

September 5, 2019

Legacy Land Conservation Commission Draft Minutes, Meeting 69.2

\*\*\*\*\*DISCLAIMER\*\*\*\*\*

THE FOLLOWING IS AN UNEDITED DRAFT TRANSLATION. THIS TRANSCRIPT MAY NOT BE VERBATIM, HAS NOT BEEN PROOFREAD AND MAY CONTAIN ERRORS. PLEASE CHECK WITH THE SPEAKER(S) FOR ANY CLARIFICATION. JC

\*\*\*\*\*DISCLAIMER\*\*\*\*\*

>> Commissioner: All set? Welcome, everyone. This is the continuation of meeting number E -- is it nine Legacy Land Conservation Commission. 69. We're going to pick up where we left off yesterday afternoon. We were on item 4-I, Na Wai 'Ehā. We have a quick clarification for that project before we move on.

>> Scott: I wanted to show you that didn't come up yesterday that is substantive. When I was showing you

>> Scott: Here is the one in the area. Here is the one that is further to the west. The clarification is that you recall we told you that it wasn't land formally owned this as well in -- whether they sold it. When they sold it they are planning to give a divided interest to an additional chunk of it right there. And that -- and that is not showing up on any of the maps right now. The clarification is that we're talking about I think in our application it said 11,800-acres or something like that. This little piece carves out 800. So it takes a few -- 11,000-acres roughly. I wanted to make sure that you're aware that that piece is -- going to have to account for that somehow.

>> Commissioner: What is the divided interest?

>> Scott: When he sold the PMK as part of the sale he included interest in this 800-acre piece over here.

>> Commissioner: Was it [away from microphone]

>> Speaker: Undivided interest in another TMK that is next door.

>> Scott. Is that not what I said? Did I say it wrong? Undivided interest. Did I say divided interest? Sorry. Undivided interest.

>> Commissioner: Separate TMK.

>> Scott: That TMK is this one here but the template --

>> Scott: It was this one here.

>> Commissioner: But that overlap that 800-acres. Is that a separate  
TM --

>> Scott. No.

>> Commissioner: Did they do a reconsolidation to add to the one  
they did previously?

>> Scott: No yet.

>> Commissioner: Is that their intent?

>> Scott: I think so. Our working assumption is that this 800-acre  
piece will not be part of what we purchase.

>> Speaker: Total acreage?

>> Scott: About 11,000. We just were not aware of that when we  
wrote up the application and found it out later when we talking.

>> Commissioner: So you get us the new money figures and the more  
precise acreages before we start the discussion period tomorrow and we'll fill out  
that table and go through all the changes one more time before decision-making.

>> Scott: Okay.

>> Speaker: Do you need us tow like --

>> Scott: Do it now. You should do it now because you asked if our  
money was changing from 5.2. So, yes, we're going to put the application in for  
2 million. We're going to pursue those other -- those other sources as we  
indicated on the slides yet.

>> Commissioner: Is that 2 million going to be just this year? 2020?  
Is it going to be split between 2020 and 2021?

>> Scott. This. Year.

>> Speaker: [away from microphone] requesting 2 million in 2020 and  
2021. That is like the same.

>> Speaker: If you get 2 million in 20 then -- don't need 2 million in 21.

>> Speaker: What I meant was put 1 million in 2020 and 1 million in --

>> Scott: No, we would not like to do that.

>> Commissioner: Before we continue and move on to other agenda items for the people who weren't here yesterday, just want to reiterate the announcement that we do have a remote transcriber who is helping us to prepare our minutes. So please speak loudly, clearly, slowly towards the microphone over there and state your name when you begin speaking so that we can get the most accurate possible record of the proceedings here today.

And, then, also, on the tables in the back, we have one or two copies of each application that is under consideration before the Commission for the whole process and then there were also packet materials are on the back table. The sign-in sheet is on the back table. Please sign in for today and then we'll have another sign-in sheet for tomorrow if you're here tomorrow. There is some bottled water back there.

Also, copies of the testimony received for the application as presented today. I've asked the presenters to summarize that and distribute the packets of the written testimony that you probably received most of it already on e-mail Commissioners but we do need a copy for the public file and maybe additional things that I didn't process yet that you may want to talk about.

>> Commissioner: Okay. Please return the applications to their spot when you're done looking at them.

>> Commissioner: Is there any further discussion on item 4. I on Na Wai 'Ehā? Okay. I propose we move on. This item is listed as item 4. A in the agenda. The applicant as Ala Kahakai Trail Association, and the application title is Manāka'a Fishing Village.

>> Reyna: In our online application we didn't submit the -- in the real copy records we didn't submit the historical assessment. There is just a but that you know needs to be clicked and I resubmitted it. Just a technicality more than anything. And then we just wanted to some of the additional testimony.

166ing signatures from the community supporting the protection of Manāka'a, some very cute drawings from some supporting this project and then a letter from the Nature Conservancy in support of this project. If you want to take a look at them I will leave them here. Yes. You can take a copy of the list.

>> Keoni: I am a lineal descendant of Manāka'a, Ala Kahakai and a practitioner. Our first slide here is a picture of our board members, our nonprofit organization as well as our measure the Natinal Park Service unit the Ala Kahakai Trail Association. Began as an organization in 2006. It became an

official 501(c)(3) in 2008. As with many trails in the national trail system a private nonprofit association assessed NPS providing community support for planning and managing the trail. The board includes members with genealogical ties where sections of the trail network are located. These ancestral ties are heightened awareness of the Kahakai protecting trails and supporting cultural and natural resources.

The Ala Kahakai natural trail and network are well-connected to the community and that Hawaiian values and principles are in place and practice.

This is a slide that shows the designation portion -- designated portion of the trail system. The Ala Kahakai Trail was designated in the year 2000 for the preservation, protection and interpretation of Hawaiian natural resources. 170-mile corridor and network starts up north in Kahakai and the point and travels south around Kali or south point through Kau and ends at the Hawaii Volcanoes National Park. It is administered by the National Park system.

>> Speaker: Those of you that don't know the land is a nonprofit land trust organization and it is to protect land for people ensuring healthy livable communities for generations to come. And our goal that program we focus on protecting lands that are culturally and historically important to the Hawaiian community and returning them to stewards of these lands and protecting Ala Kahakai secret story cases from developing.

To give you a little background on our work along the Ala Kahakai, completed nine projects along the system and currently working on six projects in **Kahaki** and we help the Kau community protect in 2006 which is green color up there and Kau in 211. We are very, very humble to continue our work in support of the Ka'ū to protect the entire coastline.

Just so you know Manaka is larger -- we have protecting 6600-acres along the coast and that is connected by 6 miles of the Ala Kahakai Trail. So just to orient you, Ala Kahakai is here. 1841-acres. It is next to the forest which is [NAME?] and that neighbor is Waikapuna which is 2370-acres has 2.3 miles of trail. It sits next to a small state owned parcel that is 55-acres and then Kavala we're working with [NAME?] ranch and the Galimba family to protect those lands with a privately funded conservation easement and Manaka is the Kahakai which is 348 acres and includes 1.2 miles of trail and next to that is Kahakai which is 663-acres and includes about 2.7 miles of trail. Just to kind of give you the big picture of this landscape level conservation.

>> Keoni: Provides connectivity for all of these properties in 1892

[NAME?] declared that all roadways and trails in existence at that time were to be owned by the people of Hawai'i.

The protection of our trail system and the right for public access is still protected by state law today.

>> Reyna: Just to introduce you to ala Kahakai it means two and in reference to [NAME?] which is a stone that lies just in the sea. Next to the coastline. It is a place where fishermen would offer aqua and banana to the shark who came from Tahiti. There is also another rock next to Manaka where -- after the winner center and the Kahuna performed the ceremony and remove a branch from the shoreline which is an indication that fishing was but prohibited.

>> Keoni: This cover shows a cover of the free magazine of homes and lands. Basically highlights the properties on the islands and the reason we include they'd slide we wanted to emphasize the development thread on the property. Although we have just applied for legacy funds to preserve this land in perpetuity for my family we are actually trying to protect this land for many years.

The original owner was -- well, not the original owner but one of the more recent owners was C. Brewer who became co-agri and when they went out of business in 1996 they put all the coastal properties up to sale and then you saw a lot of land speculators and developers purchasing these properties for really cheap and seeing them as ways for them to invest subdivide, develop, partition off and then just really make a lot of money off of these lands. So in 2004, Oahu led by realtor purchased the property and quickly applied for a subdivision permit and to our surprise they were granted approval.

My family reached out to the owners. They already had their mindset on doing the subdivision whereas you have multiple lots here right along the coastline and everybody would be able to take advantage of this 270-degree view of Kahoot.

We were very fortunate that native that wine corporation was willing to represent us and we questioned the approval of the permits by the planning department. I want to say our attorney relied on a case that had been recently decided called Leslie decision basically because the property touched the special management area and required some increased density -- it required them to get an estimated permit. We asked the planning department if they would agree and they did concur and the application or the approval was rescinded. Really

that was our only way not just stopping this development but we had multiple other applications being submitted at the same time kind of put everything on hold.

This land shows just -- **Hogott** land awards here and grants on this side and this is actually showing two Ala Kahakai to the north and just for reference, the property that we're requiring funds to purchase is No. 11. It is owned by Kama family **Coka** and my family is No. 8. No. 18 is my great, great, great, great-grandfather's property **Kulaki** and this is my great, great grandfather's property No. 21, **P Polly**. This is an archeological site map. We good give a lot of detail about what everything is but what we wanted to do was convey the density of the cultural sites. So when the owner got the approvals to do the development, they had not done an archeological survey. You know, from when I was a small kid my family always said, don't go back there in the caves because aural family is buried back there. I didn't know exactly which caves but just knew enough not to go in the caves. The archeological -- in order to get the estimated permit the landowner had to do an archeological inventory survey. It was very intrusive. They went in all the caves and found many more than what I would ever imagine. Some with more than 90 individuals with them. Some with coffins in them showing they continued to be used in more modern times this. Emphasizes the cultural sites on the property and importance of maintaining that cultural landscape.

This slide shows just the Manaka village itself. It is focused in the southwest corner of the property. Didn't make it all the way on our site visit but very amazing how everything is interspersed and related. A picture of some of the cultural sites on the property. Historic house site which I believe was part of the Coca family habitation area and a lot of artifacts are still found on the landscape.

This slide shows the Manaka trail system that went through. You have two trails connecting **Manaka and Manakupa** to [NAME?] a lot of people don't realize that it was actually -- this is where all the farmers live and if you are there and live in Ala Kahakai you see the pasture land and grant land that is actually where our families grew our food. And of course down here you had sweet potato and wealth of marine resources.

This is a picture of this trail. Ending at Manaka village and going down to **Pulli**. That is where we're going to go.

This is a quote from my great-grandfather's brother uncle her better.

Both my great-grandfather and brother were interviewed many times in the 50s and 60s and I went to the museum one day and I saw this up on the wall and I thought oh my gosh they actually have quotes from his tapes. Recorded all the conversations and I'm not fluent in that. I took French in high school. Just provides amazing guidance for future generations. This talks about the importance of using the Ala **Kaua** trails.

This property has amazing views. You know, the landowner she knew what the value was of these views. Not just the 270-degree coastal view but views of Malama and when there is snow up there it is amazing to see the snowcapped mountain.

This is actually view towards volcano national park. You can see Olohen that. And that is the cliff.

This is a picture of the local family or ranch. The ranch owned by the Galimba family and we have [NAME?] here representing and she'll talk more when she gives her testimony. But they are the lessees of the entire Manaka property and owners of 800 acres immediately mauka.

>> Reyna: There is a lot of -- as mentioned there is lava systems in Manaka and a lot of these caves are secret to Ala Kahakai because they have the underground springs which are basically drips and if you go in the caves you find these rock caverns situated New Testament under the drips with kind of indentations where other kinds of gourds were used to collect water and so a lot of these caves are really sacred because they are really the only resource for fresh water in this aqua.

>> Keoni: This is the 575 underground cave which spans the width of the property. It runs in Manaka direction. Used extensively for habitation, water collection and refuge. It includes its own underground trail system. Actually that big. Connects over 50 terraces and enclosures and living spaces including multiple rock caverns like Reyna said it collects the water. Many of these features still have the organic material on the sleeping area so you have remnants of mat -- could be **kohalali** and other kind of marine sources and there are multiple, multiple artifacts. Sinkers, [NAME?] and numerous -- and it is amazing that we have all this and still enact and it is a museum. 575 meters long.

This is a picture that shows just kind of what the landscape looks like. You can see the pasture grass there. We also saw some picture of coastal vegetation. Because this land was used for farming for so many -- ranching for

so many years and there has been extensive qualifiers in the area they have a lot of dry land forest up in the area but along the cliffs which are protected out of the reach of a goat you have all kinds of native vegetation like the **Maoli ola, and nopoka with kona (sp)**

>> Reyna: We have been talking about the Manaka. The translation is giddy cliff. It is famous in legend because it refers to niu **lohiki** which was a coconut tree that lives on the cliff. It was a form of the **hena** and she wanted to send her son to Tahiti and he climbed the tree and sat on top of the tree and it grew and grew and grew and created this bridge. And as the boy sat in the tree, he got giddy because he was, you know, almost flying eventually landed in **lohiki**. That is where the name comes from.

>> Keoni: This is a story [inaudible] his younger brother, Kepo and their cousin who went fishing in the sea. He was a noted Fisherman in the area and made fun of them, called them unskilled Fisherman. [NAME?] who is a noted kahuna and [NAME?] or ex excuse me to somebody that is not an expert in fishing and fish habits. Began to offer prayers to female aumakua who lived in the sea. She answered his prayers by giving them quantities of fish which he caught for his team. **[NAME?]** when they first was caught in Manaka, he forgot his unkind words and in his excitement ran to help so that he may be given some of the catch and soon after in 1854, **Houli**, the wife, gave birth to a little girl and that was my great, great-grandmother. This is her name as she was named **[NAME?]** for short. This last verse indicates that this is a name given to the child for her three fathers, the unskilled Fisherman of Manaka.

So the vision for Manaka is protected landscape protected by the community corrected to the surrounding island by the Ala Kahakai network. The land will continue to be grazed by cattle by the ranch and for the foreseeable future with pockets of protected areas containing native plants and [coughing]

The entire property will be conserved for cultural practice and fishing come I forgot to mention is extremely important in **Kahaki**. People rely on fishing, and hunting and as well as enjoyment in nature and education. ATA, the Ala Kahakai Trail association is committed to community based stewardship. We will engage with stakeholders to develop a resource management land for the property after taking ownership.

In this last slide just kind of emphasizes our resource management values. We included a write up about this in the application. But right now we have a landowner who is looking to sale. She has to sale. Her investment into

this property and I don't know she could talk to the next developer I don't know what is -- she could sale to the next developer I don't know what is going to happen. She has been aggressive in her plans to develop. There was some bull dozing started without permits. We had to keep a really close eye on this property and for me personally I'm just looking for some peace and harmony. I want to be able to tell my family that they're safe and we don't have that yet. That is what this really means to me. Anything else you want to add in?

>> Reyna: No, I think that is everything.

>> Commissioner: Thank you so much. I believe there is some other people here who may wish to testify but do you have any questions for either Reyna or Keoni before we hear from Michelle? Okay, Michelle, would you like to say a few words?

>> Michelle: You talked about let's see, protecting some of the very special areas. You know, happening all around and that is new and how would you do that?

>> Keoni: First of all, we would work with the community to do resource management plan and then we would also want to work with Michelle's family to come up with both an agricultural plan and cultural resource plan and what we -- she'll talk a little bit more about this but what we did with an adjacent property in Kahakai is barrel sites that are above ground that are getting trampled by cows, Hana where it is not appropriate to have cows in there doing their thing and maybe you know if we find plants we can work with them to try to actually pass off those areas and exclude that from pasture.

>> Michelle: Thank you. With

>> Commissioner: Would you please identify yourself for the record.

>> Speaker: I have a question just to clarify. This always comes up about the conservation easement component. Just to confirm that they're not seeking an easement waiver.

>> Commissioner: Conservation easement on the property post --

>> Keoni: We also applied for a program through the Hawai'i program and their meeting for ranking is actually on Monday. They're going to give their official rankings then. I did speak with Maxine today and she said that currently we are ranked the No. 1 project. So the county of Hawai'i would get a conservation easement for this property and they would also be contributing towards the purchase.

>> Commissioner: Does that answer your question?

>> Audience Member: Just to confirm that -- under our program the easement is required but request waiver so we just want to make sure which side of the line you're on for that.

>> Keoni: No, we are not.

>> Michelle: Aloha, everyone. I'm Michelle. We have a family ranch in Kahakai and we have been leasing land in the area for over 20 years. The Manaka -- let me back up a little bit and say that I support -- I strongly support the projects A, B and C. Maybe [inaudible] I might to have go on a conference call later. I'm not sure if I could be here for discussions later. So just talking about Manaka, we actually only have been ranching that particular piece for about two or three years. But kind have been in the area for quite a long time. Our ranch started in 1993 but I actually spent most of my childhood in Kau and roaming around on the land because my Dad was working at a previous ranch, the owned Parker ranch when they were here. And he also was working on dairy in the area that sometimes the lease gets landed. I have a lot of tie with this land.

My family has been in agriculture in Ka'ū three generations above me. My own daughter who I'm not sure if she's going to be in agriculture but we'll see hopefully she grew up in ag but hopefully she does that.

We do produce about one-half a million pounds of beef a year for local markets, whole foods, food land, various farmer's markets and restaurants.

We've -- as family mentioned we have been working closely with Ala Kahakai and TPL on the Waikapuna piece and Puna piece and amazing to buy it from [NAME?] and we're putting agriculture easement on that as he mentioned. We could go back to that in more detail later.

I really think that this acquisitions are mutually beneficial for us and for the nonprofits, the ranch can provide buyer loads -- keeping the grass down so that less likely to have wildfires which this area is prone to wildfires. Unfortunately some people are not very responsible with, you know, their cigarettes or their camping fires so we do have them occasionally. Let's see, the ranch also is there all the time. We're constantly monitoring these lands and going down there and checking on water and fences so we're able to sort of keep an eye on security because unfortunately some people are not as respectful of cultural sites as they should be.

And we can manage access as well. So a lot of -- you know, I've really realized that ranching can get sort of a double-edged sword. The cattle don't

know what is a cultural site and what is not. They generally don't like to walk on stones so they generally don't want to go on to a wall or a cultural site. But there is a certain amount of slow degradation that does happen. But compared to some of the places in Ka'ū that have -- aren't being ranched and coastal properties that have unrestricted access, I mean, it is a lot better for the cultural resources to have the cattle for protecting the sites.

I think it is -- nonprofits can help us by providing some relief from development pressure obviously. And they can also help to protect the cultural resource sites. I think that is something we care about as well despite being ranchers.

As Keoni says, the Ka'ū community is very supportive of these projects and keeping this coastline open and protected, consistent pushing is very important and we work with the community and provide access for -- across the lands that we lease to get to the coastline.

And actually the community is very supportive of managed access. They actually don't want, like, everybody to come down and steal their fish.

[Laughter]

Let's see, I just wanted to say as well that, you know, my family is very happy to be ranching there. We consider it a privilege. Sort of the bottom line is that we are even below that more fundamentally we're really supportive of conserving this cultural resources and natural resources so that's really -- I mean, most important thing. If we can ranch on it and work with non-profits, that is just extra.

Yeah, so just thank you for considering these projects in Ka'ū. If you want more sort of info on the conservation of this I'm happy to answer questions.  
Zero

>> Commissioner: I was wondering if you could address the breadth of Chinese invest in Ka'ū lands and how that affects timetables and so on. Costs to manage it.

>> Michelle: Yes, right. Ka'ū has been really lucky in that whenever things sort of heat up in the real estate market, something happens. It gets really hot but then there is a recession and then we're like whew.

[Laughter]

Um, and right now that is sort of a little bit less likely because we do have Chinese money coming in. There was a group of Chinese investors that bought 1600-acres above Ala Kahakai but adjacent to some of the lands and they

were willing to pay market price which is just like nobody even willing go and pay anything like market price for that piece of property. So definitely driving up property values so it is really kind of important that we move on this now before that factor increases property values. Yeah. Scary. Thank you again.

>> Commissioner: Any further questions for any of the applicants?

David.

>> David: Commissioners and others remember to say your name first before you begin speaking it is easier to compose the minutes.

>> Commissioner: Any further testimony of anybody? Yes, go ahead.

>> Speaker: You folks have three applications before us. At some point we're going to ask maybe after all la Kahakai we're going to ask your ranking of preference in priority but maybe if you could just explain a little bit about the match for this particular project you mentioned this project. It is looking promising.

>> Speaker: It was shared off the record that the project ranks anyone. We'll get confirmation on Monday. There is a small chance it could shift a little because there is going to be some discussion on Monday amongst the Commissioners to make the final decision. But the way that the county process works is we don't submit a number to them because basically the county requires acquisition of some kind of interest in land which is basically for them a conservation easement. So we would be working with the county to craft the conservation easement that they could agree and to we would praise that easement and that is the amount that the county would contribute.

>> Speaker: I would like to add they have a pretty good budget right now for these kinds of purchases and there is very accommodating like to work with us and according to the county if they use any funds to purchase interest in properties such as this to qualify to also apply for stewardship grants. It is very unique this program that they have. They take a percentage of the conveyance tax for real property and then they take a quarter percent specifically to allow for stewardship by different nonprofit groups. So we hope to take advantage of that.

>> Speaker: So PONC is county of Hawai'i?

>> Speaker: Correct.

>> Speaker: Are they up for match on any of these other properties?

>> Speaker: We're going to discuss that a little bit later but

Kaunāmano they have rates agreed to contribute towards that purchase through the conservation easement. The Kiolaka'a we plan to apply next year. Applications are due in February.

>> Commissioner: Okay. Not hearing any further questions or discussion on this we'll move on to item 4-B which is the same applicants but for Kaunāmano.

>> Keoni: All right. Well, I'm in the hot seat again. The good thing is a lot of these slides you have already seen. I'm going to kind of ship through that.

Again, I'm Keoni Fox. Al Kahakai Trail Association and representing Ka'ū and picture of our board with our National Park Service partners. Again the map of the 175-mile long trail. Are we're landowners and received a grant from you folks in 2014 for a 40-acre property up here in Kahakai called [NAME?] and last year we were donated 100-acres of land at Keili which is just South of Kaunāmano.

>> Reyna: You know all about this and I won't do that again. And then again, just emphasizing all of the work that we have done long the Al Kahakai and now we're talking about Kaunāmano which is the area in the purple.

>> Keoni: With the Trail Association we refer to the queen highways back in 1992 that protects our trails. The -- this shows the trail going up in the north part of Kaunāmano around this bay here and again state law continues protect our trails today. Many of you folks know that Al Kahakai is kind of the authority on a lot of the trails what is considered public and what is private.

Kaunāmano, let's just say there is so many cultural and natural resources on the property. Hardest part about doing our site visit was what to show you. We could have been throughout for a week and not seen everything. Just some of the views of Kaunāmano look can north towards Kiolaka'a. We have 4 miles of coastline over 440 cultural sites, but 20 something burial sites. You have -- I mean what could be one burial could be multiple individuals. Trails, two different villages, amazing things.

Same from before showing ownership of the property after the Mahala. There is six different grants here. What is sad, there was more than six families, the Mahala in Ka'ū, I don't know if this is true everywhere. All of these families are [NAME?] or [NAME?] not common people got land in Kaunāmano.

This is a map showing the density of to get cultural sites. There was a survey done by Haha and associates. There was a lot of errors or holes. I

reviewed the whole thing. They did miss a lot. But even if they didn't you can see that there is extensive historical resources throughout the land.

Just wanted to point out the property is here. Then we have a large estate property here and then we have a county property owned here which recently acquired through the program and it is the [NAME?] or the Waikapuna and actually that is a picture of that property.

So the reason why we include they'd slide was to show you what the larger cultural landscape is. So Kaunāmano means where thousands are set. It speaks of the multitude of Hawaiians that live on this land and you know not just this property but immediately adjacent properties had some amazing things. There is a war hey elementary school. There is a sun or rain halo whichever way you want to look at it but there is a whole legend -- not legend but historical reference about that halo and native planters and Mary talks about the Ka'ū and telling the rain to stop. He was the plantation manager in Hutchinson used to go there and make it rain whenever -- and the same hillside in an area called **popaco** you had a yellow blossom trees and here is the **kahoola ula** and this was a private property purchased from the plantation after they closed in 1996. And the owners didn't do anything with it. But the county was mandated by the EPA to close a large -- in -- they started to look around and said look at this property with lots of dirt. It is downhill. We don't have to pay for a pump. This is grated. Way from the homes. When my family and any other members of the community said wait. This is a huge opportunity to bring back the community have -- I'm meeting with another board that has grants to take care of this property.

The north side of Kaunāmano actually starts here at the property bound rid is right about here. Many of you that have gone through Ka'ū may have stopped at this point. It is really well known and popular for tourist because you can see the entire east side of the island all the way to volcano national park. The view is amazing. **Pohena paul**. It is historic and important to work for Kahului and a place where chiefs are pure yid and here is a blow hole and famous story about that piece of property. Again this is the view north. Towards [NAME?] protected with public land assistance. And then the view south. The 4 miles of coastline. This is only about two-and-a-half miles to here. This point here called Ala Kahakai and three or four bay with some good fishing and some of those bays are known for certain kinds of fish.

The property we visited this the village, you have lots of extensive caves

running for miles provided shelter for families and we had cases used near the training ground specifically for warriors and that is what you see here. Lots and lots of caves. Over 100 caves documented used for reasons and habitation and temporary shelter and some specifically used for water. I have noticed that those caves they were not -- there was not like a co-mingling where you had us living here and there and they were getting water as well. The way I was taught was that those caves were very secret. Fresh water resources. There is no strings or anything else in Kaunāmano so in order to support this driving population they had to rely on the fresh water and the quality of water in order to provide that subsistence. Just some other areas I wanted to take you to we did not have enough time there is a blow hole called [NAME?] and another case system with a bunch of things here.

A little fishing village right at the coastline. Really an amazing place. Popular for the community. For fishing and overnight camping. We're really lucky to be working closely with the agency conservatory because our partner has a drone that takes amazing pictures and he loves any excuse to take a drone picture. He took this on the site visit. This is **paola** village and old Jeep road that goes through the village. We stopped here and played a game of Jacks and also a place for collecting Paki salts and you have more at this edge. I don't know if you have seen these on other islands and always known as being found at Kaunāmano. Paola is known in Hawaiian Lord. Do you want to tell the story?

>> Speaker: It is named after really beautiful woman who loved to play kimo or similar to jacks. And **Kiohi**, Ka'ū was from Puna really attracted to Paola and he came but he was also Paola lover and found the two of them playing kimo together at the shoreline and she turned them both to stone and so when you're at here you can still see the two of them there. I don't think that we got to --

>> Keoni: We did not get a chance to see. It is a little graphic. You can see the agony. The Hawaiian man always gets --

[Laughter]

Sorry. In the village of Paola it is not just the Al Kahakai that goes there you have the secondary trail system. It is very elaborate. This picture here is an elevated trail that goes over from probably a prominent person's home and then same trail going Maki to the shoreline.

Lots and lots of halo on the left and I believe this is a fishing -- this is my favorite place in the world I think. This is actually the bathing area for the

people at Paola. You have [NAME?] come is very deep and rough and that is -- and Waikiki which is shallow and peaceful. That was for women and children and that is actually where I like to go. But Kaunāmano is important because that is where **Opopela and [NAME?] -- picture of [NAME?]** come we got to visit. And within the cave is a stone line pool which was used to collect fresh water and that is a lot of kopi in it and they got their profile picture.

>> Reyna: I think there was a story about **[NAME?]** and her Grandmother being up to two weeks in this cave and they would bring up to their family and [inaudible]

>> Keoni: More pictures of the bay. Great place for fishing et cetera, during the fishing tournaments. People make reservations a year in advance. Everybody wants that spot.

>> Reyna: Paola is made famous by [NAME?]. She grew up in Waikapuna. Raised by her Grandmother and when she was about 75 she -- she visited Kiolaka'a again with some friends. She composed the lyrics to the song you all might be familiar with and talks about a lot of these really special places along the coast and I guess the song is kind of upbeat but there is some other meaning that kind of reminiscing and talking about -- there was so many people that lived here but a lot of these have become somewhat lost.

>> Keoni: Sounds like a cheerful song but it is sad. These places are no longer inhabited. Do you know that song? Yeah. Pictures of some of the coastal vegetation. Lots of that. On the coastline. People to have step on the name. Resources. Because the -- there is a significant drop. There is not like -- I mean there is some nice really close system and in fact there was a study done by NOAA and they said that the marine resources were comparable to [NAME?] and just the water quality so clean. But you also have a really sharp drop so the humpback whales come really close. People like to go down there to do the humpback surveys but the whales can be really loud and need a lot of attention and flap their tail. It is amazing how close they get to the shoreline.

We also have a lot of historic feature from the plantation days. I was like skip this part. I think it is important for our history as well. This is actually a picture of a World War II artillery range. That is on the north side of the property. And then I -- the historic railroad or rail pass which connected Naalehu sugar mill and I believe it was built in 1890 and in the beginning they actually didn't have a train. They just used carts and mules and used gravity to take the sugar down to -- and this goes through most of the property. Again the

lessees of the property is the Galimba family who has been ramping this for many generations and years, three generations.

>> Reyna: Raised about 400 cattle there. Is that correct?

>> Michelle: Yes.

>> Reyna: Something tolls note this area long with Ka'ū has -- is unique and provides for wonderful grazing. Probably John can share more about Kiolaka'a.

>> Keoni: We included the slide to emphasize the development threats. The property was purchased by an Arizona based Real Estate Investment Trust originally and they put together this subdivision plan that was going to be 46, 28-acre luxury lots and once again the buying department said go right ahead. And we said no. So really what we try to do was not go the legal approach. Say hey these guys are here and they don't know what they're buying. See a good deal. We met with the landowner and took him on a tour with this SUV. Drove through the property and showed them all the different sites and said, hey, you know, really want to work with you on this plan for development. Everything was really cordial. I think he saw the writing on the wall because he sold the property 4 months after that. To the current landowner that we're working with now. But they did have again a permit and [coughing]

We did appeal that and it was resubmitted.

Again a slide showing who our stakeholders are and who we would work with on the management of the property. Again, Al Kahakai depends on community based stewardship. If we go the money from you and no development, in my opinion we really haven't saved the property. We really haven't done it justice.

There were a lot of wrongs done in the plantation era and Ka'ū feels when you hear it in the voices of the kahuna they have been marginalized from the properties for so long. Even going down the beaches, we all know that the trails are public but the landowner is saying no, you're not allow placed this property. They were disconnected from those lands. Even when they're -- when it is a drive down the ranch is going to use that key to the gate to, you know, hold some kind of authority over the land and to subordinate. A lot of the descendants and that is why it is important for us to connect with the community and descendants and they need to be empowered to the resources. The property is too big and too many amazing things. We need all the

stakeholders to work together.

Our last slide is again our resource management values. Again protecting the cultural sites. Working with the ranchers on sustainable ranching. And protecting the natural resources. All right. Another good shot from the village.

>> Commissioner: Thank you. Questions for the applicants?

>> Commissioner: Care to say any more Michelle?

>> Michelle: Not really. It is amazing all the resources down there and I mean I'm totally happy to work with Keoni and [NAME?] in that space and figure out ways to get everybody happy about the site.

>> Speaker: David wants me to mention we got three additional letters of support to add to our application. One from [NAME?] conserve see and can each take one and pass it.

>> Keoni: A little bit about **Hulio**. They run a program and every year they bring in I think it is college students or maybe high school students that might be interested in cultural resource management. It is really an opportunity to -- for them to learn the field. We have not had a lot of them in that field and since then I have seen a few of them actually get jobs with archeological companies. I think it is a great program. They visited this property in Ka'ū in 2016.

>> Commissioner: John, when those come around and there is extra, will you make sure that I get them to put back.

>> Commissioner: Okay. You don't need to bring them down to me. I have all these in digital form I think.

>> Speaker: Wherever it stops on the table there.

>> Commissioner: I don't want any more paper.

>> Speaker: Thank you. Keoni, Wendy. Could you elaborate on the match? Looks like you secured 3.7 million. Is that all from Hawai'i County?

>> Reyna: There is no specific dollar amount until we negotiate a conservation easement and they appraise the means. What we have in there is estimates. But the project has been approved by the county so the funding is there.

>> Wendy: All from the one source.

>> Reyna: Correct.

>> Commissioner: Anymore?

>> Speaker: How close are you usually in your estimates?

>> Reyna: I think we based -- probably based that off of our Waikapuna project maybe [NAME?] can share. Did it come to 60% of the value that is correct? In [NAME?] the conservation easement came out to about 60% of the fee value. And so this is I think we -- it is about 50% is what we put in. Again it all depends on the type of restrictions that are provided for in the conservation easement, the more restrictive the more valuable it becomes. Obviously there is not going to be any development, you know, and there is also a formative obligation in terms of care taking, the natural and cultural resources so the more of those restrictions and affirmative obligations there are in the conservation easement the more valuable it becomes.

>> Speaker: We just went through that process with the county. We did finalize conservation easement. That -- Waikapuna will be the first county means. They're using that in another project in South Kona and we hope to use that same thing for Kaunāmano and that appraisal was done this year.

>> Commissioner: Okay. Thank you very much. I suggest we take a short break. David. Yes. Let's take a very short break. I have got -- let's meet back here at 10:35. We'll reconvene.

[break]

>> Commissioner: Let's reconvene, folks. Going back into session after our short break. The time is 10:40. If we can reconvene. Meeting 69. Next up is item 4point M, applicant Mālama Kaua'i, Olohena 'Āina. Speak loudly so we can record. Introduce yourself.

>> Megan: I'm Megan Fox. Not related to Fox today. Basically I work for director for Mālama Kaua'i and we have been doing that since 2006. So I really just want to thank you for allowing us to be here and participating in this process. This is our project I guess I should say is not as fully planned and fully funded as a lot of the other projects in the competitive process. So it is really exciting to have the opportunity to share what we're doing with you. I wanted to start off and talk a little bit about why we are so early stage in and share with you a little bit of the background of the project.

This is not our first project. We provided physical sponsorship and helped raise first quarter of 1 million for Hawai'i's ag launching in -- and handed off to another community group once they bought their nonprofit status. We've also managed 8-acre community farming since about 2009. But actually the property is going up for sale. So we're going to be off that property by June of 2020. Having an ag park in Wailuku is our general planned and we have been

working with farmers for over a decade and we know that land access alone is not the only barrier that they face on the island it has a lot to do with cost of living while they start their businesses. So we really as we're building the model for this next ag park we really had to focus on building one with housing opportunities for our youth so they can be incubated and accelerated while they start the business. We see so many move off the island while they have these kinds of dreams.

We run into plenty of stumbling blocks trying to find the right property for that project. Large landowners won't provide long enough leases to get infrastructure based grants. Most ag lands on Kauai and land is far above the appraisal values.

Since 2017 we joined the Hawaiian investment accelerator and they helped to us fine-tune our business model and we continued to look for the right land opportunity.

But as you all know, 2018, a lot happen placed Kauai. We got sidetracked. The instruments flood hit our entire island. And most of our ag lands are in flood zones on Kauai. So impacted farmers, across the entire island. Very deeply. You know, some of the sites that we had actually been looking at to site this project were completely flooded. And destroyed fields and animals and their farms and they're still not recovering. You know, during that time we kind of focused our gears on helping people who are impacted for that year. So we distributed one run \$40,000 to 53 devastated farmers and ranchers long the coastline that were impacted. Definitely not enough to make a dent in the damage that was done to their farms.

And then we started working with the Olohena 'Āina to get the management of their water system and [coughing]

And so we -- we went through a lot that year. Kind of stopped looking for land for a little bit. But we became determined after this experience to never mess with land that is in a flood zone. That was a commitment after seeing so many our ag lands in Kauai in flood zones we realized that we needed some land if we're going to end you know the kind of resources into the future.

In 2019, we refocused back on our biggest goal for island yet and found land for an ag park with housing to accelerate and incubate new ag businesses right on location. We found the ideal property but just found it in May. Three short months ago. Every time we find a property we have to kind of retool that entire package and business plan. That is why we're still pretty early stage with

this one. We have the capabilities to quickly and typing and that takes a little more than a few months to do that.

As far as this property it is 21.6-acre, one of the only ag parcels in the entire area. Never been subdivided. It has a lot of potential. This is since its first ward. It has been basically in active kind of cattle ranching as long as the history books go back in the 1920s. History wall home for Sami and Maula, Hawai'i's most notorious con man. He went to the mainland and sold the hotel people even though he didn't own it. And then even way in the great Mālama there was only one man that had claims in this and supposedly right in the valley nearby and there is some old kookoo and lauhala that said he did some farming on this property, too.

Some of the -- probably the biggest banyan on Kahakai as you can tell -- on Kaua'i, this is a huge house for reference. This tree it a giant tree front there.

So to tell you a little bit about -- the most unique part about this property is that it has existing structure that has full density available. These buildings are all kinds of centralized in the front of the property. The oldest one is about 1916. These are really old homestead kind of like historical plantation houses. Newer, bigger one on the top is the most recent one built in the 70s.

And then with -- in addition to that we also have the ability and desire to build another small residential structure and county calls it a guesthouse. It is a very small size. And then it would be a business area and office storage area in the front of the property. You can see an old historic barn right there behind that. There is one small storage area. This will be kept in the front.

The other great part about, this all the utilities are hooked up which is rare for ag properties. It can cost so much money to have all of your electric, Internet, water, anything like that run out. So the property already has one water meter and it is again never been subdivided even though it has the county water that can get real expensive even with ag rates. We have already seen that with the last ag park that had water issues. This conveyors unique. Has about 80 to 100 inches of rain annually. To put that in perspective, Hawai'i is the wettest state. This is a wet area. A couple of times we brought people throughout and it was always raining. There is actually more things we shouldn't grow sometimes than we should. There is an opportunity to work with NRCS and some different storage attachment distribution systems and not 100% reliant on county property.

It was incredibly challenging to find something like this. It is an incredibly rare property on Kauai and it is the perfect location and has all the mental we need for a project like this. Happily outside of coastal flood zone and at an affordable price point below the county assessed value. So I'll walk you there. This is basically our projections for what we would like what to do with the property. I'll say it is very loose because the way that we work, we really bring the community in to all of our planning processes very deeply. So this is more of a projection of land use but not necessarily who will be using each piece.

So in the front right there ag forestry, that is strawberry guava densely, densely strawberry that would want to be focused with a food forestry. I should say that Beryl I know you came. Nobody else has come to the property. This is the front where the two cottages are. This is where the guesthouse processing area would be. This is where we kind of entered in.

So right here there is this beautiful cattle trail that comes around this area up into this zone. So there is -- I can show it to you guys in a video later. But really that hau section is for us in agriculture. We have a lot of cultural groups that would like to do various activities. Like we had ko and guava collections and maoli ko halaly, and that valley turns into a wet land. We think with more rehabilitation and removal of more invasive it will be a lot healthier of an ecosystem and bring some water back. There are a lot of ducks in the area and things like that. Kind of preserving that zone.

The conservation area, those are really hillier -- hillside areas so when those we're looking to do like production of native ferns or cultural purposes which is there is a lot of them tucked into those areas. And then, also, things like mumakil, guava and halali and there is a lot of strawberry guava and albizia, a lot of nasty trees. And then so the agriculture is really where our background in expertise is, these are -- these plants right here are more traditional for agriculture. They're flat. They're nice and elevated and flat. So those will basically have incubated farmers, incubator and accelerator folks on that land with business plans being supported in business development, accounting, things like that. So right now we have an ag internship program. We lease out land to small agribusinesses and basically putting them on a piece of land that they can have and really develop their business plan.

Our goal with those folks is to have them in and out of the property in five years. One would be development and set up of their business. Three years tax returns so they can build financial background to be able to get a loan

to actually purchase their own land after that. We see that work for some of the folks on our island that have had those opportunities that, you know, getting serious, having a lot of support and in five years you can go get your own farmland. So we really want to help support our youth and being able to achieve those dreams through that project.

This phase II conservation, this is our very steep fairly inaccessible zone. My friend Nick works with nature concerns and he loves exploring and building trails and shooting pigs so we're probably going to just send him down there to see what he finds. Maybe plant in ko for us but it is last priority in rolling out the protections on the property.

>> Commissioner: Which way is the slope coming down?

>> Megan: Coming down this wait a minute initially we would like to work with NRCS and do a hedge around the whole ridge just so it is thickly protected from anybody going over it. Yeah. Oops. Let me pull that out. I guess -- so the Commissioner's visited us a few weeks ago and butch asked how much money have you raised? None. Really because a lot of the funders that we went to we did an internal feasibility study and basically without the fund from this program, it really wouldn't be feasible for us to raise. You know. \$1.8 million. .8 Doable. .7 Doable. 1.8 not. So instead of driving our fundraiser in the last two months really hard, we basically kind of actually are relying to find out if they would be willing to be our nest egg. We have raised this kind of similar funding levels before so it wouldn't be the first time. And it is early in the process for that right now. A part of your packets we didn't -- we did outline the perspective capital stack for acquisition costs and there are -- there is a loan opportunities for -- so there are concerns that we cannot fundraise fast enough to do it in realistic time. We do have lending agents that are willing to work with us and feed the hunger or Rudolf Stiner who we have been working with before. Because butch made us feel so bad I tried to do Bernie Sanders in a little bit. In a couple of weeks two or three weeks we're able to get 30,000 just from our community from HSMA and 91 different individuals that said if you get the grant we'll throw in. So that was nice to see at least people in our community are willing to step up. These are just regular individuals from a couple of social media posts. With more time I think that would absolutely be a benefit.

But really probably the most important thing you wanted to I guess get across for this project, I'm really not coming here like Megan Fox and coming

here like Mālama Kaua'i. I'm coming here for Kauai. We don't take that lightly. Our work is very much community derived, designed and embedded and our community has been asking for a project like this for over a decade. You know, it is an investment that our taxpayers would be really proud to have made on their behalf. We have submitted over 150 letters of support and pledge commitments for their application. So I just wanted to talk about some of those in our government.

Our government is really interested. They developed a general plan that supports this kind of project. They want to see Mālama based for economy, security and disaster and organizations and networks cross the islands actually see this as a unique model offering statewide benefits for them. There is a lot of support across the state. Different industries.

Our education sector is really interested in this project providing meaningful connections and opportunities for their students and for their graduates. Our Community College is very supportive and involved from the top down.

Obviously conservation and ag industry is -- when you see projects like this happen it helps to support pathways for youth. Special projects and partnership that they can work with and really just for future workers and entrepreneur in their field they want to develop a workforce for some of their businesses.

And then our restaurants and food producers obviously want this for increased access to local ingredients. We're in a huge place where demand far exceeds our supply of food and they're willing to fight over it.

I just wanted to kind of say again, you know, our general plan for Kaua'i on this new one, it won awards because of how involved the community was. This is something that the community was really vocal about they wanted an ag park in every -- they wanted to address affordable housing. These are major, major issues for our island and I think one of the coolest things about it personally that is this is one of those rare projects where everybody on Kauai agrees on something and we have democrats and republicans and seed companies and Gary Hooser and HAPA and we have cultural activist and multi-national hotel corporations and everyone is into this and they really want to see something happen. So you know it is a rare opportunity. I fully understand that it is a risk coming to the front end on our funding cycle rather than on the back end but if you are willing to take a risk on an island pull together

and make this happen, Kauai will do it because we always do. Thank you.

>> Speaker: I want to say how much I appreciated the work you've done. Butch and I were able to visit. You said really good agricultural projection and, you know, thank you.

>> Megan: I'm still dreaming about butch's suggestions of butterfly rehabilitation. I really enjoy the visit.

>> Commissioner: Does Kaua'i County have any kind of funds available that could be approached as many county do so?

>> Megan: I have councilmen on every chair running around trying to find those pots. We're kind of non-traditional for open space. They just did a huge purchase for black bot and big \$5 million purchase over at black bot and in the past they have been stingy to be honest. I think they gave a small amount when they had their project. So we typically will get funding from economic development that maxes out at 20 grand. That is almost a given if this goes through. They fund us every year. The Mayor is going to start looking in pots and everybody is going to look in pots. There is potential actually with housing. There has been a lot of funding put into affordable housing and since this project will have housing elements, you know, supporting an acquisition that will provide low income housing for youth while they're in incubation acceleration programs could be a big project.

>> Commissioner:

>> Speaker: One clarification on the water situation. You said there is county ag water.

>> Megan: Yes. Regular county water with an ag meter.

>> Speaker: You're paying regular or ag water rates?

>> Megan: You would pay regular water rates. We have not put the ag on it yet.

>> Commissioner: Okay. So looking at the application, I didn't see an operating budget again [away from microphone]

>> Megan: You know, we basic live all the budgets for all three phases of the acquisition. I think if you look at the first application there is an estimated capital stack projections. Not detail though. Most of that is because until we're able to dig in to a lot of the factors we can't right size our numbers. I do have a budget for the last property we looked at but we kind of need to retool that. That takes a lot of time. I just wanted to see kind of where we got here first because we have to have the building assessed, too.

Some of them are so old. Are we going to have to tear them down or are we going to have to rebuild the footprints? What is restoration going to cost? There is a lot of things to cost out for all phases of it really. Depending on the housing and how many people we have in the program directly impacts what that operating budget could be. So I think originally we're thinking like we might be able to only have about six or eight people on a property given this property's capabilities we could probably have about a dozen. But what is that actually going to change in terms of making sure that they have equipment and support systems to make sure that they thrive there, too. We just to have retool that.

>> Commissioner: And then the immediate picture the application talked a little bit about bringing on somebody to do funding development. Do you have a budget or source of funding for that?

>> Megan: Pretty much unrestricted fund from our organization. We usually get flex funding from the Hawai'i which gets awarded in November. We put out an RFP, gotten some applications, started talking to some people. The person I really want is on another project on Kaua'i. I'm trying to hopefully she wraps up. We have not brought anyone on yet. Just because we wanted to see how far we get long to do it. We're ready to, yeah.

>> Commissioner: Then as far as [away from microphone] in that area obviously you probably got various acidic soil. What sort of crops were you thinking of planting in the ag portion?

>> Megan: Just to be clear I'm not farming. I'm farming farmers. Really the technical assistance provided by the groups that we partner with will help each farmer determine what their business plan that will be part of a submission and evaluation of their concept for that land and up it is a fit who gets selected to have those parcels and like Commission-based kind of process. Our committee that is working with them. Making sure that they're open to it, to adjusting to what the property needs to.

>> Commissioner: And then for the most part just because of that high rainfall you mentioned are you planning to use natural rainfall as your primary irrigation source or would you be putting in basic infrastructure to tap-in off --

>> Megan: We're going to put in basic infrastructure. I hope we don't need that much. It is more of a back-up and storage units especially in the far back of the property where it is going to take more to solar pumps are not that bad. Just run in the back of it. That is where NRCS comes in to design

something that works for the property.

>> Commissioner: A quick question. You mentioned wanting to avoid flooding. That potential of flooding hence moving out of the Hanalei watershed. You mentioned there is wet land on the parcel you're looking at. Can you just kind of -- I am curious what is the drainage? I'm not too familiar with that area.

>> Megan: It is kind of interesting. There is a small like seasonal stream that comes through here, very small. Almost nonexistent because of the non-invasive. There is valley land. If you follow that ha zone, it comes through here. So they said when the big flood did come, it basically, you know, we had like four or five, 8 feet up in north shore. But there they had up to here. They said it either flowed through or sunk in pretty quickly. Naturally just flows through that zone.

>> Commissioner: What is -- I mean what is mocha the watershed?

>> Megan: On the trailhead it is a quarter mile half a mile Mālama trail head. A quarter mile up the street.

>> Commissioner: Obviously I'm from [NAME?] and I should know this. I wonder if you can talk more about the housing use model because I know that our farm housing situation has been that a farmer had to have about \$35,000 worth of profits and then you could have then a certain amount of fault housing.

So this -- you're talking about the different density or it seems as if you're talking about all these houses that comprise a certain amount of dense and it is so forth estimated so it -- it would be a new model. Do you foresee having to get some kind of a variance or special permit to do this kind of a dormitory --

>> Megan: So what is amazing is that everything on the property is already compliant. I met with Kina in planning. Mike [NAME?] was former planning director and is now our county manager on this project the whole time it has been a dream in our head. We have worked with him. Every time we look at a property we call him up and say what is possible? What is not? If we do have to demolish and rebuild the buildings, we would have to get a regular -- go through a permitting process because it is in like the ag zone. But they're all -- it wouldn't be an issue. It becomes an issue if we wanted to build a new dormitory that is not in any of these prints which isn't in our plans, it is not in our proposal. That would require going through the planning Commission

and going through a bunch of new stuff.

The unique thing about this housing and why we have gone into it and mess with it and why other people cross the state are looking at this is because we found a way to de-risk the housing like landlord tenant relationship with this project. Instead of us, you know, this being a guy who leases this and lived there and he leases this space from us, he is actually in an accelerator and incubator program where this is an access for the program. It is a unique model. If we can show that it works, it could really de-risk ag housing opportunities across the state for a lot of large landowners that are really nervous about getting into that landlord tenant thing with housing. It can be really litigious. It is kind of a new model. The farmers housing does come up -- we have been working with councilman Blaich and we to help develop it first few years when it came out the policy. That is part of our thought process around having the accelerator candidates on the property for five years is again can we get them hitting gross 35,003 years in a row for taxes that way they can build that financial thing necessary to go and actually get land and put something on it, too. Because they can bring that business with them.

>> Commissioner: Can you -- I might have missed this. You might have already said it and I apologize if so. About the current landowner and the status of the property. It obviously is for sale.

>> Megan: Yes, it is very much for sale. The owners have actually owned the property since before -- after Hawai'i became a state in 19 consistent the same family. Hillary and Joe Stitora, super, super sweet. Actually I have a quick video of the property, too. Just reminded me. This is a video uncle Joe did with his drone. It is not as professional as all the lovely pictures that -- he's actually on his phone watching it on his computer. He's so cute. He sent this to me. This give you a little bit more. You can see some of the kind of elevation components.

>> Commissioner: Can you show us on the --

>> Megan: It is kind of -- this is coming from the back property looking towards the front. This is where the main house area was. This is going to be walking through the cattle trail. The valley is to your left right there that is the cabin that was built in the 40s. That is the one that was built in 1916. Some of those are more conservation focused areas. You can see the crazy invasive landscape.

>> Commissioner: The green patches are the areas that would be

farmed?

>> Megan: The more flat land zones, yes. See that bigotry and keep an eye on that big tree and I can show you when we go back. That is the tree line there and it will give you some perspective.

So the owners, they want to retire. They want to get a condo Princeville. They said they're over, you know, after 40 something years of pulling the same weeds.

>> Commissioner: Have they been farming the property?

>> Megan: They had taken -- there is Uncle Joe. They took cattle off the land in 2013 as people preparing for a sale. That is really when a lot of this came in. The cool thing is there is not a lot of grass, Buffalo grass, because the cattle was on there so long. There is every other moose that you can imagine.

>> Commissioner: Do they live there currently?

>> Megan: They do. They live on the property in the big house. They first lived in the little cottage when she was in high school. So this down here, this is that big. That bigotry that we're looking at. Here that is tree line. To give you some perspective. That used to be cut off in two different places for cattle down there.

>> Commissioner: Do you have a sense of your -- I don't know if they're tenants or anyway the farmers who would work these various sub-lots within the bigger parcel to have an idea -- do you have clients out there and do you know who they are and do you know what --

>> Megan: We have been paying an ag internship for students since 2014 and 15 and we have a minority farmer technical assistance program where we help farmers and ranchers with grant applications getting different government assistants programs and things like that. We have a huge pool of people. I think -- there is a lot of interest. There is so much interest. It is more finding a very equitable process to take into and applications and make assessments for the resources and really involving the community and developing that process and that plan for it. David.

>> David: Just a normal clean up here on making sure that we have all the correct information for the application. Also, there was one piece of public that came in that I think all the Commissioners saw and also here on the back table. So I want to make sure that we have the right numbers and right details if there is change or anything that you notice.

>> Megan: In regards to that testimony I'm actually impressed. We

have had dozens and dozens if not hundreds of sub licensees over a decade on our property. One nasty gram. That is good for Kaua'i.

[Laughter]

>> Commissioner: Okay. Laura.

>> Commissioner: I'm sorry.

>> Laura: Aloha. I'm Laura Kaakua and Megan has done a great job covering the entirety of the project but just from landscape perspective we're willing conservation means here and really the system so many type of agriculture projects over the years our focus now is really on making sure that the food that we're growing is food that can be consumed here for our local market to just increase our food sustainability. And then who the farmers are that are supported on this property is really interesting. Exciting to me so Megan and her organization are dedicated to prioritizing disadvantaged and interested. So people who want to farm but would not even be able to get a leg up and really where do you start? If you don't have money a lease there is only so many properties that are small enough for a new farmer to start. You're not going to actually make money from that land for many years. Where do you go to -- where do you live during that period and so a lot of it is kind of, you know, we could farm but they're never actually going to get to the level of being a full time farmer unless they have the opportunity to be employed by a larger company? So for us this -- the focus on especially those who cannot really will be all of those who would never be able to afford this. Knowing that Mālama Kaua'i infrastructure is there to support them and connect them. As you heard Megan say, she's farming farmers. Knowing that those pieces and the support system will be in place for them.

To me I mean even if Megan gave an estimate up to maybe a dozen at a time over five year period even if that was cut in half. Really conservative estimate. If you -- if we look at that and six at a time every five years, over time that is going to make a massive change to our farming community. Looking real long term, the land scape -- that we can follow this and if any of those farmers went and any of these -- these farmers are ready to make that jump. They'll have saved money and they'll have a business plan and making money off the farming and ready to put that on a mortgage and buy their own small lot, we would like to follow them and do conservation easement with them to help them carry that large mortgage load and re-invest in the farming because a lot of -- I think that might be a partnership we can continue to do. Megan gets them on

their feet and then we protect the land and make it financially viable to continue. We're proud to be a part of this Mālama Kaua'i.

>> Megan. Thank you for bringing that up. I didn't mention that 70% of clients are funded by [NAME?] and schools. We work with a lost youth on the OI going to be a big funnel for us in Kapaa and we have highest recipient zones on the island and high concentration of low incomes.

>> Commissioner: Thank you, Laura.

>> Laura: Thank you.

>> Commissioner: More discussion? Questions? Or either?

Okay. Thank you very much. We can take an early lunch or slightly later lunch. How do you feel?

>> Commissioner: Later.

>> Commissioner: I thought of a question for you as we set up. You applied for two years of funding. Just one. Just the first year.

>> Megan: Most because it is not going to be available next year.

>> Commissioner: There is urgency on this.

>> Megan: They basically were like it is really interesting the owners are amazing. They have been trying to like turn away some people who wanted to do really full development of craziness there. If they walk in and the first question is, you want to sub-divide? Where is the sub-divide lines? When we told them what we wanted to do, literally tears were coming from their faces saying this has been in our family since Hawai'i was a state. They really -- it was a legacy for them and they want it held in agriculture. But, at the same time, they have a really good real estate agent. There is interest and they promised me they would not sale it [away from microphone]

>> Commissioner: That is important consideration. Thank you.

>> Commissioner: All right. Good morning. Fox board member for --

>> Speaker: We have met before.

>> Speaker: All the slides are the same from our previous one so we'll try to zip through it. A picture of our board. Actually a different picture of the trail corridor the 175-mile. This is actually MPS put together. It is not just the footpath but corridor. This darker brown line

>> Keoni: It does connect all the national parks of the Hawai'i islands. Next slide. Kiolaka'a this property in red. I'll save a portion of [NAME?] and in Ka'u we have some that doesn't go all the way to the ocean. And before I

forget, we did get some last minute letters of support. We have one from Manuka. This is a local based nonprofit organization which I am also a board member of. We have the stewardship application for the grounds. Take one there.]

Also another letter of support from [NAME?] the director of the conservancy. I talked to you before about this program that they do. I think the last one was on Hawai'i and we were involved with them. And then another letter that we just got yesterday was adjacent property owner. A long time in the family and they own 25-acres adjacent to this property and it is also -- it also has plants on it and cultural features so they're hoping to be involved with any future stewardship from the property. Grosam is last name, Jodi. We had letters in all the application booklet from the Office of Hawaiian Affairs and conservancy of Hawai'i. I think that they're based in Hilo but they have board members from all of -- throughout the state and they are particularly interested in protecting the key systems in Ka'u, not just for the cultural resources but for geologic resources. They do [NAME?] and really interested in the native, endemic insects that live in the caves. Some of them are only found in Hawai'i.

>> Commissioner: Flying spiders and I think there is a sin --

>> Keoni: And centipede. There is another one from Hawai'i Wildlife Fund. They're based in Maui. I think their main objective is to protect marine life. Their focus has been on marine clean-ups and they have steward shouldn't of Ko Hui Ku Maoli and they travel through to get there and also protect the pods where plants at Kamilo. So Kiolaka'a is adjacent to Waiohinu. This portion of the property stretches four and a half miles mocha from the ocean all the way up to Waiohinu town.

>> Reyna: It is made up of three different -- and Kiolaka'a means throw or roll. It is a reference to ulaa or Hawaiian bowling course that was popular.

>> Keoni: This is towards Waiohinu town. Not Lahoo and this is the kama system and this is the entrance. There is [inaudible]

Old maps of the property. This is the old map after we were able to access some of the boundary Commission records. It was -- there are testimonies given by native Hawaiians that live in the area and some bird catchers. They knew the names of everything around the rain forest. Really amazing. Every single point there is a name and we have a lot to learn.

This one is just focusing on Kiolaka'a Bay. This property is a weird

shape. The four and a half miles that goes all the way up and then you have this old grant 5-acre piece right along the east side of Kiolaka'a Bay. It was granted to Hutchinson sugar but it is now part of the same TMK as the larger piece. When we went on our site visit we stopped right here and this is the cattle chute that we talked about. They push the cows over this ramp into the water and hoisted them onto the ships.

Again we have another property with right up to development. I'll be honest we had this as a feature project. I'm much more familiar with the other properties. I knew this had a lot of culture values. But I kind of thought we always had time to apply for this. It was not until we spoke with the property owner who is the [inaudible] did we find out that he had already paid for a survey which is completed and not just that. He had already prepared a subdivision map. It is my understanding he has done some prelim applications, submittals. He's had the property on the market for many, many years. I kept thinking he's not getting any bites and that is why you have not seen movement. But I think he's becoming impatient and he's looking at dividing it out to 20 and 40-acre lots already.

So the part of the property has remnant of a dry land forest mixed music. I want to say somebody called -- lots of wiliwili. Which has become much more rare in Kiolaka'a because of the moss. Really healthy stands of trees. We saw a little bit at the site visit and then lots of lama. Really healthy lama on the property. I noticed pilo. And I have taken an interest in this plant because it was -- on some of it the adjacent properties that were listed for sale. A lot of them are older plants. I didn't see a lot of keiki and something has been attacking them and a lot of dead ones and if you're familiar with cultural uses a lot of these trees were used for weapons, fence posts, that kind of thing.

Oola Keokea. This is important piece. We don't have a biological report for the part of the property. I believe they did some stuff on the site but we were not able to find any kind of biological report for the area.

I have only hiked to this property the area twice to be honest with you. The first time I went through that I found this grove Kiolaka'a and I knew that we had to save that. It was a moment of excitement me. I think I screamed out loud. But this is a plant that we definitely want to save. As I mentioned at the site visit. I have never seen a Keokea before in Ka'u. I seen some in the natural reserve but not in this part of Ka'u. Lots of haha. Naio. Koha and I barely had a chance to investigate the sand dune area. It was mentioned in the

site visit the winds blow sands from Waikapuna 3 miles way and it created the sand dune system right in the middle of the property. Didn't get a chance to investigate all of it but I found some no-ho there. I forget to mention before moving forward the forest areas currently leased for ranching. The rancher is and triple T ranch. We are working with Wally on the property. He has a tenant there. Triple T ranch. We let them know what our interest was. They're not conservation minded. So these trees everything that I have taken a picture of their right in the cattle pasture. These areas weren't being -- I want to say within the last ten years. The leases are somewhat recent. They did investigate a lot of money in the fencing so we are concerned about protecting these plants, working with the ranchers and find the ballots.

>> Reyna: They're also very supportive with the project and we consulted with all of them by both lobby and Willie. Is that how you pronounce it? And they are obviously concerned about the development, ranch hands are not hard to find in Ka'ū and so because they have both invested quite a bit of money in terms of fencing and infrastructure on the property they are interested in working with Al Kahakai to preserve it.

>> Keoni: This is a sketch of the habitation in the middle of the property. That is first stop on the site visit. It is very dry and there are a lot of native Hawaiians were able to grow it and other crops. This area was just an extension of [NAME?] where we had the springs and water and that really was the breadbasket of Kiolaka'a which is why we kept getting attacked from our neighbors in the north. But you have an old habitation complex areas like this Pahala ash and we looked at the hao and forms at the site visit. You have this amazing system the kalapo system and most falls in Wainaku so protected and these here mipoli which is under browned fresh water lake. Stone hinge called that because of -- there is a geology reference to it. Some large boulders that were thrown out by the Wacino standing up right. We have a picture of it. I'll show you. It is very eye-catching. Most importantly, [NAME?] it is right here we did visit that. The entrance is on the state property. The entire cave falls on the property we're trying to protect.

Another Shalan shot showing the cave and another one towards Kamilo Beach. I see remnants of the old trail that connected all these, too. This site is on the Wikeno property. Show this picture we good get a chance to visit. It is part of the same case system. Hawaiian name is [NAME?] and [NAME?] because of the folders that surround it.

>> Reyna: This is a closer shot of the opening shot you saw. You can see Shala standing there. You can see how large it is. This is where we hiked down with some of you. It is the -- it is 1 kilometer long. They measured it.

>> Keoni: The entrance -- there is an entrance going to mauka and one to Kahakai. There is fortress walls on both sides. You have the 6-foot tall wall in the key system going mauka and one that is a little less well experienced going makai we did not visit that part. I was told as a young boy that these fortresses were built during the battles with [NAME?]. Our kiwa was protecting lands with army. Kayana which was general which was very well known, attractive. And he was leading his army to invade it. A lot of the battles were done in this area right around Kali and the fields above that. So we have these caves where people are taking refuge. Armies could hide in the darkness. The only entrance into the area was small puka here had you have parapets here that allow for defenses. At the site visit I pointed out the area here right near entrance full of sling stones. These caves were obviously used I did have some personal respect concerns about making this public. A lot of people in Ka'ū know about this and stay way out of reverence but I realize this is important for you folks to see why we need protect this property and how this play into our heritage.

>> Reyna: I think we didn't get to go behind the wall when we went on the site visit. There is about 102 sleeping platforms there and many, many pieces and it went back a kilometer and also that is part of that [away from microphone]

>> Keoni: This is the cave that Paul's or portion of the cave that falls on the Wihenu state property and this is picture of underground freshwater lake. There is a drill down there and this was used by the native Hawaiians for pressure water and these frame two different archeological studies done within the last 20 years. Colleagues, cave conservancy had access to all the reports actually learned a lot through them but they have been investigated thoroughly by archeologists and geologists.

>> Reyna: I think during ranching times they had both a well above the cave but there are also really old [NAME?] that talk about people who come and [inaudible] and they come on donkeys and they bring them and fill up their water in these caves. When there is high ground water flow that this lake here is tapped by fresh water.

>> Keoni: Some more picture of the Kampala area and then another

trail that Shala was walking up to in the distance. Another great shot from Shalan. Actually on our site visit. Showing the property. You have the bay. This used to be a fishpond and wall was right there. Actually maybe I can better answer your question from the site visit. But the Ala Kahakai trail continues from **Pahi Bay through Cavela**. And then actually went over this fish pond wall. Continued on this side and went to this spring. This fresh water hole called **Kapanoko**. We visited that briefly at the site visit that. Falls on the property. It continued over to **Kasm milo**. They had a right idea to go a shortcut to get to Kamilo this way. This area the east side of Kiolaka'a Bay is part of the 5-acre parcel that is included in this overall purchase. Then again Kaunāmano and you have a complex that come down to the bay here and this is where we part for lunch.

>> Reyna: This refers to wrinkle appearance of the wrong fissures and looking at that wrinkle and when people gain weight refer to people. In ancient time the bay was important, canoe landing, safe place for canoes and also a famous fishing spot for the Ali'i and it also is referred to as a famous surf spot as well. There is also a theme that talks about the families of Kiolaka'a having large families **[NAME?]** descendants are as numerous as driftwood.

>> Keoni: Kiolaka'a has a rich ecosystem. I would say it is probably in the top five places for the public to go camping. We camped there a lot when I was a kid. I saw a picture at our site visit. We had a very large contingent. A little bit of off-road driving. A picture of the east side of the bay. Great place for camping and swimming. A lot of our beaches we don't have sand. We have some really rough in the water but it is pretty well **crussed**. That is easy place to take kids and go and jump in the water.

It is also relatively shallow. One of the few places in Ka'u where you can go get hay.

A picture of a lot of the coastal vegetation that is found along -- around Kiolaka'a and at **Kapanoko** spring. There are old trees, milo trees from previous **hohoins** that live there. What else do we have? A lot of **ola**. It was used by the **hyenas** to sting the fish. Some more pictures of people. I never tried but it was a way to catch fish that were caught in the type holes and the one that we don't have here is one we saw on the site visit. It was a **VIP** that grew around the **Kapanoko** water hole. **Shaila** looked it up. It was **epoma little rales**. I didn't go if you knew that. Maybe you guys were thinking something different. I'll wait for you comment later. A picture of **can Kapanoko**. We're hoping to

partner with Hawai'i Wildlife to the resources near the coast line. They drive right by. They go down to Kamilo every week and they bring people from the community to help with the marine debris control. To take care of the native plants. There they have biologists on staff. In fact Megan Lamson actually works for the state aquatics and she loves these ponds. She was not familiar with this pond so when we visited the first time. She jumped right in. She said this water quality is perfect for the poi because it had the red crust on the rocks that they like to lick. There is Megan there. A picture showing some of the other angeline vines blond the coconut tree where is we stopped for lunch that day.

>> Reyna: We didn't really get to see all the ponds because during high tide they come and go and there is six different pools that vary with the tides.

>> Keoni: We ran out of time to see the fishing community complex that was on the other side of the spring. I just included a few pictures on a presentation. A lot of these temporary shelter that fishermen would have used to get out of the sun during the day and work on their tools and push hooks. They had in fun and got some boards and other areas where they were used to make palu.

This is the trail that goes from Kapanoko looking north towards Monalo. Didn't get a chance to see that. Just another picture where the fishpond was before the walls were reached.

Again community based stewardship is essential for our success. We are looking to partner with nonprofit organizations like Hawaii Wildlife Fund and planted the seed to help with dryland forest management. Keeping the cows out of the pristine dryland for area descendants, these are people that need to be empowered that have all that inherent ancestral knowledge about the place that helps us to preserve it for future generations and then just the general community.

This property is accessed regularly by the public. The makai area regulated by the public. People love Kiolaka'a and they keep it clean. They love the water there and love the fishing at Kahului and we hope to harness that energy and do what they're already doing. And again these are our resource management values that we are hoping to full till and protect through this process.

Another quote from uncle. They like him I guess. Because we have

these good things we should do the right thing to. Leave something for those who are coming after us so they may go. So really these projects are not just about purchasing the land and leaving it alone. It is about helping the land to heal. There is this idea from -- we help the land heal we help ourselves and

>> Commissioner: Questions. Well, we have \$3.2 million to spend in 2020. So given that, you know, taking all kinds of things into consideration, what if you could provide us with --

>> Commissioner: Clarification this request is in for FY 21.

>> Keoni: Only 2021 on this one because we still need county funding.

>> Commissioner: For 2020 we have two applications to consider.

No. 1 and then No. 2. Had is there a No. 1, 2 and 3.

>> Keoni: We did anticipate the question. First of all, this is so hard for me to answer. Each one of these lands is like a kupuna to me. This is what keeps me up at night worrying about the future of the places how do we protect from the next generations. If they had that development threat I had a lot of work already. We could have waited. But it is that urgency which is really driving these projects and I knew that was a risk by applying for three projects in a row through the cycle.

And, also, I don't want to downplay what each of these properties brings. That Kiolaka'a comes with it each one has natural cultural resources to protect. Kiolaka'a. Also, you know, I had to think about what our community partners think. This is not about Al Kahakai. This is not. This is about the Kiolaka'a community and how do they look at things and value things differently and really they're going to be the ones that are going to carry this forward. And thinking all those things through and talking with our partners, I think Kaunāmano is our priority now. Personally this is the one I worked with the longest. This is the one that helped to raise me and I feel like I am the man today because of Kaunāmano. My great-grandparents lived adjacent to the property and that was my playground when I was a little kid. I know it better than anything. I feel like I'm at home. It makes me feel safe. I feel loved. I get the same feeling in all these other places, too, but I have a longer connection with that.

We also have the county monies in hand. That economics is another important part. So I feel like if we were able to get the state funding we could close on soon Al Kahakai is ready we're ready to hit the ground running and work with Michelle and her family to do the resources.

No. is two a hard one. Selfishly like we have that property next to it. And just today we found out that it is going to be ranked high by the county. It is looking about for county funding. I'll be honest what keeps me up is the Kiolaka'a property. There is some reserved area in with the cows and I don't -- I'm worried that we might not have another opportunity to save those. I don't know if you want to add anything to that as well. Am I missing something?

>> Reyna: These are just different ideas how to prioritize different projects like Keoni said they all have division applications and surveys. They're all right now.

>> Keoni: Going back if I had to think of economics, 1800 -- 1800-acres so basically the price comes out to \$800 per acre if you look at the -- what we're asking of you and what the cost would be. And then Manaka is \$2500 an acre. So more bang for our buck if you look at it that way. I know is very western thinking. Throwing out economics. But I would probably have to say that would be the second one, Kiolaka'a and then Manaka a third. This is just coming from me. All our community partners may be different. I'm just trying to do what is best that I know. Tough question.

>> Commissioner: Wish we had more money.

>> Commissioner: Because of the quality of the property and all the issues involved.

>> Commissioner: I wanted to note that Kapok has all sorts of scams come down there over the decade. I remember about 35 years ago the first rocket launching attempt and they wanted to put two launching pads. That is when I first got into [NAME?]. Looking for resources up in that area. And there have been many others and they just see this landscape that is wide open and large landscape and let's just do something. Wide open and until it is tied up that is just going to continue. It is not only subdivisions. You can only do so many. It is not approved agriculture because resources don't support it.

>> Keoni: That is a good point. [NAME?] Was going to be dredged. And then Kamilo and Waikapuna was space launch for rocket launching back in the 80s. Big toaster stop that.

>> Speaker: What you just mentioned for agriculture but historically a lot of these were used for agriculture. Are there any plans to do agriculture besides cattle ranching?

>> Keoni: We're definitely open to ideas. There is other nonprofit

groups ball doing community sale feed. But I don't know if this is the best place for that. It doesn't have like the --

>> Speaker: [away from microphone] maybe some of the areas that you require for agriculture.

>> Keoni: Definitely to that for sure.

>> Reyna: And Kiolaka'a only support a small bit of ranch now. I can't remember the acreage off the top of my head. It is in that --

>> Commissioner: Will that expand, you know, what is going to happen with cattle ranching at Kiolaka'a?

>> Reyna: They only have a lease for that section of the property currently so I would imagine any kind of conservation you would negotiate with the county would be perhaps limit that. But that would all depend on how the negotiations happened.

>> Keoni: I think one of our priorities would be to do that biological survey. I barely scratched the surface of the area. I don't drive out there at the Manaka area. It is like a three hour hike one way, three hour back. I had two hours just to jump in the bushes and I found that Kiolaka'a in the first 15 minutes. There could be lots more on that, that I have not identified yet. I think if we know what those resources are and where they're located then we can work out some kind of an enclosure or exposure and work with the rancher to remove that cattle from that portion. Maybe we can accommodate them at Waikapuna. We'll have that property and there are areas in there where that is more appropriate. E

>> Commissioner: You probably followed big island general planning process a little bit. Is there any discussion any mechanism to say remove the egg densities in any way because this is going to go on in -- in -- eternally. This is critical area but I'm sure that as we worked our way around the island there were the critical coasts. Is it part of the discussion at all?

>> Keoni: They just revised the general plan doing community meetings the last few weeks. They do **tide** up with this and intend to do this. I was actively involved in the community development plan which was approved two years ago. In fact Michelle was our Commissioner on at this time. That was a big focus how we can maintain the character of **Kahako**. You are going to see different people coming in and not really understanding how much we value our open space and our resources. And could also lead to destruction of the cultural sites.

A lot of the changes that our CDP wants to limit the subdivisions to areas that have already been approved. We have a huge community and ocean view. I want to say -- of those lots are vacant. It doesn't have water everywhere but they're getting monies and budget for feign structure. They put in a station and our counsel woman has been supporting request for a well. These areas they -- a lot of them is going to be difficult for them to get water. The developers are going to have to put in infrastructure. The CDP is trying to limit the development towards existing residential areas around not **Lahoo** and **Paola** and just emphasizing that every time we see the new applications go in commenting a lot of them have to get SMA permits. There is a process for the public to get involved. I always thought don't wait for -- you have to get out there early. Just have to be maka'ala and read all the announcements and things that come out. I actually go through the historic preservation department's weekly reports to see who is applying for grade and growing permits. Work with them on mitigation. It just is staying getting involved. Good question.

>> Commissioner: I don't see listed on our sheet. What is the zoning on these properties now? Ag?

>> Commissioner: Some conservation.

>> Keoni: Correct. This property is part conservation. The 4 miles that piece was surveyed. That is in the southern division plan. They excluded this. I think it was because they knew they were going to have to get the SMA permit. Tried to keep that separate in order to -- the risk. The rest is all ag 20.

>> Reyna: This is in their plan that they worked hard on. In addition to that, they really prioritized protecting agricultural land and protecting the cultural and natural resources. I mean, this vision is -- really belongs to the community and it is just -- you know, it is really landscape level protection. Even though it is three separate projects it is kind of -- we're hoping that eventually they are.

>> Commissioner: Our last chance at these guys. Any questions? Oh you guys, thank you.

>> Keoni: Now you have a hard decision to make.

>> Commissioner: I wish I had more money.

>> Commissioner: Thank you for doing all three at once. Three important parcels in that area to belong --

>> Keoni: Very close. It is a realistic goal.

>> Commissioner: It would be ashamed to see somebody slip in and pull the plug from it. Thank you for putting it n I know that is a lot for you all.

>> Commissioner: Thank you.

>> Commissioner: Okay. You look like you're pregnant with words. Did you want to say something?

[Laughter]

>> Commissioner: I want to say before we break for lunch, thank you everybody for coming. If you haven't signed in yet for today's meeting, there is the sign-in sheet back there. Pick up another one. There is coffee and snacks here and --

>> Commissioner: With that -- I propose we reconvene at 1:30. It is 12:05. Do you want that long?

>> Audience Member: It took us that long yesterday.

>> Commissioner: It took that long. Actually, we're -- I think that we're okay. We will have -- we have only two more after.

>> Commissioner: Is there any way to get any of the Friday applicants here today?

>> Commissioner: We're not allowed. We are in recess. 1:30.  
[lunch break]

>> CART Captioner: On standby.

>> Commissioner: Okay. Here we go.

>> Commissioner: Item number and time. Commission welcome back, everybody. We reconvene from our lunch recess at 1:34 and we're still on agenda anyone four's. We will continue them with 4. K, applicant Hawaiian Islands Land Trust for Waikalua Loko I'a, Ko'olaupoko **conservation**.

>> Laura: Hawaiian Islands, everyone, I'm Laura.

>> Herb: I'm Herb. CEO of the Pacific American Foundation.

>> Laura: So we're excited to be before you all again to talk about Waikalua Loko I'a, fishpond, which is in Ko'olaupoko, O'ahu. This opening slide here is Herb Lee out on the wall here. Just before we get into our Power Point and sharing more about the Fishpond with you, I wanted to clarify the acreage for the property. It is 17.1-acres. I think somewhere in the application there was another place that it said 17.9.

Also to share with folks and we'll get into this at the end of our presentation. But we -- we do have a verbal estimate from our appraiser who

continues to work on the appraisal report and, so, the numbers from the appraiser, he's estimating very conservatively he said so. Estimating very conservatively the fee value of the property would be between 2 and 2.4 million. Again, estimated very conservatively not factoring in all of the affirmative obligations that we're fairly certain the city and actually Pacific American Foundation as well and the -- want to impose on this property really heavy public benefit educational use of the property. Not factoring those in.

The conservation, the property after the conservation easement is put on would be worth the ceiling amount would be 500,000. And, so, it could even go down from there and, association the difference between the two gives us our conservation easement value and, so, those -- that number range there is between 1.5 and 1.9 million for the conservation easement value.

And, so, our application that we submitted to you is likely underestimating the conservation easement value. We now know it would be higher. We're not going to increase our legacy land request, however, but we're going to talk a little bit after the meeting today about if we're going to revise our form before tomorrow's meeting so just wanted to not throughout to you as a possibility. Mahalo.

>> Herb: If it is okay I'll start with my story and then we'll kind of go through some picture so you can maybe attach the story to some of the pictures and, then, I also have some pictures that we have accumulated over the years. So no text but just pictures so you kind of get a feel and just pass that around.

So first off, Ko'olaupoko and I grew up in Ko'olaupoko and didn't I know that Waikalua existed until I was 40 years old because it was owned privately. It was owned by the Wong family. They sold the respond to Pacific Atlas who basically bought the Bay View golf course wanted to expand the Bay View course in the late 80s like many other investors that wanted to do golf courses in Hawai'i. This is one of them.

And then actually had plans to develop a hole in the middle of the pond. Of course they didn't know what they had and I was brought onboard during that time to be like -- to resolve the conflict between the community and the landowner at the time. The consequence of that was that I was given the opportunity just at the right place at the right time to say, okay, the remedy is going to be, I will take it. I'll start a nonprofit. I'll tank stewardship in Ko'olaupoko Park and that was in 1995. We started a local fishpond society. The pond is with Dr. [NAME?] and doing course sampling it is about 400 years

old. It is right in the southern part of Ko'olaupoko Bay. Right where the stream and Waikalua comes into Ko'olaupoko Bay. The response is right in the middle. We actually have another baby pond that is adjacent to the Kokokahi, a time which is another 2-acre pond also by -- but 1995 to now we have been focusing on the main fishpond to clean it up. There was a lot of debris a lot of abandoned vehicles all kinds of things. We have been in restoration process since 1995.

We partner with the Pacific American Foundation in 2000. Got our first grant as a result of a school and a teacher coming to the pond asking to bring students that were at risk to teach them science in a different way because they weren't -- she was not able to reach them in the classroom. They were mostly made of Hawai'i kids and in 9 months we saw this amazing transformation in these kids. This is 1998.

And, then, went to every grant writing workshop. I wrote grants for three years. I won zero. And, then, I partnered with the Pacific American Foundation. We went after native history education and Federal grant and all of a sudden I had \$1.1 million in my pocket to develop what is now called Waikalua Loko I'a, call it the response to teach math, science, language arts in the context of Hawaiian local and this is in 2000. Our goal was to train 95 teachers statewide. When we went statewide I put together what I now call the dream team of curriculum specialists, artist, language specialists and others to put together the best curriculum that we could meeting the standards at the time which was at the time standards and now call hiccups two.

So make a long story short, since that we were super successful. Everywhere we were delegating to teacher that wanted to learn this stuff.

We have the next one that was called aloha to talk about the context of the Waikalua. We were able to -- 21 titles later we have done fishponds now in Wailuku the island of [NAME?] for three years with Kirk and the PKL and PBS then we did for US Fish and Wildlife in Hawai'i and then we did with University of Alaska, tsunami, curricula, all doing the same thing, culture based in Hawai'i. Rigorous. The same team of people that were just magnificent and we won lots of awards.

Most important thing about that story is that what happened in terms of how that assisted us in the pond was we -- to tell you the truth we didn't -- we were learning as we were going. And once we started based on that experience that we had with the first feature having the curriculum, now all of a sudden we

had lots of teachers that wanted to come not to our pond but we tried to particular Fishponds to bring people to come and help and learn and we gave them the curriculum. It is still up to the lie buried and what happened was that not only teachers came but kids came. And then the kids went home and they were super excited and they brought the families and in 2017 we went over the 100,000 mark and -- at our pond in terms of people that have health recognizing the restoration of this pond. We have been able to train now over 6000 teachers statewide in all of its curriculum. Won awards. But it was not about the awards. It was really about how do we -- we kind of stumbled upon the idea in the restoration of preservation process how to integrate that into mainstream public education system. Now we're at a point where the public ed system is realizing that the community is the classroom. It is not just about teaching within the four walls and they're not only going to ponds but they're going to farming area, they're going to any resource that they can. We never intended it to be like that and may have created a small rule but it has been really magnificent.

All this time we went through six landowners. The Japanese went bank result and sold it and sold to it another and another and Church of Nazarene was the 5th landowner and they sold us the pond for under market value. We got a HUD grant in 2009 and I signed the final document that gave us the deed July 29, 2019, ten years after we purchased the HUD. They good renege on the promise to sell it to us under market. Now it is in our hands. We have a new landowner. We're trying to develop relationship with him. He wanted to build a house over there. He was really scared that he was going to use legal means to try to challenge us because it was very tenuous. I got the land subdivided from the golf course. We have the deed now. I really want to make sure that this property is protected forever.

We know in our analysis in our research that there were 488 of these loko i'a that were developed over 800 years and there are probably less than 15% of them that are left. So unfortunately in our lifetime, the loko i'a are on the verge of vanishing. None of us, we belong to Ahoi and local there businesses 40 of us that are restoring ponds but sad to say none of us have been able to bring these ponds back as they were originally intended. Granted we live in a different society. In the days of old you could amass a lot of people to go fix the ponds because it was very labor intensive. We're in a market economy now and it is a very different situation. But I believe that remaining loko i'a is really super

important towards the future of sustainability of our community in the middle of the Pacific. Pretty much fished out. I believe that the loko i'a and wisdom that comes from it is really important going forward. Especially in terms of teaching kids how to be students than we were.

So that's kind of principally the reason that I'm here trying to put some -- we are a nonprofit organization. I like to hope and think that we're going to be around for the next 400 years but just in case we're not, the most important thing is that we have organizations like yours at IHL that will help to defend us and protect intuition perpetuity. It has become a catalyst for many other things. We have maybe 200 partnerships now and -- I forgot we have written testimony. In 2011 Honolulu did a magazine article for us [away from microphone] in 2011 because of the threats that we had with landowner that wanted to build houses on it and do all kinds of stuff. You believe the community has rallied to our support and we continue to have three, 5000 kids and community members that come every year. We have had it for over 20 years now. That come and help us stewardship of the pond.

We're moving now, the first 25 years it was restoration. The next 25 years is now really about food propagation, sustainability. We're trying -- we're feverishly trying to focus on growing legal first. We have been very successful in figuring out a specific type of leave that grows nest our area, the [NAME?] we're moving towards the stage to bring back some of the fish that -- that were there with the pond. And now it is principally the mullet or the ama or the aba or the orange fish. But we got intensively invasively moved. We experience many extinction in 2018 when the temperature went up and all the [NAME?] disappeared in two, 3 months. Both in the pond and [NAME?] and that was our window of opportunity for us to try to hopefully grow native ling again so don't have to compete with the grass area that grows three times faster. We're taking 100 tons out just in our little pond every year.

So we're really trying to -- working with a lot of different partners. Ko'olaupoko Bay is considered a marine geo site. An observatory in the institute. We have a partnership them. Made a commitment to them for the next 30 years to helped scientists collect data about Waikalua and the respond to make sure kids are working long side to learn this scientists in the world about the impacts of global and climate change on communities like ours and throughout the world. Those are very robust. We have a fabulous partnership with [NAME?] in the pacific. Our kids go there every week to learn side-by-side

within scientists. We have MOU with Community College developing a grand new agricultural curricula, and Fox who is a young and up-and-coming agricultural specialist. And we work with Dr. Collide tomorrow and many years retired now but -- so we're kind of -- kind of in the succession mode looking for the next generation of kids and younger people than me that can continue this on and I think it fits in well with our ask to -- in terms of trying to hopefully get to it a point where we can protect it and then really focus on the work that we need to do to not only help the pond but help the can Ko'olaupoko community and Waikalua. I'm going to stop there because it feels right.

We've been -- we're almost -- only got like a third of an acre left for the mangrove and we've been at war -- the mangrove is a good thing for 99% of the world. It is a cancer to local [away from microphone] and our other Fishpond is basically overrun with mangrove. I'm thieving for the next generation. You have to leave something for that, for the kids, right, so they understand hard work. This is mlo but these are our pets. Kind of like the three bears, you know, two hot, medium and cold. We tried different things. Some with fish, some without fish but, some with legal and some without and see what worked the best. We have them all over the place. We have tanks on the ground and we have them in the pond and tanks and we just trying to find the right formula. And you know the ecosystem keeps changing. You heard about [away from microphone] it has very much affected us but people don't realize it is not just about water height. It is about the micro-organisms and basic other kinds of species that come in with the King Tides that really change the complexion of the microbiology and the biology of the water. So we're kind of always having to like throb that form last does it work anymore? We're constantly doing water analysis and meta-analysis everything that we can think to have figure out how we can give the native varieties of best option.

So this is -- all of this used to be mangrove like two years ago. But you see there is a constant battle with all of the little ones coming back in. This is koolau and this is invasive one.

You can see what we planted there right adjacent to us. That is also been a problem. This is the only place in Hawai'i that has a fishpond right next to a sewage treatment plant. The good news is that it was decommissioned in 1994. They just finished a 3-mile tunnel that is the size of the H-3 tunnel into the mountains that goes -- sewage now goes to the treatment plant. So hopefully I don't get any more calls from the city wastewater at 3:00 in the

morning. I'm sorry, we got another 50,000-gallon spill in the pond. The last spill was in March of last year. We had a rain event. It just flooded the streams and flooded the sewage treatment plant. Broke the fence in the back and all their stuff flooded into our pond. But to their credit they -- in 24 hours they cleaned it up. So anyway, is that the last one? Going back.

The kids have **cuckoo** to rebuild it and we use mangrove and we use **koi** which lasts two or three years. We use whatever resources we can. We have three of these which require a three month to make sure that the water is about 36 inches, 39 inches all the time.

These are our latest tanks that we've built and that when we're at community college the agriculture department is building so we do consider an annex and in terms of this kind of stuff. New development, fishpond -- trying to figure out, rediscover the formulas. Next.

That we're going to tear down. This is the only building on the property that has a legal building permit. Until we get our new permit to build we need to show proof that we had a building that we can sort of replace because it is conservation and preservation land. That is why we kept it up.

>> Laura: When we came before you last time there was a lot of support from this Commission. There was also honest feedback that the project wasn't really ready because Pacific American Foundation, in order to gain title they had to do -- they had to complete a subdivision basically separate their Fishpond property from the adjacent golf course property. The other feedback in terms of the project not quite being ready is that we really didn't have to get clear indication from an appraiser of the value of the conservation easement so we're very happy to -- a lot that can happen in less than a year. So we're happy to report that the subdivision has been completed. Pacific America Foundation is the legal owner. No more conditions left to go of the fishpond. Herb said he's kind of still in shock. This only napped July -- very end of July.

>> Herb: March and then the warranty deed was July 29th.

>> Laura: This is an outline -- we can zoom in. This is a subdivision map. This is what Herb has been waiting for, for a very long time. If you go to the next slide we can zoom in on the Waikalua property. I just wanted to point out the boundaries here. Herb had talked about the second pond. Do you want to point out that Pontiac?

>> Herb: This is the main pond and this is **[NAME?]** runs here and out into the bay and this is the other pond right here. This is **cocoa**. If you're

familiar with this area this is where they park all the Hobe cats on the property right here and this is the other pond. All overgrowing here and it doesn't look like a pond. The stream comes out right in here.

>> Commissioner: Herb, there is two ponds there and one was filled in right?

>> Herb: This one is just overgrowing.

>> Laura: The fishpond is at Waikalua Loko í'a and it is actually two ponds for one price. That is --

>> Herb: A better deal than that. One of them now different now about the Waikalua. It could mean two waters or mean water of the pit. There is different because there is different more level about it. So both of them are called Waikalua. I don't know. It is just called Waikalua.

>> Laura: This is kind of looking forward. Hawaiians are nothing but resourceful. Herb with his pop up tents has managed to grow the 98 and four to 5000 learners every year and really pop up tents and so we see how --

>> Herb: And **kami toys** and we also see -- this is really where his operation is running from here. And so what the conservation easement will do is prohibit subdivision, prohibit residential use of the property and actually remove all of that. So all of what is there now that is actually serving a great public purpose will be taken down, removed and at the bottom of this slide you see Herb's future looking interpretative center, cultural educational interpretative center.

>> Herb: Here and this is one --

>> Laura: The conservation easement will allow this one structure sole purpose of education and there is associations with that center. Once it is built there is going to be a minimum number of learners of all ages, youth learner, cultural practitioner, community work days and really a very rigorous, I would say, public benefit requirement put on Pacific American Foundation which is what -- exactly what Herb and his team wants.

>> Herb: Been going on 20 years now. Hopefully want to ramp it up even more. This is our architects. He calls this a glue which means to grow. And these are designed so that this is facing the pond. This is a pond over here. Everything has to be built 9 feet above the ground because of floodgate. On the pond side the entire wall opens up. The idea is that you're sitting under a tree kind of concept. This is more of a 21st Century version of that. They wanted it to -- something that is going to last next to the ocean but, also, feel like they're

connected to the pond and then this is -- this is a -- using what I call a cabin design. It is basically all filled with rocks. They're like cages and you put rocks in them. People, all of us are piling rocks in the cages and building cages up and that becomes a wall. It is kind of reminiscent of the cool **powell** wall. Our gate here will be like a huge 15-foot makaha. So we're trying to -- you know, blend in indigenous wisdom with contemporary so we have architect working with us for many years and so we finally came up -- this I think is going to be close. I'm not sure.

You know there, is one thing to do nice picture but then when you actually figure out how much it is going to cost to build. That is I whole other reality. So we got \$2 million from the state. One and a half in 2015 and half-a-million this year to build this. So we are underway beginning that construction as we have so many people. We're serving P 20 now. So from the youngest all the way to the gifted ones. We want them to, you know, understand what Waikalua Loko I'a is and they can go to any other item.

>> Laura: We do have some video testimonies and we had a number of people that really wanted to be here and we're very disappointed that it was on Maui this year. They asked if there was a way they could share --

>> Herb: I have never seen this. I'm seeing this for the first time.

>> Commissioner: Not sure about the sound.

>> Herb: New Chancellor January 1 of 2019.

>> Laura: It is just coming from your computer.

>> Commissioner: I don't know how to connect it over there. Hold on.

>> Commissioner: Sorry, didn't master that part yet. Maybe by tomorrow.

>> CART Captioner: Captioner is unable to hear the audio.

>> Commissioner: While they're doing that anybody have questions for Herb?

>> Commissioner: Herb, can you explain your match, where is -- you have a \$427,000 match. Where is that coming from?

>> Herb: Maybe that is a Laura question.

>> Laura: We definitely have -- we have been -- the match we're going to go to natural land fund after this. We definitely have enough funds in their account to support this effort. We have basically kids from every single district

on O'ahu and other islands as well are educated at Waikalua Loko I'a. We had support from all the council members to make conservation easement happen. We're very encouraged about our chances for funding with the King water process and so if we are -- we wanted to start here but if we are just in the timing of this funding cycle and then our next step guys right to the city Commission. We already acquired how quickly we can get on their agenda for our proposal. That is our next step.

>> Commissioner: So it is pending.

>> Laura: Yes, it is pending.

>> Commissioner: Is there a [away from microphone]

>> Laura: They have a rolling application.

>> Commissioner: Laura, you mentioned you owned the pond but the land [away from microphone] your centers can go on it.

>> Herb: Yes. We have -- out of the 17-acre, it is both the water and the land around it. So all of us are proposing to build is on our land. Our ponds.

>> Laura: Right now it is owned by the Pacific American Foundation with no restrictions.

>> Commissioner: It is a conservation easement?

>> Commissioner: We'll start over. Hopefully it is loud enough for everybody.

>> CART Captioner: Unable to clearly hear the video. On standby.  
[Play Video]

>> Video: Because it was a great opportunity actually get involved. I had students pulling mangrove. I brought faculty to do the same thing. It was a great opportunity for them to get to know what it means to be learn by doing and then -- [away from microphone] get hands dirty. I served on the board for about four years at Waikalua Loko I'a Preservation Society before it was turned over to the Pacific American Foundation.

>> Video: I'm interim Dean [away from microphone] my area of coverage involves natural sciences, math, business, computer science. As well as social sciences. Before becoming an interim Dean I taught in environmental science and even Hawaiian Fishpond class over the years and then for me fishpond has been important. For one I served on the [away from microphone]

Pacific American Foundation and preservation society to preserve the Fishpond and preserve it mainly for the purposes of educating its students over there and so that is basically how I viewed the main importance of that Fishpond.

>> Video: I'm Jason a student at WCC. Also the coordinator for this campus. The significance of the Fishpond is part of the native Hawaiian adding to scientists. Fishpond provides a way of [away from microphone] scientists and they have one way of presenting information and data for the native voice to understand. Both of them I see go hand-in-hand.

>> Video: I'm Robert. Part-time [away from microphone] Community College but also full time science teacher [away from microphone] and this is my testimony regarding the Waikalua Loko I'a Fishpond. I have been going out to that Fishpond for nearly 15 years. Now it has been an invaluable resource to me as a teacher. To give you an example when I first started working back in 2009, we were tasked to create project for our students. We actually brought out somewhere around 250 of our biology students to the Fishpond to understand the dynamics of how the fishpond works.

>> Video: I'm [away from microphone] at Haskell High School. I think our relationship with Waikalua Loko I'a is so vital to our kids and the trajectory that they're on in terms of what they want to do and what scientist group at high school. Natural resources academy actually goes out to different sites. It is really cool because they get to make that real-time connection between what they're learning here as a high school and what is really going on in their community. And we're so lucky because we have the natural resources at our disposal. We have a community that rallies around our school to make sure that we maintain that strong connection and that is so important for our kids because very want to develop that strong place where they're from and all of them always talk about after they experience this giving back. The importance of giving back to their community and where they're from and how/what they learned transfers globally. Anything that they decide to do post high school.

So this relationship is vital to our school is vital to our [away from microphone]

>> Video: [away from microphone] how does it make you feel to know that Waikalua Loko I'a is not protected?

>> Video: [away from microphone] all the things I have put into it and my friends put in to it and my school and community around and it -- like working

on a project you have been working on for so many years, somebody taking it and destroying it in front of you. Having that feeling that it might happen to Waikalua Loko I'a.

>> Video: How would you feel if Waikalua Loko I'a is permanently protected?

>> Video: [away from microphone] just been protected.

>> Herb: I think he is ten but he's been down there since he was one.

>> Video: I'm Mark. I'm here to support the Waikalua Loko I'a fishpond. We have known uncle Herb for a long time. We both started to restore our areas and we both have been there to support each other and the water is what always connects us. This is the portion of the Waikalua Loko I'a and through the years work with the community and children throughout the years getting a connection to Waikalua Loko I'a and we're in an incredible time and organization that are working together to preserve our body and also the area security biological diversity and this goes on. Each of these areas we're getting a chance to restore it and go back into use for our community.

>> Video: I know in the way Ko'olaupoko community, I have lived here for 50 years ago and now living at [NAME?] I'm associated with the Waikalua Loko I'a fishpond going back to the time when it was owned by my uncle, Henry Wong. He used to come here for family parties and gatherings but until the fishpond was sold to the golf course to eventually first by the Pacific American Foundation, the Waikalua Loko I'a would not have been restored as it is today. So it is very important to continue this restoration of the Waikalua Loko I'a also in conjunction with the preservation of [away from microphone] fishpond. Because this response is very important culturally as well as environmentally in the [NAME?] so if we want to extend what is begun here [away from microphone] so whatever would help we can get especially financial resources to continue to work here not known restoration process [away from microphone] 800 years old fishpond but also to conduct the educational programs for the community here for the local people as well as schools and this is a very important -- society is very important place to continue our off of Waikalua Loko I'a.

[end of video]

>> Herb: Any other questions? We did have -- we submitted hard copies of support letters and many others that have submitted that --

>> Commissioner: Do you have a chance for educational center, the restroom, would that be tied into the sewer or --

>> Herb: Yeah. That added like another \$700,000 to the whole thing because originally we were told that we could hook up right to the sewer stream plat but the water supply said no. We have to hook up to their water system which is like 1000 feet away. So we're being -- we're hooked up to them and then we have to hook up to the sewer system out there. So but we don't have any flushing toilets now but we have to comply.

>> Commissioner: That is good no septic.

>> Herb: No seconded septic. 3 feet underground and you hit water. Pretty shallow. It is preservation on the county side. And it is conservation on the state side. Preservation, too, I think because it allows golf courses.

>> Laura: The property is really interesting because there were originally three home sites on the property. It's conservation state land use. County's only preservation. There is out of the three home sites, one foundation is still left and then one standing home is still left. There is a possible argument for doing more than one home but we just asked our appraiser to just go conservative in the -- in the appraisal and so he's working with just the one home and really looking at it as an estate. That is his idea of the highest best use for the property.

One home, which you can't do because it is still standing, Herb -- this whole project only really works with all the pieces fitting in together at the same time. And, so, the home site there would be transferred not to an estate with a beautiful fishpond as an amenities but into cultural educational center with the pond being open for all.

>> Herb: As a classroom.

>> Laura: Right.

>> Commissioner: The value was at 2.4. That was appraised value or assessed value?

>> Laura: That is the appraised fee simple value and so the conservation easement value between 1.5 and 1.9. It is our appraiser's last verbal appraisal. So there is different standards of appraisals kind of the most initial you can get is the verbal appraisal which that is where we're at now. He

will be finalizing our written conservation easement appraisal which will have before we go for city funding if we get support there.

>> Herb: He is familiar because he did an appraisal for us ten years ago. We had to upgrade to purchase the property.

>> Commissioner: All in the SMA all of them?

>> Herb: Not all of it. Not all of it. We will have to build a building staying 60 feet way from the edge. That is a standard. We're in the back. There is an SMA in the front and then in the back of the pond where we're going to build a building, we cannot build within 60 feet of the edge of the pond so it is protected. We're totally fine with that.

>> Commissioner: You showed some new plants that are coming in that you're fighting all the time, the evasive I know. I'm curious what your longer term plans are for restoration of the area vegetationally and also the issue with this green that has been diverted away from the pond if there is any plans or dreams maybe. Restoring fresh water.

>> Herb: We definitely would like to restore fresh water because these ponds were typically brackish water and had a fresh water source.

The good thing is that -- I guess wasn't intended but good thing from our standpoint now at Kawa stream is considered one of the most degraded streams in the state of Hawai'i. Part of it really has been a true educational program so that people need to learn that they cannot recreate the stream. If they -- if kids invested in restoration of it they're not going to pollute the part of it. So until we're constantly monitoring it but it is still degraded. But hopefully some day we wanted to bring it back in. We did discover as we removed mangrove over the last year, Dr. Floyd McCoy and Hal Hammett now we have the ability to use drones and do heat sensitive -- but I don't know. They can look -- yeah. They can go below surface like ground penetrating the radar. We actually have uncovered old traditional walls in the back of the pond that look like there was some kind of filtration process where Kawa used to come into the pond. We think it could have been a low e or something like that, that became like -- almost like a wet land. A natural wetland to clean the water before it comes into the pond. So we're very intrigued by that. And maybe that might be part of the solution. We have built regarding the garden and native plants we did start a small little mala about ten years ago on the property to basically try to show the kids what are some of the native plants that can grow

down in a makai environment. We're presently surprised that some of the mecca plant were growing pretty well. If there is tender loving care and we use a lot of mulch and things like that. Including Barracuda and tilapia. We just signed an agreement with another community organization to basically when that house goes down, the gotten is right in front of the house. Now we want to expand that garden in that area and we sign an MOU just a couple of weeks wag that, that they're going to help us grow that and really be responsible for having more experts that could teach kids about native invasive plants at the site. That is a very -- that is one of the cornerstone components of the educational program going forward.

>> Commissioner: Any question or discussion from the Commission?  
Any comments, questions from the public?

>> Laura: Can I add one more thing?

>> Commissioner: Please.

>> Laura: I heard this is all very positive feedback about kind of Herb and his team's tenacity over the years but it does correlate with threat and urgency, right, so you folks have this scoring matrix and we've heard about places that are really threatened and I don't know if this is me really advocating but just kind of an acknowledgment that what I have shared with Herb because people tend to say Herb is here. He's not going to let anything bad happen. I think when we look at something -- at something as important as our protein source moving forward, our fishponds, I don't think that that type of burden is really fair to put on an individual in our community when we're looking at perpetuity of our resources. So I have all the confidence in the world in Herb.

>> Herb: I'm getting older. We want it to be pass placed. That is why we do this.]

>> Laura: You know, Herb, I'm just sharing if that is okay then to just mention that his group lost one of the aunties last night that has been absolutely critical and she passed away last night. I was very sad to learn about that at lunch today. But it definitely has me reflecting on, you know, what kind of a burden are we putting on our champions of these resources and you know we've heard kind of a repeated theme here that they want to feel peace and knowing that their places are protected which I think is what is so great about this program it offers that actually becoming a reality.

They have managed to overcome every hurdle that has come their way and made one huge leap in actually taking title just a month ago. But it is not done yet. I think that -- that sense of peace and being able to tackle things like getting the stream back and locating the old **moke** and moving to the next pond and like Herb said the next 25 years is about actually bringing fish back, you know, extending that educational piece to actually be able to eat from the land again. There is a lot of work to be done and I see the conservation easement as absolutely critical to allowing that to happen.

>> Commissioner: I think you said that this would be the first conservation piece on the Waikalua Loko I'a fishpond?

>> Herb: That I know of.

>> Commissioner: That you know of. That doesn't mean that, you know, many of the other ones are under threat.

>> Commissioner: No.

>> Herb: But they have different situations in terms of ownership [away from microphone] owned by people that are different but ours we have been working on this pond all these years without any guarantee that we would end up -- until three weeks ago until a month ago. So you know --

>> Commissioner: Okay. Last chance.

>> Herb: Thank you. Thank you everybody.

>> Laura: Thank you for everyone's help with our video play.

>> Commissioner: Moving on to item 4.G. This is DOFAW request for Nānu'alele.

>> Commissioner: This is our last application for today. We have three more tomorrow morning. Folks that came in recently please sign in on the back table there so we can -- the more attendance we get the better it looks so more sign ins please. But don't fake it or anything. Don't stuff the ballot box. All the application materials and other pieces of the board packet are in there in the back. If you need help locating something just ask me.

>> Commissioner: Be sure to identify yourselves.

>> Fern: I am Fern Duvall. I work for Department of Land and Natural Resources, the protection and management section. I brought with me a handout to give to the Commissioners simply showing a very old map from 87

of the peninsula that I wish to talk about. So this -- this request is to propose a new natural area reserved serve in the Hāna District out in Hāna and situated on Hāna Bay and so this first diagram is this aerial map and you can see in red I identified five fishponds that are certainly within the area that is in question being transferred from on a ranch as a proposed natural aerial reserve and Nānu'alele Anchialine refers to many waves coming in quick succession so it is Nānu'alele Anchialine.

So this proposes the 10 acres from this bay you see here, cutting off this portion. And it is an area that we were contacted early on by Kona ranch that they want to us propose getting up as a natural area reserve after having also talked with a public group about the area. Those talks are still on-going.

Okay, so these two diagrams show you the tax map key and the one highlighted in blue and the others by Wendy Wiltse. There were purple lines around it and encumbered state lands that we hope will be transferred to the in order to address some of the access modes for the area. So this just shows I'm not going to speak much to this in the context of the entire Hāna coast. The state parks. Airport land. The botanical gardens. All that we figure into the future into a bigger plan into the north shore areas.

The access to the area, since access was questioned earlier, that sort of dividing two different types. There would be management which by that it is understood management by the Natural Area Reserves staff, the staff that we have here. And we do have agreement from some family that live there on at least two of these private properties, not any home or person present on the third one. For management purposes, they have been allowing us access go in and look at the site, look at the pools and they joined us on various time that we have been there to see what we were doing and to also learn from us about the areas.

The public of course can get in right now but the highest wash along the coastal areas and then any of the area that is on unencumbered land right now. Next slide.

So of the resources that are on the site, rather small site but one of the main attractions to the natural area reserve system is that it is a hollow forest and there is win ward pools and most alkaline are found in dry area. This is quite the opposite. It is very wet Hāna and wet and cool and there are five of these. The handout I gave you, it shows you all the different ones that had been associated with these fishponds in the past. So they're not new

discoveries. They're very old discoveries with Hawaiian connected to them. It is probably the chief resource that we're looking at for protection and management of the natural of resource there. It is not pool of water. It is pressure and water, seawater mix. But they do have shrimp in them. About 2008 it was reviewed by the Department of Product resources and they did find **opil out of the la in the pods**. We have not seen them there but we think it may be due to the sedimentation and vegetation debris in the ponds preventing the proper circulation used to re-enter the pools. There is currently opae **guna** which is large shrimp and native shrimp there and we were glad to found **[NAME?]** a fly. A Federally listed and endangered species and found in two of the pools there on location and beyond the Maui for that species. I'm just putting up the threats now.

Notice guppies in some of the ponds so introduce fish as a problem in the future, sedimentation, education, debris that falls in from nonnative vegetation there and, sea almonds, firewood trees, java plum and all the other things that affect the quality of the water and use by native plants organisms. We're not quite sure what the extent of thermogenic -- something that we find out discussing with the people that regularly access the area u

Next one, please. This is just a picture of the rare damselflies. **piano** **zampopolus**. A difficult photo. When you see them they're not just sitting there nice picture that you had. Somebody is holding on to the animal like wow, look at this. And then the other thing is it is a good area for the yellow faced -- sorry spelling. Yellow faced and we -- we expect that they could be there. We just haven't found them in the amount of surveys that we have done. We would also manage for them.

If they're yellow faced still present we have to probably manage for ants and put out the yellow face bee hotel type things and develop fish and wildlife for management of the -- of that species.

With the other attraction is that this would be protected in the natural area reserve system. It would be a hollow forest and certainly what there it was is highly debrided now. But I'm sure that the hollow forest would be promoted through nonnative vegetation.

Sea level rise is a problem for the area. You'll see a slide in a moment about that even with 5-foot sea level rise, not much of the actual area is removed from these. We found evidence of rats out there feeding on [away from microphone] other plant ceases, too. There is trampling by human activity and

there is locations where you see that fires were started. So all those things are threats to the area currently. Next slide please.

So this is addressing the question sea level rise at 5 feet of sea level rise you see green and blue materials that would be expanded. The blue is probably expansion actually at the pools themselves in terms of extent.

So our plans, you know, if it does come into the system is to do the due diligence and request for monies to -- to the Commission. It is to actually cover the cost of due diligence because the land itself is donated to us. We did take this to the Commission concept and they agreed that it would be in addition to -- could be in addition to the and system and would take it to the board at some point in the future. No date has been set that I'm aware of.

What we would also do is assess the resource conditions for all the things, the plants that are there, the pools and invertebrates in the pools and we would have to develop a management plan. The one for [NAME?] also has alkaline pools might work in some aspects but that is very dry Lee ward side and hot and not similar. The management plan is going to have to be tweaked in a different way. We would of course do that with public involvement and -- of the people living there and all the nonprofits and it is -- that are very interested in this area. We would rehabilitate the pools by removing the threats to them, sedimentation and then we would do debris removal. Marine debris and debris within the pools. Removing and plants. That is something that the system normally does. In s areas we would enhance the halo forest and vegetation type that used to be there.

And very interestingly it is also completely peaceful to use it as a recovery site for at least three -- not only rare but pep species. Super *spinatus* forms and [NAME?] and human sloni [NAME?] which is a large vine called AAA and it is a very rare only on the [NAME?] thank you. Any questions? This is the flowers.

>> Commissioner: So the match would be the donation, right? The property donation?

>> Fern: Yes.

>> Commissioner: What does that say? Fern that is the [reading] *Arrisia (sp)* it is a long pendant thing with very large yellow flowers. Bird pollinated in the past.

>> Commissioner: Might be a stupid question but -- stupid at times. So what is the \$66,000 for this is going to be given to you?

>> Speaker: It is doing appraisal, doing a title report, doing -- paying for closing costs and we just don't really have a strong idea how that is, the title reports can range from 1000 to \$15,000. Appraisal just depending on how messy the title is. That is overarching estimate.

>> Commissioner: Would it include an environmental assessment?

>> Speaker: We don't think that we would need to do an environmental assessment unless -- because the land is undeveloped. I don't think that we would be required to do an environmental assessment but that cost would be didn't cover that.

>> Fern: We have education surveys, conveyors of the birds and pools that have been all the [away from microphone]

>> Commissioner: How do I turn it off?

>> Commissioner: You set a record for matching percentage?

[Laughter]

>> Commissioner: Any question from the Commission

>> Commissioner: Oh, yeah, I have a question. So doesn't Del have money out of different pocket to pay for the due diligence?

>> Speaker: No. I think it is, you know, it is achievable but we really don't, you know. We have a budget [away from microphone] operating budget this year.

>> Fern: My operating budget for all the systems and all the operation we do is [away from microphone]

>> Commissioner: Per year.

>> Fern: Yes, for this year. But for Maui, **Mulkie**, the entire staff and everything that we do all the acres that we cover, 11 different Natural Area Reserves. This being tiny compared to those.

>> Speaker: Because it would be a donation would we have to do an appraisal but we would have to do an environmental survey just to see if there is any -- anything on the property but I think that that is a liberal estimate. So we probably would need less but I think it is better to lean on that side because if there is -- is anything on the property that -- any pollution or anything like that, that triggers at least 2 PSA then we would need to do [away from microphone]. I highly doubt that is necessary but you want to have a little room for it in case it is necessary. But

>> Fern: Just to clarify for the audience we had a little vocabulary situation. Environmental assessment generally refers to chapter 343,

environmental impact law which is the question Leah answered, and it doesn't trigger chapter 343 requirement, environmental site assessment which is part of our -- for -- when the state acquires property that is one of the things on the list of land division requirements for state plan.

>> Leah: [away from microphone] appraisal and review of this. And honestly I'm not clear on this. I can try to get that clarification for you but we might be telling the landowner that we would do an appraisal if they would have that for their tax [away from microphone] so I'm not sure if that was agreed upon. If we agreed to do that. That is something that I know we have done for other donations.

>> Speaker: If that is a requirement we may have to do the appraisal because -- just so that they can say this is the value that we donated to the state for -- they can receive the tax payment. But

>> Fern: Does the landowner usually pay for that?

>> Speaker: That is negotiable. Sometimes yes, sometimes no.

>> Fern: So my contact on a ranch representative that has not been brought up even as a topic. The site since you walked around during the site visit both you and Rick were out there but it is much undeveloped. The type of things that are there probably are not systematic for the site but they wash in with the -- with the currents that flow to the ocean side of the property and to the bay and that is not some debris.

>> Speaker: I can also comment -- so for closure I'm from [away from microphone] you can see my house on the map there. I'm very familiar with this area. We go camping, fishing out there all the time when I was little. [NAME?] There is and local people believe it is season. That sometimes you can go and you see it and sometimes you go and you don't. But present and I have seen them there within the last three years.

>> Fern: That is a very good point. It could be with the influx of more fresh water and winter rains they actually can come from the sub terrain channels in the water.

>> Speaker: The local people believe they hide underneath or if -- there is vegetation covering some of them, too, so they'll hide in some areas and then they appear in the ponds that -- where they're denoted on the map certain times of year. The fishermen that there are know when it is usually the time of year that you see them.

>> Commissioner: You have -- please identify yourself for the record.

>> Chad Meyer: I'm a member of staff. I'm a resident. I'm here just listening today. You'll have our say so or whatever tomorrow for our presentation. I'm curious, how many acreage is involved from Nānu'alele Anchialine partners. I think this is land they would be glad to get rid of in terms of ownership. My observation was that you might get them to do some of the title reports and disclosure documents that you're looking for at cost to them rather than to the state. We have talked to them. They have a list of properties that they're trying to turn over to the state including Kaliki which is financial liability to the state [away from microphone] but it is interesting. Something as important that is in history nobody wants to assume title and ownership responsibility.

I think these lands are probably in that same category in some respect. I am interested in how you're going to integrate this residents who are there in access and buy in.

>> Fern: Well, some of the residents that were there -- and there are two properties that had residents come out and they went with us. Told them what we were going to do. I have had staff go out there multiple times for pool conveyors and looking at least one time for yellow faced bees and that is [NAME?] from the program and John burrito who has been going in and out of here. Both of their family, from right there. They also have connection and then Kanoa who works for me they have property that is right there so we're sort of a known entity in a way but we didn't have a need to discuss with them because the sanctuary rules have to apply and that is going to have some impact on you know grass what can be done and they need to be aware of and it needs to be worked out.

>> Commissioner: I'm wondering also since it is the same owner as the Maka'ālae Lands and the Moloka'i lands, could the donation of this property help as a match on those parcels?

>> Commissioner: I can say one thing to that. I don't think so. It is going to a different place. The land is a different applicant.

>> Commissioner: Different applicant.

>> Commissioner: It is pretty different yeah. I don't think so. The current landowner is the same but where it is going is a different place.

>> Commissioner: This could go into the state and -- the s program where the other was going to Kauai

>> Commissioner: Kauai has expressed interest in taking this land if

that is the community's preference.

>> Speaker: When they contacted us we said did you contact the Ala Kahakai it looks like that is the kind of thing that should be donated to the community. And they had been in Ala Kahakai and we got in touch with Kahakai and we got in touch with our member both and started a dialogue with them. We only proceeded down this route because what was told to us that Ala Kahakai was not interested in taking it. Now, we're open to that and I think that -- we met with them and I know they're interested and we continued to talk and our preference in the beginning this go to some kind of a community group. We still feel that is a good option. So with regard to working with the community and how we would work with them, we feel that we just begun discussions with community on what kind of management would be done here and what kind of this would be and we expect we're going to continue to talk to Kahakai and others, too.

>> Commissioner: Do you have a comment on that Laura as partner with --

>> Laura: I guess it is just obvious that it all has to work together, right? What I'm hearing from the state my impression is everybody want to stay protected. And so it really -- it all goes together. Absolutely. The communities steadfast and protected in this coastline. I think it is a great line the state is like hey. You know. Calling Ala Kahakai is involved and is a resource and partner. So I don't have a preference but yeah. I think it is maybe just more discussion that is needed.

>> Speaker: Fern and Scott I was wondering up the state would not incorporate [away from microphone] state did take the property and . That would allow the periphery around there would be where the public could do their traditional activities without being encumbered by rules for instance overnight fishing and those kinds of things.

>> Fern: Like Scott said it is really prelim what uses -- are taking place there. And where those take place. If indeed it mostly fishing and [NAME?] collection, you're right, probably not even touch on the properties necessarily. But there is some use of the ponds of the pools and the resources there so it is just I do not have a good feel from what has gone on historically there or why. The thing that was Paramount to us is when we're -- [away from microphone] pools are important to recess. That was the main thing.

>> Commissioner: I think that you might be references those -- [away

from microphone] showing right there. I think those are problematic for. That is my gut feeling. I don't know if you guys put that on the Commission agenda or not.

But we set aside those to until it was vetted with regard to how it would impact the community. My gut feeling is it is probably not a good idea.

>> Commissioner: Fern, what are the uses of the pool? You said the pools have some uses. What are they?

>> Fern: I think it is opi --

>> Commissioner: Collection.

>> Fern: Yeah. There is some pool but not the one that you're talking about that has fish that have been obviously place they'd probably bait fish stores fishing offshore.

>> Commissioner: Yes.

>> Speaker: Speaking for myself but I think that the community has resources they could be drawn out to work with the state I think that is a great way to receive some help. I think our organization is going to be hesitant because we're really stretching to work with in Maka'ala'e and Moloka'i parcel and come up with a good management plan for them. What I hear is this is going to require input strategies and I don't think we're in a position -- we would like to support this program because it is very parallel to our goals in terms of conservation so I just -- that is my sense about things to be summarized.

>> Laura: I make the comment, too, this area is much different resources and much different need than the Moloka'i Maka'ala'e area. More culture sites. [away from microphone] on the site. The natural resources have been degraded and this area is going require a lot more scientific expertise than the community is very rich and -- in cultural expertise but not very rich in scientific expertise that would be required to restore and cover and protect the resources on this site, Alae pond and equip to restore and manage the site than the community.

>> Commissioner: Main advantage I would see for the Land Trust to take on this site would be that it would provide a substantial map that they could use towards acquisition of the other properties.

>> Laura: Perhaps. In regards to camping you're not allowed to camp at this site because it is very overgrown and wet. So the camping is [away from microphone] so the stream it is like nice, sandy pebbles and families do a lot of camping on that site and then it is further inland and so this Lily is not known

for camping. Anything day fishers are going to collect a fee or drop poles or throw a net and even throw a net there -- they are much better fishing grounds on the inside of the bay than there is on the -- it does get a lot of action and so there isn't much camping if at all over there.

>> Commissioner: More appropriate testimony?

>> Speaker: This might take a minute.

>> Commissioner: Go ahead.

>> Speaker: I'm Thorn a former Commissioner speaking as a resident of Maui Ma and thank you for coming. I appreciate your time in doing that. I would say a little legal down here by the bay and there is quite a collection of bed and breakfast and [NAME?] down here and is wonderful walk to go up this beach. If I had known about this I certainly would have gone throughout to check it out. In fact I wanted to go out there but my wife thought -- I saw people camping on the beach along with some untethered dogs that looked so friendly that that we decided to turn around and go away. If it does -- s has -- its impetus is protecting not creating public access. There is some social impediments to public access in the sense of untethered dogs and other things like that. I would strongly suggest from a public citizen standpoint encourage taking advantage of this opportunity to protect this very unique property especially with endangered resources as well. And then the second thing I would like to say is that there is a map here -- how many of you like to surf? Okay. How many of you swim? How many of you like to hike? Almost all of us. How many have hiked Ko'olaupoko head? Oh, good on you. You would be good on Maui because here is what is really happening. You heard yesterday that cruise Bay is down here and the access and walking it is a nice walking trail down there. A lot of cultural sites but it is really hot. It is really dry. It is primarily limited by the number of parking spaces. That is what really limits it. It is full, 50, 75 people a day.

Where is the next best place to hike? Well, over here in Malay Bay. Down to the windmill to the other side and then it is the same way. The first part of it is just like walk Ko'olaupoko head. Is step. I have to use this thing. You better take a hat and a lot of water because you're going to dry out and roast and bake. That is a big steep hike.

The next other hike is lao valley. A state and county park which is really great. It is packed every weekend. Again, limited by the number of parking spaces come gives you a sense of how much use there is.

Then there is Waihee ridge trail which spent a lot of money on fixing up because it is totally overwhelmed with people. First quarter mile you have to have one of these and a plot to get up the hill. That is just to get to the trail head. There is no shade. Is hot. Sunny. If you're an elderly person, where do you go hike here? If you have kids, toddlers, you going to take them somewhere you can bake their brains out? No. Where there is no water? What about, you know, families with a bunch of kids that are under tweens age? Very difficult for them to hike in any of these circumstances. We all said we like the water. We like hiking. We like being outdoors.

The other thing is unlike Honolulu believe it or not Kanae has better hiking than a lot of places on Maui because there is a lot more forest growth that you can get into and see more wild life and see more birds.

With that all said, this -- the -- the [NAME?] project one of the great benefits of it is there is a beautiful trail called swinging bridges. It goes way up in the valley. It was perfect for kids. The infrastructure is already there. We wouldn't have to hopefully spend a lot of money fixing it up. This is a trail that was very, very popular. But it used to be people's cars were broken in all the time and had to cross some individual's private land about 600 feet of it. So he said well, I'll charge people for parking and I'll protect your cars. That was a really great idea. But then he started having people sign, as I understand it, sign a waiver of liability. The water company didn't like that because people thought this they're getting a liability waiver for the whole area not just his 600 feet. Next thing you know now there is big barbed wire fencing kind of like steroid to heaven on O'ahu. You have to sneak in in the morning and climb under the fence and do all kinds of crazy stuff this. Would be a great restoration of public access. What it would do is take a lot of pressure off these other locations that are literally limited just by the size of the parking lot.

We're overrun now because we have nowhere to go. Nowhere to go and do outdoor recreation with families with kids and so you go up to the Rung trail now. It is -- there is 75 people up there. Easily. There is no peace and quiet anymore. You have to not on a weekend at least. We need create some more hiking. I know you will say we just gave you a bunch money but because [NAME?] got that money and [NAME?] got that money they were able to track more money by the legislature and get more money. I know it is a big ask for this Commission out of your budget but please consider the project very highly because there is a benefit beyond just watershed and watershed protection.

Habitat protection there is also the public access and public -- thank you.

>> Commissioner: Can I ask you a question. I guess it is to Fern and to Alama. Is -- if this area were cleared and the responds were evident but there was maybe less complete vegetative coverage, is it possible for camping and keeping the ponds and the down supplies, et cetera, et cetera, are those compatible at all?

>> Fern: Natural area of --

>> Commissioner: Forget those rules. I'm just asking thinking again --

>> Fern: Not in -- no.

>> Speaker: In another location even if the area was improved you can't get around the fact that it is just -- nobody wants to put their tent in the ground and sleep on the wet ground. Especially when you have better camping areas that is around the corner. More easy to access, too. You can see you have to go through other people's properties or walk along the really rocky and talking about all rock. This is not easy to walk on area. There is lots of great camping areas Hāna area. This is not an area that anybody wants to go camping in.

>> Commissioner: Do you know if this is the area where the Noah family used to live.

>> Speaker: So you see that nice -- that big -- the cove area?

>> Commissioner: Yes.

>> Speaker: It is the adjacent property just to the left. It is the Hawaiian village. A little bit further.

>> Commissioner: This one.

>> Speaker: Then the property neighboring it.

>> Commissioner: I have been there.

>> Speaker: People use the little pond area and go swimming and fishing right off of that point on the inside of it. Fishing on the inside it is much better than on the point. Because of the wave action.

>> Fern: Phyllis and Leslie have allowed us to use their driveway to --

>> Speaker: Leslie is great. A good friend of the community. She lets people have access all those areas and come on her property.

[away from microphone]

>> Fern: Historically it was called white Kalo and it was a property that came into the Bruces from a trust.

>> Speaker: Everybody refers. That is **whited kalo**. If you look at **Hanuman** by the sign that starts with that large state property. [NAME?] and [NAME?] that is all considered --

>> Commissioner: More input into the discussion of Nānu'alele Anchialine? More questions for the applicants?

Okay. I think that means we have completed the agenda items for today. We have three more applicants, but we can't deal with those because they're flying in tomorrow morning. We'll pick those up at 8:00. 8:00 A.M. tomorrow morning. We will begin. So plan your breakfast and whatever is accordingly. 8:00 A.M. Right?

>> Commissioner: That is in response to the Commissioners request for more discussion and decision-making.

>> Commissioner: We should have a very hard day tomorrow.

>> Speaker: Will our applicants be here at 8:00 A.M.?

>> Speaker: They're to land at Moloka'i 7:45.

>> Speaker: Maybe 8:15.

>> Speaker: The agenda says 8:00. We'll be here then.

>> Speaker: We'll plan to meet at 8:00.

>> Speaker: Could we review which properties already have a firm match, can we just go over that for the one that we have talked about today?

>> Speaker: I'm not sure what you mean because we don't have an agenda item about that.

>> Commissioner: So we can't discuss it?

>> Commissioner: Last we discussed.

>> Commissioner: It would be okay to add that to the agenda if the Commission was agreed.

>> Commissioner: If you just want to clarify certain facts I mean not all the applicants who may want to ask are here. The ones who went up until this point. So we want to make sure that we treat everybody equally and, you know, just -- somebody is not here to respond, somebody else is here to respond that is why we have been asking for clarifications throughout and, in fact, I have been receiving some e-mails from applicants with clarifications that I will assemble and go over when we start the discussion period tomorrow.

>> Speaker: [away from microphone]

>> Commissioner: Yeah. Yeah. I think that might be better. I

have been making notes along the way on that kind of thing.

>> Commissioner: Me, too.

>> Commissioner: You know, some applications get modified lot, et cetera, but we're still trying to sort all that clearly.

>> Commissioner: I see many of you taking notes on this big sheet. That is pretty much what it is for. That will be the first thing that we do during the discussion period is go through this sheet line by line and make sure that we have everything straight.

>> Speaker: We'll do that. Any --

>> Commissioner: Any other sort of final comments? We're not going to add agenda item unless somebody else is proposing there is one. Otherwise, we will reconvene tomorrow morning for the continuation of 4 in meeting 69. Do we have a move to adjourn?

>> Commissioner: I move to adjourn.

>> Commissioner: Sending.

>> Commissioner: All in favor.

>> All. Aye.

>> Commissioner: The meeting is adjourned, 3:20.

>> CART Captioner: Thank you.

\*\*\*\*\*DISCLAIMER\*\*\*\*\*

THE FOLLOWING IS AN UNEDITED DRAFT TRANSLATION. THIS TRANSCRIPT MAY NOT BE VERBATIM, HAS NOT BEEN PROOFREAD AND MAY CONTAIN ERRORS. PLEASE CHECK WITH THE SPEAKER(S) FOR ANY CLARIFICATION. JC

\*\*\*\*\*DISCLAIMER\*\*\*\*\*