example of when we should trust our kanaka way.

Bill: IN the interest of time, if the SHPD can propose blanket approval of ohana?

HKW: Short statement from ohana.

I. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Diane Puanani Fitzsimmons and Teyre Kealohilani Fitzsimmons Crowell as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Skeletal Remains, located at Kawaiaha'o Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Discussion/Determination: Discussion and determination on the Department's recommendation to recognize the applicant as cultural descendant to Native Hawaiian skeletal remains at the above project.

DF: CD claim. Hanakeola lived where Honolulu Hale is; death certificate indicates Kawaiahao Cemetery. David Leleo, servant of kingdom. Buried next to parents.

HKW: Wants to hear from applicants' about why they seek recognition

DF: Dream of Kinimaka pacing the graves, decided she needed to know what was going on. 10, of which 4 are lineal direct. FB. RP in this area. FB post stated to call Lani Maa. Called Lani who stated to file CD application.

HKW: Applicant indicated to council her willingness to attend as a voice of representation to her ohana.

Motion: to accept the department's recommendation to recognize the applicants as Cultural Descendants

Moved by: Member Caceres

2nd: Member Amaral

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

J. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Arlen W. Bento Sr. as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Skeletal Remains, located at Kawaiaha'o Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Discussion/Determination: Discussion and determination to recognize the above individual as cultural descendant to Native Hawaiian skeletal remains encountered at the above parcel.

Summary of discussion:

Comments: to malama iwi kupuna is to be present, physically; 'ohana Caceres will always advocate for preservation in place, even when outvoted, and will participate in relocation/reburial practices as required

Sometimes, people who vote/advocate for relocation do not show up and participate in relocation/reburial

Member Amaral stated that, in a case where an applicant is ill or not able to be present before the Council, any letter prepared by them on their behalf should be notarized

Hilo commented that there is no legal requirement for an applicant to physically attend the OIBC meeting(s) and/or engage with the Council and/or public; SHPD makes its

recommendation based on the application, applicant's genealogy, and any submitting supporting documentation; SHPD recommendation is provided to the IBC, IBC authority is for recognition determination as cultural or lineal descendant

Chair Wong-Kalu stated that she has not been to all Kona reburials, but those that Chair has attended adhered to protocol; because of the volume and rigor that the OIBC has to endure, and through experience, the OIBC has made many decisions; outer islands don't handle the volume the OIBC handles

Member Fermantez agreed that the OIBC's practice has been face-to-face engagement with individuals/ohana seeking recognition

Chair acknowledges Member Amaral's comments; kanaka perspective – controlling interest versus controlling presence, placing faith and trust in those who are present and supporting those present; a letter creates a situation that could set precedent, potentially trump other applicants, by putting their support for an individual in writing, such that an individual becomes the voice for all; palapala way is the way of the malihini

Fitzsimmons stated the three 'ohana represent those connected to iwi

Chair Wong-Kalu does not support the precedent a letter presents; Chair does not know the people indicated by the letter; provided the example of Kaanohi Kaleikini, who was one voice; means no disrespect to anyone's family

Jerry Spencer: wanted clarification as to the precedent being discussed; the letter being discussed allows the Council to make a decision?

Hilo: No, that's incorrect. The letters I'm referring to are the letters of recommendation that goes to the Council upon which they make their determination. These are letters that go directly to the Council from the Department based on an applicant's submitted claim and supporting documentation.

Chair Wong-Kalu: applicant provides application and documentation to the SHPD, who then prepares a recommendation based on the submitted materials

Jerry: That's the precedent?

Chair: No, that's the Burial Sites Specialist's role. As the law lays it out, that's a process that is followed. This Council has set a precedent to interact with applicants. Malama iwi kupuna. The timeframe of doing that is long.

Jerry: I have an application in, I have an item on the agenda. My brother has an agenda item, he's in Texas. He cannot come today. That would mean that when I sit down and represent myself, I cannot represent my brother.

Chair: Hawaiian way versus modern Hawaiian way. Hawaiian way: those present on the land malama. Modern Hawaiian way, send in the palapala and do it another way. We get plenty Hawaiians that live in America. They are not here on a daily basis. What happens to us is largely determined by those that live here. I'm half Chinese, and went back to my great-great grandparents' village. I have no kuleana there, even though my great great grandfather's picture is on display in the village, in 2014. If I assume the responsibility and am going to be there, rain-and-shine, through thick and thin, maika'i no. So when you as a representative of your family, you don't need to get this letter or that letter or physically round people up, but know what voice you represent. When you're unsure about the mana'o, it's up to you to make the phone call. Could we take the letter? Yeah, we could take the letter, that's the technical way of doing it. That would be setting precedent.

Chair stated Chair would not be voting

Fitzsimmons stated that Hilo had indicated letters could be sent to the department and Hilo would read them

Chair state Chair's vote would be recused in that case; Chair's word stands for the rest of Chair's family; Chair would let the other members vote, and did not want to set a precedent; in Chair's 'ohana example, Chair entrusts the Maui family to handle Maui business

Fitzsimmons commented that Arlen expressed his readiness to accept the kuleana

Chair: this is going through palapala, not voice or face to face

Fitzsimmons: should defer and look up the law

Chair stated again that Chair would recuse from voting

Hilo: the law is clear. It's the Council's determination.

Chair asked the OIBC for a motion

Chair stated that if an application was submitted and the applicant showed up, the Council would engage with the applicant

Motion and subsequent discussion were unclear

Chair: Regina can make all the recommendations she wants, but the Council may disagree.

Vice Chair stated he supported Kalehua and all ohana who come before the Council to advocate for the protection of iwi kupuna.

Motion: to deny the recommendation made by the Department for Arlen W. Bento, Sr., to be recognized as a Cultural Descendant

Moved by: Member Fermantez

Chair commented the actions were not made out of disrespect for the 'ohana, but to not set a precedent. "Tell them they needed to show up." It's not meant to say their voice is irrelevant, their voice is through you, this is haole way, but we are dealing with kupuna ways. If they are going to show up, engage, ho'opa'apa'a, and if need to move the iwi, then those individuals show up.

Member Fermantez asked if it would be more appropriate to defer

Previous motion to deny the Department's recommendation was dismissed

Motion: to defer recognition until Applicant can come before the Council

Moved by: Member Fermantez

2nd: Vice Chair Mitchell

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR [Chair Wong-Kalu recused]

Deferred

K. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Patricia Atcherley Hitchcock and Eric Morgan Hitchcock as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Sheila Okin commented, the applicant is the family's genealogist who lives in California, and requested the item be deferred

Motion: to defer recognition

Moved by: Member Caceres

2nd: Member Holck

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

Deferred

Chair stated the following, for the record

"If you call your 'ohana and they show up, great. When it comes time to ho'opa'apa'a i ka manawa kakou noho ai ke pākaukau, ho'opa'apa'a. Kūkā kama'ilio, 'o kākou ka po'e noho ma ke pākaukau, ha'i ko kākou mana'o, kēlā no kākou e holomua ai. Those of us who show up at that table. Recognition means that they get to show up at that table, to be invited, which is what's going to happen. They will be invited. But if they don't come, I don't want anyone over there saying, "I got my thirty family members to say, as if to say, now my vote

is going to trump everyone else's." I don't think that's right. Any one of us, we can go gather up the thousands of Hawaiians that live in America and say, "Well, these Hawaiians stand besides me." If I were to go run for office and I made all the Hawaiians from America [go vote for me], I can win, beat everyone over here. Same concept."

Member Fermantez stated he would vote for Chair Hina, then said he needed to leave

Member Fermantez left the meeting

Shelia Okin commented, Hilo stated that Sheila's item was IV. X

Chair addressed Item IV. X next

L. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Kaupena Aukai Kinimaka as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Request made by family members present to defer

Deferred

Individual lives on Kaua'i; those present will inform the applicant to come

Bill Haole asked if the Council's perspective was to invite individuals not yet recognized to meetings involving recognized descendants

Chair responded 'No', because deferred agenda items meant an individual had not yet been recognized as a cultural or lineal descendant; if Council members recognize applicants, then those recognized individuals may attend a meeting reserved for recognized descendants

Comments: urgency to speak, urgency to be present and testify; Council wants to ensure that those recognized will actually show up

Chair has been to so many meetings where they 'get going', cannot have someone say they're speaking on behalf of someone, only speak on behalf of yourself; face to face

M. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Faith Lihue Kinimaka Lopez as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Request to defer

Deferred

N. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Oddetta Kapu Kinimaka Alquiza, Jill Kapulani Kinimaka Alquiza, Duke Limaloa Kinimaka Alquiza, Kameamakamae Kawailoa Kinimaka Palama Alquiza, Nick Kamanawa Kinimaka Alquiza, Kaiolohia Nick Leleo Kinimaka Perreira-Alquiza, and Renee Therese Malulani Kinimaka as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

The following 'ohana were addressed together:

Oddetta Kapu Kinimaka Alquiza and 'ohana (Item IV. N, above)

Ellen Marie Keala Kinimaka Senkus (Item IV. W)

Anita Nani Janice Kuuleilani Kinimaka-Davis (mother), Keanohi T. Davis-Milo (daughter), and Kuliaikanuu Kellie Davis (daughter) (Item IV. R)

All from Kaua‘i, sisters, combined

Testimony:

‘Ohana is dear, had expected to rest at Limahai, but cannot rest knowing that the kupuna cannot rest because they have no final resting place, would like to know where they are and visit their headstone; feels for everyone in the room with emotions, is focused on what she’s feeling and her reasons for sharing; requests that the Council accept her.

Present to ask and let the Council members know that she knows where she comes from, who she is, and the Kinimaka progeny, from Kailua-Kona; there are 10 who have passed on at Kawaihāo; as Pattie (Atcherley) stated, there is no history and no books; we know as we read our genealogy books, over 15 compiled books for genealogy, from her father Joseph Kamanawa Kinimaka to his father, Mathias Leleo Kinimaka, before him is David Leleo Kinimaka, before him Keawemahi Kinimaka; before him is Kapaiwi Kinimaka; women would go side by side as they go along in all the years of history; asking today, and considering all Council members ‘ohana, allow us to take back what is truly ours, what we begun with in life and what we have today, as our ‘ohana; give us back that, because they all belong with us today, and now, thank you

Chair: “Perhaps not what we can give back to you, but what we can enable you to do. In the Council’s recognition today enables people to engage, to participate, and to have a voice that matters in what goes on.”

Testimony:

“Mahalo, and ditto what was already said. Personally, just recently I heard about this family situation, and I feel that we wouldn’t want to be departed from our family. That alone we deserve to be accepted as cultural descendants to our kupuna. It’s really funny because I’m a mother, but yet, I feel them, my kupuna, calling. I feel them. They’re lost and it’s my kuleana to bring them home. And I also feel and believe if you’re truly kanaka in this whole situation, we should know what to do, with no question, with no palapala, with no outside influence, because our na‘au speaks to us, and we were raised to follow our na‘au. It has never led us wrong, ever, in our lives. They’re calling us home, they want to come home. Mahalo.”

Chair asked if there were questions or comments

Vice Chair Mitchell: Is there another sister?

Applicants: There are seven. Kaniu? Yes, she was here. Seven girls, nine boys. Kaniu has a little problem.....her name is not included.

Chair stated if Kaniu was a separate listing, they would address her because she was listed previously; she had showed up previously

Motion: to recognize Oddetta Kapu Kinimaka Alquiza, Anita Nani Janice Kuuleilani Kinimaka-Davis (Item R.) and Ellen Marie Keala Kinimaka Senkus (Item IV. W) and all ‘ohana as cultural descendants to Native Hawaiian iwi kupuna located at Kawaihā‘o Church MPB Renovation Project

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell

2nd: Member Amaral

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

Oddetta thanked the Council for their support and recognition, asked how the recognition affects her children

Chair stated the recognition affects the children because they were also recognized and may consult as recognized descendants; the requirements have been met and the law followed; Council relies on the precedent they have set and the way in which they have done things

Item O was addressed next

- O. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Kaeo Frederick Lopez as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017**

*Request to defer
Deferred*

- P. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Merilyn Puanani Kinimaka Moku as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017**

*Request to defer
Deferred*

- Q. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Titus Nihi Kinimaka as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017**

*Request to defer; applicant is a brother to those recognized under Item IV. N
Deferred*

- R. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Anita Nani Janice Kuuleilani Kinimaka-Davis (mother), Keanohi T. Davis-Milo (daughter), and Kuliaikanuu Kellie Davis (daughter) as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017**

Addressed under item IV. N, below

Motion: to recognize Oddetta Kapu Kinimaka Alquiza, Anita Nani Janice Kuuleilani Kinimaka-Davis (Item R.) and Ellen Marie Keala Kinimaka Senkus (Item IV. W) and all 'ohana as cultural descendants to Native Hawaiian iwi kupuna located at Kawaiaha'o Church MPB Renovation Project

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell

2nd: Member Amaral

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

- S. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Priscilla Kamaile Kinimaka as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017**

*Request to defer, oldest sister to those recognized under Item IV. N.
Deferred*

Chair asked Council, as Chair had told one individual that applicants needed to show up rather than provide a letter; Council could opt to recognize siblings who are not present via their siblings present at the meeting; Council asked if any members were opposed to that approach

Comments and testimony from Kalehua Caceres:

“E kala mai, hele au a mihi, but let me give some context to that. My sister is a cultural, she works and helps to preserve iwi as an occupation, but although I could, because of our genealogy, we’re here to be recognized today. We have the exact same parents, same genealogy. She is not prepared or willing to come to the meetings. That’s not to say that’s the case for you folks, and although there are time where she says, “Well, you could,” on principle, I won’t. So when we are listed, you’ll see six, but that’s my minor children who also come to every meeting. We keep them home when we have OIBC recognitions, we keep them home from school and they sit here for all these hours because eventually they’re going to have to. So I stand on that principle, only for that reason, because we come here, endure the long hours, understand, hear the conversation, be able to advocate for kupuna, that’s this part, that’s not even the consultation part. And then the reinterment part.”

Comments:

“We appreciate your thoughts. Like I said earlier, it takes a, you know a car by looking at it. They should deserve it.”

“I’m sorry, your reason was because she chooses not to partake?”

Kalehua: “I have one sister. He [Mana] has one full-blooded brother. We use both of our genealogy when we bring our keiki. You gotta be willing to sit here, engage, listen to the dialogue, go to all the meetings. It’s here. It ends when we’re standing and putting kupuna in our hands and putting them back in the ground. That’s why we sit here, because somebody got to. And we bring our minor children with us because it’s not likely to stop, right? We hope to pass legislation one day that would advocate, but when we talk, we’re talking about laws of this land, and abide by that. But there’s a law of kanaka, and to me that law supercedes all of this. But yeah, we gotta partake of this, and that’s ok. And my children come to learn for that same reason. My sister doesn’t. I’m not saying that’s the same case, but should my sister be prepared someday to do this, because I do this alone for ‘Ohana Kamohoalii. My sister will sit here on her own merit and be prepared to take on the kuleana when she sits before the Council.”

Comment:

“The faithful stand strong, and you can put your trust in it. It’s a whole lot more, putting your trust in someone who’s present, consistent with their presence, yeah? And the labor of his works says a lot more of his character, who his is and what he is. When labor is less, don’t feed them.”

Chair: “Mahalo for that. I now have greater clarity because my eldest brother, my one brother, let him stick to being a chef. He’s a fantastic chef, so fantastic they vote his restaurant number one. But as far as this? No, stay over there. Good, I got it. Mahalo. Maika’i loa.”

Item T was addressed next

T. Department’s Recommendation to Recognize Kaleo-o-kalani Joseph Lopez as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua‘a, Kona District, Island of O‘ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Request to defer; applicant is the son of Lihu‘e, who’s recognition has already been deferred

Deferred

U. Department’s Recommendation to Recognize Wren Wallace Westcoatt as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao

Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua‘a, Kona District, Island of O‘ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

*Sheila Okin commented that Wren is her cousin, and he did attend a meeting that did not have quorum; Sheila will talk with him, requests to defer
Deferred*

V. Department’s Recommendation to Recognize Laura-Lee Sumiko Rodrigues as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua‘a, Kona District, Island of O‘ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

*Request to defer
Deferred*

W. Department’s Recommendation to Recognize Ellen Marie Keala Kinimaka Senkus as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua‘a, Kona District, Island of O‘ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Addressed under item IV. N.

Motion: to recognize Oddetta Kapu Kinimaka Alquiza, Anita Nani Janice Kuuleilani Kinimaka-Davis (Item R.) and Ellen Marie Keala Kinimaka Senkus (Item IV. W) and all ‘ohana as cultural descendants to Native Hawaiian iwi kupuna located at Kawaiaha‘o Church MPB Renovation Project

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell

2nd: Member Amaral

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

X. Department’s Recommendation to Recognize Sheila Ulwin Eckart Okin as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua‘a, Kona District, Island of O‘ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Discussion/Determination: Discussion and determination to recognize the above individual as cultural descendant to human skeletal remains encountered at the above parcel.

The Council may elect to go into executive session pursuant to HAR §13-300-25(d). The Council may close a meeting whenever location or description of a Native Hawaiian Burial site is under consideration. The chairperson, by concurrence of a majority of members present at the meeting, shall be authorized to require the public to leave the meeting while the confidential matter is being discussed and reopen the meeting once the confidential matter is no longer being considered.

Chair read the above item and accompanying HAR onto the record, which served as the reading for all descendant recognition items listed on the agenda

Executive session also applies to any case in which a descendant wishes to discuss, privately, with the Council

Summary:

Sheila stated she was seeking recognition because her connection to the kupuna who have passed is as close to the people present who are cousins and aunties. Most of the people she’s close to, she is now 76, have passed. Something that is just who she is, not learned

somewhere in church, learned it in her family. Lives in Waimea on Hawaii island, has a family home in Waimanalo, has access to stay here when on Oahu. That is the connection to the land, in Waimanalo, where she grew up, understands the connection. Sheila is a person who shows up, as she showed up today.

No comments from Council or public

Motion: to recognize Sheila Ulwin Eckart Okin as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaihahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell

2nd: Member Amaral

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

Sheila stated she will show up at the meetings; has a special kind of Hawaiian Airlines pass
Chair stated that was a very good example
Item L was addressed next

Y. Department's Recommendation to Recognize John Kinohou Spencer Jr. as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaihahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

*Request to defer, as the applicant lives in Texas; brother Jerry Kenui Spencer requested the item be deferred; stated there is interest, but applicant is not able to travel, unlikely that the applicant would fly from Texas to attend a meeting in the future
Deferred*

Z. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Jerry Kenui Spencer as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Skeletal Remains located at Kawaihaha'o Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Summary:

Testimony offered by Jerry Kenui Spencer: "First of all, thank you for the opportunity. You know, just being aware of what has happened in the recent past, having been contacted --"

Comments: not able to attend the meeting on the 20th, but the recognized cultural descendants will be contacted about the meeting discussion

Chair: "E kala mai."

Jerry: "That's ok. That's my family that just left. Sorry. My grandmother is Alice Kinimaka, sisters were Haaheo; Mathias. There are others, but their family is here. So I'm representing my grandmother. It just kind of is very unsettling to know that, maybe, their graves or burials have been compromised. Whether it's true or not, I'd like to find out. There's documentation that my great grandfather and great great grandfather, and their wives, are buried at Kawaihahao but we can't find the gravesites. And that, you know, I don't want to get into who's right and who's wrong, I just know we can't find them. And, I'm going to be 68 this year. I don't know how long I'm going to be around. My grandfather, Samuel Mahuka Spencer, [if he were to] ask me what did I do? I cannot say that I didn't do anything. Sorry. I had composure all the way up to this point."

Chair: "That is kanaka, we uē."

Jerry: "I know. Thank you."

Chair: "It is ok to ue."

Jerry: "There is so much more in my history that I wish I did, so at least this before I die. What I request, I have a sister and a brother, and we just put in applications today; same applications, I just passed them on to Regina."

Chair: "Yours [Jerry] was in and yours [Johnston Kaipo] was not."

Kaipo: "Yeah, I signed on the wrong page. And had to sign it again."

Chair: "You live on Oahu?"

Kaipo: "Yeah, only the two of us live on Oahu."

Chair: "So you want to share the responsibility with your brother?"

Kaipo: "Yes, I want to share the responsibility with my brother. I used to communicate with my grandmother, that was 8 years ago. In the last 7 years, I have not been able to communicate with her, she was buried at Kawaiahao Church, I knew she had a headstone, and now we don't know where the headstone is. I know what the first Aunty was talking about, six hundred. They need to be back in the ground. I know my grandmother would want her bones to be back in the ground, not in the basement. That's why I'm here."

Chair: "For you, we will wait until the formality of your paperwork will go through. We will make note that these two brothers have shown up. Thank you for showing up and sitting next to your brother."

No comments or questions from Council or public

Motion: to recognize Jerry Kenui Spencer as cultural descendant to Native Hawaiian iwi kupuna located at Kawaiahao Church

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell

2nd: Member Holck

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

Chair commented: applicant Kaipo is now familiar with the process, eye-to-eye, show up to meetings, advocate as the applicants see appropriate

AA. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Laura Lili'u Eckart Tomasello as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiaha'o Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Request to defer made by Sheila Okin; applicant is Sheila's niece; Sheila asked the following be deferred: AA, CC, DD, FF

Deferred

BB. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Jon E.K. Kinimaka as Descendant to Native Hawaiian Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiaha'o Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Deferred

CC. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Hina Kneubuhl as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Deferred

DD. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Wren Wallace Westcoatt, III (father), Ethan James Ka'imipono Westcoatt (son), and Jayna Lyn Ka'iulani Westcoatt (daughter) as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Deferred

EE. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Jeannette Kama Bento as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Deferred

FF. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Rolf Leonard Parkes as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Deferred

GG. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Gina Vasconcellos (mother), Micah Vasconcellos (son), and Kylie Vasconcellos (daughter) as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Deferred

HH. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Aileen Keliokalani Panee as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Testimony from Aileen Panee:

“Mahalo for allowing me to speak with you. My grandfather is buried at Kawaiahao. Every meeting that Kawaiahao had prior to beginning their construction I have attended, taking my mother with me. As a young girl, they always took us to put flowers on his grave. My father is the oldest child. I would see a few of my aunts come and put flowers. But now all my father's siblings have all passed. I am the youngest of five. My two brothers who lived here on O'ahu have passed. My two siblings who live on the Mainland, although they come home a couple times a year. So I'm the only one. Although I have cousins, I don't know how much they know or how much they want to know. But we have always gone to the grave. So I want to do that and take care of my tutu.”

Chair: “Mahalo.”

No comments or questions

Motion: to recognize Aileen Keliokalani Panee as a cultural descendant to the iwi kupuna at Kawaiahao

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell

2nd: Member Amaral

VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

II. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Lenette I. Makahilahila, Kimberly K.M. Miyamoto, and Ashley K. Makahilahila as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Combined with Item JJ, as Colby is the sister of Kimberly and Ashley; Lenette is their mother

Testimony:

Kimberly: "My name is Kimberly. I submitted the application on behalf of my mother and sister and then we also had my other sister submit her application after. We actually started on this endeavor because of our uncle and my grandmother, Alexander Akau and Elaine Akau, and sharing what they've been going through with Kawaiahao Church. When they shared what was going on with us, we've known they been in that process for a while now. And young, when they started with that. At this time, we feel, I'll speak for myself: I feel that I'm ready to take on that responsibility, to help carry on what they've been working so hard for. After listening to a lot of the testimonies that have been shared and reading up culturally on taking care of iwi kupuna, that's another reason why, knowing what my kuleana is in taking care of my ancestors and their remains, and coming forth at this time, going through the formalities of this process to be recognized. I tried to attend the meeting on behalf of my uncle and grandmother when he was having health concerns, and was told we could not attend because we did not go through this formal process. So we're coming before you today."

Chair: "Mahalo."

Lenette: "My brother and my mom have been going through this process for a while. We know where our kupuna is buried. I'm a member of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints and do genealogy work, I work in the Temple. We have had kupuna come to us, and say why was I taken away from my spot? I have not told my mom that. Though I do not know who it is, I do know it is a time now that I need to come forward and help with the work they're doing or trying to accomplish in preserving or keeping our kupuna iwi together. And just making sure they're taken cared of. And that's why I'm here."

Chair: "Mahalo."

Ashley: "Aloha. 'O au o Ashley Makahilahila. There are two things that matter most: the first being Ke Akua, and the second being 'ohana. When it comes to why now, when the kahea is put out, I answer. When kuleana is set forth, I auamo. It is time, for me personally, I can speak for myself. The things that I've needed to do, I've made myself makaukau. And hopefully, as we continue through this process, I remember upon whose foundation I am built to put me in the position that I am in. And the way to do that is to continue to malama them. And when my kupuna who are here put out a kahea, I answer as well. Mahalo."

Colby: "I echo everything that my family has shared. Until recently I have been in Utah, it's the reason my application was separate from theirs. But I've decided to move back home, which is why I've answered the call to help my family to be for them, to stand up for them, to have a voice for them. That is why, as my family has said, we are coming forth now is to take our responsibility."

Chair: "Mahalo."

No comments or questions

Motion: to recognize Lenette I. Makahilahila, Kimberly K.M. Miyamoto, and Ashley K. Makahilahila (Item II.) and Colby K. Makahilahila (Item JJ.) as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaiahao Church

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell
2nd: Member Holck
VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

JJ. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Colby K. Makahilahila as Cultural Descendant to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaihahao Church Multi-Purpose Building Renovation Project, Honolulu Ahupua'a, Kona District, Island of O'ahu, TMK: [1] 2-1-032:017

Addressed with Item IV. II

Motion: to recognize Lenette I. Makahilahila, Kimberly K.M. Miyamoto, and Ashley K. Makahilahila (Item II.) and Colby K. Makahilahila (Item JJ.) as Cultural Descendants to Native Hawaiian Human Skeletal Remains located at Kawaihahao Church

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell
2nd: Member Holck
VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

KK. Department's Recommendation to Recognize Brandy Kalehua Kamohalii Caceres and 'ohana (listed on separate page) as Cultural Descendants to Human Skeletal Remains at Kūhio Collection at Waikīkī Project, Queen Emma Land Company, Waikīkī Ahupua'a, Kona District, O'ahu, TMKs: [1] 2-6-021:100 & 114 (Ewa lots) and [1] 2-6-021:075, 076, 101, 108 & 109 (Diamond Head lots)

Member Caceres recused himself from the agenda item

Motion: to recognize the applicant and 'ohana, as cultural descendants to Native Hawaiian skeletal remains at the above project and location

Moved by: Vice Chair Mitchell
2nd: Member Amaral
VOTE: ALL IN FAVOR

V. INADVERTENTS/COMMUNICATIONS

**A. Inadvertent discovery of human skeletal remains on December 23, 2017 at Kualoa Regional Park, Kualoa Ahupua'a, Ko'olaupoko District, O'ahu, TMK: [1] 4-9-005:001
Information/Discussion:** Discussion on the above inadvertent discovery.

Presented by RKH

**B. Inadvertent discovery of human skeletal remains on January 2, 2018, near Mauna Lahilahi Beach Park, Wai'anae Ahupua'a, Wai'anae District, O'ahu, TMK: [1] 8-4-001:001
Information/Discussion:** Discussion on the above inadvertent discovery.

Presented by RKH

**C. Inadvertent discovery of human skeletal remains on January 15, 2018, at Pīlilaau Army Recreation Center, Wai'anae Ahupua'a, Wai'anae District, O'ahu, TMK: [1] 8-5-001:009
Information/Discussion:** Discussion on the above inadvertent discovery.

Presented by RKH

VI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Next meeting date is scheduled for Wednesday, March 14, 2018, at 11 AM, at the Kalanimoku Building, Board Room #132; 1151 Punchbowl Street; Honolulu, HI 96813.**

**APPROVED and RATIFIED by the Oahu Island Burial Council at their meeting on 2018-08-08.
Respectfully prepared and submitted by Regina K. Hilo, Burial Sites Specialist, History and Culture branch, State Historic Preservation Division.**

‘Ohana Caceres

**For recognition at the February 14, 2018 Oahu Island Burial Council meeting,
agenda item below:**

IV. Business

LL. Department’s Recommendation to Recognize Brandy Kalehua Kamohalii Caceres and ‘Ohana, listed below, as Cultural Descendants to Human Skeletal Remains encountered at Kūhio Collection at Waikīkī Project, Queen Emma Land Company, Waikīkī Ahupua’a, Kona District, O’ahu, TMKs: [1] 2-6-021:100 & 114 (Ewa lots) and [1] 2-6-021:075, 076, 101, 108 & 109 (Diamond Head lots)

Norman “Mana” Christopher Moore Kaleilani Caceres
Kekamamakoakailihou Kaleilani Kamohalii Caceres
Keaheaalaiianiikekamaehuokahikiku Kiekiekananiokuuleilehua Kamohalii Caceres
Kekamakeuakuiikuhaikalai Kalehuahiehie Kamohalii Caceres
Kahuakaokekamaakawai Kamanaokaopuulehua Kamohalii Caceres